Vol. 41.1   June/Junio 2019

Abstracting and Indexing

Atlantis **is indexed in the following Thomson Reuters services:**

- Arts and Humanities Citation Index®
- Current Contents®/Arts & Humanities
- Emerging Source Citation Index
- Social Sciences Citation Index®
- Journal Citation Reports/ Social Sciences Edition
- Current Contents®/Social and Behavioral Sciences

Atlantis **is also indexed or abstracted in the following databases and directories:**

ÍnDICEs-CSIC
- RESH, Revistas Españolas de Ciencias Sociales y Humanidades

De Gruyter Saur
- International Bibliography of Book Reviews of Scholarly Literature in the Humanities and Social Sciences (IBR Online)
- International Bibliography of Periodical Literature in the Humanities and the Social Sciences (IBZ Online)

EBSCO*host*
- Academic Search Complete
- Fuente Academica Premier, Humanities
- Humanities Abstracts
- Humanities International Complete (HIC)
- Humanities International Index

Elsevier BV
- SCIMAGO Journal and Country Rank
- SCOPUS

Gale-Cengage
- Academic ASAP
- Expanded Academic Index ASAP
- General Onefile
- Informe Académico
- Infotrac Onefile
- Literature Resource Center

ProQuest
- Annual Bibliography of English Language and Literature (ABELL)
- CSA Linguistics and Language Behavior Abstracts (LLBA)
- Literature Online (LION)
- MLA Directory of Periodicals
- MLA International Bibliography, published by the Modern Language Association of America
- Periodical Index Online (PIO)
- Periodicals Contents Index (PCI)
- Sociological Abstracts

Other abstracting and indexing services:

- A Bibliography of Literary Theory, Criticism and Philology
- American Studies Journal Directory
- Bibliography of European Journals for English Studies (BEJES), European Society for the Study of English (ESSE)
- CARHUS Plus+
- CIRC Clasificación Integrada de las Revistas Científicas
- CWTS Journal Indicators
- DIALNETPlus
- DICE, Difusión y Calidad Editorial de las Revistas Españolas de Humanidades y Ciencias Sociales y Jurídicas
- DUOTROPE
- Eigenfactor
- ERIHPlus, European Reference Index for the Humanities
- Google Scholar Metrics
- Índice H de las Revistas Científicas Españolas según Google Scholar Metrics
- JSTOR Integrated Digital Platform
- Journal Scholar Metrics
- LATINDEX
- Linguistics Abstracts Online (Wiley-Blackwell)
- MIAR Matriz de Información para el Análisis de Revistas
- ROAD Directory of Open Access Scholarly Resources
- YWES. The Year's Work in English Studies (Oxford Journals)
- Ulrichsweb (Online)

Calidad de Revistas
Científicas Españolas
FECYT | FUNDACIÓN ESPAÑOLA PARA LA CIENCIA Y LA TECNOLOGÍA | 2014

Table of Contents • Índice

Book Review Articles • *Artículos de revisión*

ARTICLES

ARTÍCULOS

A Queer Eye for Gilman's Text: *The Yellow Wallpaper*, a Film by PBS

CAROLINA NÚÑEZ-PUENTE
Universidade da Coruña
c.nunez@udc.es

This article puts forward a queer interpretation of PBS's *The Yellow Wallpaper* (1989), adapted from Charlotte Perkins Gilman's canonical story. It is structured in three parts: an approach to the term *queer*, a reading of the queerness (and feminism) of Gilman's text and an analysis of the queer (and feminist) aspects of the film. The third part also responds to the only academic essay about PBS's production, by Janet Beer, which ignores the movie's queer character. This section discusses the queer treatment of topics—the instability of identity, autoeroticism, lesbian tendencies, mental illness, women's solidarity, and gender and class inequalities—while dialoguing with film critics such as Linda Hutcheon and Laura Mulvey. The queer use of formal resources—light, shots, sound, music, symbolism and scene-motifs—is also highlighted. My ultimate aim is to demonstrate that *The Yellow Wallpaper* is an innovative queer adaptation of Gilman's piece for a modern audience.

Keywords: queer theory; film studies; feminist literary criticism; Charlotte Perkins Gilman

. . .

Una mirada *queer* al texto de Gilman: *The Yellow Wallpaper*, una película de PBS

Este artículo propone una interpretación *queer* de *The Yellow Wallpaper* (1989), una adaptación de PBS del relato canónico de Gilman. Consta de tres partes: una aproximación al término *queer*, una lectura *queer* (y feminista) del texto de Gilman y un análisis de los aspectos *queer* (y feministas) del film. La tercera parte también responde al único ensayo académico sobre dicha producción, escrito por Janet Beer, el cual omite el carácter *queer* de la misma. Esta sección explora el tratamiento *queer* de los temas—identidad inestable, autoerotismo, tendencias lésbicas, enfermedades mentales, solidaridad entre mujeres y desigualdades de género y

clase—a la vez que dialoga con críticas de cine como Linda Hutcheon y Laura Mulvey. Se señala además el uso *queer* de los recursos formales—luz, planos, sonido, música, simbolismo y motivos escénicos. Mi objetivo principal es demostrar que *The Yellow Wallpaper* es una innovadora adaptación *queer* de la obra de Gilman para un público moderno.

Palabras clave: teoría *queer*; estudios de cine; crítica literaria feminista; Charlotte Perkins Gilman

1. What is *Queer*? From Sexuality and Gender to Race and Class

An adjective, a noun and a verb, the word *queer* has become remarkably pervasive in academia in recent years. "Perhaps a borrowing from German […] *quer*," the adjective *queer* has several meanings such as "strange, odd, peculiar, eccentric" and even "suspicious, dubious" (*OED* 2019a). As a noun, the sense of "homosexual man" dates from the late nineteenth century. The verb *to queer* chiefly means "to ask, inquire; to question" (*OED* 2019a). The senses mentioned are relevant for queer theory, which dates from the 1990s (*OED* 2019a) and affirms the need to be suspicious about and question apparently natural ways of thinking. It must be clarified, however, that *queer* and *homosexual* are not synonyms. In their introduction to *The Routledge Queer Studies Reader*, Donald Hall and Annamarie Jagose comment that

> queer speaks to the unintended but profound naturalization of the dominant system of sexual classification effected by the political successes of the lesbian and gay movements, staking an alternate claim […]. While arguing for the validity and significance of various marginalized sexual identities and practices—such as […] bisexuality, intersex and transgender subjects, […] and sadomasochism—queer studies attempts to clear a space for thinking differently about the relations presumed to pertain between sex/gender and sex/sexuality […]. Rather than separating sexuality from other axes of social difference—race, ethnicity, class, gender, nationality and so on—queer studies has increasingly attended to the ways in which various categories of difference inflect and transform each other. (2013, xvi)

To develop these ideas, I will refer to the work of some of the principal experts in queer theory today. Readers need to be aware that there is neither a unique nor a fixed definition of the term queer, which is marked by indeterminacy and challenges our willingness to tolerate the overlapping of supposedly contrary concepts (e.g., normal/abnormal).

For Jagose, queer is "a category in the process of formation," whose "political efficacy […] depends on its resistance to definition" (1997, 1). She adds that "queer focuses on mismatches between sex, gender and desire" (3) and on calling into question "any 'natural' sexuality […] [including] terms such as 'man' and 'woman'." This leads to queer theory's utter rejection of binary oppositions (e.g., masculine/feminine, heterosexual/homosexual), instead putting forth an identity which is "always ambiguous, always relational" (96). Denaturalizing and destabilizing normativity are thus the core aims of queer research. Judith Butler's pioneering attempt to denaturalize gender and sexuality is widely known: "There is no gender identity behind the expressions of gender [...] [since] identity is performatively constituted by the very 'expressions' that are said to be its results" (1990, 25). Regarding sexuality, Butler contends that "gender does not necessarily follow from sex and […] sexuality […] does not seem to follow from gender" (1990, 135-36). In fact, the illusion of a "gender core […] [is only] maintained for the purposes of the regulation of sexuality […] [and] reproductive heterosexuality"

(136). To challenge normative beliefs and provoke social change, she urges subversion through queer performance, which leads to the confusion and proliferation of both genders and sexualities. In a later text, Butler elaborates on performativity by positing that "gender is a kind of a doing [...] with or for another" (2004, 1). To the nominally gender-deviants, whose lives are qualified as less than human, she points out ways of undoing gender through "speech" and "language" as favorite means to pursue society's transformation (199)—a linguistic emphasis that will be questioned below.

A major exponent of queer thought is Eve Sedgwick, for whom queer "can refer to the open mesh of possibilities, gaps, overlaps, dissonances and resonances [...] of anyone's gender, of anyone's sexuality [that] aren't made [...] to signify monolithically" (1993, 5-9). Her words join with Jagose's and Butler's calls to defy imposed definitions by taking into account the aspects that do not fit into established parameters. On this basis, Sedgwick proposes that we extend the notion of queer beyond sexuality and gender to other fields to highlight "the ways that race, ethnicity, [and] postcolonial nationality criss-cross with these *and other* identity-constituting, identity-fracturing discourses" (1993, 9; italics in the original). Both she and Butler (2004) praise Gloria Anzaldúa's concept of the "mestiza consciousness" ([1987] 2012) for its intersectional approach to the subject. I would add that Anzaldúa's oeuvre advocates a queer scholarship that aims to explore people's material conditions so as to challenge and, ultimately, change the white-hegemonic heteropatriarchal liberal-capitalist system. Taking this into consideration, an up-to-date queer analysis of literature or film would be one that focuses on issues which non-queer scholarly approaches tend to gloss over—from masturbation and fetishism to mixed-raced individuals and socioeconomic class—and which aims at an ideological-material rebuilding of the world.

As one might expect, queer researchers have been the target of criticism, mainly due to the radicalism of some of their arguments. For example, Tim Dean and Christopher Lane argue in "Homosexuality and Psychoanalysis: An Introduction" (2001) that queer thought "advocates a politics based on resistance to all norms" (quoted in Ahmed 2013, 426). On his part, Gerard Coll-Planas (2013) suggests the need for a minimum set of norms in the realm of sexuality that protect people from harassment, rape, pedophilia and necrophilia. From my point of view, one of the most insightful contributions of queer theory is to make academics realize how little we actually know about sexuality, which is mysterious, elusive, chaotic, unclassifiable and far more flexible than we might have imagined. Sedgwick's opening up of the use of queer as a tool with which to analyze other areas besides sexuality is commendable, given its rejection of rigid definitions, its emphasis on the relational character of identity and its enormous value for literary and film studies.

It must be emphasized that this article relies precisely on the notion of queer as a critical paradigm that cuts across boundaries, from desire and language to sexuality and socioeconomic class. I am also critical of the fact that, due to its predilection for ambiguity, queer rebellion may have vague, if not vain, results. Along with Donald

Morton (1996), I hold that it is vital not to neglect the material dimensions of queer thoughts and actions so that going queer does not paradoxically end up reinforcing the established order. The analyses below, therefore, both celebrate and reassess queer revolution.

2. Queerness in Gilman's "The Yellow Wallpaper"

In its 127-year history, "The Yellow Wallpaper" (1892) has posed innumerable questions to literary criticism, some of which have received multiple answers. This is in coherence with queer research, which is concerned with opening up interpretative possibilities that transcend established parameters. Therefore, I will examine aspects of Gilman's tale that can fruitfully be read from a queer perspective, starting with the difficulties faced by critics in determining its genre—diary (Michaels 1987), autobiography (Rogers 1988) or "literature of hysteria" (Diamond 1990, 59) have been suggested, among others. Specialists are further divided when it comes to determining whether the story is realist (MacPike 1992), gothic (Becker 1999) or both (Núñez-Puente 2006). Such generic instability signals the queerness of the text.

Gilman's unnamed leading character can be said to have queer features too. Living in the late 1800s, the protagonist is required to stop her work as a writer after becoming an upper-middle-class wife and mother. She is told that she has a "temporary nervous depression—a slight hysterical tendency" (Gilman [1892] 1992, 25) and her doctor orders her to rest. Nowadays, we would suspect she has postpartum depression, which the author herself may have suffered from (Gilman [1913] 2009). The disorder was not classified as such at the time and the condition was labelled hysteria, an illness which women, especially intellectual and upper-to-middle-class ones, were said to be prone to. Diagnosing female patients as mentally ill is rewarding for patriarchy because it reinforces the sane man/insane woman gender hierarchy (Felman 1997; Showalter 1985). From an alternative point of view, Elin Diamond has suggested that hysteria is dangerous for patriarchy, since a self that is unstable cannot be pinned down to any fixed definition, thus offering what I would qualify as a queer "disruption of categories and systems of meaning" (Diamond 1990, 61). This controversial issue (hysteria as either mortifying or liberating) will be reconsidered in the next section, especially concerning whether the protagonist's supposed hysterical fit at the end of the story is productive as regards social change.

Socioeconomic class, the study of which matters to queer theory, is a crucial topic in Gilman's tale from its very first lines: "It is very seldom that mere ordinary people like John and myself secure ancestral halls for the summer" ([1892] 1992, 24). It must be noted that, given the couple's social status, they cannot be deemed "ordinary," a qualification that has been attributed to an unreliable narration (Núñez-Puente 2006, 31). Later on, the character-narrator describes the estate as having "lots of separate little houses for the gardeners and people" (25), an affirmation that gives us a glimpse

of her classism (Núñez-Puente 2006, 31). As for the other female personae, Mary (the baby's caretaker) is presumed to be working-class and the character-narrator defines Jennie (her sister-in-law) as a "housekeeper" that "hopes for no better profession" (24). The protagonist is lucky to be able to count on other people to do the motherly and domestic duties that would otherwise be expected of her, and it is unethical of her to regard them as inferior. An updated queer reading of Gilman makes us reflect on the artificial ranking not only of genders and sexualities, but also of jobs and salaries, which entail the formation of unequal classes and oppositions such as respectable/nonrespectable people.

On another note, the heroine embodies a queer self, one that has severe problems living with her contradictions and adjusting to the gender parameters of her time. She fights against the two principal voices informing her knowledge of the world: her husband's, which stands for patriarchal authority, and what she "personally" (Gilman [1892] 1992, 25) believes and disagrees with. John, her husband, is a doctor who orders her around and "scoffs openly at any talk of things not to be felt and seen and put down in figures" (24); his embodiment of masculinist rationality, however, crumbles in the end when his spouse goes out of control, looks him in the eye and he simply faints, thereby displaying the weakness of traditional femininity. In a Butlerian fashion, this role reversal queerly troubles the period's binary gender regime.

Because of the lack of ethical-affective dialogue between the protagonist and her partner, their sexual life is not intersubjective enough. For instance, when she asks him to have their cousins for a visit, he forbids it saying that it would be as bad as "put[ting] fireworks in [her] pillow-case" (29), a metaphorical expression which suggests his refusal to have sex with her (i.e., penetrate her "pillow case"). William Veeder (1988) argues that the couple has no sexual relations during the whole summer and that the husband pretends to work overnight because he has a lover. Towards the end, it is striking that the wife hides her bedroom key "under a plantain leaf!" (42). Of all plants, the author's choice of a plantain, a phallic symbol, gives readers a clue about the main character's lack of sexual satisfaction. Questioning whether normative heterosexuality satisfies everybody is among the goals of queer theory.

The main character's relationship with her sister-in-law lacks affection too, Jennie simply acting as a guardian when her brother is out—an instance of how patriarchal women may become other women's enemies. Furthermore, both women follow John's commands without discussion, a lack of dialogical interaction that prevents a truly ethical mutual recognition from taking place. The heroine's cold relationships with her family, her inability to look after her baby due to her illness and the lack of the social interaction she would need as a writer underpin her anxiety to make affective contact with someone—who might be hiding in the yellow wallpaper in her bedroom. As mentioned in the first section, this longing for interpersonal intercourse resonates with queer studies' conception of the self as necessarily relational.

Given the text's stated questioning of heterosexuality, some scholars deem it the product of Gilman's own barely affective relationship with her husband (J. Allen 2009; Horowitz [2010] 2012). Others claim it as lesbian (P. Allen 1999; White 1997) or even queer (Crewe 1995), the woman's figure that the heroine finds in the wallpaper being the female lover she craves. Jonathan Crewe identifies a "chiastic exchange" between the protagonist and the imprisoned figure—"I pulled and she shook, I shook and she pulled" (Gilman [1892] 1992, 39)—who at the same time becomes "her own same-sex partner […] and her own 'liberator'" (Crewe 1995, 281). He goes further in asserting that, in the 1890s, there is a necessary "lesbian implication" (1995, 280) in the protagonist-narrator's statements that "Jennie [her sister-in-law] wanted to sleep with me" (39) and "she [Jennie] wouldn't mind doing it herself" (40). As we will see, the lesbian inclinations of this nineteenth-century wife become compounded with autoeroticism, which means she cannot be identified simply as lesbian, but perhaps as bisexual—and definitely as queer.

Sexuality is also represented in Gilman's text by means of the imagery used to describe the wallpaper. It has "smooch[es]" (35, 40), one of which "runs round the room […] a long, straight, even smooch, as if it had been rubbed over […]. Round and round and round—round and round and round—it makes me dizzy!" (37). These "smooches" have puzzled critics, some of whom have suggested they imply onanism (P. Allen 1999; Núñez-Puente 2006), which used to be considered a symptom of the hysteric. That is, at the turn of the nineteenth century, the medical authorities still believed that the "habits of the […] homosexual or intersexual woman might take the form merely of masturbation" (Jeffreys [1986] 1997, 170). In those days too, lesbianism and solitary sex were categorised together as both being the result of frigidity understood as the "dislike of" or "failure to respond with enthusiasm to […] sexual intercourse" (Jeffreys [1986] 1997, 171-72). In line with this, Sedgwick has found connections between lesbianism and masturbation in the works of some nineteenth-century women writers. I propose that the name Charlotte Perkins Gilman be added to those of Jane Austen, Emily Dickinson and the Brontës, whose queer writing has been studied by Sedgwick (1993, 109-28).

The textual gaps, intricate expressions and leaps in time in "The Yellow Wallpaper" can also be called queer, given their attempt to, precisely, queer masculinist discourse. This style is reflected in the wallpaper itself, which seems to have a queer (unconventional, nonlinear, incomprehensible) design too: "One of those sprawling flamboyant patterns committing every artistic sin" (Gilman [1892] 1992, 37). As its lines "plunge off at outrageous angles," it becomes an uncontrollable "kind of 'debased Romanesque' with *delirium tremens*" (31; italics in the original), and its "defiance of law […] is a constant irritant to a normal mind" (34). The main character comes to admit that it "is getting to be a great effort [for her] to think straight" (32) and the word *queer* appears three times, the first as early as the third line of the story: "there is something queer" (24). Although the straight/queer binary was not commonly recognized in the

late nineteenth century—*straight* was first recorded as "heterosexual" in 1941 (*OED* 2019b)—the presence of the word *queer* can certainly incite a queer interpretation on the part of today's readers.

Last but not least, an issue that has occupied numerous academics is that of the narrative voice, especially in relation to the ending: if the story is narrated in a homodiegetic fashion, when the protagonist apparently goes insane, we should ask ourselves who is narrating. This has led to the hypothesis of a second narrative voice apart from the main character's (Feldstein 1992; Núñez-Puente 2006; Rogers 1988). Her words, "I've got out at last [...] in spite of you and Jane" (42), are equally cryptic, since "Jane" could refer to John's sister (Jennie) or to the unnamed heroine's patriarchal self—the one who would remain under her husband's yoke. A personality that splits into two and an inconclusive denouement—we do not know whether she will recover—are also marks of the queerness Gilman confers on both the identity of the character and the writing.

3. *The Yellow Wallpaper*: A Queer Film Adaptation

In 1989, PBS launched *The Yellow Wallpaper* as a television production. According to Janet Beer, although the adaptation "was almost entirely the work of [the scriptwriter,] Maggie Wadey," some decisions were made with the producer, Sarah Curtis, and the director, John Clive (1997, 197). Beer's essay, included in her book *Kate Chopin, Edith Wharton and Charlotte Perkins Gilman: Studies in Short Fiction* (1997), concentrates mostly on the screenplay and omits any reference to the queer singularity of the production. My study both differs from and responds to Beer's by carrying out a queer discussion of the movie. I thus explore its queer treatment of topics such as the instability of identity, autoeroticism, lesbian tendencies, mental illness, women's solidarity and gender and class inequalities. I also point out how the film's use of formal resources— light, shots, sound, symbolism, scene-motifs and Carl Davis's soundtrack—contributes to representing the aforementioned issues.[1] It must be added that my analysis is both critical and speculative, as I believe the evocative form and content of PBS's *The Yellow Wallpaper* demand this queer kind of reflection.[2]

---

[1] I agree with Linda Hutcheon that the soundtrack composer can also be considered an adapter, since music "reinforces emotions or provokes reactions and directs our interpretation of different characters" (2013, 81).

[2] From amateur videos and animations to stage plays and ballets, the audiovisual recreations of "The Yellow Wallpaper" seem countless, proving its continuous appeal. Among the screen versions, Marie Ashton's short (1977) stands out for its queer features. The way that Elizabeth (Sigrid Wurschmidt), the protagonist, stares at Jennie (Susan Lynch) is noteworthy throughout. Once she touches Jennie's arm and back making her feel uncomfortable; on another occasion, Elizabeth giggles as she lies on the bed with her dress and legs lifted up, which triggers speculation about solitary sex. More recent movies, however, have chosen to draw inspiration from the horror aspects of Gilman's work—e.g., in Logan Thomas's motion picture (2012), the main character is tortured by visions of her dead daughter.

3.1. Opening Credits and Scenes: The Instability of Identity

As the movie starts, we see the stout façade of a mansion whose garden is full of weeds and withered flowers. The gothic appearance of the house could symbolize the enduring resistance of the masculinist order. Inside, the furniture is covered by innumerable white sheets and there are flies buzzing against the window panes. Both shots may be read as synecdoches of the puritan ideology and its ghostly legacy. The protagonist is then shown travelling by carriage while we hear an auditory flashback of her doctor describing her illness to her husband and prescribing "a period of complete rest" to her (01:29). As the opening credits roll, the authority of the male word is thus established. The slow-motion discontinuous shots of the actress's profile display half of her face in a fragmentary manner, which underscores the instability of her situation—before she was a healthy independent writer, now she is an ill mother who depends on her husband and has to obey her physician. Uncertainty and change are marks of a queer identity, although they only provoke negative effects in her case.

It is worth noting here that the gloomy light and colors used at the beginning are maintained throughout the film, as even the yellow wallpaper and dress that appear later are dull. This places viewers in the nineteenth-century atmosphere of austerity and ideological darkness with regard to women; at the same time, it contributes to blurring any type of categorical truth, facilitating the emergence of the kind of alternative ideas preferred by queer theory. The first musical composition we hear, a slow tune played by wind instruments, causes the audience to feel worried as well as curious to find out more about this woman.

3.2. Self-Eroticism

The main character in this production is called Charlotte (Julia Watson); her husband John (Stephen Dillane) likes to call her Lotta, presumably as a term of endearment. The fact that she has two names is important, particularly bearing in mind how she unfolds into more than one self as the movie progresses. This unfolding partly manifests in her self-eroticism, an aspect of sexual behavior that queer scholarship is interested in.

For some literary critics, as previously noted, the wallpaper's "smooches"—together with its stunning circling pattern—connote masturbation and PBS's adaptation would seem to support this idea. Charlotte goes to bed during the day, in her nightgown and with her hair loose, supposedly to take a nap. The camera focuses on how her hand grabs a bar of the bedhead; this is followed by a close-up of the wallpaper that looks as if it were expanding. At the same time, we hear a panting that rises in crescendo and may lead us to speculate about a female orgasm (29:12). Charlotte opens her eyes and shouts as two eyes appear from the wallpaper and stare at her—the wallpaper's eyes are repeatedly mentioned in Gilman's story. These eyes could be symbolic of the multiple I's (i.e., aspects) of her personality, as well as of her refusal to acknowledge the Kristevian abject (1992): the queer masturbating Other within her I.

As described above, the concept queer encompasses non-heteronormative practices (Grosz 2013). In the light of this, the possibility of a fin-de-siècle wife-and-mother who masturbates is queer, not only in that period but even today, since female self-stimulation remains a taboo topic. In the case of this movie, the main character's autoeroticism is in fact justified: on the one hand, it does not entail the risk of pregnancy, which Charlotte seems keen to avoid at the moment; on the other, from a previous bed scene with her husband, the viewer understands that her sexual life with him is unsatisfactory. The mere fact that the movie chooses to portray solitary sex grants the heroine the right to both rebel and enjoy herself despite her situation. During the protagonist's orgasm, the audience is shown the wallpaper instead of the actress's face. Consequently, the film does not expose the woman's onanism to the gaze of spectators, thus purposefully circumventing the problem Laura Mulvey warns of, namely, that "in a world ordered by sexual imbalance, pleasure in looking has been split between active/male and passive/female […]. Woman [is placed] as image, man as the bearer of the look" ([1975] 2010, 2186). Mulvey encourages filmmakers to destabilize the link between the objectifying male gaze and the observed female and, as I go on to argue, PBS's *The Yellow Wallpaper* follows her line of reasoning by putting forth an alternative feminist view of a woman's body and pleasure.[3]

It is vital that the audience recognizes that the eyes coming out of the wall actually belong to Charlotte, as if she were looking at herself in a mirror. The heroine will continue seeing a woman's figure in the yellow wallpaper, an obsession with the female that supports the lesbian interpretation that is put forward below. Moreover, the audience's experience of the protagonist's pleasure comes from hearing her gasping. The choice of the sense of hearing instead of seeing also disrupts the masculinist economy of the gaze challenged by Mulvey. As explained above, the autoerotic moment reveals Charlotte's sexuality as both queer, which is to say unexpected—a fin-de-siècle wife's onanism—and ambiguous—given her latent bisexuality.

Another erotic scene in the movie also happens when Charlotte is alone. By chance, she finds the mansion's secret library, enters, caresses the books and tries to embrace the shelves (13:23). She then appears lying on her bed, reading, surrounded by several books. The shot of her whole body in a relaxed, happy, pleasurable attitude invites us to identify the queer links between female sensuality and intellect. When John finds out about Charlotte's library visit, he persuades her not to go there again because reading is too exhausting and she must proceed with the rest cure. The juxtaposition of the two scenes foregrounds the veto on knowledge imposed on nineteenth-century women, be it bodily or intellectual knowledge.

---

[3]   Film studies have turned to women directors in search of alternative nonsexist cinema (Kuhn 1994). This move, however, may be argued to rest on an essentialist assumption, as there are also patriarchal women and feminist men—John Clive could perhaps be named as an example of the latter.

3.3. The Treatment of Hysteria

Like self-eroticism, mental illness constitutes another taboo area that interests queer researchers. One day Charlotte faints, prompting John to call her physician.[4] Dr. Stark (James Faulkner) debases his patient in multiple ways: he tears out the blank pages left in the diary she has been writing in secret, thus silencing her literary voice; he insists that, as a married woman and a mother, her only responsibilities are "[her] child, [her] husband, [her] home" (48:24); and he grabs hold of one of her earrings in a bluntly objectifying manner. Afterwards, the doctor shares with John some photographs of "a very extreme form of cure" (53:46) that appeals to "feminine vanity," a statement that exposes his male chauvinism. Although not all spectators might be aware of this, those are the photographs of Dr. Charcot's female patients at the Salpêtrière hospital between 1876 and 1880 (Didi-Huberman 2007). Based on these images, feminists have questioned the degree of dramatization, and even pornographic exposure, supposedly sick women were subjected to as they posed as models following the instructions of the cameramen (Showalter 1985). PBS's film condemns this medical treatment too through the unprofessional manner in which both men leer at the women in the photos. In this way, the movie's explicit criticism of the reifying male gaze identified by Mulvey continues to pay tribute to her groundbreaking study.

Before the doctor's visit, John scolds his wife for alluding to her feelings, to which she retorts: "my feelings are the only things left to my life" (46:23). When the two men are alone, Dr. Stark comments on women's denial of sexual feelings. When John says that his spouse "doesn't seem to deny them" (53:15), Stark replies that he should not judge based on his "own personal experience," although it is he who is generalizing about women. Generalizations have often been the target of queer academics, who choose to focus on the particulars of every case to avoid homogenizing individuals. PBS's production attacks the nineteenth-century belief that all women have a propensity for hysteria and so must be medicated when the condition arises. Towards the end of the film, Charlotte puts her fingers down her throat and vomits up the medicine given to her (01:06:25), a symbolic act of rejection of the status quo à la queer.

PBS's portrayal of the pathologization of women as hysterical invites me to speculate on the cited "smooches" in Gilman's text yet again. In the nineteenth century, the circular "smooches" might allude to the pelvic massages and vibrators that were applied to allegedly hysterical women, as shown recently in Sarah Ruhl's stage play *In the Next Room* (2009) and Tanya Wexler's film *Hysteria* (2011). Charlotte's erogenous zones might have been manipulated in this way by her physician. Therefore, the movie's Charlotte, whose eyes are closed during most of the autoerotic scene described above, could be recreating or even dreaming about this medical procedure, which would likely cause her both pleasure and disgust.

---

[4] Her fainting fit is due to the stress provoked by her mother-in-law's visit. Unpleasant and narrow-minded, Mrs. Stamford (Dorothy Tutin) proves to be the prototype of a patriarchal woman.

3.4. Feminist Solidarity

In Gilman's narrative, the heroine and Jennie never join forces against John's authority. Similarly, throughout history women have never been sufficiently united to bring about the downfall of patriarchy. In this respect, the strangeness and revolutionary potential of women's solidarity make it a characteristically queer topic. In addition, and as mentioned earlier, queer studies is also concerned with socioeconomic class and how it intertwines with factors like gender, a comparatively neglected area of study. We may wonder why Jennie decides to spend the summer with her brother and his spouse. Apparently, she has neither a husband nor children; perhaps she needs money and is happy to have a place to live for free. If so, this would convey a criticism of the economic difficulties faced by unmarried women in those days. Since she has not succumbed to compulsory heterosexuality (Rich 1980), we may also speculate about her sexual orientation and the problematics of lesbians in and out of the workplace both then and today.[5] In the PBS adaptation, Jennie (Carolyn Pickles) appears variously holding her baby nephew, brushing Charlotte's hair and helping her dress, supervising meals and folding linen, as well as doing other household chores. She plays the piano so that her brother and sister-in-law can dance together, and plays and sings for John and Dr. Stark, although they continue talking without paying her any attention. A caretaker, a homemaker and an entertainer, the movie's Jennie is a reminder of the way in which working-class housewives have been exploited throughout history.

PBS's Jennie stands up to John only once. Despite that, her words and accusatory tone clearly question male despotism: "And do you always know what's right for Charlotte? Has it occurred to you that even Dr. Stark may sometimes make mistakes?" (01:02:09). The use of a mirror shot duplicates her image at this point, a technique by which she appears more powerful than her brother. His reflection is shown too, but it appears distorted and in the distance, making him more insignificant. At a symbolic level, the visual composition reinforces Jennie's challenge: patriarchal men are being asked to look at themselves in a mirror and reevaluate their behavior regarding mothers who also work outside the home. After his sister's outburst, John is left speechless and simply leaves the house as usual, going across the garden and shutting the gate after him. This is one of the *scene-motifs* (my own compound to name motifs shaped as scenes) that underscores his belonging to the public realm.[6]

---

[5] John McCarty's filmic retelling of "The Yellow Wallpaper," *Confinement* (2009), is set in contemporary times. A couple rents a house so that Kathy (Colleen Lovett) can recover from post-natal depression, while her sister-in-law Mary (Nina Lorcini) looks after their baby elsewhere. When Mary complains that something must be done about Kathy, as she cannot take care of the baby forever, John (Tony Pallone) replies: "What would you be doing if you weren't looking after him? Sitting around swapping fantasies with your looser girlfriends?" (24:52). Does he mean they are unemployed, childless, single or lesbian? All these adjectives could be applied in this case, given the actress's subtle butch look.

[6] John's continual winding of the clock is another scene-motif that defines him, revealing his obsession with control as well as his highly predictable, anti-queer life.

In the movie, Jennie is always pleasant and considerate towards her sister-in-law. She is deeply affected by witnessing an argument between the couple and cries about what might be going on in the yellow-wallpapered room before the film's end. Thanks to her confrontation with the master of the house, spectators can speculate about how different the story might be if the two females joined forces against patriarchal law. Hence, PBS's version adds a crucial detail for women viewers at the turn of the twentieth century: solidarity. By allying herself with her sister-in-law and rebelling against her brother, Jennie makes an incipient gesture of solidarity that is a lesson to the world today, which is in need of more feminist coalitions.

3.5. Compulsory Heterosexuality and Queer Existence

There is another scene-motif featuring the gardener's daughter riding a bicycle, until she is told she has become a woman and is no longer allowed to do that. The girl reminds us of the way in which the New Woman advocates rode bikes in the late nineteenth century while claiming their right to lead their own lives, including their sexuality. The child is usually shown wearing a white flounce dress; however, during one of Charlotte's naps (25:38), she is seen dressed as an acrobat in red and white, balancing on the bicycle next to an also red and white rosebush—a sequence that clearly symbolizes her menstruation and adult sexuality. The gardener's daughter showcases the relative freedom then offered to girls until they became women, whose (sexual) lives were determined by their husbands. Charlotte is fascinated by the girl's seriousness and determination, which remind her of the time when she contemplated editing a journal. As she finally admits, her fertile plans about her profession were aborted when she "met John" (23:37), who has a thriving career and whose professional trip to London brings about the film's climax.

John travels to the Royal Academy of Medicine to deliver a paper on how to improve the health of the poor by means of the "restorative qualities of pleasure," including "books and pictures freely [being] shown" to them (01:07:94). This is highly ironic because he does not allow his wife to read and seems unconcerned about her pleasure; besides, his contempt for the lower classes is made evident from the beginning—"superstition is for servant girls," he claims (08:14). While he is away lecturing, his spouse locks herself up in the yellow room, blocks the door and spends the night pulling off the wallpaper. He returns next morning, runs upstairs and forcibly breaks into the room. When he finds Charlotte crawling around on the floor, there are no words spoken, only a terrifying close-up of her strange-looking, ghostly face (01:12:16). Her Medusian look is so powerful that he faints as if struck by "the deadly *femme castratrice*" (Creed 1993, 127; italics in the original). Their gender roles are thus reversed not only in terms of the symbolic order, she being the gazing "male" and he the fainting "female," but also in physical terms since she climbs over his body lying on the floor. Although the situation cannot be interpreted as a triumph for the protagonist, whose mental condition seems deeply disturbed, it does lay the blame for her current state on patriarchy's negligence—

at the beginning of the movie, she was actually healthier, and it is due to the wrong medical diagnosis and treatment that she is having a psychotic breakdown.

While John is in London, the movie crosscuts scenes of him delivering his paper and Charlotte tearing off the wallpaper (01:08:06), thus perfectly foregrounding the nineteenth-century gender regime of separate spheres. Every time she tears off a strip of wallpaper, a sharp metallic creak is heard. At the symbolic level, this knife-like sound hints that she has got hold of the phallus, albeit only temporarily. When she finishes, there is silence and she is shot from below, suggesting she has gained a sense of self. Moreover, her fingertips are stained in an inky black as a metaphor for the writing side of her self. We are also shown other contrasting shots regarding gender roles: he faces his audience and she a blank wall; as he shakes hands with his medical colleagues, a woman's hand emerges mysteriously from the wallpaper.

Performed by the same actress, the wallpaper figure is dressed in yellow and has gray hair. Since Charlotte finds a yellow dress in a trunk earlier in the film, we could think that the wallpaper woman stands for her projection in the future as a healthy old woman. This explanation would suffice if it were not for the fact that, at once, the two women join their lips, close their eyes and the wallpaper woman caresses Charlotte's face (01:10:40), a sequence that invites speculation à la queer. Their passionate meeting complicates the already multiple sexuality of a fin-de-siècle masturbating wife-and-mother, who, I would like to insist, could be called bisexual and is definitely queer. To enhance the impact of the women's kiss, there is a close-up of their faces and the image is frozen for a few seconds. In this way, the heroine is "undoing" (Butler 2004) both the pattern on the wallpaper and the regime that regulates her sexuality and gender, not through language but through affect: "the body's capacity to enter relations" (Braidotti 2002, 104).[7] Through such "undoing," PBS's adaptation grants the character the affective Other she longs for in Gilman's tale. As for the soundtrack, when the two women are face to face, there is soothing organ music, and as they approach each other, the soft jingle of a bell is heard. The religious-sounding music gives the scene a special halo, as if the pair were joined in body and soul, thus reinforcing the idea of women's solidarity discussed above.

3.6. The Post-Ending: The Political is the Personal

To Gilman's denouement, the film adds a puzzling extra scene that shows Charlotte wearing a yellow dress and crawling in circles on a bed of dry leaves (01:13:45). I propose the term *post-ending*, rather than the more literary *epilogue*, for audiovisual texts that revisit their endings in order to actively involve their viewers in, for instance, post-film discussion. In this case, the allegorical post-ending invites the kind of speculative inquiry that queer thought requires.

---

[7]   There is an affective impulse in queer theory's attempt to disarm the Hegelian violence of recognition (of the Other); I thus suggest that queer researchers pursue an in-between Braidottian-Butlerian method.

Displaying Charlotte in an animal-like position as she crawls on the fallen leaves underscores her convergence with so-called nature, the ultimate Other, whose situation concerns queer studies too (see, for example, Gaard 1997). In fact, the female figure slides out of shot and we can only see leaves at the very end, which could be read as an ecological statement. From a symbolic point of view, the scene suggests that humans must come into profound contact with nature (body, leaf), queer—i.e., delve into—our conception of it and eventually stop its maltreatment. More literally, the post-ending foregrounds the fragile materiality of the body and of nature, both of which must be handled with respect and affection. To regain happiness again and be able to resume her activities, Charlotte is going to require not only an alternative treatment but also an Other that can establish an equitable affective relationship with her, since "affects" and "connections" are crucial for the life of the "embodied subject" (Braidotti 2002, 21). The actress's circular movement indeed reveals the need for a guiding hand, a friendly Other, implying the futility of lonely rebellion. In this connection, Morton challenges the apparently liberating moments of queer self-invention that do not produce "a structural change in society" (1996, 273-74). The lesbian and autoerotic moments discussed throughout this article could be criticized on the same grounds: though rebelling in private can be transformative for the self, it is not enough to bring down patriarchy and lead to greater alterations. That notwithstanding, as can be gleaned from both the text's and the film's protagonists' trajectories, women and men need to join forces à la queer and fight together to achieve real change both in and out of the home.

The soft music played during the post-ending is exactly like the piece heard at the start of the film. Using the same composition replicates the circular structure of the adapted text, which opens and closes with a temporal reference: "It is very seldom" (Gilman [1892] 1992, 24) and "every time!" (42). Both the story and the motion picture hint that women's history tends to repeat itself. It is about time that social transformations are implemented so that mothers who work can carry out their occupations, as well as their hobbies, without being stigmatized, sometimes by other women. It is about time too that people who do not identify as heterosexual are not deemed to be ill, unless everybody is, since our (sexual) potential cannot be foreseen and all of us are queer.

4. CONCLUSION

Both Gilman's tale and PBS's adaptation portray a self who feels constrained by gender rules and tries to free herself. Queer thought and action also attempt to radically alter the status quo by, for instance, avoiding categorizing people as either normal or abnormal and searching for a dialogue among categories instead. The desire for radical transformation makes queer advocates quite different from lesbians and gays, who simply call to be allowed to join the existing system—for example, by getting married. As implied throughout this article, queer studies is interested

in the in-between aspects of identity, the ambiguity and instability that do not fit into naturalized classifications. The PBS production is explicit in its depiction of a fin-de-siècle wife-and-mother who masturbates, has lesbian tendencies and finally revolts against her domineering husband; hence, she is represented as a queer subject who neither adjusts to nor subscribes the established gender and sexual norms. The movie also alludes to the possibility of a feminist alliance that could overthrow the unjust patriarchal regime. By adding an extra scene after the ending, it encourages the audience to ponder on the protagonist's lonely revolution. Gestures like hers can attract some people's attention, maybe achieving temporary outcomes; nonetheless, it is imperative to add a material dimension to queer desire if we want to remodel our socioeconomic framework and bring about real transformation leading towards a more isonomic world. This includes the treatment given to women, workers and other supposedly second-class citizens in the domestic, medical and work spheres. In addition, the textual and the televised heroines long for contact with an affective Other, who indeed materializes in the screen version, whose affection will be vital for their recovery. In both cases, then, affective relationships that celebrate connectedness are seen as the cornerstone to the kind of queer revolution that seeks to dismantle hierarchies.

In its urge to free the queer I, PBS's *The Yellow Wallpaper* is an innovative queer response to Gilman's piece that interpellates viewers at the turn of the twentieth century. As implicit in the post-ending, the audience is invited to engage with the movie's queer proposals, reflect on the injustices caused by a white-supremacist heteropatriarchal liberal-capitalist system and demand changes. A queer revolution should start by building a non-dualistic link with the Other—be it a sexual fantasy or a film adaptation—and others—e.g., people whose sexual orientation or economic means are different from one's own—in order to lead as ethically sound a life as possible. This entails a blurring of categories through intersubjective relationships—in other words, the achievement of the first affective queer goal.[8]

Works Cited

Ahmed, Sara. 2013. "Queer Feelings." In Hall and Jagose 2013, 422-41.

Allen, Judith. 2009. *The Feminism of Charlotte Perkins Gilman: Sexualities, Histories, Progressivism*. Chicago, IL: The U of Chicago P.

Allen, Paula Smith. 1999. *Metamorphosis and the Feminine: A Motif of "Difference" in Women's Writing*. New York: Peter Lang.

Anzaldúa, Gloria. (1987) 2012. *Borderlands/La Frontera: The New Mestiza*. San Francisco, CA: Aunt Lute.

ASHTON, Marie, dir. 1977. *The Yellow Wallpaper*. New York: Women Make Movies.

BECKER, Susanne. 1999. *Gothic Forms of Feminine Fictions.* Manchester: Manchester UP.

BEER, Janet. 1997. *Kate Chopin, Edith Wharton and Charlotte Perkins Gilman: Studies in Short Fiction*. Houndmills: MacMillan.

BELSEY, Catherine and Jane Moore, eds. 1997. *The Feminist Reader: Essays in Gender and the Politics of Literary Criticism.* 2nd ed. Basingstoke and New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

BRAIDOTTI, Rosi. 2002. *Metamorphoses: Towards a Materialist Theory of Becoming*. Cambridge: Polity.

BUTLER, Judith. 1990. *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity.* New York: Routledge.

—. 2004. *Undoing Gender*. New York: Routledge.

CLIVE, John, dir. 1989. *The Yellow Wallpaper*. Arlington: PBS.

COLL-PLANAS, Gerard. 2013. *La carne y la metáfora. Una reflexión sobre el cuerpo en la teoría queer*. Barcelona: Egales. Kindle edition.

CREED, Barbara. 1993. *The Monstrous Feminine: Film, Feminism, Psychoanalysis*. New York: Routledge.

CREWE, Jonathan. 1995. "Queering 'The Yellow Wallpaper'? Charlotte Perkins Gilman and the Politics of Form." *Tulsa Studies in Women's Literature* 14 (2): 273-93.

DIAMOND, Elin. 1990. "Realism and Hysteria: Toward a Feminist Mimesis." *Discourse* 13 (1): 59-92.

DIDI-HUBERMAN, Georges. 2007. *La invención de la histeria. Charcot y la iconografía fotográfica de la Sâlpetrière*. Translated by Tania Arias and Rafael Jackson. Madrid: Cátedra.

FELDSTEIN, Richard. 1992. "Reader, Text and Ambiguous Referentiality in 'The Yellow Wall-paper'." In Golden 1992, 307-18.

FELMAN, Shoshana. 1997. "Women and Madness: The Critical Fallacy." In Belsey and Moore 1997, 133-53.

FISHER, Jerilyn and Ellen Silber, eds. 1988. *Analyzing the Different Voice: Feminist Psychological Theory and Literary Texts*. Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield.

GAARD, Greta. 1997. "Toward a Queer Ecofeminism." *Hypatia* 12 (1): 114-37.

GILMAN, Charlotte Perkins. (1892) 1992. "The Yellow Wallpaper." In Golden 1992, 24-42.

—. (1913) 2009. "Why I Wrote 'The Yellow Wallpaper'." *Lincoln Center Theater Review* 51: 23.

GOLDEN, Catherine, ed. 1992. *The Captive Imagination: A Case Book on "The Yellow Wallpaper."* New York: The Feminist Press.

GROSZ, Elizabeth. 2013. "Experimental Desire: Rethinking Queer Subjectivity." In Hall and Jagose 2013, 194-211.

HALL, Donald and Annamarie Jagose. 2013. "Introduction: The Queer Turn." In Hall and Jagose 2013, xiv-xx.

—, eds. 2013. *The Routledge Queer Studies Reader*. New York: Routledge.

HOROWITZ, Helen Lefkowitz. (2010) 2012. *Wild Unrest: Charlotte Perkins Gilman and the Making of "The Yellow Wall-Paper."* Oxford: Oxford UP.

HUTCHEON, Linda. 2013. *A Theory of Adaptation.* New York: Routledge.

JAGOSE, Annamarie. 1997. *Queer Theory: An Introduction*. New York: New York UP.

JEFFREYS, Sheila. (1986) 1997. *The Spinster and Her Enemies: Feminism and Sexuality, 1880-1930.* North Melbourne: Spinifex.

KNIGHT, Denise, ed. 1997. *Charlotte Perkins Gilman: A Study of the Short Fiction*. New Mexico: U of New Mexico.

KRISTEVA, Julia. 1982. *Powers of Horror: An Essay on Abjection*. Translated by Leon Roudiez. New York: Columbia UP.

KUHN, Annette. 1994. *Women's Pictures: Feminism and Cinema*. New York: Verso.

LEITCH, Vincent B., ed. (1976) 2010. *The Norton Anthology of Theory and Criticism.* New York: Norton.

MACPIKE, Loralee. 1992. "Environment as Psychopathological Symbolism in 'The Yellow Wallpaper'." In Golden 1992, 137-40.

MCCARTHY, John, dir. *Confinement*. 2009. New York: Leering Buzzard Pictures.

MICHAELS, Walter. 1987. *The Gold Standard and the Logic of Naturalism.* Berkeley: U of California P.

MORTON, Donald. 1996. "Dossier 4: Queer Desire." In Morton 1996, 273-76.

—, ed. 1996. *The Material Queer: A LesBiGay Cultural Studies Reader*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

MULVEY, Laura. (1975) 2010. "Visual Pleasure and Narrative Cinema." In Leitch (1976) 2010, 2181-92.

NUÑEZ-PUENTE, Carolina. 2006. *Feminism and Dialogics: Charlotte Perkins Gilman, Meridel Le Sueur, Mikhail M. Bakhtin*. Valencia: Universitat de València.

OXFORD ENGLISH DICTIONARY ONLINE. 2019a. s.v. "Queer." [Accessed online on January 20, 2019].

—. 2019b. s.v. "Straight." [Accessed online on January 20, 2019].

RICH, Adrienne. 1980. "Compulsory Heterosexuality and Lesbian Existence." *Signs* 5 (4): 631-60.

ROGERS, Annie. 1988. "The 'I' of Madness: Shifting Subjectivities in Girls' and Women Psychological Development in 'The Yellow Wallpaper'." In Fisher and Silber 1988, 45-65.

RUHL, Sarah. 2009. *In the Next Room or The Vibrator Play*. New York: Samuel French.

SCHÖPP-SCHILLING, Beate. 1992. "*The Yellow Wallpaper*: A Rediscovered 'Realistic' Story." In Golden 1992, 141-44.

SEDGWICK, Eve. 1993. *Tendencies*. Durham, NC: Duke UP.

SHOWALTER, Elaine. 1985. *The Female Malady: Women, Madness and English Culture: 1830-1980*. London: Virago.

THOMAS, Logan, dir. 2012. *The Yellow Wallpaper*. Los Angeles, CA: Ascent Releasing Entertainment.

VEEDER, William. 1988. "Who is Jane? The Intricate Feminism of Charlotte Perkins Gilman." *Arizona Quarterly* 44 (3): 40-71.

WEXLER, Tanya, dir. 2011. *Hysteria*. Beverly Hills, CA: Informant Media.

WHITE, Barbara. 1997. [Untitled]. In Knight 1997, 197-209.

Carolina Núñez-Puente is *Profesora Contratada Doctora* of English Studies at the University of A Coruña. She is author of *Feminism and Dialogics: Charlotte Perkins Gilman, Meridel Le Sueur, Mikhail M. Bakhtin* (2006) and co-editor of *Queering Women's and Gender Studies* (2016). She is co-investigator on the research project "Bodies in Transit: Difference and Indifference" financed by the Spanish Ministry of Science, Education and Universities (FFI2017-84555-C2-2-P) and is currently working on a multiethnic study of prose, poetry and film from a multidisciplinary perspective.

Address: Departamento de Letras. Sección de Estudios Ingleses. Facultad de Filología. Universidad de A Coruña. Campus da Zapateira, s/n. 15071, A Coruña, Spain. Tel.: +34 981167000; ext. 1827.

Changing Scholarly Interpretations of Gertrude Bonnin (Zitkala-Ša)

Tadeusz Lewandowski
Uniwersytet Opolski, Poland
ted.a.lewandowski@gmail.com

The Yankton Sioux writer and activist Gertrude Bonnin (1876-1938), better known by her Lakota name, Zitkala-Ša (Red Bird), was perhaps the most prominent Native American woman of the early twentieth century. In her writings, she consistently overturned conventions of language and meaning to subvert and criticize the American discourse of civilization. Bonnin's use of English as a tool of resistance has invited misrepresentations and misunderstandings. Criticism can be distilled into three interpretive frameworks: liminal, assimilationist and bicultural. Liminal scholarship focuses on Bonnin's 1900 semi-autobiography for the *Atlantic Monthly,* which laments the author's separation from her birth culture. Assimilationist criticism springs from extra-literary sources, concentrating on her anti-peyote and pro-US citizenship campaigns. Finally, bicultural criticism argues that Bonnin's knowledge of both the white and the Sioux world allowed her to form a compelling critique of Euro-American society from differing cultural and linguistic discourses. Recently, however, more forceful interpretations on Bonnin have begun to emerge. They identify her as either a promoter of Gerald Vizenor's concept of "survivance" or as a forerunner of the Red Power movement. This article traces and dissects the evolution of Bonnin scholarship, pointing to emerging perspectives from which to interrogate her work and the direction future research and analysis could take.

Keywords: Gertrude Bonnin; Zitkala-Ša; liminal; assimilationist; bicultural; interpretation

· · ·

Interpretaciones académicas de Gertrude Bonnin (Zitkala-Ša): pasado, presente y futuro

La escritora y activista sioux Yankton Gertrude Bonnin (1876-1938), más conocida por su nombre lakota, Zitkala-Ša (Pájaro Rojo), fue quizás la mujer nativa americana

más prominente de principios del siglo XX. En sus escritos, consistentemente volcó las convenciones del lenguaje y el significado para subvertir y criticar el discurso de la civilización estadounidense. El uso del inglés por parte de Bonnin como herramienta de resistencia ha provocado tergiversaciones y malentendidos. La crítica existente puede ser clasificada en tres marcos interpretativos: liminal, asimilacionista y bicultural. La crítica liminal se centra en la semiautobiografía que Bonnin escribió en 1900 para el *Atlantic Monthly*, donde lamenta el distanciamiento que experimentó de su cultura de nacimiento. La perspectiva asimilacionista proviene de fuentes extraliterarias, centrándose en sus campañas contra el peyote y a favor de la ciudadanía estadounidense. Finalmente, la aproximación bicultural argumenta que el conocimiento por parte de Bonnin de los mundos blanco y sioux le permitió formular una crítica convincente de la sociedad euroamericana a partir de discursos culturales y lingüísticos diferentes. Recientemente, sin embargo, han comenzado a surgir interpretaciones más potentes sobre Bonnin, interpretaciones que la identifican como promotora del concepto de "supervivencia" de Gerald Vizenor o como precursora del movimiento *Red Power*. Este artículo rastrea y analiza la evolución de los estudios sobre Bonnin, subrayando las perspectivas emergentes desde las cuales se está interrogando su labor y la dirección que podrían tomar la investigación y el análisis futuros.

Palabras clave: Gertrude Bonnin; Zitkala-Ša; liminal; asimilacionista; bicultural; interpretación

1. Introduction

Much has been written on the Yankton Sioux writer and activist Gertrude Simmons Bonnin (better known as Zitkala-Ša) since the rediscovery of her work in the late 1970s. Due to this attention, Bonnin's story—from her recruitment to a Quaker boarding school at the age of eight to her tenure as president of the National Council of American Indians—is well known within the field of Indigenous Studies. She has, to be sure, taken her place in history among the Red Progressives, who, through the Society of American Indians, fought for Native rights in the early twentieth century. Yet it would not be inaccurate to observe that vastly differing conceptions of Bonnin have emerged in scholarly literature, some liminal, some assimilationist, some bicultural and some outright condemnatory. This fact is not surprising for a woman who lived a public life of considerable controversy and drama. What does surprise, however, is the selective manner in which aspects of Bonnin's career have been employed to define her, quite removed from the sum total of her life of writing and activism.

Broadly speaking, there are three main strains of Bonnin criticism that have materialized over the past forty years and at times intertwined. The first declares Bonnin a "cultural ghost" (Meisenheimer 1997, 115) who lived an endlessly liminal or "schizophrenic" existence (Stout 1984, 70)—too influenced by her white education to present a consistent critique of American society in her writings. The second paints her as an assimilationist who "sold out" to white society by using her Indian identity to promote causes detrimental to Native religion and tribal sovereignty, such as her anti-peyote and pro-US citizenship campaigns (Davidson and Norris 2003, xxiv; Newmark 2012, 343).[1] The third, more complex, strain of criticism positively recasts Bonnin's liminality as biculturalism—a trait that allowed her to interrogate and criticize Euro-American society from differing discourses, move between worlds and assert the validity of her Sioux heritage (Heflin 2000, 9). Scholars writing in this vein only sometimes cite contradictory notions within Bonnin's writings (Hafen 1997, 31-33).

While the bicultural paradigm has been used to defend Bonnin from the many attacks upon her writings and legacy, increasingly forceful perspectives from which to view her work have very recently emerged. Some scholars suggest that Bonnin should be seen as a more oppositional figure, one who advocated a position reminiscent of Gerald Vizenor's concept of "survivance"—the active effort by Native peoples to resist white narratives of dominance and instead reconstruct inherited identity (Conley 2016, 174; Newmark 2012, 341-42). I have gone further, arguing Bonnin held a position

---

[1]   Peyote is a small cactus native to the Rio Grande Valley. Its top contains alkaloids that, when ingested, cause physiological effects such as hallucinations. The Spanish recorded peyote use five hundred years ago among the Chichmeca in present-day Mexico. The Comanche, Kiowa and Wichita Plains Indians developed peyote use into a religious movement in the late nineteenth century. Peyotism became a set of rituals designed to offer a spiritual panacea to the destructive encroachment of Euro-Americans. When Bonnin witnessed peyote use on the Uintah and Ouray Reservation in Utah, her home from 1902 to 1917, she became hostile. Dismissing any religious significance to its ingestion, she deemed the cactus a dangerous drug that harmed the family unit and began a campaign to ban it. See my *Red Bird, Red Power: The Life and Legacy of Zitkala-Ša* (90-92).

defined by core tenets—racial pride, democratic tribal self-determination within the United States and intertribal identity—that constitute a proto-Red Power platform (Lewandowski 2016, 16). These marked, deeply conflicting shifts in how Bonnin has been viewed over the decades beg reflection—not only upon past approaches, but especially upon the future directions Bonnin scholarship might take.

2. GERTRUDE BONNIN AND THE *ATLANTIC MONTHLY* SEMI-AUTOBIOGRAPHY

Explanation as to how scholars have produced such differing readings of Bonnin's life requires some biographical detail. Born on the Yankton Sioux Reservation in 1876 to Ellen Taté Iyóhiwin Simmons and a delinquent white father, young Gertrude became caught up in the US government's attempts to subdue Indian populations through assimilation. This effort was the cornerstone of President Grant's "peace policy," inaugurated in 1869. At age eight, Gertrude left her mother's tepee by the Missouri River for the Quaker-run White's Manual Labor Institute, a boarding school in Wabash, Indiana. Thus began a course of education meant to instill the values of "civilization" and Christianity, and sever the tribal and familial bonds that supposedly held Natives back from the benefits of the modern world. This manner of schooling proved traumatic for many, Gertrude included. After three years at White's, Gertrude reunited with her mother but experienced a profound cultural alienation that compelled her, in 1890, to return to the school. There she was trained in music and eventually gained acceptance to Earlham College in Richmond, Indiana. In 1896, Gertrude, a polished speaker, represented Earlham at the Indiana State Oratorical Contest (Davidson and Norris 2003, xv-xvi). Presenting a speech entitled "Side by Side," she strongly criticized America's treatment of Native peoples, then sought reconciliation by suggesting that Natives could adopt white ways and make a unified "claim to a common country" in the spirit of equality (1896, 179). Though she won second place, Gertrude left Earlham soon after due to ill health and a desire to support herself financially. She secured a post at the Carlisle Indian Industrial School in Pennsylvania, overseen by former Army officer Richard Henry Pratt. Pratt's motto, "Kill the Indian and Save the Man," reflected a curriculum marked by harsh discipline and derision for indigenous modes of life. At the school, students were stripped of their Native beliefs, customs, languages and even names (Davidson and Norris 2003, xvii; Spack 2001, 175-76).

Bonnin's time at Carlisle became a turning point. She quickly determined that the erasure of Indian cultures in favor of assimilation was a cruel path to disrupted identity and a serious wrong. In 1899, she left for Boston. Encouraged by friends in publishing to write her life story, Bonnin found notoriety through a three-part semi-autobiography that served as a literary rejoinder to Pratt's institution and assimilationist ideals. Published in the *Atlantic Monthly* in early 1900, "Impressions of an Indian Childhood," "The School Days of an Indian Girl" and "An Indian Teacher among Indians" lamented the cultural upheavals forced upon Indian children at government

boarding schools, taking specific aim at Carlisle. Gertrude signed the series with a new self-given name, Zitkala-Ša (Red Bird, in Lakota), signifying her cultural and spiritual rebirth. A succession of other indigenous-themed stories, such as "Why I am a Pagan" (1902), followed the *Atlantic Monthly* debut, each questioning the foundations of assimilation and Christian missionary work. These critiques were accompanied by her rejection of the East and return to tribal lands in the spring of 1901. In Sioux Country, Simmons cared for her aging mother and married a fellow mixed-race Sioux, Raymond Telephause Bonnin. In 1902, the Bonnins relocated to the Uintah and Ouray Reservation in Utah. While there, Bonnin wrote little, moving instead toward Native rights activism under the auspices of the Society of American Indians (SAI), founded in 1911. She also inaugurated her own projects: *The Sun Dance Opera* (1913), an amalgam of Sioux ritual and western operatic forms, as well as a grass roots community center and a fierce, multi-state anti-peyote campaign meant to outlaw the cactus, aided in part by the assimilationist Indian Rights Association (IRA).

The Bonnins left Utah for Washington, DC, in 1917 to further Gertrude's activism. In the capital, Bonnin took over the SAI, edited and penned articles for its *American Indian Magazine,* and dueled, alongside Pratt, with pro-peyote ethnologist James Mooney before a congressional subcommittee. After leaving the SAI in 1919, Bonnin commenced an effort to win Natives US citizenship through work with the progressive General Federation of Women's Clubs, at whose meetings she performed and lectured in buckskin. During this period, she promoted herself as the granddaughter of Sitting Bull to attract media attention and published the pamphlet *Americanize the First American* (1921), which laid out a path to the regeneration of Native peoples. In 1926, Bonnin founded the National Council of American Indians. The council represented indigenous nations in a quest for land rights, legal protections and sovereignty, each year conducting months-long investigations into reservation conditions (Lewandowski 2016, 11-14). Bonnin died in 1938, impoverished by the Great Depression and convinced that the Indian remained a "veritable prisoner of war" in America. Any beneficial results of her years of activism, she wrote a friend in 1935, were "scarcely visible" (Welch 1985, 229). Following her death, she was quickly forgotten.

Before delving into the changing scholarly perceptions of Bonnin, a brief recounting of her 1900 *Atlantic Monthly* trilogy is also relevant and necessary. As the first auto-biographical account produced by a Native American woman without the aid of an editor or interpreter, the series has largely dominated interpretations of Bonnin's work (Hofel 1997, 110). Its installments take the reader through Bonnin's first twenty-four years, blending fact, fiction and literary devices as a means to criticize Euro-American society for its treatment of indigenous peoples. The first part, "Impressions of an Indian Childhood," begins on the Dakota plains, where the "wild" Gertrude lives with her mother, a model of wisdom and rectitude. She teaches Gertrude never to intrude upon others, like the "paleface" who has attacked the Sioux for decades (Bonnin 1900a, 87). Gertrude's father, a warrior rather than delinquent white man, has been killed

fighting American aggressors. Though content living with her mother and learning her traditional ways, Gertrude is tempted from her Edenic home by missionary recruiters for an eastern boarding school, who promise to take her to a land with a "great tree where grew red, red apples" (46). The Biblical motif casts Christians as devils offering knowledge of new lands and "civilization" in exchange for displacement and separation. The apples they speak of also boast another connotation. Their red peel reveals a white interior—the very endgame of Indian assimilation policy. Gertrude succumbs to temptation, begging for permission to make the journey east. Although aware of the missionaries' deceit, Gertrude's mother eventually agrees, realizing that her daughter will "need an education when she is grown, for then there will be fewer real Dakotas, and many more palefaces" (47). On the day she is set to leave, Gertrude immediately regrets her decision. Placed in a carriage and separated from her mother, tears run down her cheeks.

Gertrude's journey to "civilization" continues in "The School Days of an Indian Girl," which presents a reversal of the white-as-civilized, Indian-as-savage discourse prevalent at the time. Once at boarding school, Gertrude's mood only worsens as she is robbed of all her mother's old ways, her language, her religious beliefs and her dignity. Treating the pupils like "little animals," the missionaries violently cut their hair, causing Gertrude to lose her "spirit" (Bonnin 1900b, 187). In another episode, a friend is beaten for playing in the snow. Life at the boarding school, meanwhile, appears as little more than a purposeless "iron routine" (190) shored up by threats of damnation lest the students rebel. This "civilizing machine," devoid of humanity and personal attention, generates casualties (190). Gertrude looks on as an ill classmate dies with a Bible in her hands, a victim of the "superstitious ideas" that are the foundation of white schooling and Indian assimilation (190). White "civilization" is therefore not a new life for the Indian but, more likely, death.

And yet, Gertrude finds herself irrevocably changed by missionaries. When she returns to Yankton after three years she cannot reconnect with her mother and lives a painful, liminal existence. "I was neither a wee girl nor a tall one; neither a wild Indian nor a tame one," she writes, "I seemed to hang in the heart of chaos, beyond the touch or voice of human aid" (191). Gertrude's "wildness" as a child, we learn, had not been the "savagery" perceived by whites but rather a "freedom" now lost. As a result, Gertrude must return east to find her place and complete her transformation. Though she eventually achieves academic success and renown as an orator at Earlham College, she comes to feel that nothing in white society can compensate for her dislocated identity and physical displacement.

In "An Indian Teacher among Indians" Gertrude completes her journey, ultimately finding agency within herself and rejecting her errant path toward "civilization." Deciding to direct her energies into "a work for the Indian race," she travels to Pratt's Carlisle boarding school in Pennsylvania (Bonnin 1900c, 382). She is briefly reunited with her mother when Pratt sends her on a recruiting trip to Sioux Country, but the

meeting is spoiled by the poverty that prevails on the reservations and the intrusion of white settlers. Gertrude returns to Carlisle determined that her peoples and heritage must be protected from the onslaught of Euro-American society, fully aware of the process of transformation she has endured. "For the white man's papers I had given up my faith in the Great Spirit," she ruefully admits, "For these same papers I had forgotten the healing in trees and brooks. On account of my mother's simple view of life, and my lack of any, I gave her up, also" (386). Separated from what is right, Gertrude struggles on in a world where she does not belong, stating, "I made no friends among the race of people I loathed. Like a slender tree, I had been uprooted from my mother, nature, and God. I was shorn of my branches, which had waved in sympathy and love for home and friends" (386). Carlisle's students, "a small forest of Indian timber," risk the same fate (386). Appalled by these circumstances, Gertrude leaves Pennsylvania for Boston, where she reflects on her experiences.

In the last lines of her story, Gertrude recalls visitors to Carlisle leaving satisfied that their nation has shown such generosity. "In this fashion," she writes, "many have passed idly through the Indian schools during the last decade, afterward to boast of their charity to the North American Indian. But few there are who have paused to question whether real life or long-lasting death lies beneath this semblance of civilization" (386). In telling her story, Gertrude has linked assimilation with the physical genocide that marked previous relations between whites and Indians, implicitly arguing that "civilization" means little but enslavement to new, inferior norms. Overturning these conventions of language and meaning, the *Atlantic Monthly* series subverted and criticized the prevailing Euro-American discourse. The result is a canonical text in American Indian literature.

3. LIMINAL INTERPRETATIONS

Bonnin's rediscovery came forty years after her death with Dexter Fisher's article, "Zitkala-Ša: The Evolution of a Writer" (1979), written for the *American Indian Quarterly*. Fisher's pioneering scholarship was key to resuscitating Bonnin's legacy, but the legacy resuscitated was unfortunately skewed—based almost exclusively on the liminality expressed in her early works. As such, Fisher developed a narrative in which Bonnin betrays her Yankton heritage to make her way in the white world and becomes psychologically cursed as a result. In this selective reading, passages such as "I was neither a wee girl nor a tall one; neither a wild Indian nor a tame one" and "I seemed to hang in the heart of chaos" (Bonnin 1900b, 191) buttressed Fisher's conclusion that due to the clashing cultural demands of her reservation childhood and boarding school education, Bonnin's writing reflected her "truly liminal position, always on the threshold of two worlds but never fully entering either" (1979, 233). This "conflict between tradition and acculturation," Fisher continued, ever remained a "plague" on Bonnin's life (231). Incomplete assimilation, then, accounted for her writings and

activism, which derived from a supposedly broken or split sense of self, creating "a model of ambivalences, of oscillations between diametrically opposed worlds" that "struggled toward a vision of wholeness in which the conflicting parts of her existence could be reconciled" (236-37).

Though Fisher's research was vital to reviving Bonnin's legacy, its critical precedents exercised a decidedly negative effect on how subsequent scholars perceived the writer's work and drew attention to the *Atlantic Monthly* series as the principal, full, final and liminal representation of her life. Mary Stout, writing in the mid-1980s, quoted Fisher's "excellent thesis" at length while speaking, in even stronger terms, of Bonnin's "schizophrenic life" as "someone neither wholly white nor wholly Indian" (1984, 70-71, 74). During the years that followed, scholars in fields outside Indigenous Studies adopted this perspective as well. In the early 1990s, Laura Wexler and Sidonie Smith both published liminal statements on Bonnin's psychological makeup. Citing the *Atlantic Monthly* series, Wexler claimed that Bonnin's use of sentiment—derived from her "sentimental indoctrination" and the "dictates of a sentimental education"—demonstrated that her "self-conception had been so effectively ensnared in the codes of sentiment that there was no Indian in them that was left untouched by Western codes" (1992, 32, 34). Bonnin, therefore, was a "sentimental writer" who tried to reject the assimilationist doctrines of boarding school education, but betrayed her fragmented nature in passages that indicated "her own increasing inability to straddle the contradictions between the two societies" (31, 33). Ultimately, Wexler surmised that Bonnin merely created "short fiction that spoke within and to sentimental forms," rather than any sustained critique of white society's wrongs against the Indian (33).

Reinforcing Wexler's analysis, Smith put forth similar contentions. She argued, quite insensitively, that the *Atlantic Monthly* semi-autobiography constituted nothing more than a failed attempt at resisting "passification [*sic*] and assimilation," insisting that being "truly American" means "adopting the values, behavior, dress, and point of view of the Anglo-American middle-class and shedding the differences of language, outlook, dress, [and] demeanor" (1994, 121). In her estimation, Bonnin, despite her attempted rebellion, fit such criteria because her texts were "marked by the inescapable mark of Americanization" and the "context of her understanding of her past and its meaning in her autobiographical narrative is inflected throughout with the education that has Americanized her" (135). The "language of the paleface," Smith added, "is precisely the language of her self-constitution" (135). Ironically, then, Bonnin's "critique of the colonial oppression of the dominant culture is rendered in the canonical discourses of the conqueror" (136). Smith capped her discussion with a remarkable paragraph worth quoting at length:

> [Bonnin] unmakes herself as an American of conformity and docility, even as she can never entirely escape being remade as American. She writes herself through Western discourses

to the traditionally based but historically adapted beliefs of the Sioux Indians. She critiques the civilizing mission from inside the effects of that mission. She inveighs against Americanization to other Americans having already become an American. Her resistance narrative, an act through which she would assert her sense of her own individuality against the cultural expectations of docility and industriousness, through which she would assert the viability of alternative spiritual values against a denigrating Christianity hostile to Indian difference, is precisely the durable legacy of her American education and its myth of radical individualism. (36)

Smith's ethnocentric, monocultural interpretation, which appears to hinge on a discourse in which only Euro-American values and education legitimately serve as a means of expression and resistance, cast Bonnin not as conscious agent, but as the very embodiment of unwitting liminality. Referring to this established line of thought, D. K. Meisenheimer, Jr., writing in 1997, noted: "Criticism of [Bonnin's] work typically concedes her status as a cultural ghost, interpreting key passages of her autobiographical essays as her own recognition of, even acquiescence in, a tragic cultural dissolution" (115). This concession, based on such a narrow view of Bonnin's writings and life, unquestionably required correction.

4. Assimilationist Interpretations

As liminal interpretations developed and took root, another selective reading of Bonnin established itself—this time from a decidedly extraliterary source. Its origin is traced to James Sydney Slotkin's *The Peyote Religion: A Study in Indian White Relations* (1956), where the author took a derisive view of Bonnin that became the starting point for subsequent assimilationist characterizations. Citing Bonnin's involvement in efforts to suppress peyote use through legislation, Slotkin labeled her "a marginal fusionist"—that is, a member of a "subordinate group" who is "violently opposed" to Native customs (27, 121). Through distaste of her own heritage, Slotkin hyperbolically and wrongly asserted, Bonnin sought to abolish all Indian cultures and actively gain official approbation through "White religious organizations" as an "entree into the dominant group" (121).

Thirty-five years later, the same assimilationist assessment appeared in a widely-cited paper by the prominent Cherokee scholar William Willard, "The First Amendment, Anglo-Conformity, and American Indian Religious Freedom" (1991).[2] This survey of the Indian Rights Association's anti-peyote campaign of the 1910s implicated Bonnin in the promulgation of "the doctrine of Anglo-conformity" against indigenous religious freedom. Willard highlighted her furnishing of a petition to the IRA and her 1918 clash with the pro-peyotism ethnologist and "champion of religious freedom,"

---

[2]   Willard, however, cannot be counted as a Bonnin detractor. See his earlier article, "Zitkala-Ša, a Woman Who Would Be Heard!" in the 1985 volume of *Wičazo Ša Review*, where he praises Bonnin's lifetime of activism.

Mooney, before a House subcommittee hearing arguments for and against a peyote ban (25-26). Bonnin had declared peyote a demoralizing, lethal drug that "excites the baser passions" (28). For later scholars concerned with peyotism, these actions strictly, even exclusively, defined Bonnin's life. Thomas Constantine Maroukis (2005), Mooney biographer L. G. Moses (1984) and Scott Richard Lyons (1999) have all singled out Bonnin as the primary villain in the peyote controversies of the late 1910s.[3] Similar sentiments also appeared in Robert Allen Warrior's (Osage) *Tribal Secrets* (1995), which deemed Bonnin and her Red Progressive colleagues principally "Christian" and "secular assimilationist" in character, stating once again that opposition to peyote obstructed Native sovereignty (4, 10).

The effect of such combined criticisms on Bonnin's reputation were, in some academic circles, devastating and almost dehumanizing. With an apparent nod to Slotkin's "marginal fusionist" condemnation, in "Splitting the Earth: First Utterances and Pluralist Separatism" (2006), Jace Weaver, with little recourse to supporting facts or justifications, made an offhand but venomous attack on Bonnin as a willing and traitorous tool of transplanted white society, comparing her to both Squanto and Pocahontas. The first, Weaver wrote, though "kidnapped" and "traduced," had returned "speaking the language of the colonizer" to assist the Pilgrims. The second, he charged, yielded in "sacrificing her body and her health on the altar of mediation" (2). Bonnin, in Weaver's estimation, was a distillation of both. Along these lines, there has also appeared an undercurrent in certain scholarship on Bonnin that suggests, or even declares openly, that she was mentally unstable. Deborah Sue Welch, author of a path-breaking dissertation on Bonnin, has remarked upon her subject's "almost paranoid" personality (1985, 119). Welch has also posited that Bonnin's activism was little more than "a purpose she adopted to assuage the guilt" over engaging the white world, rather than the result of a desire to fight injustices done to Native peoples (2001, 38). Such activism purportedly led to even greater insanity. Fisher states that Bonnin's "own image of herself eventually evolved into an admixture of myth and fact, so that at the time of her death in 1938, she believed […] that she was the granddaughter of Sitting Bull" (1979, 236). Moses has also depicted Bonnin as a woman "harried" by many "demons" (1984, 198). Speaking mainly to these male critics, Ruth J. Heflin has suggested that, as a woman, Bonnin's "assertive personality" may have negatively influenced scholarly perceptions (2000, 107).

Toward the end of the 1990s, liminal and assimilationist readings of Bonnin contributed to Betty Louie Bell's (Cherokee) wide-ranging critique, "If this is Paganism… Zitkala-Ša and the Devil's Language" (1998). Bell rendered an excoriating portrait of Bonnin's work as, essentially, traitorous. Bonnin was portrayed as an actor,

---

[3] Due to the nature and complexity of Bonnin's anti-peyote campaign, a full discussion of its significance is outside the scope of this article. As noted above, her opposition to peyote use, in any case, was based not on any distaste for Native religion, but on her belief that peyote was a harmful presence on the Uintah and Ouray Reservation.

all flash and little substance, who lost touch with her indigenous roots and exhibited nothing but short-sighted naiveté. Perhaps worse, Bell noted that Bonnin was "proud of her achievements and, even long after she had become alert to the cultural and spiritual costs of such a trajectory, she advocated education and the acquisition of English for Native people" (61). In a doomed endeavor, therefore, Bonnin wrongly attempted to gain independence through integration and pure sycophancy. What falsely informs her work is "the hope that a voice of accommodation can enact resistance within an alien and hostile culture and its language" (67). Bell continues:

> Many scholars have interpreted, with good reason, her embrace and advocacy of education and citizenship (and testimony against the syncretic peyotist religion) as assimilationist. For [Bonnin], tribal self-determination could be gained only through Indian accommodation with "the good intentions of a benevolent Government." She failed to see that the act of assimilation, or even the appearance of it, in postcolonial cultures does not rearrange hierarchies of power but stabilizes them. (67)

Bonnin's "rhetoric of accommodation," Bell added, "undermines the strength of her political legacy," thus ensnaring "her argument in a colonial identity" (67). Such gestures, in the end, contradicted her superficial position "against native dependence and disenfranchisement," annihilating any potentially meaningful criticism in her writing (67). With Bell's analysis, the question had become: how could this supposedly confused, *almost* assimilated and mentally entrapped individual produce anything ideologically consistent?

5. Bicultural Interpretations

Thankfully, by the end of the 1990s new scholars had begun to challenge the basis of this question, putting forth a bicultural reading of Bonnin that was, initially, tentative. In an article for *Wíčazo Ša Review,* "Zitkala-Ša: Sentimentality and Sovereignty" (1997), P. Jane Hafen (Taos Pueblo) gave a different, generally positive account of Bonnin. Through a more inclusive survey of her life, Hafen acknowledged that Bonnin "remained firmly committed to her tribal sovereignty," while also highlighting the supposed "contradictions within [her] work" by noting that Bonnin "embraces" the "dominant ideologies" of early twentieth-century white America (31). The culprit in such contradictions was, much like in Fisher, "an 'ideological product' of both Native and Euramerican identification" (32).

Yet in positively redefining liminality as biculturalism, Hafen made a significant breakthrough that led to an important re-evaluation of the *Atlantic Monthly* series. Soon after, Ruth Spack took this reorganization of perspective further, deeming Bonnin's biculturalism an asset that "enabled her to speak for herself, to represent herself, and to render her (bi)cultural experiences in all their complexity" and interrogate Euro-American

society from differing discourses (1997, 25). Along these lines, Penelope Kelsey has stated that Bonnin's "complex heritage" created not negation, but "a successful critique of colonial policy" (2003, 136) that—as Dorothea Susag similarly argued—"operates to break the Euro-American powers of (de)culturation and acculturation" (1993, 23). This more sensitive, nuanced current of literary analysis continued to evolve throughout the 2000s as more academics contributed feminist-inspired evaluations that took a view of Bonnin's writings as a successful fusion of Yankton Sioux communal values and American individualism. Margot Reynolds, for instance, argued that the *Atlantic Monthly* series constituted an attempt to "rework imperial, Christian-influenced patriarchy" (2007, 189), while Ron Carpenter wrote of how Bonnin employed her "bicultural resources to produce a new type of Indian, one that exceeds the prescriptive roles offered Native American women by either culture" (2004, 2).

Scholars in the bicultural vein also sought to explain Bonnin's supposed acquiescence to Euro-American culture from a different standpoint, interpreting conciliatory gestures to the white audience as a sprinkling of sugar necessary to sway ethnocentric public opinion within the narrow dominant discourse of her times. They concluded that Bonnin's work inescapably featured compromises and tensions that would only be resolved by demanding a white exodus to the Old World—meaning that engaging Euro-American society required an intricate negotiation ripe with real and rhetorical barriers that restricted literary protest. Refuting liminal and sentimental interpretations of the *Atlantic Monthly* series, Martha J. Cutter contended that Bonnin's writing "subverts traditional [American] modes of autobiographical and linguistic self-authentication" (1994, 31). In doing so, Bonnin refuses to "legitimate" white literary conventions by conforming to "generic criteria" such as "a structural movement from disorganization to coherence" or "the expectation that an autobiography will establish a pattern of dominance over circumstances" (33). Rather than constituting a doomed quest to become whole or to reject the dominant culture while unwittingly embodying it, Cutter argued that Bonnin effectively shows that forced acculturation is performed at "the expense of the self" (36). The concept of a sentimental narrative that leads to triumph, so pertinent to late nineteenth-century readers, dissolves into a critique in which the promise of white society is shown to be false. Susan Bernardin seconded this assessment, arguing that Bonnin's "stories selectively use the language of domesticity to scrutinize sentimental ideology's foundational role in compulsory Indian education as well as its related participation in national efforts to 'Americanize' the Indian" (1997, 213). Mary Paniccia Carden, writing around the same time, likewise noted how Bonnin "maneuvers for self-determination within the colonizer's vocabulary" (1997, 60).

Such revisions in interpreting the *Atlantic Monthly* series evolved into a view of Bonnin as a conscious and tactical actor. Vanessa Holford Diana, for instance, has drawn attention to the author's "careful playing of her white audience's expectations and preexisting world view." The effectiveness of this method relied on Bonnin's

"understanding of her position's inherent restrictions and her exploration of ways to subvert them" (1997, 156). Amelia Katanski, in *Learning to Write "Indian"* (2005), also countered Wexler's and Smith's charges of sentimentality and individualism, arguing that "[Bonnin] does not use this framework [of sentimentality] to indicate her acquiescence in the *values* of sentimentalism. Instead, she attempts to use the masters' tools to dismantle the masters' house, showing the way that institutions spawned by sentimentalism were injurious to Indians and urging their reform" (158; italics in the original). Bonnin's perspective consequently differed radically from that of the dominant culture, because her work showed she had not imbibed but rejected the ethnocentrism at the national discourse's core. This fact made her semi-autobiographical writings an act of cultural integrity and resistance, first and foremost. Katanski noted that these tactics were employed with phenomenal success in *Uncle Tom's Cabin* (1852), which also meant not only to condemn, but to spur change by making the audience feel "pain and subsequent anger" (159). The effect of Bonnin's work is thus to deny "any simple classification" and "encourage us to question our own critical assumptions concerning Indian identity and its representation" (164). Perhaps the most significant act underlining her series, Katanski suggested, was Bonnin's decision to identify herself with a Lakota name—sending the message that even the most forceful efforts of white society to erase Native cultures are unsuccessful (114-15). In this view, the *Atlantic Monthly* writings ultimately show that boarding school education leads not to assimilation, but to resistance and an awareness of how ethnocentrism clouds the minds of reformers—though not their wards, who recognize the value of the cultures from which they hail.

Still, it should be noted that the bicultural strain does at times betray a degree of tentativeness in its analyses. Spack admits that Bonnin was always conscientious in "satisfying a mass audience" (2002, 149), while Hafen has echoed liminal interpretations by writing that Bonnin "seemed caught between validating her indigenous beliefs and seeking public approval" (2001, xx). Hafen, however, goes on to say that this position was "part of the complex mediation that Native peoples frequently reconcile in order to survive in the modern era" (xx). Nonetheless, thanks to bicultural readings of the *Atlantic Monthly* series, by the end of the 2010s Bonnin's self-awareness and intellect were restored within scholarly literature, and her mission to proclaim the value of Native identity outside colonial conceptions and annihilating discursive contradictions recognized. Rather than being seen as assimilationist preacher or, conversely, casualty, Bonnin had finally, at long last, rightfully regained her agency.

6. Recent Interpretations

Bonnin's agency has come more fully to the fore in recent interpretations of her writing and activism. So, too, has a wider scholarly view of her work, which is shifting to an emphasis on Bonnin's actions as a campaigner for Native peoples. In 2012 Julianne

Newmark, in an article for *American Indian Quarterly*, argued vigorously for an expanded perspective on Bonnin, far removed from reductionist readings of the *Atlantic Monthly* series. Looking at the bulk of Bonnin's committed activism with the National Council of American Indians and her later writings on Indian issues, Newmark countered the liminal and assimilationist interpretations put forth by Warrior and Weaver in favor of a pluralistic reading. In making her argument, Newmark depicted Bonnin as a strong advocate of "Native persistence and *survivance*—in regard to land, language, community, and culture" (2012, 341; italics in the original). Such advocacy spoke out against the White Nativism of the 1910s and 1920s, offering a vision of "mutual empowerment of all Americans" (343). Newmark was adamant that previous scholarly criticisms that did not consider Bonnin's "cooperative work" and "life experiences" failed to recognize her ultimate goal, which was "securing permanent home places for and equitable treatment of all Native people in regard to health care, education, and financial matters" (343). This focus on the survivance aspect of Bonnin's work was later reflected in Paige A. Conley's "Strategically Negotiating Essence: Zitkala-Ša's Ethos as Activist" (2016), which employed the concept in an analysis of Bonnin's speeches from 1920 to 1925. Conley argued too that Bonnin "sought to both survive within the dominant American society, and simultaneously maintain, if not advance, sovereign forms of identity, community, and culture" (173-74).

In 2016, I published the first scholarly biography of Bonnin, *Red Bird, Red Power: The Life and Legacy of Zitkala-Ša*, with the University of Oklahoma Press. The book offered a more forceful interpretation of Bonnin, designating her a precursor of the Red Power movement of the late 1960s and 1970s. Through an inclusive assessment of her lifetime of activism coupled with philological analysis of her entire body of writing, I argued that—despite her anti-peyote campaign and advocacy of US citizenship—Bonnin was a fierce defender of Native peoples. In her early and later works, her emphases on self-determination, cultural preservation and the moral and spiritual superiority of Indian peoples, encompassed by her belief in an intertribal bond whereby all Indians shared the same fate, combined to formulate what I called "a proto-Red Power platform" (16). Though I did not specifically link Bonnin to the Red Power movement that followed her, I pointed to the similarities between her writings and positions and those of Vine Deloria, Jr., the major Red Power intellectual of the 1970s. Key to this comparison was the racial and cultural pride evinced by both activists, their plans for the regeneration of Indian nations and their harsh criticisms of the Bureau of Indian Affairs and US government. Ultimately, I placed Bonnin within the long-term efforts of the Lakota to resist white encroachment, labeling her "one of a new generation of Sioux resistance fighters who sought protections using the tools that her historical period offered" (16). Her legacy, then, is as a forerunner of Red Power.[4]

---

[4] Reviews of *Red Bird, Red Power: The Life and Legacy of Zitkala-Ša* have been generally accepting of its central thesis regarding Bonnin's legacy as a forerunner of the Red Power movement. See, for instance, Blanchard (2017), Estes (2017) and Newmark (2018).

7. Conclusion

The latest interpretations of Bonnin as a proponent of survivance and forerunner of the Red Power movement demonstrate the radical change in how scholars have perceived her work and writings since the late 1970s. Once viewed as either a creature doomed to ineffectual protestations born of tragic liminality or unwitting assimilation, Bonnin—after rehabilitation though bicultural scholarly readings—is now beginning to garner an even fuller appreciation for her oppositional stances. Bonnin's *Atlantic Monthly* writings, which arguably began her life as an activist, meanwhile remain a focus of scholarly attention. In the recent *Sovereign Stories and Blood Memories: Native American Women's Autobiography* (2017), Annette Angela Portillo revisits the semi-autobiographical series, noting approvingly that despite issues of liminality and acculturation, Bonnin "subversively uses the English language to illustrate the hypocrisy of her audience" and "dispel the myths and negative connotations about Native American identity and culture" (115, 188). This would now seem the standard interpretation, but perhaps not for long. In the forthcoming second volume of *Changed Forever: American Indian Boarding School Literature*, Arnold Krupat puts forth a more critical reading of the *Atlantic Monthly* series, based not on liminality, but on the "highly selective" way that Bonnin tells her story (2). He seeks to demonstrate that bicultural assessments of the *Atlantic Monthly* writings, grounded mostly in their narrative of resistance to assimilation, have in fact appeared from "reading them back through the lens of [Bonnin's] later life and work" as an activist (3). To make his argument, Krupat points to the contradictions within the series, its cultural and historical misrepresentations and Bonnin's use of Indian stereotypes "to appeal for the reader's sympathy" (15). Unlike those scholars who have promoted a view of the semi-autobiography as a stinging indictment of Pratt's program of forced acculturation, Krupat argues that Bonnin gives a much-sanitized version of boarding school life and Carlisle's "ethnocidal ideology," which leaves out many of the forms of ethnocide practiced at the school, such as name-changing (35).[5] How Krupat's criticisms affect readings of Bonnin will become evident in time. Yet it is a testament to the density of her *Atlantic Monthly* writings that fresh interpretations and criticisms are still possible after decades of dissecting what are, in essence, three small texts.

Krupat's point is well made, for it seems that interpretations of the *Atlantic Monthly* series, once so dismissively censorious, have in the last decade veered toward the other direction—that of uncritical praise. Undeniably, tendencies to "read into" Bonnin's semi-autobiographical writings have produced scholarly statements that might, in retrospect, reveal layers of meaning not necessarily justified by the works' content. Krupat's circumspect approach, if taken by other scholars, could do much to clear away

---

any hyperbole and embellishments that mark the more enthusiastic bicultural analyses of Bonnin's early semi-autobiography.

My own wish is that future research would also shift its focus from Bonnin's earlier to her later writings dating from the mid-1910s onwards. Fortunately, there are still relatively fresh texts to interrogate. Lengthy and mature works that have rarely garnered the scholarly consideration they warrant include "The Sioux Claims" and "Our Sioux People," both dating from 1923, and the National Council of American Indians Petition to the Senate (1926)—undoubtedly Bonnin's most complete statement of her views on Native-US relations.[6] Bonnin's writings for the Society of American Indians' journal, the *American Indian Magazine,* have also regrettably not received due consideration in the body of scholarly literature, despite their relevance to her US citizenship campaign. Analyzing her Congressional testimony on peyote and letters from the Uintah Reservation in Utah, meanwhile, do more to explain Bonnin's opposition to the cactus's use than generalized assertions that she was against Native sovereignty. Critically pursuing these avenues of research would do much to generate debate and achieve a greater and more nuanced understanding of Bonnin's political stances.

In conclusion, one hopes that assessing Bonnin's life and legacy more broadly and inclusively is still in its infancy and that differing evaluations of her work will continue to appear, each adding insight into issues of liminality, assimilationism, biculturalism, pluralism, survivance and the Red Power movement. And if the past is any indication, we can be confident that scholars will never reach a final consensus. For a person as complex as Gertrude Bonnin, this is to be welcomed.

Works Cited

Acampora, Christa and Angela Cotton, eds. 2007. *Cultural Sites of Critical Interest: Philosophy, Aesthetics, and African American and Native American Women's Writings.* Albany: SUNY P.

Bell, Betty Louise. 1998. "If this is Paganism… Zitkala-Ša and the Devil's Language." In Weaver 1998, 61-68.

Bernadin, Susan. 1997. "The Lessons of a Sentimental Education: Zitkala-Ša's Autobiographical Narratives." *Western American Literature* 32 (3): 212-38.

Blanchard, Paulette. 2017. Review of *Red Bird, Red Power: The Life and Legacy of Zitkala-Ša*, by Tadeusz Lewandowski. *American Indian Culture and Research Journal* 41 (2): 174-77.

Bonnin, Gertrude (Zitkala-Ša) 1896. "Side by Side." *The Earlhamite,* March 16, 177-79.

—. 1900a. "Impressions of an Indian Childhood." *Atlantic Monthly* 85 (1): 37-47.

---

[6] I have recently edited *Zitkala-Ša: Letters, Speeches, and Unpublished Writings (1898-1929)* for Brill. The volume, published in 2018, features a selection of Bonnin's letters, later speeches and writings, including the previously unpublished "The Sioux Claims," "Our Sioux People" and the National Council of American Indians Petition to the Senate.

—. 1900b. "The School Days of an Indian Girl." *Atlantic Monthly* 85 (2): 185-94.

—. 1900c. "An Indian Teacher among Indians." *Atlantic Monthly* 85 (3): 381-86.

CARDEN, Mary Paniccia. 1997. "'The Ears of the Palefaces Could Not Hear Me': Languages of Self-Representation in Zitkala-Ša's Autobiographical Essays." *Prose Studies* 20 (1): 58-76.

CARPENTER, Ron. 2004. "Zitkala-Ša and Bicultural Subjectivity." *Studies in American Indian Literatures* 16 (3): 1-27.

CASTILLO, Susan and Victor M. P. DaRosa, eds. 1997. *Native American Women in Literature and Culture*. Porto: Fernando Pessoa UP.

CONLEY, Paige A. 2016. "Strategically Negotiating Essence: Zitkala-Ša's Ethos as Activist." In Ryan, Myers and Jones 2016, 173-94.

CUTTER, Martha. 1994. "Zitkala-Ša's Autobiographical Writings: The Problems of a Canonical Search for Language and Identity." *MELUS: Multi-Ethnic Literature of the United States* 19 (1): 31-44.

DAVIDSON, Cathy and Ada Norris. 2003. Introduction to *American Indian Stories, Legends, and Other Writings*, by Zitkala-Ša, xi-xxxvi. New York: Penguin.

DIANA, Vanessa Holford. 1997. "Hanging in the Heart of Chaos: Bi-Cultural Limbo, Self-(Re)presentation, and the White Audience in Zitkala-Ša's *American Indian Stories*." *Cimarron Review* 121: 154-72.

EDMUNDS, R. David, ed. 2001. *The New Warriors: Native American Leaders since 1900*. Lincoln: U of Nebraska P.

ESTES, Nick (Kul Wicasa). 2017. Review of *Red Bird, Red Power: The Life and Legacy of Zitkala-Ša*, by Tadeusz Lewandowski. *Journal of the Native American and Indigenous Studies Association* 4 (2): 101-102.

FISHER, Dexter. 1979. "Zitkala-Ša: The Evolution of a Writer." *American Indian Quarterly* 5 (3): 229-38.

HAFEN, P. Jane. 1997. "Zitkala-Ša: Sentimentality and Sovereignty." *Wíčazo Ša Review* 12 (2): 31-41.

—. 2001. Introduction to *Dreams and Thunder: Stories, Poems, and The Sun Dance Opera*, by Zitkala-Ša, xiii-xxiv. Lincoln: U of Nebraska P.

HEFLIN, Ruth. 2000. *I Remain Alive: The Sioux Literary Renaissance*. Syracuse: Syracuse UP.

HOEFEL, Rosanne. 1997. "Writing, Performance, Activism: Zitkala-Ša and Pauline Johnson." In Castillo and DaRosa 1997, 107-18.

INNESS, Sherrie A. and Diana Royer, eds. 1997. *Breaking Boundaries: New Perspectives on Women's Regional Writing*. Iowa City: U of Iowa P.

KATANSKI, Amelia. 2005. *Learning to Write "Indian": The Boarding School Experience and American Indian Literature*. Norman: U of Oklahoma P.

KELSEY, Penelope. 2003. "Narratives of the Boarding School Era from Victory to Resistance." *Atenea* 23 (2): 123-37.

KRUPAT, Arnold. Forthcoming. *Changed Forever: American Indian Boarding School Literature, Volume 2*. Albany: SUNY P.

LEWANDOWSKI, Tadeusz. 2016. *Red Bird, Red Power: The Life and Legacy of Zitkala-Ša.* Norman: U of Oklahoma P.

—. 2018. *Zitkala-Ša: Letters, Speeches, and Unpublished Writings (1898-1929).* Leiden and Boston: Brill.

LYONS, SCOTT RICHARD. 1999. "The Incorporation of the Indian Body: Peyotism and the Pan-Indian Public, 1911-1913." In Swearingen and Pruett 1999, 147-54.

MAROUKIS, Thomas Constantine. 2004. *Peyote and the Yankton Sioux.* Norman: U of Oklahoma P.

—. 2013. "The Peyote Controversy and the Demise of the Society of American Indians." *American Indian Quarterly* 37 (3): 159-80.

MEISENHEIMER, D. K. Jr. 1997. "Regionalist Bodies/Embodied Regions: Sarah Orne Jewett and Zitkala-Ša." In Inness and Royer 1997, 109-23.

MOSES, L. G. 1984. *The Indian Man: A Biography of James Mooney.* Chicago: U of Illinois P.

NEWMARK, Julianne. 2012. "Pluralism, Place, and Gertrude Bonnin's Counternativism from Utah to Washington, DC." *American Indian Quarterly* 36 (3): 318-47.

—. 2018. Review of *Red Bird, Red Power: The Life and Legacy of Zitkala-Ša*, by Tadeusz Lewandowski. *Western American Literature* 52 (2): 257-59.

PORTILLO, Annette Angela. 2017. *Sovereign Stories and Blood Memories: Native American Women's Autobiography.* Albuquerque: U of New Mexico P.

REYNOLDS, Margot. 2007. "Mother Times Two: A Double Take on a Gynocentric Justice Song." In Acampora and Cotton 2007, 171-90.

RYAN, Kathleen J., Nancy Myers and Rebecca Jones, eds. 2016. *Rethinking Ethos: A Feminist Ecological Approach to Rhetoric.* Carbondale: Southern Illinois UP.

SAMUELS, Shirley, ed. 1992. *The Culture of Sentiment: Race, Gender, and Sentimentality in Nineteenth-Century America.* New York and Oxford: Oxford UP.

SHOLER, Bo, ed. 1984. *Coyote was Here: Essays on Contemporary Native American Literary and Political Mobilization.* Philadelphia, PA: Coronet.

SLOTKIN, James Sydney. 1956. *The Peyote Religion: A Study in Indian White Relations.* Glencoe, NJ: The Free Press.

SMITH, Sidonie. 1994. "Cheesecake, Nymphs, and We the People: Un/National Subjects about 1900." *Prose Studies* 17 (1): 120-40.

SPACK, Ruth. 1997. "Re-Visioning Sioux Women: Zitkala-Ša's Revolutionary *American Indian Stories*." *Legacy: A Journal of American Women Writers* 14 (1): 25-42.

—. 2001. "Dis/engagement: Zitkala-Ša's Letters to Carlos Montezuma, 1901-1902." *MELUS: Multi-Ethnic Literature of the United States* 26 (1): 173-204.

—. 2002. *America's Second Tongue: American Indian Education and the Ownership of English, 1860-1900*. Lincoln: U of Nebraska P.

STOUT, Mary. 1984. "Zitkala-Ša: The Literature of Politics." In Sholer 1984, 70-78.

SUSAG, Dorothea. 1993. "Zitkala-Ša (Gertrude Simmons Bonnin); A Power(full) Literary Voice." *Studies in American Indian Literatures* 5 (4): 3-24.

SWEARINGEN, C. Jan and Dave Pruett, eds. 1999. *Rhetoric, the Polis, and the Global Village: Selected Papers from the 1998 Thirtieth Anniversary Rhetoric Society of America Conference.* Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Earlbaum.

WARRIOR, Robert Allen. 1995. *Tribal Secrets: Recovering American Intellectual Traditions*. Minneapolis: U of Minnesota P.

WEAVER, Jace, ed. 1998. *Native American Religious Identity: Unforgotten Gods.* Maryknoll, NY: Orbis.

—. 2006. "Splitting the Earth: First Utterances and Pluralist Separatism." In Weaver, Womack and Warrior 2006, 1-89.

WEAVER, Jace, Craig S. Womack and Robert Allen Warrior, eds. 2006. *American Indian Literary Nationalism*. Albuquerque: U of New Mexico P.

WELCH, Deborah Sue. 1985. "Zitkala-Ša: An American Indian Leader, 1876-1938." PhD diss., University of Wyoming.

—. 2001. "Gertrude Simmons Bonnin (Zitkala-Ša)/Dakota." In Edmunds 2001, 35-54.

WEXLER, Laura. 1992. "Tender Violence: Literary Eavesdropping, Domestic Fiction, and Educational Reform." In Samuels 1992, 9-38.

WILLARD, William. 1985. "Zitkala-Ša, a Woman Who Would Be Heard!" *Wíčazo Ša Review* 1 (1): 11-16.

—. 1991. "The First Amendment, Anglo-Conformity and American Indian Religious Freedom." *Wíčazo Ša Review* 7 (1): 25-30.

Tadeusz Lewandowski, PhD, is an American academic who has authored *Red Bird, Red Power: The Life and Legacy of Zitkala-Ša* (U of Oklahoma P, 2016) and edited *Zitkala-Ša: Letters, Speeches, and Unpublished Writings 1898-1929* (Brill, 2018). He is an Associate Professor and Head of the Department of American Literature and Culture at the University of Opole, Poland.

Address: Instytut Filologii Angielskiej Uniwersytetu Opolskiego. Pl. Kopernika 11, 45-040, Opole, Poland. Tel.: +48 775415923.

Joy Harjo's Poetics of Memory and Resilience

Carmen García Navarro
Universidad de Almería
mgn024@ual.es

This article examines Joy Harjo's autobiographical memoir *Crazy Brave: A Memoir* (2012), where the author narrates the processes through which she was able to claim her own voice and construct her identity as a woman and as a writer, within a context dominated from her early childhood by violence, fear and silence. Those structural factors, together with the various forms of resilience Harjo developed, which included a variety of creative expressions, would eventually give cohesion to her identity, in a long-term, resilient creative process that involved integrating and then releasing through her writings her experiences of violence. Some poetry works by Harjo are also explored as examples of an alterity resilient to the experience of violence and fear.

Keywords: Joy Harjo; indigenous literature; violence; memoir; poetry; resilience

. . .

La poética de la memoria y la resiliencia en Joy Harjo

Este trabajo estudia el volumen autobiográfico de Joy Harjo *Crazy Brave: A Memoir* (2012), donde la autora narra los procesos mediante los cuales ha podido reclamar su propia voz y construir su identidad como mujer y escritora, en un contexto dominado desde su infancia por la violencia, el miedo y el silencio. Estos factores estructurales, junto con las formas de resiliencia desarrolladas por Harjo, que incluyen varios canales de expresión artística, darían, con el tiempo, cohesión a su identidad a través de un proceso creativo resiliente consistente en integrar y liberar dichas experiencias de violencia a través de su obra escrita. Se ofrecen también ejemplos de su obra poética como muestras de una alteridad resiliente frente a las experiencias de la violencia y el miedo.

Palabras clave: Joy Harjo; literatura indígena; violencia; memorias; poesía; resiliencia

I release you, my beautiful and terrible
fear. I release you. You were my beloved
and hated twin, but now, I don't know you
as myself. I release you with all the
pain I would know at the death of
my children. (Harjo [1983] 2008, 71)

The quotation chosen to begin this article expresses Joy Harjo's need to relinquish her subjection to the fear caused by the violence that she suffered in her childhood and youth. My perspective seeks to explore Harjo's autobiographical memoir, as well as some of her poetry, as creative resources in her claiming of her own voice and constructing of her identity as both a woman and a writer within a context where violence coexisted with fear and silence. To address this, I will refer to *Crazy Brave: A Memoir* ([2012] 2013) and to part of her poetic work, mainly *She Had Some Horses* ([1983] 2008) and *Conflict Resolutions for Holy Beings* (2015). For this purpose, *Crazy Brave: A Memoir* represents a vantage point (Mithlo 2009, 5) from which Harjo surveys the rich, meaningful intersections of her identities as a woman, an artist and a Native American. As regards the two poetry collections, they are, respectively, the starting point of her public recognition and the latest development in her artistically coherent poetic trajectory. I discuss some of the distinctive features of that trajectory in order to contribute to a better understanding of Harjo's work, which is well-known in the United States and other American regions, but not so much in Spain, where, as far as I am aware, it has scarcely been studied to date.[1]

This article assumes that the need to retrieve one's traumatic past (Herman 1992) can become a strategy to initiate a transformative healing process that gives way to a poetics where a claim to life is expressed in the story to be told (Morrison 2013). The process relies on personal, family and collective history, giving the individual the opportunity for personal and cultural legitimation (Ricoeur 1999). Under such an interpretation, the experience of violence in Harjo's early life provides an initial foothold for her to integrate this part of her life cycle by using it as a literary subject. My hypothesis is that Harjo's life and writings reveal an open wound, and that this wound allows her to develop cohesive attitudes towards herself as a woman and as a writer, as well as towards the rest of the community (Butler 2006, 51-52).

Resilience is understood as the ability to cope with traumatic events by exercising the possibility of giving meaning to situations that are painful for the individual and emerging strengthened from the process. Both Boris Cyrulnik (2006) and

---

[1]   In the academic years 2016-2017 and 2017-2018, I included Harjo's work in the syllabus of the course "Cultural Studies: Narrative, Identity and Gender," which I taught as part of the Master's Degree in English Studies, Professional Applications and Intercultural Communication at the University of Almería. Àngels Carabí pioneered academic interest in Harjo's work in Spain with "Joy Harjo," published in *Belles Lettres* in 1994 and cited in Burk (2014, 92).

Michael Ungar (2008) emphasize the role that discourse plays in the development of resilience when they state that by reconstructing traumatic life events and situations through narrative, individuals are capable of making sense out of them. From a socioconstructivist perspective, Ungar claims that through the narration of their personal story people can access broader referents as part of a process of reconstruction of the meaning of both their experiences of adversity and their own identity.

In this connection, Adrienne Rich states that "until we can understand the assumptions in which we are drenched we cannot know ourselves," to which she adds that "this drive to self-knowledge, for woman, is more than a search for identity: it is part of her refusal of the self-destructiveness of male dominated society" (1980, 15). Indeed, the desire to constitute herself as a subject has been a constant endeavor for Harjo. Her self-recognition as such began to take shape through some painful early memories and was articulated around an ongoing search process aimed at making them visible. If an individual's degree of awareness of the past is related to how they experience and perceive their encounter with the Other (Levinas 1979; Rich 1980; Ungar 2008), in Harjo's case her encounters with the male Other seem particularly significant. In general terms, my central argument is that Harjo makes use of strategies of resilience so as to foster emancipation, agency and community building. Her persistent struggle to affirm her long-suppressed personal experience and subjectivity, to locate it within a hybrid cultural and historical tradition and to share it with the public, combined with her commitment to literature and to human freedom, give meaning to her artistic trajectory (Andrews 2011, 90; Burk 2014, 83; Paul 2011, 331). They also emerge from her desire to come together with others and publicly show what can no longer be hidden by silence (Miano 2016, 81).

As Cyrulnik (2006) suggests, the sequence of events experienced by a person, traumatic as they might be, does not necessarily imply a fixed endpoint; individuals can overcome trauma by transforming pain into narratives of fortitude. From an early age, Harjo has felt a powerful longing to constitute herself as a political and cultural subject on the basis of a commitment to being faithful to the past by looking at the shadowy areas of personal memory in the face (Ricoeur 1999). Furthermore, her awareness of her finitude as a subject has anchored her to the conviction that meaning emerges from bearing witness to both one's personal pain and the pain of being human (Villacañas Berlanga 1999, 235). By remembering, Harjo allows the process of healing to grow (Paul 2011). She acknowledges her past because it enables her to shape her present. For Harjo, accepting and eventually transforming her past pain shares the mythical characteristics of a metamorphosis process, whose value resides in the fact that the pain no longer dominates the present (Villacañas Berlanga 1999, 250). This is a pivotal aspect, since it makes it possible for the individual—Harjo, in this case—to not be conditioned by traumatic experiences throughout their life, but rather cultivate values and attitudes that reach beyond the consequences of trauma (LaCapra 2001; Ungar 2008).

1. Memory and Fear: From Personal to Literary Subject

Harjo was born in Tulsa, Oklahoma, in 1951, of Mvskoke (Creek) descent. She lives between Hawaii and Knoxville, Tennessee, and is a Professor of Creative Writing at the University of Tennessee. In addition to the two collections of poetry mentioned above, she has also written *The Last Song* (1975), *What Moon Drove Me to This?* (1979), *Secrets from the Center of the World* (1989), *Fishing* (1992), *The Woman Who Fell from the Sky* (1994), *A Map to the Next World: Poems and Tales* (2000), *Wings of Night Sky, Wings of Morning Light*, a one-woman play performed in Los Angeles by the author during 2009, and two books of stories, *The Good Luck Cat* (2000) and *For a Girl Becoming* (2009), which result from her interest in transmitting elements of the Native American culture to children and young people. In fact, the latter two publications are not intended as simply light-hearted fun, but are also informative and didactic. As an editor, Harjo, together with Gloria Bird, has published *Reinventing the Enemy's Language: Contemporary Native Women's Writing of North America* (1997) and, with Rita Dove, *Truth to Power: Writers Respond to the Rhetoric of Hate and Fear* (2017). In 2005 she was a guest editor for issue 95 of *Ploughshares*, a journal for new writing based at Emerson College, Boston, and in 2014 she was the editor of *Silent Anatomies* by Monica Ong, winner of the Kore Press First Book Award for Poetry. Harjo's interviews are collected in a volume edited by Laura Coltelli, *The Spiral of Memory: Interviews with Joy Harjo* (1996), and a second volume, *Soul Talk, Soul Language: Conversations with Joy Harjo*, was authored by Harjo and Tanaya Winder, with a foreword by Coltelli (2011).[2] Harjo is also a composer and saxophone player and has released five CDs.[3] Her work has garnered public awards, including the William Carlos Williams Award from the Poetry Society of America, the Pen Literary Award for *Crazy Brave: A Memoir*, the Academy of American Poets Wallace Stevens Award, the Guggenheim Fellowship, the American Indian Distinguished Achievement in the Arts and the Ruth Lilly Award for Poetry. She is also the author of an active website and her new collection of poems, *An American Sunrise*, will be published in the fall of 2019.[4]

As Susmita Paul says, memory, for Harjo, is part of a vital movement of healing and survival (2011, 333). Chelsea Burk speaks of Harjo's "poetics of survivance" (2014, 83). According to Jennifer Browdy de Hernandez, in Harjo's autobiography present, past and future come together, giving agency to singular representations of history and the self as understood by the Native American tradition (1994, 40). Harjo has indeed spoken about memory on many different occasions (1975, 1983, 1990, 1994, 2012, 2015), although she has not always given it the same degree of reliability as a point of reference from which to offer security (Storey 2004), as may be seen in the poem

---

[2] When reissued in the United States and Italy in 2011, the latter included some new prose texts and articles. Professor Coltelli is the Italian translator of Harjo's work and the promoter of her visit to the 12th Chiassoletteraria: Festival Internazionale di Letteratura on May 7, 2017. See http://chiassoletteraria.ch.

[3] The first album, *Letter from the End of the World*, was the joint work of Harjo and her band Poetic Justice. As a composer and solo performer, Harjo has also released *Native Joy for Real*, *She Had Some Horses*, *Winding through the Milky Way*, *Red Dreams: A Trial beyond Tears* and *Weaving the Strands*.

[4] See http://www.joyharjo.com.

"Forever":

> In the night of memory
> There is a mist
> […]
> Where does it go, this forever?
> Once I was broken by time.
> […]
> I stood in the emptiness of memory. (Harjo 2015, 86)

The rhetorical question points to the blurred part of memory which precludes the possibility of discerning the beginning and end of an elusive "forever" lost in the "mist" of time as it wonders about a past rooted in individual history and entangled within collective memory (Lebow 1996; Nixon 2006; Paul 2011). The word "mist" is, plausibly, an allusion to the opening lines of *Crazy Brave: A Memoir* ([2012] 2013), where Harjo describes her first memory: a scene where she and her parents are in her father's car listening to some jazz music on the radio. For Harjo, her "rite of passage into the world of humanity" (18) came through "that birth of sound [for which] I grieved my parents' failings, my own life, which I saw stretching the length of that rhapsody" (17-18).[5] This memory is linked to Harjo's perception of her vulnerability as a child and as a member of a tribe from whom she learnt about collective humiliation, which she felt as "something larger than the memory of a dispossessed people" (Harjo 1990). In addition to other psychological effects, one of the prevailing consequences of long-term contact with violence is fear, which Harjo herself has reported was omnipresent in her childhood ([2012] 2013, 30, 53). The topic is mentioned in her texts, including her latest collection, *Conflict Resolutions for Holy Beings* (2015), where the persona assumes that the universal pain of all human beings is embedded in "a wild dilemma, how to make it to the stars, on a highway slicked with fear" (13). In response, the reader is urged to keep fear at bay: "Do not feed the monsters / They feed on your attention, and feast on your fear" (70). But by the time Harjo's poetic voice had reached this stage, more than three decades had elapsed since 1983, when she first made her stance visible in *She Had Some Horses*. This collection includes "Call It Fear" and "I Give You Back," two poems where, as discussed below, the persona is determined to appropriate her life, an aim for which resilience is shown to be a fundamental tool for survival, agency and further restorative personal processes.[6]

Harjo's contact with fear can be traced back to the behaviour of her violent father, himself a victim in a social setting where he was treated "like an Indian man in lands

---

[5] The legacy of the Native Americans being dispossessed of their lands, languages and cultures connects with Harjo's appreciation for music and its importance in the making of history, individual and collective (Castor 2012, 52). For further information on Harjo's music, see Andrews (2011).

[6] According to Paul, in *She Had Some Horses* Harjo goes beyond tribal/personal memory and instead "create[s] an open forum" that encourages *all* readers to participate (2011, 336). Following Paul's idea, such a forum would allow people to (re)tell poetry and stories across cultures, thus promoting the intercultural exchange of experiences.

that were stolen away along with everything else" (Harjo [2012] 2013, 53). Unleashed on both Harjo's mother and herself (32, 51, 53), the genealogical presence of violence on her paternal side made Harjo aware of her own growing rejection of that behaviour, although many more years would elapse before she became free of its consequences. The desire for personal recognition would lead Harjo to lay claim to herself as a person and later as a writer away from her degraded family environment and to experience a gradual transformation by developing her writing and musical skills. When her parents divorced, her mother married a white man with a permanent job, who seemed to ensure social recognition for an Indian woman with four children. However, as a result of psychological abuse from this alcoholic man, Harjo became entangled in another web of fear, to the point of having physical symptoms such as being unable to fall asleep and staying on "sentry all night" (59). Her defencelessness led her to believe that there was no escape from the abuses: "My mother confided that there was no way we could leave" (59). Abuse was also manifest in a poignant way through Harjo's subjugation into literal silence when her stepfather forbade her to sing, play an instrument or attend theatre classes (138). In Harjo's view, however, "silence is a creative possibility, even as it can be a space of shutting down" (Harjo and Winder 2011, 56). Harjo's stepfather sought to thwart all attempts on her and her mother's part to become liberated from violence, as might have occurred if the family had been offered any institutional support. As Harjo recalls, "in those times there were no domestic abuse shelters. If either my mother or I had been brave enough to report him, the authorities would have accepted his Word over ours because he was an employed White man [...] he would have been given tacit permission to keep us in line" ([2012] 2013, 60; capitals in the original). As Marcela Lagarde de los Ríos writes, an awareness of being part of a dispossessed group connects with the need to retrieve the expropriated personal value and self-recognition which, for Native American women, has been historically devalued, thwarted and violated, both privately and publicly (2012, 366).

2. Transforming One's Story

Fear, then, became Harjo's starting point to transform her life history, which she did by turning the reconstruction of her identity into her literary subject matter. In the early work *She Had Some Horses*, the turmoils of her life are voiced through poems such as "Call it Fear," mentioned above: "Call it an ocean of fear of the dark. Or / name it with other songs" ([1983] 2008, 29). The lyrical voice cannot find the exact word (Moncada 2016), but assumes the existence of a fear that, despite its resistance to being properly named, puts individuals on "[the] Edge" (29). Harjo's awareness of living in this liminal space is made clear in *Crazy Brave* (2012 [2013]), a memoir made up of stories, again personal and collective, where we learn that at the age of sixteen, Harjo enrolled in the American Institute of Indigenous Art of Santa Fe, New Mexico, with the support of her mother, who recognised her daughter's artistic abilities. But the end

of the school period was forced upon young Harjo when she became pregnant with her first child. She was not prepared to return to her dysfunctional, violence-ridden family, which led her to take shelter in the home of her child's father, her first husband. Harjo's story has points in common with those of many other women who have had violence inflicted on them. It is, in this sense, a pain tinged with the pain of others, sadly a profound pain, because it has been perpetuated over time (Lagarde de los Ríos 2012). The diachronic, culturally-embedded repetition of abuse affected Harjo again in her early twenties while she was studying Creative Writing at the University of New Mexico, Albuquerque, and, once more, it was as a result of alcoholism, this time that of her second husband (Harjo [2012] 2013, 143). Harjo was in a constant state of panic at the prospect of possible attacks to her and her children (156).

As Michel Manciaux explains (2003), the influence of the socio-cultural context is often as vital as the individual's capacity to choose how to position themselves in adverse situations. For Harjo, the need to move away from the violent atmosphere, first in her stepfather's home and then in her own, helped her make the decision to take her children with her and look for a more dignified way of life, plausibly the only way out given the state she had reached regarding poor physical health, sleeping problems, overall fatigue and anxiety and inability to resume her music practice since her stepfather's ban on it ([2012] 2013, 155-59). She also had a desire to express her pain and an increasing urge to align herself with those who suffered in the same way as she did: "This was when I began to write poetry" (153). This came after a period of extreme panic and increasing awareness of the wreckage of her life. In her first book, *The Last Song* (1975), where a parallelism is made between the mother and the wife in terms of life situations where a woman may be pushed onto the edge, the very text became the medium for negotiating a new relationship between herself and the past: "I became the healer, I became the patient, and I became the poem" ([2012] 2013, 153). Thus, in "Conversations between Here and Home", the poetic voice is embodied in a woman abused by her husband who expresses the need to look after her ill child and concludes by extending her gaze toward other women:

> angry women […] building
> houses of stones.
> They are grinding the mortar
> between straw-thin teeth
> and broken families. ([1975] 2004, 11)

As Rayna Green points out in *Native American Women: A Contextual Bibliography* (1983, 14), beyond bearing witness to pain and violence, taking action is a major concern for Native American women who face countless difficulties in a historical and cultural context that excludes and at the same time appropriates indigenous cultures, values and identities (quoted in Mithlo 2009, 13). The latter, as noted above, comes

with a long-standing violence specifically addressed against Native women (Ramirez 2007, 28). In the poem, armed to the teeth, chattering in fear or perhaps in rage, the women protect themselves as subjects who know that their family structure has irretrievably broken due to violence and terror.

3. Releasing Fear through Resilient Contexts: Education, Poetry, Community

What has been said above points to the fact that for Harjo the periods of hardship she experienced helped her forge one part of her subjectivity as a woman. Rather than isolate herself, she sought support in trusted people in institutions such as the University. She also managed to find a job, which enabled her to earn a living and not to be dependent on her second husband (Harjo [2012] 2013, 137). She then committed herself to finishing her university degree, a need she felt as keenly as her urge to write. By becoming involved in an academic environment, Harjo was able to gain visibility for her work as she participated in group discussions and literary debates. In this period, her poems included references to her origin, to members of her Mvskoke family and to the landscapes, animals, myths and stories that constitute her cultural background, what she calls "my tribe" ([2012] 2013, 137).[7] Moreover, in *She Had Some Horses* she leaves behind the role of sufferer and moves towards that of agent. Some poems depict women living far from the promised happiness of an institution such as marriage. For example, "The Woman Hanging from the Thirteenth Floor Window" describes a woman hanging from the moulding of a window on the verge of committing suicide,

> Her mother's daughter and her father's son.
> She is several pieces between the two husbands
> she has had. She is all the women of the apartment
> building who stand watching her, watching themselves. ([1983] 2008, 13)

Paul subscribes to Lang's idea of there being open possibilities for the woman in the poem, given that she thinks of falling but also, a few lines later, of climbing back through the window, which could be interpreted as her rallying against her despair (2011, 334). The persona is again both the witness and the reporter of a scene where family and community bonds are highlighted at the same time as a decision of no little importance is on the verge of being made. My emphasis, though, is on the way the woman's private tragedy is taken to the public arena so that it confronts the observer and the reader, as when she gazes upon other women who are victims themselves:

---

[7] Also of interest is Lang's (1993) discussion on the American city as trope in Harjo's work. For other references to the American city in Harjo, see Bonilla Maldonado (2011).

> She sees other
> women hanging from many-floored windows
> counting their lives in the palms of their hands
> and in the palms of their children's hands. (13)

The focus on the collective appears again in "I Give You Back," where the speaker refers to the decision of getting rid of fear after having suffered at the hands of private and public perpetrators:

> I give you back to the soldiers
> who burned down my home, beheaded my children,
> raped and sodomized my brothers and sisters,
> I give you back to those who stole the
> food from our plates when we were starving. ([1983] 2008, 50)

The speaker's own suffering, seen from the viewpoint of her innermost experience, is present in the poem, but it reaches out towards the suffering experienced by Native Americans at the hands of the colonizer, as also observed by Paul (2011, 334), Eloisa Valenzuela-Mendoza (2014, 80-81) and Manel Msalmi (2015, 23). The argument of the speaker encompasses a transition from the private to the public. For Sally Hanna, the poem is "an exorcism of an enemy […] to release […] the atrocities committed in the name of fear" (2014, 18).

Taking into consideration Ungar's notion of the importance of context when it comes to providing the resources we require from infancy (2008), I would suggest that the practice of poetry as part of her formal education seems to have led Harjo to turn her creative energy into an impulse to transform her eventful, complex life trajectory into verse. The educational environment enabled Harjo to place herself within an academic context and poetry was a tool to take hold of the complexity of her life and try to make meaning out of it. As Spanish philosopher María Zambrano puts it in *Filosofía y poesía* (1987), "la poesía es, en realidad, la palabra puesta al servicio de la embriaguez," a kind of intoxication whereby mental control is relinquished in favour of intuition and the word, the vehicle of reason, is used instead "para […] hacer de ella la sombra del delirio" (quoted in Janés 2010, 56-57).[8] Pouring herself into her academic interests and her texts, Harjo, an ardent finder of meanings, paradoxically seeks the order of her life through the delirium of poetry. Writing was, therefore, a means for her to display her intelligence instead of hiding what would otherwise have remained trapped inside her. This involved translating loss into a lifelong commitment to resolving her old battle with fear, as shown in "I take myself back, fear. / You are not my shadow any longer" ([1983] 2008, 72).

---

[8] "Poetry is, in fact, putting the word at the service of intoxication" and "to make of it the shadow of delirium" (my translation).

Having lived in a family structure where she was at significant social risk, combined with her ethnic origin, compelled Harjo to take an increasingly active role in seeking to build an educational, cultural and artistic solidarity project: "During that period my house became the safe house for many of my Indian women friends whose husbands and boyfriends were beating them. […] After the children were put down to sleep, we sat in a circle and told our stories" ([2012] 2013, 157-58). My suggestion is that this eventually led her to reconsider her role as a student, a woman, a mother and a writer. These encounters also paved the way for the blossoming of her artistic potential by allowing her to engage in reflective and productive activities and showcase her skills in ways that would transform her into an agent of her own educational, cultural, economic and social progress. Crucially, this was facilitated by Harjo's experience as a student, which meant that she could use the resources provided by her educational institution to promote both learning and community building. Thus, the mediation endeavor relied on two resources: the poetic word and Harjo's empathy for her Native American peers, who, at the same time, were supporting her access to greater empowerment as an individual and as a citizen.

It was at this point that *In Mad Love and War* saw the light of day, in 1990. Most of the poems in this collection reaffirmed the features that, since *The Last Song*, had shaped Harjo's poetics, with their focus on the value of memory and the experiences that make up subjectivity, including the enemy's historical presence, as exemplified in "The Real Revolution is Love":

> I argue with Roberto on the slicked-tiled patio
> where houseplants as big as elms sway in a samba
> breeze at four or five in the Managua morning
> after too many yerbabuenas and as many shots of
> golden rum. And watch Pedro follow Diane up
> her brown arm, over the shoulder of her cool dress,
> the valleys of her neck to the place inside her
> ear where he isn't speaking revolution
> […]
> Roberto tries to persuade me. I flight my way
> through the cloud of rum and laughter; through lines
> of Spanish […]
> I do what I want, and take my revolution to bed with
> me, alone. And awake in a story told by my ancestors
> when they speak a version of the very beginning,
> of how so long ago we climbed the backbone of these
> tortuous Americas. ([1990] 2004, 75)

The resistant voice of the poem connects the personal with the public once more, providing evidence not only of Harjo's political commitment but also of her gusto for evoking sensuality by using a language dense in perceptions and filled with evocative images (plants swaying as if dancing, Diane's neck like a valley) of a universe open to reflection on individual experiences, such as the erotic relationship with the Other and with oneself. In the poem, the observation of this relationship privileges the woman's feelings and responses ("I flight my way") and the verbal richness conveys a defence of life against daily exploitation and death, the erotic experience standing as a statement of resistance as regards the pain suffered by others, her "ancestors," in "these tortuous Americas." The latter refers, once again, to the violence historically perpetrated by the enemy towards Native American communities and, as Jennifer Andrews writes, it is also an instance of the "imaginative possibilities that one may find" in Harjo's poetry "through a combination of knowledge and empathy" (2011, 93, 95). To my mind, Harjo puts forward the conviction that it is only by confronting the past and taking charge of the suffering of fellow human beings that one can fully achieve and exercise personal and artistic freedom. Harjo's relationship with her social and cultural environment underpins a poetics "that takes charge of the present" (González 2013, 20) through a constant entaglement between her story and History (Cixous [1987] 1997, 98). The body is viewed here as a space for the inscription and reinscription of meaning. Once a place of trauma, in Harjo's poetry the body is gradually rewritten via what the I feels when admiring the beauty of the place, of the Other—and via the possibilities of finding itself through those glimpses of a humanity that is not irrevocably immersed in trauma (Buzzatti and Salvo 2001, 11). Her poetry encompasses silence and suffering, but is also a tapestry woven out of the pleasure of watching and feeling.

In the above example, the game of seduction is also a power game and an agreement made by the voice of the female I with herself: she observes but decides not to participate. Her gaze focuses on aspects that affirm the position and perception of the female I in the world ("I [...] take my revolution to bed with me/alone"). This is a woman who is not interested in compartimentalizing the richness of her identity—she sees, watches, feels, decides and takes responsibility for her own choices and the path they lead to. Harjo's writing reasserts her voice and, in so doing, reaches out towards the political. Specifically, by reclaiming the gaze of the female I, Harjo affirms a conviction of equality with the other gender, albeit without overlooking the differences. Overall, in Harjo's verse the search for cultural belonging is informed by an attempt to strike a balance between personal desire and public purpose, a balance that is manifested in "The Real Revolution is Love" through her resistance to the male protagonist's attempt to persuade her and her decision to take revolution to bed with her instead. Revolution in the poem is linked to the rejection of the requirement to fit within any publicly and socially accepted roles and alliances. This is why Harjo's writing can be called feminist, as it advocates the need for women to actively take up a position in life, dismissing any

qualms about adopting decisions consciously and freely, regardless of social pressure to conform.

The importance for women to take a personal stance with a social and political reach is also a central theme in the prose poem "Transformations" ([1990] 2004):

> This poem is a letter to tell you that I have smelled the hatred you have tried to find me with. […] This poem could be a bear treading the far northern tundra, smelling the air for sweet alive meat. Or a piece of seaweed stumbling in the sea. Or a blackbird laughing. What I mean is that hatred can be turned into something else if you have the right words, the right meanings, buried in that tender place in your heart where the most precious animals live. (84)

The beginning of the poem is an equation turned into text, where biography, memory and subjectivity are intertwined to describe the work of a woman who bears the mark of history in her body.[9] Like *She Had Some Horses*, and foregrounding as evidence the atrocities perpetrated on native American Indian people (Miranda 2007, 183), "Transformations" calls into question the western, colonial, capitalist, androcentric social and cultural model that benefits the dominant male position and often ignores and disregards the female voice. And yet, as may be seen in poems such as "Conversations Between Here and Home," "The Woman Hanging from the Thirteenth Floor Window," "I Give You Back," "The Real Revolution is Love" or "Transformations" itself, there are no traces of self-indulgence in Harjo's work. Instead, her awareness of being part of a dispossessed group is yoked to a constant insistence on resistance, recovery and survival as a woman and as a Native American, and as an individual and a member of a wider community. Tellingly, her next collection, *The Woman Who Fell from the Sky* (1994), opens with the prose poem "Reconciliation, a Prayer," where a protective divine being is invoked to ask for strength in facing the events of life: "Keep us from giving / up in this land of nightmares which is also the land of miracles" ([1994] 2004, 89). Later in the book, the poem "Perhaps the World Ends Here" resumes the idea of human understanding made possible through apparently small, yet fundamental, acts of sharing, such as "[…] the kitchen table, while we are laughing / and crying, eating of the last sweet bite" ([1994] 2004, 124).

More recent work shows Harjo's poetry expanding towards a commitment to environmental issues. In "When the World as We Knew It Ended", the poet expresses faith in the possibility of progress, both in the real and spiritual realms, and proclaims her decision to write the present:

> And then it was over, this world we had grown to love
> for its sweet grasses, for the many-colored horses

---

[9] Harjo has said that her light skin can permit her to pass as white, which makes her feel that sometimes she is not seen as a Mvskoke (Andrews 2011, 93).

[…], for the shimmering possibilities
[…]
But then there were the seeds to plant and the babies
who needed milk and comforting, and someone
picked up a guitar or ukulele from the rubble
and began to sing about the light flutter,
the kick beneath the skin of the earth
we felt there, beneath us

a warm animal
a song being born between the legs of her;
a poem. (2004, 199-200)

Once again, instead of licking her wounds Harjo opts for care and the power of creation. In this sense, she shares with other indigenous American writers a commitment to letting their creative mind flourish, "bes[ándolas] en el desgarro de la garganta" (Paredes Pinda 2009, 107-11).[10] In other words, her work forms part of a transnational corpus of indigenous feminist texts and practices that addresses the helplessness felt by American Native peoples, but also the struggles to recover their dignity and direct their efforts to the common good.[11]

4. Conclusions

When Harjo decided to publish *Crazy Brave* as an autobiographical memoir in 2012, she was sixty-one years old and had gained recognition both in the United States and, partly, in Europe. Interestingly, she did not expressly talk about fear as a poetic resource which acts as a cohesive theme in her writing. In my view, her purpose was to write about the events that had been decisive in her life as if they were snaphots shared with her readers. Further, she shows the network of individuals who have been influential in her life experience and instrumental as regards the way in which she conceives her work, which has been shaped by three essential factors: the traces of a given past, an unfailing determination to first resist and then integrate the shock of violence and fear and a firm resolution to sustain her vocation as a writer.

This article will hopefully help to increase recognition for the writing of an artist who investigates the fundamental areas in her life by following the trail of her memory as well as the memory of her ancestors, thus widening its scope to include her fellow human beings. In its variety and versatility, Harjo's work comes together like a choir of

---

[10] "Kiss[ing them] on their throat's tear" (my translation). See Chilean Mapuche poet Adriana Paredes Pinda's poem "Lifwen" (Falabella et al. 2009, 107-11).

[11] See Yi-Chun Tricia Lin (2016) and Susan Watkins (2018) for further discussion of (indigenous) transnational feminisms.

voices with a common purpose, joined in solidarity to share their truth, learnt through years of shared political, cultural and social events. Her texts raise questions about personal suffering resulting from her recognition of herself as a dweller of pain, an experience lived both as an individual and also as part of a community. She finds a way to unfold herself and open up to others by bringing communal concerns into her poetry, such as crimes perpetrated within the family or the consequences of collective forced displacement and dispossession. By revisiting memories of suffering experienced both as a child and as a young woman, Harjo's texts distil the resilience that, in turn, resulted in the articulation of a unique artistic work that makes a major contribution to the stories written by women—and perhaps, ultimately, to Herstory.

Harjo articulates the conviction that, beyond pain, self-supporting creative processes can play a crucial role as resilience-producing resources to interrogate mechanisms of dispossession for women. As a writer, she uses her biographical experiences, opening up avenues where she recognises and releases her suffering by relying on and, at the same time, reinforcing her resilience, fed at various points in her life when her boundaries were pushed to their limits. By recognising the value of what she has to say and finding channels through which a common language can travel, the poet urges us to be aware of the fact that it is ultimately possible to realise that we are, like the poetic text itself, "part of a continuum in which there is no separation of form or being" ([2012] 2013, 159). The act of rebellion featured in Harjo's poetics is an act of confrontation and survival, through intelligence and choice, made possible by the sheer capacity for resilience that inhabits the individual. By constructing her identities as a woman, a writer and an artist on the basis of a firm commitment to the fundamental importance of her formal education, Harjo's work aims to overturn a patriarchal and colonial order.

In this connection, it is worth stressing that Harjo has sought to engage in relationships with women who are politically committed to nondiscrimination and social justice. These objectives become a literary subject-matter in her work, where her choice to never hide the relevance of supporting figures, be they her mother, her sisters or her masters and companions, is part of a practice that refuses to legitimate oppressive discourses. Harjo's poetic word brings readers in touch with the value of moving towards change. Her work is the legacy of a woman that has embraced change throughout a life trajectory shaped by the recognition of the importance and value of resilience in order to (re)construct one's identity by creating new meaning for facts and feelings. Her poetry's ethics and politics make room for a personal poetic melody that rises to be shared with the rest of the people. By establishing a solid identity for herself through her poetry, Harjo gives visibility to Native American people and their culture and extends an alert, compassionate gaze to the human condition.

WORKS CITED

ANDREU, Cristina and Pere Gallardo, eds. 2004. *Culture and Power: Phobias*. Tarragona: Silva.

ANDREWS, Jennifer. 2011. *In the Belly of a Laughing God: Humour and Irony in Native Women's Poetry*. Toronto: U of Toronto P.

BELSEY, Catherine and Jane Moore, eds. 1997. *The Feminist Reader: Essays in Gender and the Politics of Literary Criticism*. 2nd ed. Basingstoke and New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

BLANCO, Nieves, ed. 2001. *Educar en femenino y en masculino*. Madrid: Universidad Internacional de Andalucía/Akal.

BONILLA MALDONADO, Daniel. 2011. "Indígenas urbanos y derechos culturales: los límites del multiculturalismo liberal." *Revista Direito GV* 7 (2): 569-604.

BROWDY DE HERNANDEZ, Jennifer. 1994. "Writing (for) Survival: Continuity and Change in Four Contemporary Native American Women's Autobiographies." *Wíčazo Ša Review* 10 (2): 40-62.

BURK, Chelsea D. 2014. "'We are alive': (Mis)Reading Joy Harjo's Noni Daylight as a Yellow Woman." *Iowa Journal of Cultural Studies* 16: 82-100.

BUTLER, Judith. 2006. *Vida precaria. El poder del duelo y la violencia*. Translated by Fermín Rodríguez. Buenos Aires: Paidós.

BUZZATTI, Gabriella and Anna Salvo. 2001. *El cuerpo-palabra de las mujeres. Los vínculos ocultos entre el cuerpo y los afectos*. Translated by Marco Aurelio Galmarini. Madrid: Cátedra.

CABALLERO ESNAOLA, Zulma. 2013. "Experiencias de la infancia en situaciones difíciles: interpretación y escritura en la frontera escolar." In Contreras and Pérez de Lara 2013, 175-87.

CARABÍ, Àngels. 1994. "Joy Harjo." *Belles Lettres* 9 (4): 46-50.

CASTOR, Laura. 2012. "'Making Songs of the Marrow': Joy Harjo's Music and Traditional Knowledge." *American Studies in Scandinavia* 44 (2): 51-73.

CIXOUS, Hélène. (1987) 1997. "Sorties: Out and Out: Attacks/Ways Out/Forays." In Belsey and Moore 1997, 91-103.

COLTELLI, Laura, ed. 1996. *The Spiral of Memory: Interviews with Joy Harjo*. Ann Arbor: The U of Michigan P.

—. 2011. "A Carrier of Memory," foreword to *Soul Talk, Soul Language: Conversations with Joy Harjo*, by Joy Harjo and Tanaya Winder, ix-xv. Middletown, CT: Wesleyan UP.

CONTRERAS, José and Núria Pérez de Lara, eds. 2013. *Investigar la experiencia educativa*. Madrid: Morata.

CORTÉS RODAS, Francisco and Alfonso Monsalve Solórzan, eds. 1999. *Multiculturalismo. Los derechos de las minorías culturales*. Murcia: Diego Marín.

Cyrulnik, Boris. 2006. "La resiliencia en el curso de las interacciones precoces: la adquisición de los recursos internos." In Cyrulnik 2006, 33-54.

—, ed. 2006. *La resiliencia. Desvictimizar a la víctima*. 2nd ed. Cali: Feriva and Ceic-Rafue.

Falabella, Soledad, Graciela Huinao and Roxana Miranda Rupailaf, eds. 2009. *Hilando en la memoria. Epu rupa*. Santiago de Chile: Cuarto Propio.

González Fernández, Helena. 2013. "¿Cómo enganchan ellas de la nación? Sobre la poesía épica a comienzos del siglo XXI." *452º F. Revista electrónica de teoría de la literatura y literatura comparada* 8: 13-27.

Hanna, Sally. 2014. "War, Death and What Remains in the Poetry of Joy Harjo." *Athens Journal of Philology* 1 (1): 9-21.

Harjo, Joy. (1975) 2004. *The Last Song*. In Harjo 2004, 3-12.

—. (1983) 2008. *She Had Some Horses*. New York: Norton.

—. (1990) 2004. *In Mad Love and War*. In Harjo 2004, 65-86.

—. (1994) 2004. *The Woman Who Fell from the Sky*. In Harjo 2004, 89-124.

—. 2004. *How We Became Human: New and Selected Poems 1975-2001*. New York: Norton.

—. (2012) 2013. *Crazy Brave: A Memoir*. New York: Norton.

—. 2015. *Conflict Resolution for Holy Beings*. New York: Norton.

Harjo, Joy and Tanaya Winder. 2011. *Soul Talk, Song Language: Conversations with Joy Harjo*. Middletown, CT: Wesleyan UP.

Herman, Judith. 1992. *Trauma and Recovery*. New York: Basic.

Huebert, David. 2018. "The Equine Erotopoetics of Linda Hogan and Joy Harjo." *Isle* 25 (1): 169-85.

Janés, Clara. 2010. *María Zambrano. Desde la sombra llameante*. Madrid: Siruela.

LaCapra, Dominick. 2001. *Writing History, Writing Trauma*. Baltimore, MD and London: Johns Hopkins UP.

Lagarde de los Ríos, Marcela. 2012. *El feminismo en mi vida. Hitos, claves y topías*. Ciudad de México: Instituto de las Mujeres del Gobiero Federal de México.

Lang, Nancy. 1993. "'Twin Gods Bending Over': Joy Harjo and Poetic Memory." *MELUS: Multi-Ethnic Literature of the United States* 18 (3): 41-49.

Lebow, Diane. 1996. "Curriculum Transformations in Community Colleges: Focus on Introductory Courses." *Women's Studies Quarterly* 24 (3-4): 187-200.

Levinas, Emmanuel. 1979. *Totality and Infinity: An Essay on Exteriority*. Translated by Alphonso Lingis. 2nd ed. The Hague/Boston, MA/London and Pittsburgh, PA: Martinus Nijhoff and Duquesne UP.

Lin, Yi-Chun Tricia. 2016. "An Introduction: Indigenous Feminisms: Why Transnational? Why Now?" *Lectora* 22: 9-12.

Liebenberg, Linda and Michael Ungar, eds. 2008. *Resilience in Action: Working with Youth across Cultures and Contexts*. Toronto: U of Toronto P.

LÓPEZ CARRETERO, Asunción. 2001. "La experiencia de saber en femenino." In Blanco 2001, 111-30.

LUONGO, Gilda. 2005. "Contrapunto para cuatro voces. Emergencias privadas/urgencias públicas en la escritura de mujeres." *Signos* 38 (57): 111-22.

MANCIAUX, Michel and Jacques Leconte. 2003. "Maltrato y resiliencia." In Manciaux 2003, 113-20.

MANCIAUX, Michel, comp. 2003. *La resiliencia. Resistir y rehacerse*. Translated by Fernando González del Campo Román. Barcelona: Gedisa.

MAZUON, Olivia. 2016. *Joy Harjo, Native American Poet: A Selective Annotated Bibliography of Dissertations and Theses*. Scotts Valley, CA: CreateSpace Independent Publishing Platform.

McCOY, Kathleen. 2016. "Sacred Sister: The Voice and Vision of Joy Harjo." *The Real McCoy* (blog), March 25. [Accessed online on August 13, 2018].

MIANO, Léonora. 2016. *Vivir en la frontera*. Madrid: Los Libros de la Catarata.

MIRANDA, Deborah. 2007. "Teaching on Stolen Ground." In Sinor and Kaufman 2007, 169-87.

MITHLO, Nancy Marie. 2009. "'A Real Feminine Journey': Locating Indigenous Feminisms in the Arts." *Meridians* 9 (2): 1-30.

MONCADA, Alicia. 2016. "Cuando nuestras ancestras hablan: genealogías de mujeres indígenas y saberes del Paülujutu'u." *Otras voces en educación*, August 31. [Accessed online on August 13, 2018].

MORRISON, Toni. 2013. "Ahora son los afroamericanos los que mandan en la cultura de EEUU." *El País*, January 19. [Accessed online on May 22, 2017].

MSALMI, Manel. 2015. *Material Ecocriticism in Joy Harjo and Gary Snyder's Selected Poems*. Saarbrücken: Lambert.

NIXON, Angelique V. 2006. "Poem and Tale as Double Helix in Joy Harjo's *A Map to the Next World*." *Studies in American Indian Literatures* 18 (1): 1-21.

PAREDES PINDA, Adriana. 2009. "Lifwen." In Falabella, Huinao and Rupailaf 2009, 107-11.

PAUL, Susmita. 2011. "Memory: The 'Spiral' in the Poetry of Joy Harjo." *Rupkatha Journal on Interdisciplinary Studies in Humanities* 3 (2): 330-38.

RAMIREZ, Renya. 2007. "Race, Tribal Nation, and Gender. A Native Feminist Approach to Belonging." *Meridians* 7 (2): 22-40.

RICOEUR, Paul. 1999. *La lectura del tiempo pasado. Memoria y olvido*. Translated by Gabriel Aranzueque. Madrid: Universidad Autónoma de Madrid.

SINOR, Jennifer and Rona Kaufman, eds. 2007. *Placing the Academy: Essays on Landscape, Work and Identity*. Logan: Utah State UP.

STOREY, John. 2004. "Memory and Identity: 'Roots' or 'Routes'?" In Andreu and Gallardo 2004, 261-71.

UNGAR, Michael. 2008. "Putting Resilience into Action. Five Principles for Intervention." In Liebenberg and Ungar, 17-36.

VALENZUELA-MENDOZA, Eloisa. 2014. "'Tending to the Past': The Historical Poetics of Joy Harjo and Natasha Trethewey." PhD diss., University of Iowa. [Accessed online on August 14, 2018].

VILLACAÑAS BERLANGA, José Luis. 1999. "Mito y alteridad. El mito del hombre autóctono y su autotrascendencia." In Cortés Rodas and Monsalve Solórzano 1999, 235-56.

WATKINS, Susan. 2018. "¿Qué feminismos?" *New Left Review* 109: 7-87.

Carmen García Navarro (PhD Granada, 2001) teaches at the University of Almería. Her research interests focus on twentieth-century women's narratives, trauma, resilience and education.

Address: Universidad de Almería, Facultad de Humanidades, Departamento de Filología. Carretera de Sacramento, s/n. 04720 La Cañada de San Urbano, Almería, Spain. Tel.: +34 950214450.

Beyond the Latina Boom:
New Directions within the Field of US Latina Literature

Macarena García-Avello
Universidad de Cantabria
gavellom@unican.es

This article aims to identify a lesser-known generation of female writers that has given a new direction to US Latina literature in the twenty-first century. Beyond the significance of the Latina boom that marked the 1980s and 1990s, the latest generation differs from their predecessors in important ways, amounting to a paradigm shift in US Latina literature that needs to be thoroughly explored. To carry out this task, I have selected three canonical Latina boom novels: Sandra Cisneros's *The House on Mango Street* (1984), Julia Álvarez's *How the García Girls Lost Their Accents* (1991) and Cristina García's *Dreaming in Cuban* (1992). These texts will be contrasted with Angie Cruz's *Soledad* (2001), Achy Obejas's *Days of Awe* (2001) and Felicia Luna Lemus's *Trace Elements of Random Tea Parties* (2004). My contention is that while the US Latina literary boom might have sought synthesis or the creation of a third space, associated with Gloria Anzaldúa's *consciousness of the borderlands*, these twenty-first century female writers offer representations of nonnormative sexualities that take indeterminacy and ambiguity to a limit that defies all resolution.

Keywords: US Latina literature; Latina boom; borderlands; new generation; nonnormative sexualities

. . .

Más allá del *boom* latino:
nuevas direcciones en el campo de la literatura latina estadounidense

Este artículo pretende identificar una generación de autoras, aún poco conocidas, que ha promovido una nueva corriente dentro del campo de la literatura latina estadounidense del siglo XXI. Más allá de la relevancia del *boom* latino de la década de los ochenta y noventa, esta nueva generación difiere de sus precesoras en importantes aspectos, evidenciando así un

cambio de paradigma que se examinará a lo largo de este artículo. Para ello, se analizarán tres de las novelas canónicas del *boom*: *The House on Mango Street* (1984) de Sandra Cisneros, *How the García Girls Lost Their Accents* (1991) de Julia Álvarez y *Dreaming in Cuban* (1992) de Cristina García. Estos textos se contrastarán con *Soledad* (2001) de Angie Cruz, *Days of Awe* (2001) de Achy Obejas y *Trace Elements of Random Tea Parties* (2004) de Felicia Luna Lemus. La tesis de la que parto es que mientras las autoras del *boom* crean una síntesis o un tercer espacio asociado a *la conciencia de la frontera* de Gloria Anzaldúa, la generación más reciente de escritoras ofrece representaciones de sexualidades no normativas que ahondan en la ambigüedad impidiendo toda resolución.

Palabras clave: literatura latina estadounidense; *boom* latino; la frontera; nueva generación; sexualidades no normativas

In *Redreaming America* (2005), Debra Castillo refers to the increasing visibility of Latinos/as in the 1980s and 1990s as a *Latin boom* in popular culture and literary studies. She specifically highlights the contributions of US Latina writers like Julia Álvarez, Sandra Cisneros, Cristina García and Esmeralda Santiago to the emergence of a literary boom that became particularly successful at creating a discursive space for the construction of subjectivities that had previously been silenced. Beyond the significance of the US Latina literary boom that marked the 1980s and 1990s, this article aims to identify a group of lesser-known female writers that have given a new direction to US Latina literature in the twenty-first century. Therefore, my research explores a major shift in US Latina literature that distinguishes the canonical authors from a new generation of writers whose work remains largely unknown. To carry out this task, I have selected three canonical Latina boom novels: Cisneros's *The House on Mango Street* (1984), Álvarez's *How the García Girls Lost Their Accents* (1991) and García's *Dreaming in Cuban* (1992). These will be contrasted with the twenty-first century texts *Soledad* (2001), by Angie Cruz, *Days of Awe* (2001), by Achy Obejas, and *Trace Elements of Random Tea Parties* (2004), by Felicia Luna Lemus.

In *Feminism on the Border: Chicana Gender Politics and Literature* (2000), Sonia Saldívar-Hull examines the different ways in which cross-border feminists challenge the power dynamics that exert material and discursive pressures on Latina subjectivities. Taking this into account, I will argue that the three Latina boom novels mentioned in the preceding paragraph can be studied within the theoretical framework that Gloria Anzaldúa establishes in *Borderlands/La frontera: The New Mestiza* (1987). I will start, therefore, by offering an overview of Anzaldúa's epistemology and how the literary texts of the Latina boom can be read through such a lens. I will then turn to an analysis of the selected twenty-first century works in order to illustrate how they differ from their predecessors. While Anzaldúa remains a major influence, the latest generation of writers focuses specifically on her contribution to queer theory rather than her concepts of the "new mestiza" or the "consciousness of the borderlands" (1987, 77). My contention is that while the US Latina literary boom might have sought synthesis or resolution through the creation of the third space associated with Anzaldúa's consciousness of the borderlands, these twenty-first century female writers offer representations of nonnormative sexualities that take indeterminacy and ambiguity to a limit that defies all resolution.

Anzaldúa understands the borderlands not only as a geographical space dividing Mexico and the United States, but as a metaphor for the *interstices* where multiple cultures, languages and worlds collide. *Mestizas* are left stranded in-between, facing several forms of oppression as women and as members of a minority group. In other words, discrimination against them comes from the dominant culture, as well as from their own ethnic group, which turns them, according to Ana Castillo, into "countryless women" (1995, 40). Anzaldúa refers to the plight of the mestiza when she describes her as "petrified, she can't respond, her face caught between *los intersticios*, the spaces

between the different worlds she inhabits" (1987, 20; italics in the original). As a result, life in the borderlands is fraught with tension, ambivalence and contradictions, thus becoming—in Anzaldúa's words—"a struggle of flesh, a struggle of borders, an inner war" (1987, 21). Anzaldúa not only denounces the predicament of the mestiza but, more importantly, she displays how her anxiety and oppression can be confronted and endured through the creation of a discursive space that embraces the conflicts and ambiguities of living in-between: "living in a state of psychic unrest, in a Borderland, is what makes poets write and artists create [...]. When I write it feels like I'm carving bone. It feels like I'm creating my own face, my own heart—a Nahuatl concept. My soul makes itself through the creative act" (1987, 73).

The borderlands becomes a space of negotiation, or as Rafael Pérez-Torres defines it in *Mestizaje: Critical Uses of Race in Chicano Culture*, an "interstitial space where differential politics and social dilemmas are negotiated" (2006, 4). For Anzaldúa, this negotiation takes place at a discursive level. More specifically, she regards writing as an inclusive and transformative process that allows the mestiza to come to terms with the unceasing struggle that life in the borderlands entails—"it is this learning to live with *la Coatlicue* that transforms living in the Borderlands from a nightmare to a numinous experience. It is always a path/state to something else" (Anzaldúa 1987, 73; italics in the original).[1] That something else is the consciousness of the borderlands or new mestiza, a new subjectivity that is the outcome of a writing process that turns the ambivalence and ambiguities of the interstices into sources of creativity. Through her writing, Anzaldúa articulates a transnational space where identity categories and labels are contested, deconstructed and discursively reappropriated. In this sense, the borderlands resemble Homi Bhabha's notion of the interstices as a space where dominant narratives can be contested and deconstructed, particularly those pertaining to heteropatriarchy:[2] "It is in the emergence of the interstices—the overlap and displacement of domains of difference—that the intersubjective and collective experiences of nationness, community interest, or cultural value are negotiated" (1994, 2).

Subjectivities in Cisneros's *The House on Mango Street*, Álvarez's *How the García Girls Lost Their Accents* and García's *Dreaming in Cuban* are formed through a narrative process that entails the search for a place of enunciation that corresponds to Anzaldúa's consciousness of the borderlands. In fact, the consciousness of the borderlands recurs throughout these novels as the protagonists create a transnational discursive space where narratives of the female self are deconstructed and re/constructed in different terms. In what follows, I will argue that despite the Latina boom writers' diverse backgrounds and the numerous differences between their work, the depiction of the narrative process of subject formation in the novels of Cisneros, Álvarez and García follows a pattern that includes three stages: thesis, antithesis and synthesis. The thesis

---

[1] Anzaldúa correlates the creative process to the Aztec goddess Coatlicue.
[2] Jacqui Alexander defines heteropatriarchy as "the twin processes of heterosexualization and patriarchy" (2005, 65).

refers to an adolescent protagonist confronted with two cultures comprised of different languages and apparently opposing worlds. The antithesis places the protagonists amidst two worlds that exert multiple forms of oppression; Denise Segura and Jennifer Pierce argue that this situation is common to most Chicanos/as, as they "come to maturity as members of a racial and ethnic minority in a social and historical context in which their political, economic, and cultural uniqueness is constantly undermined, denigrated, and violated" (1993, 70). While the antithesis delves into the discrimination and alienation experienced, the synthesis occurs once the main characters come to terms and learn to cope with these conflicts by constructing narratives in the form of writings and paintings. Thus, the fact that the struggle is inscribed through their art opens up a space for constructing an alternative self that resembles Anzaldúa's "new mestiza" (1987, 77).

Cisneros's *The House on Mango Street* presents the coming of age of Esperanza Cordero, a Chicana teenager growing up in a Latino neighbourhood in Chicago. The novel displays throughout its numerous vignettes the development of a female subject that does not conform to the notion of the lone, self-sufficient individual, but whose identity is regarded as "inflected by race, class, culture, but especially and above all, by space" (Estill 1994, 40). Indeed, Cisneros reflects on the meaning of womanhood within that particular context taking into account the parameters identified by Adriana Estill, to which sex and sexuality should be added. The house, referred to as "the house I belong but do not belong to" (Cisneros [1984] 1991, 109-10), becomes the symbol of Esperanza's alienation at the same time as acting as a dividing line separating the private self from the public world represented by the Latino neighbourhood. Furthermore, the process of Esperanza's maturing is represented in connection with the community of women living in the neighbourhood, which offers an alternative version of the bildungsroman and the subjectivity associated with it. Cisneros's stress on the community rather than the individual suggests that the self is necessarily dependent on others. Thus, Mango Street, along with the people and stories that inhabit it, cannot be separated from the construction of Esperanza's subjectivity.

Throughout the novel, Esperanza longs for "a house quiet as snow, a space for myself to go, clean as paper before the poem" (Cisneros [1984] 1991, 108), far away from Mango Street. However, her coming of age culminates with the realisation that leaving her neighbourhood behind is not an option. *Las comadres*, the three magical sisters, tell her at the end of the novel: "when you leave you must remember to come back for the others. A circle, understand? You will always be Esperanza. You will always be Mango Street. You can't erase what you know: You can't forget who you are" ([1984] 1991, 105). By the end of the novel, the protagonist understands that she cannot turn her back on her roots. Furthermore, writing allows her to come to terms with and revise the traumatic experiences that she has both witnessed and experienced, incorporating them as part of a narrative that projects healing and transformative effects. Esperanza negotiates with the oppressive circumstances she faces as a Chicana

teenager through a narrative that provides her with a channel to create a subjectivity that incorporates ambivalence and turns it into a source of creativity: "I put it down on paper and then the ghost does not ache so much. I write it down and Mango says goodbye sometimes. She [Mango Street] does not hold me with both arms. She sets me free" (Cisneros [1984] 1991, 110). While Esperanza imagines other futures for the women of the neighbourhood, she cannot conceive of herself, or her writing, as separate from Mango Street. The fact that for Esperanza the prospect of a better future is dependent on her writing evokes the potentiality of narratives to transcend the oppressive circumstances faced by Latinas.

Cisneros herself explains in an interview that when she was in college, she became aware of how her different background constituted a powerful source of inspiration, as it rendered possible the representation of subjectivities and experiences that had never made their way into fiction: "I knew I was a Mexican woman. But, I didn't think it had anything to do with why I felt so much imbalance in my life, whereas it had everything to do with it! My race, my gender, and my class! And it didn't make sense until that moment [...]. That's when I decided I would write about something my classmates couldn't write about" (Doyle 2010, 65). Not only did Cisneros's positioning or, more specifically, her difference, provide her with a genuine insight, but it also gave her a responsibility towards a community of Chicana women whose experiences had been traditionally overlooked. This realisation encouraged her to conceive fiction as a means to open up new spaces for the deployment of voices emanating from the borderlands.

The search for a discursive space associated with the borderlands is also represented in Álvarez's novels. *How the García Girls Lost Their Accents* focuses on the García sisters' feelings of displacement after their family flees the Dominican Republic due to their father's participation in a coup d'état against Trujillo and joins their cousins, who are already living in the United States.[3] The novel deals with the conflicts inherent in the process of adjusting and accommodating to Anglo-American culture experienced by Yolanda, the narrator, who describes the different ways in which she and her sisters negotiate between the two worlds. The novel exposes the set of norms and behaviours that are considered desirable for women of her privileged social class in the Dominican Republic, but from the very beginning Yolanda is described as incapable of fashioning her gender identity according to this ideal of femininity. When she is back in her native country, she sees herself through the eyes of her Dominican cousins: "Yolanda sees herself as they will, shabby in a black cotton skirt and jersey top, sandals on her feet, her wild black hair held back with a hairband. Like a missionary, her cousins will say, like one of those Peace Corps girls" (1991, 4). Yolanda's feelings of inadequacy underpin a sense of alienation that persists in the United States. Instead of assimilating into the dominant culture, through her writing Yolanda is able to find a discursive space in the interstices where dominant narratives from both nations are interrogated

---

[3] The Dominican Republic was ruled by the dictator Leónidas Trujillo from 1930 to 1961.

and deconstructed. Furthermore, *How the García Girls Lost Their Accents* demonstrates that identity categories like gender, sexuality, class, nationality or race acquire different meanings in the Dominican Republic and the United States.

Moving from one country to another implies a transposition in the categories and value systems conforming reality. Álvarez's fiction emphasises a shift in identity categories between the Dominican Republic and the United States that leads her to define the sisters as "translocal subjects" according to the following definition: "translocality describes the way in which displacement makes class, gender, sexuality, nationality and racial classifications continuously fluctuate. It also challenges the neatly defined boundaries of national, ethnic/racial, or class cultures by proposing a view that takes into consideration their transformations amidst shifting contexts" (Santos-Febres 1992, 26). While the García sisters belong to the privileged class on the island, their arrival in New York means a loss in social status. The same happens with race; while in the Dominican Republic they were at the top of the racial hierarchy, in the United States they become Latinas, that is, members of an ethnic minority. This deconstructs essentialist discourses on race and gender or, in other words, "this shift in classification itself reveals the relativity of social groupings, thereby reinforcing their fictive nature. If two countries can construct these categories differently [...] we must consider how these categories are socially rather than biologically created or natural" (Gaffney 2003, 19). Through her characters, Álvarez reflects on the confluence of discourses and material conditions that act on the body, regarded as a codified materiality represented through language, which indicates how language is used as a means to deconstruct only to later re/construct on a different basis. While the novel seems to confirm Sidonie Smith's claim that "the body is our most material site of potential homelessness" (1993, 267), writing provides a discursive space in which other forms of subjectivity can be imagined and articulated.

García's *Dreaming in Cuban* follows three generations of del Pino women: Celia, who stays in Cuba, her daughter Lourdes, determined to assimilate into the Anglo-American culture she now lives in, and Pilar, the granddaughter positioned amidst these opposing forces. The novel tackles the various problems faced by each generation, casting light on the intricate web weaving together nation, gender and sexuality. Celia spends her final years supporting Fidel Castro's dictatorship, driven by a nationalist fervour that is fused with her adoration of the leader after her husband's death: "ten years or twenty, whatever she has left, she will devote to El Líder, give herself to his revolution. Now that Jorge is dead, she will volunteer for every project—vaccination campaigns, tutoring, the microbrigades" (García 1993a, 44). The fact that Celia even replaces her dead husband's portrait with one of Castro suggests that her duty as a widow is to remain loyal to the symbolic father of the nation. The following quotation evinces how loyalty to the political regime is equated with a kind of self-surrender: "she imagines that El Líder is watching her, whispering in her ear with his warm cigar breath. She would gladly do anything he asked" (García 1993a, 112).

Taking this into account, it is not surprising that Celia regards her daughter's exodus to the United States as a betrayal of revolutionary values. Lourdes's rejection of her Cuban past is largely due to the violence and rape perpetrated against her by a soldier back on the island. Thus, Lourdes conceives of her migration to the United States as a means of leaving her traumatic past behind in her homeland: "immigration has redefined her [...] she welcomes her adopted language, its possibilities for reinvention [...]. She wants no part of Cuba" (García 1993a, 73). Nevertheless, the aftermath of this rupture gives rise to an inflated American patriotism and an excessively high libido, as well as a staggering voracity. Instead of working through the violence inherent in the sexual assault and subsequent migration, the repression of Lourdes's trauma triggers the pathological responses enacted by her body: "her appetite for sex and baked goods increased dramatically. [...] Lourdes did not battle her cravings; rather she submitted to them like a somnambulist to a dream. [...] Lourdes was reaching through Rufino [her husband] for something he could not give her, she wasn't sure what" (García 1993a, 21).

While Celia and Lourdes take seemingly irreconcilable positions, the assumption of their respective nationalist discourses and the gender roles associated with them contributes to their subordination. Pilar, on the other hand, becomes the only character who, pitted against these two opposing forces, manages to interrogate and dismantle these discourses: "even though I've been living in Brooklyn all my life, it doesn't feel like home to me. I'm not sure Cuba is, but I want to find out. If I could only see Abuela Celia again, I'd know where I belonged" (García 1993, 50). Even though Pilar is educated according to the American values professed by her mother, the telepathic communication she shares with her grandmother connects her with her Cuban roots. Her position in-between these conflicting influences generates numerous clashes and feelings of alienation that find expression through her art. When she is asked about the mutilated bodies that pervade her drawings, she thinks: "what could I say? That my mother is driving me crazy? That I miss my grandmother and wish I'd never left Cuba? That I want to be a famous artist someday? [...]. Painting is its own language, I wanted to tell him. Translations just confuse it, dilute it, like words going from Spanish to English" (García 1993a, 59). Thus the displacement and distress resulting from her double heritage is transposed to her paintings, which become the channel or language through which she creates a bicultural self that embraces the contradictions and ambiguities of living in-between two worlds, in what Anzaldúa calls the borderlands.

This in-betweeness is associated with the place of enunciation shared by the author herself. García confirms this when she explains in an interview, "those of us who kind of straddle both cultures are in a unique position to tell our family stories. We're still very close to the immigration, and yet we weren't as directly affected by it [...]. So we are truly bilingual, truly bicultural" (García 1993b, 612). In the novel, Pilar is in charge of inscribing the family past through art and drawing becomes the means to represent memory in a process that entails the transformation of her own subjectivity. Her paintings mirror the crafting of a self that, far from assuming the nationalist discourses

transmitted by either Celia or Lourdes, opts for the reconciliation of seemingly opposing worldviews. As Andrea O'Reilly argues in "Women and the Revolution in García's *Dreaming in Cuban*", through Pilar, García privileges painting over writing as a way to disclose the self and its past: "although Pilar transforms and reinscribes both herstory and History—in other words, her artwork is not unmediated by her own personal biases or, for that matter, by social or cultural specificity—nevertheless the language of painting is for her a more universal and, therefore, less 'corrupt' mode of communication and interpretation" (1997, 89).

This critical overview of Cisneros's, Álvarez's and García's novels indicates that in spite of their numerous differences, there is a shared preoccupation with the multiple forms of discrimination suffered by Latina women. But far from simply denouncing this oppression, the representation of the material and discursive circumstances surrounding the protagonists demonstrates that alternative possibilities, along with alternative selves, can be imagined and projected through the construction of narratives. The novels can be taken as examples of what happens when, following Ana Castillo's statement, "we refuse learned associations, dualisms" (1995, 170), namely, "we may begin to introduce unimaginable images and concepts into our poetics" (1995, 170). The protagonists create a space of enunciation placed in the borderlands between two worlds with different ideologies and languages, which in Pilar's case involves embracing bilingualism and biculturalism through their writings and paintings. These narratives provide them with the tools to transform their destinies while revising and redefining their subjectivities. The three novels conclude once the protagonists have articulated a subjectivity that can be identified with Anzaldúa's consciousness of the borderlands or new mestiza. Like Anzaldúa's new mestiza, the narrators have succeeded in "developing a tolerance for contradictions, a tolerance for ambiguity [...]. Not only [do they] sustain contradictions, [they] turn the ambivalence into something else" (1987, 101).

Moving on to the three lesser-known twenty-first-century works selected for discussion in this article, they resemble the Latina boom novels as regards the way they transcend the borders of the nation. However, the new generation of writers problematises the creation of a third space where tension and ambivalence can be embraced. More specifically, the representation of nonnormative sexualities throughout their novels foregrounds an indeterminacy that leaves conflicts unsolved. The analysis that follows highlights an interplay between alternative sexualities and feelings of dislocation that connects with Anzaldúa's identification of queers as those who do not belong: "we are the queer groups, the people that don't belong anywhere, not in the dominant world nor completely within our own respective culture. [...] the overwhelming oppression is the collective fact that we do not fit, and because we do not fit we are a threat" (2009, 50).

Cruz's *Soledad* tells the story of a nineteen-year-old Nuyorican girl who returns to her family home in Washington Heights when her mum Olivia falls into a deep depression causing her to lose her ability to speak. This silence sets in motion a search

that prompts Soledad to look into her mother's life at the same time as her return means she must confront the ghosts of her own past. Her narrative unveils a childhood fraught with domestic violence and abuses from her stepfather, along with the spiral of exclusion and lack of opportunities that condition the lives of girls belonging to her social and racial group. Throughout the novel, Soledad criticises the compulsory heteronormativity that she holds accountable for her oppression and that of other women around her. In addition, Soledad's ongoing clashes with her mother and her Dominican roots are represented as a dialectical struggle between her drive to move forward and leave behind this environment and the affective bonds that link her with her genealogical past. Like the Latina boom novels, *Soledad* explores the contrasts between the first and second generation. But unlike them, Cruz's novel fails to reach a synthesis, opting instead to complicate the narrative resolution. Soledad befriends Carmel, a Chicana whose discourse can be compared to Esperanza, Pilar and Yolanda's efforts to create a third space—for example, when she urges Soledad "to start our own thing, make our own rules, where the sky is the limit. A place where our mamis can come and visit and not feel like they don't belong" (Cruz 2001, 57). However, at the end of the novel Soledad has not managed to forge this place; instead of reaching a synthesis, the narrative ends with the revelation that Soledad was sexually abused, which calls into question the Latina boom approach to narratives as transforming and healing processes through which an alternate subjectivity can be conceived.

Moreover, Soledad's rejection of heteronormativity is misunderstood by her own family, who regard it as an attempt to assimilate into Anglo-American culture, and hence as some sort of betrayal of her heritage. On several occasions she is accused of behaving as "a blanquita [...] a sellout, a wannabe white girl" (Cruz 2001, 3). This echoes Cherríe Moraga's observation that the Chicana "who defies her roles as subservient to her husband, father, brother, or son by taking control of her own sexual destiny is purported to be a 'traitor to her race' [...] even if the defiant woman is not a lesbian" (1983, 113). In *Soledad*, the multiple conflicts emanating from the protagonist's gender and sexuality remain unsolved, leading to an open, uncertain ending that refuses to show her overcoming obstacles once and for all.

This pattern is echoed in the representation of Soledad's mother, Olivia, whose life is characterised as an obstacle race, due in part to the heteropatriarchy that perpetuates inequality and leaves her without any prospects. As a teenager, Olivia managed to run away from an unwanted arranged marriage and move to Santo Domingo with the help of a Swedish photographer: "if she hadn't escaped she would have had to marry that man [...] leaving home seemed like the better option [...] all she wanted, to be on her own. He [the Swedish man] said all she needed to do was look beautiful. With her green eyes, she would have no problem at all" (Cruz 2001, 47). However, this apparent liberation becomes a mere mirage once she finds herself forced to work as a prostitute. Her luck, though, seems to change when she marries Manolo, an American citizen who takes her to the United States. But far from offering any real prospect of building a better

future for herself, this turns out to be a sentence to a life of domestic confinement and abuse. The representation of Olivia's past suggests a notion of agency that is necessarily understood as an ongoing process that cannot be accomplished once and for all. This approach can be related to Donette Francis's view of female agency, defined not as "a fixed destination at which one arrives with the act being forever completed" but, rather, as "a continuous series of maneouvers to be enacted and reenacted" (2011, 60). In other words, Olivia is left with continuous acts of resistance that need to be reenacted within the context of the power relations that traverse the novel.

Unlike the discursive subjectivities identified in the Latina boom novels, the self in *Soledad* is conceived as a performance that needs to be permanently reiterated. Thus, Cruz represents an endless series of ongoing resistances that forecloses the creation of a consciousness of the borderlands. This kind of practice of subject formation resembles Chela Sandoval's "differential mode of oppositional consciousness," defined as "a tactical subjectivity with the capacity to recenter depending upon the kinds of oppression to be confronted" (2000, 14). Furthermore, it should be noted that Olivia's past is narrated indirectly through the pieces that the protagonist has been able to gather, and as Soledad delves into her mother's past, new interrogations emerge, transforming her quest into an endless struggle that ultimately eschews any possible closure. This implies that the novel ends with the conviction that every attempt to answer one question can only lead to new doubts, leaving the mystery surrounding Soledad's present and her mother's past unsolved.

Lemus's *Trace Elements of Random Tea Parties* also examines the generational conflict of a queer Chicana, Leti, whose life fluctuates between two opposing forces: that of her grandmother Nana, responsible for the transmission of traditional Mexican values, and the urban setting of Los Angeles, along with its queer community. Leti's story revolves around a dilemma that confronts her crafting of a queer self and the influence exerted by Nana, who has raised her in accordance with the conventions, norms and traditions prevailing in Mexican-American culture, with particular emphasis on the transmission of the dominant ideology of gender. In an attempt to find her own space within the queer community of Los Angeles, Leti moves out of her grandma's house, but she soon realises that the impact of her Mexican upbringing is inexorable. In spite of her relocation, the narrator reflects on how "the apartment I had rented […] I was beginning to realize was a futile attempt to outrun my Weeping Woman and Nana" (Lemus 2004, 9). The allusion to the archetype of the Weeping Woman, *La Llorona* in Mexican folklore, highlights Leti's failure to run away from the gender ideology instilled in her by her grandmother.

The numerous descriptions of Nana teaching Leti how to dress, wear her hair and act during her childhood evince the intergenerational transmission of attitudes, roles and behaviours that lead to the formation of gender expression. As a consequence, Leti's defiance of the binary gender system primarily occurs through the way gender is performed, specifically through external codes like clothes. On several occasions, Leti's

clothing choices cause an effect termed "layering" by Judith Halberstam in *Female Masculinity* (1998, 3), which refers to the overlapping of masculine and feminine symbols as a way to prove that sex and gender are not necessarily aligned. In these cases, the main role of clothes is not to conceal, but to delve into and exploit the confusion. By dressing in a masculine way, Leti does not aim to look like a man, but to carry out a subversive parody that exposes gender as a construction that, as such, can be deconstructed and re-constructed in different ways. In Halberstam's words, "if masculinity is not the social and cultural and indeed political expression of maleness, then what is it? [...]. Far from being an imitation of maleness, female masculinity actually affords us a glimpse of how masculinity is constructed as masculinity" (1998, 1). Instead of two antagonistic forms of masculine and feminine gender that align with the corresponding sex, Leti disrupts the binary classification of sex and gender by identifying herself as dyke, queer, femme, boy, boy-girl or even princess depending on the situation. Furthermore, within the context of nonheteronormative relationships, Leti alternates her adoption and reproduction of the gender roles that correspond to the prototype of masculinity with qualities and codes attributed to the feminine.

In sum, the conception of gender underlying the novel can best be understood in the light of Judith Butler's definition of gender as "performance," that is, "the repeated stylization of the body, a set of repeated acts within a highly rigid regulatory frame that congeal over time to produce the appearance of substance, of a natural sort of being" (1990, 33). This representation of gender rejects the existence of a fixed identity underlying the different acts that configure gender expression. Instead of opposing the gender system, the protagonist of Lemus's novel subverts it from within by blurring the lines that organise sex and gender into two distinct and disconnected spheres of masculinity and femininity. In other words, Leti's subversive repetition of gender roles leads to her identification as a queer subject, understood throughout the text as "a praxis of resistance. Queer in the sense of marking disruption to the violence of normative order" (Tinsley 2008, 199).

The novel thus deconstructs the binary gender system, pointing to a more flexible and inclusive spectrum of gender and sexual identities that have been associated with "genderqueer practices" (Wilchins 2002, 53) in the context of transnational cultural formations. In the following extract, Leti describes herself as being in the process of opening up new unexplored paths that defy the norms imposed by the dominant discourses of gender:

> I'd seen signs at intersections that read 'Diagonal Crossing Allowed.' Those signs fascinated me. See, even when diagonal crossing is permitted, I've noticed that the vast majority of people walk lines perpendicular to the well-traveled roads. Why? Fuck if I know. What I did know was that my life depended on me crossing the street diagonally, sometimes in a winding circular pattern for that matter. (Lemus 2004, 169)

The challenging of normative notions of masculinity and femininity is symbolised by the diagonals and circles, which resonate with the oblique, nonlinear, nonnormative paths defined by Mikko Tuhkanen and Elizabeth McCallum as lacking "proper orientation in terms of time as much as of social norms" (2011, 7). Anzaldúa also reflects on the limiting effects of linguistic terms which simplify sexual complexity and confine it to a few labels: "what I object to about the words 'lesbian' and 'homosexual' is that they are terms with iron-cast molds […]. A mestiza colored queer person is bodily shoved by both the heterosexual world and by White gays into the 'lesbian' or 'homosexual' mold whether she fits or not. La persona está situada dentro de la idea en vez de al revés" (Anzaldúa 1991, 165-66).

Against the narrator's efforts to transcend the persistent gender binaries, the novel foregrounds the endless obstacles that inhibit the lives of queer subjects. In particular, Lemus highlights society's failure to see beyond the conventional classification of gender and sex into two opposing poles, to the extent that those who do not conform to normative gender roles are viewed as inviable subjects. Seen in this way, gender is not a matter of choice, but rather, as Butler explains, it consists of "the forcible citation of a norm, one whose complex historicity is indissociable from relations of discipline, regulation, punishment" (1993, 232). As a result of not conforming to the binary gender system, the world that surrounds Leti approaches her with confusion and misunderstanding, especially her Nana, who is incapable of recognising her granddaughter's performances as manifestations of an alternative subjectivity. This is illustrated by Nana's reaction on the night of Thanksgiving, when Leti shows up dressed as a boy: "dear Mother of God. Is that a boy or a girl?" (2004, 167), she asks. The fact that Leti does not fit into the set of social norms and behaviours that are considered acceptable or appropriate within the logic of a heteronormative system makes her illegible to Nana. After the Thanksgiving episode, Nana and Leti have a falling out, which leads to an estrangement that signals both Nana's lack of a conceptual framework for understanding queer subjectivities and Leti's failure to come to terms with her Mexican roots. The problematisation of discursive spaces where queer subjectivities can be fully developed leads Jackie Cuevas in "Imagining Queer Chican@s in the Post-Borderlands" to establish an epistemological distinction between the Chicana tradition of the 1980s, on the one hand, and Lemus, on the other, concluding that in the latter's work, it is "genderqueerness that becomes the next borderlands of Chican@ identity to be crossed, entered, negotiated, constructed, interrogated, and imagined" (2013, n.p.).

This struggle is aggravated at the end of the novel when Nana dies without making peace with her granddaughter, which confirms that Leti has not succeeded in reconciling her queer subjectivity with her Mexican background. Nevertheless, the failure with which the novel concludes should not be read only in negative terms. On the contrary, the fact that other forms of subjectivity are represented and imagined in the novel points towards a more promising future, a time when other ways of being, acting and desiring could be read and included. In this respect, Lemus offers a representation of

queerness that resembles José Esteban Muñoz's association between queerness and the idea of futurity: "queerness is an ideality. Put another way, we are not yet queer. We may never touch queerness, but we can feel it as the warm illumination of a horizon imbued with potentiality. We have never been queer, yet queerness exists for us as an ideality that can be distilled from the past and used to imagine a future. The future is queerness's domain" (2009, 1).

Obejas's *Days of Awe* also explores the irresolution experienced by the narrator, Alejandra San José, a Cuban Jew exiled in the United States as a young girl. Alejandra embarks on an identity search that takes her back to the island only to be confronted by a complete lack of a sense of belonging: "what could be more dramatic than returning to the place of your birth and feeling nothing, absolutely nothing, but the slightest cyber of an echo from a bottomless pit?" (2001, 75). Her critical interrogation of her background prevents her from recognising herself as either Cuban, American or Jewish, enhancing the uncertainty conveyed throughout the novel. Diaspora becomes a symbol of Alejandra's inability to relate to a homeland or a place of origin, exacerbating feelings of absence and loss. In her article "Next Year in the Diaspora: The Uneasy Articulation of Transcultural Positionality in Achy Obejas's *Days of Awe*," Dara Goldman concludes that "the loss is never fully eradicated. Although the protagonist does successfully realize a journey of discovery that leads to more satisfying self-expression, the novel ultimately presents a vision of increased equilibrium and authority within a situation of irrevocable displacement" (2011, 61).

This indeterminacy is mirrored by Alejandra's alternation of masculine and feminine roles within the context of homosexual relationships. The destabilisation of national identity and sexuality are thus inextricably linked through Alejandra's account, which is reminiscent of Ellie Hernández's statement that "gender and sexuality offer more varied responses to the idea of the dissolution of the nation" (2006, 5). In this sense, it is worth noting that Alejandra's urge to adopt masculine roles associated with the stereotypical Cuban lover happens when she becomes involved with an American woman: "She called me her Latin lover [...]. I've never been more Cuban than when I was with her [...]. With Leni [her American girlfriend], I was closer than ever to all the dark peoples for whom I interpreted and to whom I represented a system and established order that I never felt part of. With her, I relinquished my own darkness" (Obejas 2001, 178-79). As in Lemus's novel, gender performances in *Days of Awe* also have subversive effects, as it is the female protagonist who adopts the masculine roles reserved for men within the national discourse on Cubanness. This leads Alejandra to reflect on her feelings of inadequacy at different points in the novel, as is the case when she wonders, "Who am I in all this? I'm a stranger, as out of place as a whale whimpering on the shore, a lute, a hairless native pretending to live free" (Obejas 2001, 192).

In this respect, Alejandra's narrative contradicts Gustavo Pérez-Firmat's thesis in *Life on the Hyphen*, according to which indeterminacy can in fact become a permanent state. Pérez-Firmat identifies three stages that the 1.5 generation of immigrants goes

through until they reach biculturality. The first one is a substitution phase dominated by a nostalgia that encourages them to re-create their homelands in the new country. The second stage is a response to the realisation that the homeland cannot be recovered: "no amount of duplicate landmarks can cover up the fact that you are no longer there and what's more, that you may never return" (Pérez-Firmat 1994, 9). Finally, the impossibility of living in a fantasy or imaginary recreation leads to the reconciliation of certain aspects of the homeland and the destination country, which results in the achievement of biculturality.

Obejas, on the other hand, presents a character who is incapable of reaching this third stage. Unlike Pilar, Yolanda and Esperanza in the Latina boom novels, Alejandra never escapes the uncertainty, nor does she learn to cope with it. She remains in a state of constant struggle, overwhelmed by endless questions and doubts, which is equated in the novel with the image of diaspora. The fact that her father's ashes are scattered at sea at the end of the novel suggests that her father, just like Alejandra herself, is left floating in the ocean, unable to be pinpointed to one particular location. In "Days of Awe and the Jewish Experience of a Cuban Exile: The Case of Achy Obejas," Carolyn Wolfenson states that "a Jew is not the one who returns, seems to say Obejas, but the one who wants to return. Jewish heritage is not land, but a form of desire, and Jewish community is a commonality of desire" (2010, 115). Instead of creating a third space that could be identified with the borderlands, the novel concludes with the narrator's failure to reach a narrative resolution.

This article evinces how the more contemporary novels by Latina writers revolve around some sort of absence or loss that cannot be overcome in the present time. The representations of alternate sexualities in *Soledad*, *Trace Elements of Random Tea Parties* and *Days of Awe* contribute to the proliferation of conflicts that leave the protagonists exposed to alienating circumstances, resulting in the openness that characterises their endings. In the Latina boom texts examined here, on the other hand, while multiple forms of discrimination are also exposed, ultimately the protagonists—Esperanza, the García sisters and Pilar—are shown embracing ambiguity. In Sigrid Wiegel's words, they learn "to voice the contradictions, to see them, to comprehend them, to live in and with them, also learn to gain strength from the rebellion against yesterday and from the anticipation of tomorrow" (1986, 99). The construction of their respective narratives means a present resolution, as it allows the narrators to cope with their reality in a manner that is absent from the work of the latest generation. In their novels, the representation of nonnormative sexualities fosters in the protagonists insurmountable feelings of inadequacy that cause their narratives to end with the same irresolution they began with.

In Cruz's *Soledad*, lack of closure is illustrated by Olivia's frustrated agency, but also by Soledad's failure in putting together the pieces of her own past or that of her mother. In Lemus's *Trace Elements of Random Tea Parties*, the gender fluidity embodied by Leti contrasts with an environment that lacks the conceptual frameworks through

which queer identities can be articulated and comprehended. Nana's confusion represents the unintelligibility that queer subjectivities experience in a world that has not been able to transcend gender binaries. In Obejas's *Days of Awe*, Alejandra stays in the diaspora, identified as an imprecise and misty space. The unresolved conflicts and inconclusive endings of each of these more recent works enhance the openness that leaves their narrators floating in a sea of indeterminacy. While this suspension could be misinterpreted as a present failure, the fact that the underlying conflicts are articulated points towards a horizon, a future that has not been reached, but which has at least been imagined. This resembles Agamben's notion of "the potential," defined in "On Potentiality" as "to be one's own lack, to be in relation to one's own incapacity. Beings that exist in the mode of potentiality are capable of their own impotentiality; and only in this way do they become potential. They can be because they are in relation to their own non-Being. In potentiality, sensation is in relation to anesthesia, knowledge to ignorance, vision to darkness" (1999, 182).

Since the inception of an unrealised future places the post-boom novels within the realm of the potential, their endings can also be related to Hernández's argument in "The Future Perfect: Chicana Feminist Critical Analysis in the Twenty-first Century." Hernández uses the title of one of Tomás Rivera's stories in *…Y no se lo tragó la tierra*, "Cuando lleguemos," to illustrate how Chicana feminisms project towards a perfect future: "when we arrive" signals "orientation toward the political as a future perfect construction, motivated by hope and situated within the realism of present-day politics" (2006, 65). Since in the novels written by Cruz, Lemus and Obejas, the present is imbued with misunderstanding and the failure to create a discursive space where nonnormative selves can be narrated, hope becomes necessarily displaced towards a future time. Therefore, instead of creating the third space identified in Anzaldúa's *Borderlands/La Frontera* (1987), the new generation of lesser-known Latina writers rejects narrative resolution through their representation of alternate sexualities, pointing towards a new horizon of potentiality.[4]

Works Cited

Agamben, Giorgio. 1999. *Potentialities: Collective Essays in Philosophy*. Stanford, CA: Stanford UP.

Alexander, Jacqui. 2005. *Pedagogies of Crossing: Meditations on Feminism, Sexual Politics, Memory, and the Sacred*. London and Durham, NC: Duke UP.

Álvarez, Julia. 1991. *How the García Girls Lost Their Accents*. New York: Wokman.

Anzaldúa, Gloria. 1987. *Borderlands/La Frontera: The New Mestiza*. San Francisco, CA: Aunt Lute Books.

—. 1991. "To(o) Queer the Writer-Loca, escritora y chicana." In Keating 2009, 163-75.

Bhabha, Hommi. 1994. *The Location of Culture*. New York and London: Routledge.

Butler, Judith. 1990. *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity*. New York and London: Routledge.

—. 1993. *Bodies That Matter: On the Discursive Limits of "Sex."* New York and London: Routledge.

Castillo, Ana. 1995. *Massacre of the Dreamers: Essays on Xicanisma*. New York: Penguin.

Castillo, Debra. 2005. *Redreaming America: Toward a Bilingual American Culture*. Albany: SUNY P.

Cisneros, Sandra. (1984) 1991. *The House on Mango Street*. Reprint, New York: Vintage.

Cruz, Angie. 2001. *Soledad*. New York: Simon & Schuster.

Cuevas, Jackie. 2013. "Imagining Queer Chican@s in the Post-Borderlands." *Revue Lisa e-Journal* XI (2). [Accessed online on December 10, 2017].

Doyle, Jacqueline. 1994. "More Room of Her Own: Sandra Cisneros s *The House on Mango Street*." *MELUS: The Journal of the Society for the Study of the Multi-Ethnic Literature of the United States* 19 (4): 5-35.

Ecker, Gisela, ed. 1986. *Feminist Aesthetics*. Boston, MA: Beacon Press.

Estill, Adriana. 1994. "Building the Chicana Body in Sandra Cisneros s *My Wicked Wicked Ways*." *Rocky Mountain Review of Language and Literature* 56: 25-43.

Francis, Donette. 2011. "Novel Insights: Sex Works, Secrets and Depression in Angie Cruz's *Soledad*." In Smith 2011, 53-71.

García, Cristina. 1993a. *Dreaming in Cuban*. New York: Ballantine Books.

—. 1993b. "'… And There is Only Imagination Where Our History Should Be': An Interview with Cristina García." By Iraida López. *Michigan Quarterly Review* 33 (3): 605-17.

Gaffney, Karen. 2003. "Julia Álvarez, Yo!" In Quintana 2003, 15-23.

Goldman, Dara. 2011. "Next Year in the Diaspora: The Uneasy Articulation of Transcultural Positionality in Achy Obejas's *Days of Awe*." *Arizona Journal of Hispanic Cultural Studies* 8: 59-74.

Halberstam, Judith. 1998. *Female Masculinity*. London and Durham, NC: Duke UP.

Hernández, Ellie. 2006. "The Future Perfect: Chicana Feminist Critical Analysis in the Twenty-First Century." *Chicana/Latina Studies: The Journal of Mujeres Activas en Letras* 5 (2): 59-91.

—. 2009. *Postnationalism in Chicana/o Literature and Culture*. Austin: U of Texas P.

Keating, Anne, ed. 2009. *The Gloria Anzaldúa Reader*. London and Durham, NC: Duke UP.

Lemus, Felicia Luna. 2004. *Trace Elements of Random Tea Parties*. Berkeley, CA: Seal Press.

McCallum, Elizabeth and Mikko Tuhkanen. 2011. *Queer Times, Queer Becomings*. Albany: SUNY P.

Moraga, Cherrie. 1983. *Loving in the War Years: lo que nunca pasó por sus labios*. Boston, MA: South End Press.

Muñoz, José Esteban. 2009. *Cruising Utopia: The Then and There of Queer Futurity*. New York and London: New York UP.

Nestle, Joan, Clare Howell and Riki Anne Wilchins, eds. 2002. *GenderQueer: Voices from Beyond the Sexual Binary*. New York: Alyson Books.

Obejas, Achy. 2001. *Days of Awe*. New York: Ballantine Books.

O Reilly, Andrea. 1997. "Women and the Revolution in García's *Dreaming in Cuban*." *Modern Language Studies* 27 (3): 69-91.

Pérez-Firmat, Gustavo. 1994. *Life on the Hyphen: The Cuban-American Way*. Austin: U of Texas P.

Pérez-Rosario, Vanesa, ed. 2010. *Hispanic Caribbean Literature of Migration: Narratives of Displacement*. Basingstoke and New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Pérez-Torres, Rafael. 2006. *Mestizaje: Critical Uses of Race in Chicano Culture*. Minneapolis: U of Minnesota P.

Quintana, Alvina, ed. 2003. *Reading US Latina Writers: Remapping American Literature*. Basingstoke and New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Rivera, Tomás. 2012. *...Y no se lo tragó la tierra*. Houston: Arte Público Press.

Saldívar-Hull, Sonia. 2000. *Feminism on the Border: Chicana Gender Politics and Literature*. Berkeley: U of California P.

Sandoval, Chela. 2000. *Methodology of the Oppressed*. Minneapolis: U of Minnesota P.

Santos-Febres, Mayra. 1992. *The Translocal Papers: Gender and Nation in Contemporary Puerto Rican Literature*. Cornell, NY: Cornell UP.

Segura, Denise and Jennifer Pierce. 1993. "Chicana/o Family Structure and Gender Personality: Chodorow, Familism, and Psychoanalytic Sociology Revisited." *Signs* 19 (1): 62-91.

Smith, Faith, ed. 2011. *Sex and the Citizen: Interrogating the Caribbean*. Charlottesville: U of Virginia P.

Smith, Sidonie. 1993. *Subjectivity, Identity, and the Body: Women's Autobiographical Practices in the Twentieth Century*. Bloomington: Indiana UP.

Tinsley, Omise'eke Natasha. 2008. "Black Atlantic, Queer Atlantic. Queer Imaginings of the Middle Passage." *GLQ: A Journal of Lesbian and Gay Studies Volume* 14 (2): 191-215.

Wiegel, Sigrid. 1986. "Double Focus: On the History of Women's Writing." In Ecker 1986, 23-52.

Wilchins, Riki. 2002. "Changing the Subject." In Nestle 2002, 47-54.

Wolfenson, Carolyn. 2010. "*Days of Awe* and the Jewish Experience of a Cuban Exile: The Case of Achy Obejas." In Pérez-Rosario 2010, 104-18.

Macarena García-Avello holds a PhD in Hispanic Studies from the University of Maryland (2017) and a PhD in Gender and Women's Studies from the University of Oviedo (2014). She currently works at the University of Cantabria in Santander. She has published books and articles in peer-reviewed journals on twentieth-century American literature, feminist theory and the representation of gender in fiction.

Address: Departamento de Filología Inglesa. Facultad de Educación. Universidad de Cantabria. Avda. de los Castros, s/n. 39005 Santander, Spain. Tel.: + 34 942201252.

Taking the I out of Being: Zen Buddhism and Postmodern (Dis)contents in Ruth Ozeki's *A Tale for the Time Being*

MOJCA KREVEL
Univerza v Ljubljani, Slovenia
mojca.krevel@guest.arnes.si

By internalizing Zen Buddhist teachings, the protagonists of Ruth Ozeki's *A Tale for the Time Being* (2013) resolve their conflicts with the world and within themselves. The scenario echoes current theoretical interest in the Buddhist concept of no-self as a model of self that is suited to the postmodern condition. This article argues that since the fundamental Buddhist principles conceptually accommodate the many-worlds interpretation of quantum mechanics—the key to the novel's structure—and the metaphysical framework of postmodernity, Ozeki's novel illuminates the empowering aspects of the fractal nature of postmodern selves, while charting the possibilities for their actualization.

Keywords: Buddhism; digital cultures; empowerment; fractal subject; postmodernity

. . .

El Ser sin el Yo: budismo zen e (in)satisfacciones posmodernas en *A Tale for the Time Being*, de Ruth Ozeki

Mediante la interiorización de las enseñanzas del budismo zen, los personajes protagonistas de *A Tale for the Time Being* (2013), de Ruth Ozeki, resuelven sus conflictos con el mundo y dentro de sí mismos. El argumento de la novela, pues, refleja el interés teórico actual por el concepto budista del no-yo como un modelo del ser que encaja con la condición posmoderna. Este artículo sostiene que, dado que los principios budistas fundamentales se ajustan conceptualmente a la interpretación de los mundos múltiples de la mecánica cuántica—la clave de la estructura de la novela—y al marco metafísico de la posmodernidad, la novela de Ozeki arroja luz sobre los aspectos empoderadores de la naturaleza fractal de los seres posmodernos, a la vez que traza las posibilidades que tienen de hacerse realidad.

Palabras clave: budismo; culturas digitales; empoderamiento; sujeto fractal; posmodernidad

1. Introduction

Contemporary clinical practice increasingly attributes the unprecedented rise in the incidence of anxiety disorders over the last two decades to the incompatibility of the Western dualist conception of self, which is still prevalent in contemporary societies, with the social, cultural and economic realities of postmodernity (Stolorow 2009; Levine 2013). This interpretation is corroborated by current research in theoretical psychology and the philosophy of self, which has been increasingly concerned with developing a model of self that could more effectively accommodate the challenges instigated by globalization and the omnipresence of media (Giles 1993; Ho 1995; Gaskins 1999; Hoffman et al. 2008). The Zen Buddhist principle of no-self is a non-dualist model that is frequently identified as compatible with the increasingly acknowledged view of self as a socially constructed entity and it explicitly informs some of the most influential contemporary conceptualizations of self.[1] The concept "denies the ontological reality of the self" (Ho 1995, 121), thus altogether evading the Cartesian dualist view of the self as simultaneously a subject and an object.

From this perspective, Ruth Ozeki's novel *A Tale for the Time Being* (2013) seems to lend itself as a literary case study of how internalizing a Zen Buddhist approach to self and reality may contribute to the contentment and empowerment of individuals within familiar postmodern environments and situations. Judging by the number of languages the novel has been translated into and the unanimous critical acclaim and scholarly attention it has received worldwide, the significance of issues North American Ozeki explores is as topical as it is global. In an interview with Eleanor Ty, Ozeki explains that *A Tale for the Time Being*, her third novel, was indeed meant to convey "a sense of the way the world is now," which resulted in an account "informed by basic Buddhist principles—of interdependence, impermanence, interconnectedness" (2013c, 161).

Ozeki had been toiling on the novel for five years when the tsunami that devastated the northeast coast of Japan on March 11, 2011 provided her with a suitable means to pursue this "sense of the way the world is now." Due to the ensuing Fukushima nuclear meltdown and its unprecedented media coverage, the disaster reached global proportions and laid bare the ruthlessness and hypocrisy of global postindustrial capitalism (Beauregard 2015, 96, 103). Ozeki rewrote the novel, using this cataclysm as the trigger that sets the events in motion (Ozeki 2013d). Anchoring the story on what is now embedded in collective memory as 3/11 enabled Ozeki to address and explore a number of issues arising from globalization, digitalization and the transnational neoliberal market economy. *A Tale for the Time Being* became the first instance of 3/11 literature outside Japan (Usui 2015, 91) and thus an ideal ground for critical reflection on the ways in which current socioeconomic processes affect literature and vice versa. In fact, the implications arising from its status as a transnational 3/11 narrative seem to be a common denominator across existing literary

---

[1] Such as Connie Zweig's concept of no-self, Rollo May's myth of self and Kirk J. Schneider's paradoxical self (Hoffman et al. 2008, 135-73).

criticism on the novel, which invariably recognizes interdependence, impermanence and interconnectedness as the governing principles of its internal and external structure.

However, while interpretations of the novel so far have duly acknowledged the relevance of Ozeki's "poetics of connectedness" (Bernard 2017, 25) for the exploration of the manifold issues arising from the shift of the sociohistorical paradigm, the fact that Ozeki self-identifies as a Zen Buddhist novelist (Ozeki 2013a) has not been sufficiently addressed.[2] This is not to say that the Zen dimension of the novel has been ignored. However, scholars have tended to mention individual Zen Buddhist elements in passing and as metaphorical renderings of the postmodern political, economic and social conditions that the novel addresses (Beauregard 2015; R. Davis 2015; Lee 2018; Lovell 2018). In contrast, taking into account Ozeki's statement that her 2010 ordination as a Zen Buddhist priest was instrumental in overcoming an extensive period of writer's block and completing the text (2013a, 39), my approach will examine postmodern (dis)contents in the light of the Zen Buddhist teachings at work in the novel. By reading the novel in this way, I hope to identify and elucidate the ways in which the Zen Buddhist metaphysical and ethical framework might reconcile the frictions between the Cartesian model and present sociohistorical conditions that underpin the ongoing crisis of the dualistic self. In addition, approaching the novel as primarily a Zen Buddhist narrative may help account for the inconsistencies and contradictions affecting Ozeki's protagonists, which current scholarship identifies and interprets as inherently postmodern. If that is the case, the novel may well be read as suggesting possible ethical guidelines for a stance that—due to its essentially nondualist nature—may lead to a more contented and empowered existence within the globalized and digitalized realities of postmodernity.

In order to situate Zen Buddhism and postmodernity within a common context, I first consider the correspondence between the metaphysical framework of postmodernity and the Zen Buddhist notions of self and the cosmos that are invoked in the novel. This is followed by a consideration of the ways in which the internalization and enactment of key Zen Buddhist principles in the novel affect how the main protagonists perceive and react to their traumas and anxieties. These observations are then discussed in terms of their relevance in the broader context of actual contemporary social, political and economic realities in order to establish the novel's capacity to productively interfere with these realities as a bona fide postmodern medium.

2. POSTMODERNITY: CONCEPTS OF REALITY AND SUBJECT

In charting the conceptual framework of the postmodern epoch, I will rely on concepts and terminology developed by Jean Baudrillard. My decision is prompted by three

---

[2]   The novel has been discussed in terms of its posthumanist implications (Lovell 2018), postmodern (eco) cosmopolitism and cosmopolitics (Lee 2018; Usui 2015), trauma studies (Bernard 2017), postcolonialism (Beauregard 2015) and postmodern narratology (R. Davis 2015; Lovell 2018).

factors: the agreement between his key postulates of hyperreality and fractal subjects and the observations of other influential theoreticians of postmodernity (Krevel 2017, 123), the fundamental reliance of these postulates upon the nature and role of media in the societies of late capitalism, and the fact that both postulates structurally accommodate (to) the principles of the many-worlds interpretation of quantum mechanics that Ozeki explicitly foregrounds as the key to the novel's structure.

The shift in the reality principle signaling the advent of the postmodern epoch is conditioned by the spread and ubiquitous presence of electronic media in postindustrial societies. Their gradual digitalization, by blurring distinctions between media formats, "erases the notion of the medium itself" (Kittler 1987, 102). Hence, the reality of our sense perceptions and our ensuing understanding of the environment ultimately rely upon systems of digitally coded information. Such a reality is, according to Baudrillard, hyperreal in the sense that it is produced from "matrices, memory banks and command models—and with these it can be reproduced an indefinite number of times" (2004, 366). The transmitted data defy verification of their *truthfulness* since they refer to nothing substantial; they are an algorithm, a function of the probability of a message. Hyperreality could, therefore, be described as a potential system that could be created from media-generated information, which in turn means that all hyperrealities exist as a potentiality at the same time. Due to the constant influx of new information, hyperrealities are fluid, impermanent and open to connecting and merging with each other depending on their compatibility.

The described transformation of the reality principle corresponds to the transformations observable in the concept and the structuring of the postmodern subject. These changes are the result of the late capitalist shift in production relations and the waning of the functional value of products, which came into full effect after World War II with the viral growth of the advertising and media industries and the development of information technologies. Buying becomes consumption and objects of consumption serve as signs for the purpose of consumers' self-representation. These signs connect into fluid networks that constitute the postmodern subject. What we perceive as identity is one of the possible systems constructible from available signs, a possible identity variant rendered at the moment of observation. Since we choose from a universally shared fund of these signs, the nature of our subjectivity is "not at all contradictory with mass status" and it is a priori "fractal [...], both subdivisible to infinity and indivisible" (Baudrillard 2011, 64). The postmodern subject, Baudrillard concludes, is a "subject without other" (64), an endless variation of the same subject.

Both hyperreality and fractal subjects exhibit the structural properties of quantum physics, which over the last six decades has been replacing Newtonian science as the dominant mode of (scientific) thought. Basing itself on the principles of superposition, entanglement and the measurement problem, the many-worlds interpretation of quantum mechanics maintains that our universe is one of many possible universes,

since every choice we make causes the splitting of the world into the universe of what was selected and the universe of what was not. Each potential past and future is an actual universe, all of which coexist at the same time with all other potential universes. Reality is therefore a multiverse of all possible quantum results (Deutsch 2011, 294). The implied coexistence and interconnectedness of everything across space and time conceptually matches Baudrillard's description of postmodern realities and subjects as fluid, interchangeable and interconnected systems of media-generated information. In other words, both hyperreality and the fractal subject conceptually comprise all possible systems constructible from available data; they refer to a multiverse of states potentially rendered as a seemingly specific reality and a seemingly specific self at the moment of observation.

3. A Zen Buddhist Approach to Reality and Self

Ozeki is a priest of the Sōtō school of Zen Buddhism, founded in Japan by Dōgen Zenji in the thirteenth century. The Sōtō school posits that enlightenment—the experiencing of the true nature of reality and being—is always already present (Gaskins 1999, 209). However, this originally enlightened state is masked by conceptualizations. These facilitate everyday discourse and functioning, but are fundamentally delusions and the source of human suffering because they objectify the self and place it in opposition to reality. Such a state entails "craving, striving or thirst" (Gaskins 1999, 206), which constitute the core of human frustrations. To experience a harmonious existence, it is therefore essential to transcend the concept of a separate, essential self and all other conceptualizations with it, and acknowledge the original, enlightened mind: the totality that is Buddha nature. According to Dōgen, Buddha nature is a mode of how entities are, not something they possess (Raud 2015, 1). Buddha nature therefore implies an absence of any referents in the dynamism of all possible particular manifestations (Raud 2015, 9). In other words, Buddha nature is simply emptiness, impermanence and unceasing manifestation (Dōgen 2002, 75-76).

The principle of emptiness (*śūnyatā*) is central to the non-dualist nature of Zen Buddhism. This principle refers to what remains when all signification and all cognition are removed, which means the fullness of potentialities to be expressed. This in turn implies the inherent interfusion of all phenomena; within such a setup, all is one and one is all (Dōgen 2002, 49, 72; Raud 2015, 1). Consequently, once all conceptualizations are abandoned, one is no longer in any way directed or afflicted by the situation, since in the state of emptiness one is not separate from the situation, but actually *is* the situation: a "configuration of a potentiality at a given moment" (Gaskins 1999, 209).

Inherent to the state of emptiness is the principle of impermanence (*mujō*) which posits that everything is constantly changing and that every moment is "unique and robust with possibilities" (Gaskins 1999, 213). There is no permanent, fixed reality or self that one could define oneself in relation to, which corroborates the *śūnyatā*

connotations of universal oneness and the ensuing interfusion of all phenomena. We could perhaps describe impermanence as the realization of the (spatial) principle of emptiness on a temporal axis, especially if we take into account Dōgen's assertion that "impermanence is in itself the Buddha Nature" (Dōgen 2002, 76). This statement implies that all existence is realized as a succession of endless becomings and that being is time. *Time being* is, in fact, the central category of Dōgen's metaphysics; it is existence in a constant flux of momentary manifestations through which "every entire being in the entire world is each time an [independent] time, even while it makes a continuous series" (Dōgen's 2002, 51). The momentary realizations of potentialities attest to the all-inclusiveness of Buddha nature, which can only be comprehended by focusing on every moment and thus existing in the now. Being completely aware of each moment means being completely aware of all other moments and being (one with) the situation. One can achieve this state by clearing the mind of all thoughts through the practice of zazen meditation.

As everything is subject to constant transformation and is one with everything else, there can be no separate, essential self. Zen Buddhism maintains that what we recognize as what we *are* is an ever-changing configuration of potentiality that fully depends on the context (Gaskins 1999, 206). A permanent self is a delusion that places us in conflict with our environment. Enlightenment as the source of harmonious existence involves abandoning the concept of self altogether and realizing the no-self (*anattā*) principle as the state of emptiness after the removal of illusions about the self, which is at the same time the state of the fullness of potentialities. No-self does not, therefore, refer to self-denial; rather, Buddha nature is the lack of self in the total awareness of being the all-encompassing, ever-changing, interconnected self (Hoffman et al. 2008, 16).

The Buddhist framework described in the preceding paragraphs conceptually matches Baudrillard's notion of the postmodern hyperreal: both conceptualizations maintain that all realities exist at the same time as a possibility, the expression of which depends on momentary contexts. In Zen Buddhism, the ultimate expression of this model is the principle of no-self, which is both a momentary expression of a set of already existing qualities made compatible by a specific context and the sum total of all possibilities of expression. As such, no-self corresponds to Baudrillard's notion of the fractal self as a fluid, ever-changing system of media-generated data, which is simultaneously the sum total of all the possible systems creatable from all transferred information, and hence to the basic principles of quantum mechanics. The Zen Buddhist approach therefore indeed seems to provide a productive basis for the development of a new concept of the self, one that is better suited to the postmodern condition.

4. *A Tale for the Time Being* and Its Time Beings

A Tale for the Time Being combines the first-person narrative of sixteen-year-old Nao from Tokyo and the third-person story of middle-aged novelist Ruth, who lives on an island in British Columbia. Their stories connect when, during a stroll on the beach, Ruth finds Nao's diary in a lunchbox that seems to be part of the flotsam washed on the shore after the tsunami that hit Japan in 2011. The title of the novel, the epigraph, taken from the beginning of the eleventh chapter of Dōgen's *Shōbōgenzō*, titled "For the Time Being," and the first sentence, "My name is Nao, and I am a time being" (Ozeki 2013b, 3), signal that the protagonists, the events and the worlds in the novel will be used to examine the practical implications of Dōgen's concept of time being.[3] Time being combines the Zen Buddhist understanding of time as a series of interconnected moments and the principle of no-self as a summation of all potential selves within all potential contexts. Hence the fundamental postulation of the concept of time being is that of the connectedness and interdependence of all beings across space and time, which in turn entails the impermanent, fluid nature of existence. In this section, I chart the ways in which these postulates are acknowledged by the main protagonists in *A Tale for the Time Being*. I also consider how their realizations that being is time and that self is a context, not an essentiality, contribute to their contentment and empowerment.

4.1. Time Being Nao

That Nao's name echoes the word *now* is not a coincidence as she is constantly intrigued by its implications. Her account of how obsessed she was with her name as a little girl, whispering it repeatedly in an unsuccessful attempt to "catch the moment when the word was what it is: when *now* became NOW" (99; italics and capitals in the original), reflects one of the leading thematic concerns of the novel: the implications of catching (up with) the now for the time being.

Nao's misery begins when her family has to move back to Tokyo after her father is fired from a lucrative programming job in Silicon Valley. Having spent most of her childhood amidst the prosperity of Silicon Valley, Nao suddenly finds herself in a scruffy flat, where she shares a bedroom with her parents. Her command of Japanese is basic, the local customs feel foreign to her and her peers, who perceive her as a foreigner, subject her to brutal bullying. Her American friends quickly lose interest in communicating with her over the internet, while her suicidal father and distanced mother are so preoccupied with their own distress that they remain oblivious to her problems. The girl feels abandoned, vulnerable and scared, realizing, as she says, there is "nobody left in my life I could count on to keep me safe" (74). After her father's first suicide attempt, Nao is sent to her great-grandmother Jiko to spend the summer at the temple where she lives.

---

[3]   All subsequent references to the novel are by page number only.

Jiko's role in the novel is that of the traditional Zen Buddhist instructor, teaching by example and *kuans*.[4] The direction as well as the manner of her teaching are already implicit on the evening of the girl's arrival at the temple when Jiko suggests they take a bath together. Despite Nao's initial unease, she is soon comforted by Jiko's calming presence. The nascent feeling of connectedness with her great-grandmother is signaled by the girl's genuine interest in her. Minutely inspecting Jiko's body in the water, she realizes that the nun looks "part ghost, part child, part young girl, part sexy woman, and part [witch], all at once. All the ages and stages, combined into a single female time being" (166).

The underlying message of Nao's observation—namely, that one is all—corresponds to the main postulate of emptiness, which implies the essential connectedness and interdependence of all things across space and time. Various assertions of what Jiko calls "the not-two nature of existence" (194) permeate her teachings and coalesce in one consummate lesson on the nature of such connectedness when the two are having a picnic on the beach and Nao—under Jiko's guidance—actually experiences it.[5] Having just learnt about the bullying at school, Jiko asks Nao to bully a wave. No matter how hard the girl beats at the water, the waves are stronger, they pull her with them and make her part of them; she is not one with them, but also not separate from them. The experience of fighting the waves while being the waves makes her feel good (193); the power of the waves that keep knocking her over is also her power, demonstrated precisely by her attempts to fight them. After briefly considering just letting go and allowing the waves to take her out to the open sea, she decides against it and joins Jiko on the beach. Her decision may be interpreted as Ozeki's reference to the principle of no-self not constituting the denial of the self, which implies detachment and passivity, but rather the state of being everything—a sum total of infinite, ever-changing possibilities, which *in itself* entails agency.

The underlying message of the episode on the beach—that what we do is what is being done to us because of the fundamental interconnectedness of everything—is central to Ozeki's way of conveying what the world is like now. The narrative strategy of "eschew[ing] all dialectical subsumption" (Bernard 2017, 28) by drawing attention to the ambivalent character of all suppositions, which scholars identify as instrumental in conveying the modalities of existence in the globalized postmodern context, perfectly aligns with the implications of implementing the not-two nature of existence on all discursive levels.[6] In order to convey the full scope of these implications, however, we must first consider how the not-two nature of existence relates to the critical

---

[4]   Riddles that prompt disciples to comprehend Zen Buddhist principles by themselves.

[5]   Jiko's teachings include explaining to Nao that up and down are the same thing (194), the meaning of the Heart Sutra—"Form is emptiness, emptiness is form" (106)—or asserting that washing used freezer bags and meditating are the same thing (205).

[6]   For instance, Guy Beauregard (2015), Hsiu-chuan Lee (2018) and Catherine Bernard (2017) highlight this ambivalence at the level of themes and motifs, while Rocío G. Davis (2015), the author of this article (2017) and Sue Lovell (2018) discuss it with regard to the novel's structural organization and focalization.

importance of each moment and the meaning of now, which are also an integral part of Jiko's teachings.

In Appendix A of the novel, Jiko explains that "you can't understand what it means to be alive on this earth until you understand the time being, and in order to understand the time being […] you have to understand what a moment is. […] *A moment is a very small particle of time*" (407; italics in the original), so small that one snap of one's fingers equals sixty-five moments. Snapping your fingers from dawn till dawn, "*you will experience the truly intimate awareness of knowing exactly how you spent every single moment of a single day of your life*" (407; italics in the original). In order to "truly live our lives" (408) we must therefore acknowledge each passing moment in the constantly changing universe, which can only be achieved by focusing on (each) now.

Nao learns what a moment, a now, is when she plays the drum at the annual Obon ceremony: "When you're beating a drum, […] your whole attention is focused on the razor edge between silence and noise" (238). By drumming, she experiences the creation of now, the oneness of time and being. Existence is revealed to her as a series of connected, yet separate, moments which are "the time being. Sound and no-sound" (238). Now is, then, a state which comprises all potentialities and paying attention to it makes us realize that each moment of whatever we do contains all the possible alternatives of that particular action. Due to the not-two nature of existence, our every action affects the entire universe, which means that at any given moment we define the fate of the cosmos. Nao—and her father—are able to truly acknowledge that fact at the end of the book, after reading the secret diary of Jiko's son Haruki, who was forcibly enlisted as a kamikaze pilot and died towards the end of World War II. From the diary, they learn that he consciously steered his plane into the waves instead of crashing into an enemy ship as ordered. Haruki's momentary change of course not only spared enemy soldiers but also their families and friends. His action affected all of their pasts and all of their futures, as well as those of Nao and her father. After reading about it, they acknowledge the crucial importance of each moment and realize that the position they are in is precisely where they need to be in order to make productive use of their existence and thereby affect the entire universe—Nao by writing and her father by using his programming skills to develop programs that remove unwanted contents from the internet.

Mastering zazen is also instrumental in Nao's path towards the comprehension of the importance of each moment. The practice requires assuming a correct posture, which forces one to acknowledge one's physicality. Concentrating on breathing, one gradually abandons all thought and reaches the state of emptiness. By "enter[ing] time completely" (183), one captures the now and becomes aware of the utter interconnectedness of everything and of oneself with everything. In the novel, this is clearly conveyed through Nao's realization that, after mastering zazen, she is no longer bothered by aggressive mosquitoes, realizing that "my skin [is] no longer a wall that separate[s] us, and my blood [is] their blood" (204).

Later, when she returns to school, the ability to let go of all thoughts at will proves useful when a group of students attempt to rape her, and when, after she quits school and starts prostituting herself, she is with an exceptionally brutal customer. However, the full implications of the state of interconnectedness and interdependence that one becomes aware of via cognitive withdrawal—which does not cure one of all afflictions but teaches one "how not to be so obsessed with them" (162)—are, at this point, still to be comprehended. Their comprehension—namely, that at any given moment one is precisely where one needs to be in order to affect the cosmos in any given way, as the development of the story shows—is conditioned precisely by a series of violent and painful events that make Nao decide to commit suicide.[7] First, however, she decides to document Jiko's life in a specially crafted diary where empty pages are inserted between the covers of Marcel Proust's *À la recherche du temps perdu*.

Nao's account of the lost time in order to ensure that her great-grandmother is remembered is interrupted by the news of Jiko's dying. She rushes home to get her father, but he is just leaving the flat, evidently about to attempt suicide again. She says nothing and boards a train alone. While waiting for the bus to take her the last leg of her journey to the temple, Nao realizes she is all alone and that all the people she loves are dying. She is ashamed of herself, and sees no point in writing the diary or living anymore. "I guess this is it," she says. "This is what now feels like" (341).

4.2. Time Being Ruth

Ruth, like Nao, is acutely aware of the symbolism of her name: of its etymological connection to *regret*, as well as of the meaning of the Japanese pronunciation of it, *rutsu*, denoting "absent" or "not at home" (59). It is worth noting that immediately after reflecting on the connotations of her name, she explains that "home-leaving is a Buddhist euphemism for leaving the secular world and entering the monastic path" (61). But how can Ruth be on a path to enlightenment? When she finds Nao's diary, she is existentially stuck. She cannot get used to life on the remote Canadian island where she moved with her husband from New York due to his health problems. She avoids direct contact with the islanders and spends most of her time surfing the internet. As she keeps forgetting things, she is afraid she has Alzheimer's, like her deceased mother, whose memoir she has been unsuccessfully struggling to write for years.

The answer to the question above may be suggested by Nao's father's whispering "'Tadaima,' which is what you say when you arrive home" (163), when he reaches Jiko's temple later in the story. The seeming contradiction—that leaving home, and hence being absent, is at the same time arriving home, and so being present—is resolved if we consider it in terms of the not-two nature of existence. At this point, however, Ruth is

---

[7]   Instrumental in that decision is her torturers' posting of the video of the attempted rape on the internet and putting her panties up for sale in an online auction. These events also lead to her father's subsequent suicide attempts.

still far from acknowledging the not-two state of "relief [of] just hang[ing] out happily as part of an open-ended quantum array," of "*forget*[ting] *the self* […] *to be enlightened by all myriad of things*" (398; italics in the original) and be able to write again (Krevel 2017, 120; Lee 2018, 39).

The crucial moment in the process of that realization is when, the first time she holds Nao's diary in her hands, she becomes "aware of an odd and lingering sense of urgency to […] help her" (29).[8] Her interest in Nao breaks the stasis of her life; she starts searching for the girl and her family and familiarizing herself with Dōgen's teachings. At first, her research is limited to the internet, but the nature of the information she seeks forces her to start establishing personal contacts, each of which is shown to be critical to the course of events. Physical interconnectedness is hence revealed as inherent in acknowledging the universality of mind, which is also suggested by Nao's feeling of physical oneness with the mosquitoes when sitting zazen or her observation of Jiko's body in the bathtub.[9]

The first signal that the reading of the diary will interfere with Ruth's reality, making Nao part of that context and vice versa, is Ruth's dream on the night of the diary's discovery. In the dream, she finds herself in Jiko's temple. The old nun is writing an e-mail explaining that up and down are the same thing, because "when up looks up, up is down. When down looks down, down is up" (39). These are the same words that Jiko says to Nao when observing the surfers during their picnic on the beach. Ruth, to no small surprise, realizes this when she reads the diary a week later. In the course of the story, Ruth's dreams turn out to be the medium through which she enters Nao's plane of reality, where Jiko also becomes her teacher. The first dream strengthens Ruth's feeling of involvement and connectedness with Nao through space and time to the point where she needs to be reminded of the temporal gap between them (312). The dream also contributes to Ruth's eventual comprehension that what she interprets as signs that she is losing her mind may very well make perfect sense if considered from a different perspective (398-99).[10]

In her second dream, Ruth puts on Jiko's glasses and is absorbed into an unformed blur. There she experiences the feeling of "nonbeing, […] of vast and empty ruthlessness" (122). She panics, initially, but when she gives in to it, she experiences "a sense of utter calm and well-being." In the morning, she feels "oddly at peace and well rested" (123).

---

[8] Beauregard's reading of Ruth's impulse to help as a trope of a discourse of dominance that is, however, like all other such tropes in the novel, immediately relativized (2015, 99), illuminates the ways in which the not-two principle is at work at the narrative level. In Zen terms, Ruth's impulse is simply what it is, since its interpretation relies on the context. Due to the interconnectedness of everything, it is indeed a consequence of all the moments which have led to that particular moment and which allow us to consider Ruth's urge (also) as a display of dominance.

[9] For the importance of objects and physicality in Ozeki's poetics, see Bernard (2017, 29-31).

[10] For instance, the disappearance and reappearance of text in Nao's diary, the vanishing of an article on Jiko that Ruth has found on the internet or her possession of Jiko's son's secret notebook, which he had on him when he crashed his plane.

Ruth feeling *ruthlessness* may be interpreted along the same lines as Nao's fight with the waves: both moments reveal the not-two nature of existence inherent to the principle of emptiness. Ruth's description of the "blissful state" (123) of experiencing various sensations despite complete dispersal is also very similar to the "blissful state" of the "focused but vast" attention she had "when she'd been writing well" (92). In order to recall this state and force her mind to "wake up" (185), she starts sitting zazen, which Nao describes as "a home that you can't ever lose" (183). Ruth's early attempts at zazen, however, are not really successful.

When Ruth reaches the part of the diary where Nao is sitting at the bus stop, she discovers that the rest of the pages have descended into blankness. That night, the dream first brings her to a state in which "sounds merge and separate […], turning meaning into cacophony" (348). She feels the time swell with events and people from the diary; she sees a reflection that is her and not her. Then the word *crow* forms into an actual bird and takes her to a park in Tokyo, where Nao's father is waiting for some companions he has arranged to commit suicide with.[11] She explains to him that Jiko is dying and urges him to help Nao. The crow then takes Ruth to Jiko's temple, where she places Jiko's son's secret diary in a box for Nao to find.

In the morning, the pages in the diary are once again full. Apparently, Ruth's dream-state intervention not only prevented the suicides of both Nao and her father, it also enabled them to learn from Haruki's secret diary, which ensures the happy ending of the story in Nao's diary. This, combined with Jiko's teachings and her husband's explanation of the seemingly illogical events via quantum mechanics, makes Ruth realize that since each event is a matter of perspective and context at a given moment, she should focus on each moment as it is. When her husband asks her whether she is happy in the world they are in, she replies with what are her last words in the novel: "Yes, I suppose I am. At least for now" (401).

5. Zen Buddhism and Postmodernity

From the perspective of Zen Buddhist principles, the suggested path to the main protagonists' contentment is the result of their apprehension that all beings—everything that *is*—are interrelated across space and time. This insight dissipates their perception of self as a separated, self-contained entity that is defined in opposition to the environment and makes them realize that at any given moment their actions—or lack thereof—affect that environment and their existence in it.

This outcome is precipitated by Nao's decision to recount her great-grandmother's story in her diary. Prompted by her love for Jiko, the writing connects the girl with her reader, thus creating the world of the Ruth that finds the diary. Ruth's decision to read

---

[11] The bird is the Japanese jungle crow that Ruth and her husband have been spotting in the trees surrounding their house since the discovery of the diary.

the diary and her involvement with it make that world part of Nao's context and vice versa. When Nao reaches her now at the bus stop and the pages in the diary disappear, Ruth's existence within that particular context is in jeopardy as well. As her husband observes, "if she stops writing to us, then maybe we stop being too" (344). If Ruth has so far been a comparatively passive recipient of Nao's story and Jiko's wisdom, she is now at a point where she has to actively interfere with that context if she is to preserve it. Since she accesses Nao's world through dreams, her interference is only possible in a dream. Moreover, in order to affect the situation she must become the situation by entering the state of emptiness, which is what happens at the beginning of her final dream. Her subsequent agency in the dream is directed by the crow, which, as Lovell observes, connects "all worlds on one plane of possibility" (2018, 68) and may be interpreted as a symbol of the principle of emptiness. Ruth's agency in the dream is hence revealed as inherent to the state she is in. Since, as Jiko points out, "our original nature is to be good and kind" (181), because anger and hate suggest separateness from our environment (which is a delusion), Ruth's agency is necessarily good and kind and creates contexts that are good and kind—in this particular case, a happy ending for Nao and Ruth.

Ruth explicitly associates dreaming with writing, suggesting that both activities involve the summoning up and exploration of potential realities and selves (392). They both entail letting go of a clearly delineated notion of self within a particular environment and an opening up to other options and contexts. It is in this state that Ruth is able to create—*write*—the context, in which she gradually acknowledges that the self and corresponding reality are a matter of perspective and are governed by the principles of interdependence, impermanence and interconnectedness. When she reaches her own now and the story within this novel's particular context ends, she is aware she is precisely where and what she needs to be and she is happy. The epilogue, written as Ruth's letter to Nao, suggests that Ruth indeed concentrated on the moments to come and started writing what may very well be the novel in front of us.[12] By choosing to read it, we—like Ruth upon finding the diary—become an interconnected and interdependent part of its context. Nao's decision to become a writer at the end of her last diary entry attests to the same. It symbolizes the importance of internalizing the principles of interdependence, impermanence and interconnectedness for the enhancement of contentment and empowerment. Due to the nature of these principles, their internalization not only affects individuals but whole societies across space and time.

Ozeki's proposal that literary acts (can) crucially affect reality is a convenient vantage point from which to consider the relevance of Zen Buddhist metaphysics in the context

---

[12] The autobiographical dimension has been extensively discussed with regard to the interchangeability and interdependence of the narrative agents in this novel being symptomatic of the dispersal of subjectivity and agency in current socioeconomic conditions (R. Davis 2015; Krevel 2017; Lovell 2018). In Zen Buddhist terms, the fluidity and intangibility of the protagonists in Ozeki's literary act simply attests to the not-two nature of existence.

of contemporary consumerist societies and digital cultures. Much like contemporary research on the concept of self and its postmodern (clinical) discontents, Ozeki foregrounds the Cartesian dualist perception of self as the main cause of dissatisfaction with one's position in the world. Ruth's initial struggling with zazen, for instance, is symptomatic of the dualistic concept of self and Protestant utilitarian ethics, in the context of which contentment is equated with the achievement of clearly demarcated goals as a way of defining oneself in society. In contemporary hyperproductive consumerist cultures, however, the achievement of each goal automatically increases our aspirations. Therefore, the search for goals, motivated by the promise of contentment, paradoxically enhances the degree of restlessness and anxiety (Gaskins 1999, 204). Dōgen's understanding of zazen as a practice of *just sitting*, unconcerned with any goals or gains (Dallmayr 1996, 179), is therefore utterly foreign to such a mindset. In Zen terms, the effort of gaining something is part of the delusion that there is something to gain, which is the cause of suffering. In contrast, the interconnectedness of everything entails absolute presence, which is the feeling of being at peace and at home that Nao refers to with regard to zazen. For Ruth, the zazen-induced feeling of being at home paradoxically equals the feeling of not being Ruth and losing her self means losing her mind, which is why she abandons the practice. At the end of the novel, having experienced the contentment of letting go of the self and living in the moment, zazen is no longer problematic for Ruth (398) since *self* is a home one can never be absent from as it embraces the totality of all potentialities, one of which is Ruth.

Ozeki's recipe for empowerment, that is, abandoning the concept of the self defined through its otherness vis-à-vis the environment by establishing connections, seems simple enough to actualize in an age governed by globalization and digital media. Networked connectedness and connectivity are, indeed, the defining features of the internet, the medium that has for the last few decades been decisively shaping contemporary notions of reality and its agents. So much so, that we are intimately affected by such global events as, for instance, 3/11. In addition, the ubiquity of digital media and the specifics of their connectivity have instigated the phenomenon of electronic sociality, which effectively disperses the boundaries between the virtual and the real to the point where the objective reality of the interlocutors is merely an assumption.

The actual effects of connectedness established by postmodern digital media are, however, a far cry from those suggested by either Zen Buddhist principles or postmodern philosophy and quantum physics. The initial theoretical enthusiasm over the internet's potential to transcend the bod(il)y, and with it the concept of otherness, seems naïve at best in an age of cyberterrorism, online child pornography and fake news. Governed by the interests of global corporate capitalism, postmodern media are primarily directed towards massive production and dissemination of needs that steadily sustain the culture of consumerism. The barrage of data on what to do and what to be and constant exposure to global traumatic events relayed through a plethora of "alternative facts" are

utterly confusing, devastating and paralyzing in terms of the traditional positioning of self within a knowable objective reality.[13] At the same time, they paradoxically reinforce the need for such a positioning precisely because the reality they create is unpredictable, unknowable and threatening. The more information that is received, the greater the confusion, frustration and threat, which may lead to isolation from the world and its threatening otherness while simultaneously enhancing the need to gather more information. The growing numbers of *hikikomori* and the global intensification of extreme right-wing tendencies may serve as cases in point.

Ozeki's novel significantly reflects on the internet and its alleged capacity for establishing connections. Ruth spends her days on the internet and the more she pursues information there, the greater her frustration with the unstable, disappearing contents and failing connection becomes. For Nao, the internet initially seems to be a channel through which she can stay connected to her old life, but she soon realizes that "[o]n email, it's never now" (124), which means that those who communicate are never part of the same context and the connection between them is only a medium-induced illusion.

Not only is internet communication presented as an illusion that instigates frustration and aloneness, the medium, despite—or perhaps due to—its fundamentally democratic and accommodating nature, even becomes the site of the violence and humiliation that push Nao and her father towards suicide. They are, however, saved by Ruth's dream intervention, which is, as has been shown, essentially literary. The episode may therefore be read as a key to what I consider one of the central points that the novel is making, namely, that literature can function as a means of empowerment within contemporary conditions precisely because it functions on the basis of the Zen Buddhist principles of interdependence, impermanence and interconnectedness. Ozeki's narrative practice makes clear, as Lovell claims in her posthumanist reading of the novel, that "narrative discourse [is an] actant constructing subject positions that, when adopted by readers, enable them to experience the new actual world" (2018, 60). Literary texts are therefore a "catalyst, generating and distributing agency across the material networks of literature" (Lovell 2018, 59). As such, they enact the main premises of emptiness, the implications of which are rendered in Ruth's last dream. By its very nature, literature connects across space and time by making us participate in various potential contexts and enabling us to embody and experience various instances of Otherness, thus rendering the notion irrelevant altogether. Our identification with the stories and the protagonists corroborates our sense of empathy, which is inherent in the epistemology of Zen (B. Davis 2018). Empathy in itself provides us with the agency to direct our actions with regard to that which is Other precisely because it is founded on the realization that the Other is a potentiality of ourselves. The actions

---

[13] The phrase "alternative facts" was used by Trump's counsellor Kellyanne Conway in 2017 to refer to the disputes regarding the number of people attending Trump's inauguration.

of the main protagonists in the novel, which eventually create the context of a happy ending, are all grounded in compassion and care. Moreover, the implications of the state of empathy as a condition of being aware of the relativity of all (pre)suppositions are also at the heart of Ozeki's poetics of connectedness and "heeding" (Bernard 2017), which she arguably puts forward as the basis for a constructive ethical framework.

Empathy may therefore be seen as the state in which the frictions between the self and the environment disappear and subjectivity does indeed become fractal in the sense that it actively participates in the creation of realities that are inherent to it. Empathy is thus revealed as the fundamental ethical position from which individuals in the globalized and digitalized societies can pursue a more harmonious time being. In that respect, *A Tale for the Time Being* chimes in with Jeremy Rifkin's argument that, in the currently existing socioeconomic conditions, the development of empathic consciousness is crucial for the survival of the global economy and the preservation of the biosphere (2009). In an age where the perception of reality is conditioned by the media, the capacity of literature to catalyze empathy renders story-telling instrumental in configuring that perception in terms of compassion, attention and care. In fact, the functioning of the literary medium itself may serve as a model of how such an ethical stance can be implemented in the present day and age.

6. Concluding Remarks

Due to the reality-forming potential of literature in the context of the postmodern paradigm, Ozeki's propositions may be summed up as follows: at the core of the functioning of the literary machine are the principles of Zen Buddhist understanding of existence. As these conceptually correspond to the metaphysical structuring of the postmodern globalized and digitalized realities, conceptualizing the self in terms of these principles may have a greater potential for ensuring a productive and contented existence within such realities than the dualist model. Since literature is a medium, it participates in the formation of postmodern hyperrealities in the same way as other media, that is, it generates information that may be incorporated into what postmodern individuals perceive as their respective realities. Hence, it is an ideal means of planting the implications of Zen Buddhist principles into the experiential scope of contemporary individuals.

On a broader scale, this means that the key to contentment and empowerment within the present circumstances lies in establishing communication on the basis of the same impulses that make us read, namely, interest, attention and care. In so doing, we call others into existence within what, by the act of connecting, becomes a shared context. Experiencing other contexts changes the concept of Otherness into an intertwined not-sameness that suggests essential oneness. The global consequences of 9/11, 3/11 or the war in Syria attest to the fact that we are indeed an integral part of global processes. Acknowledging that fact on a personal and communal level might very well lead to the

dissolution of the notion of Otherness on all levels, as well as to the comprehension of the critical importance of connectivity and connectedness and to the resulting awareness of the fundamental agency of being. Such a scenario is, after all, not only enacted in Ozeki's third novel. The possibilities and implications of its implementation are central to the research conducted by those distinctly postmodern disciplines that acknowledge the necessity for a new mapping of existence, from posthumanism, ecocriticism or queer theory to quantum physics. What Ozeki's example suggests is that perhaps there is no particular need to invent new ethical concepts for the current social and historical circumstances, since all the components of a suitable ethical system, one founded on empathy and care, already exist. In the words of the author and Zen Buddhist priest, delivered via Skype transcontinentally at what was simultaneously 6:30 a.m. and 1:30 p.m., "The world that the Zen story describes does seem to map very nicely on the world as we experience it now."[14]

Works Cited

Baudrillard, Jean. 2004. "Simulacra and Simulations." In Rivkin and Ryan 2004, 365-77.

—. 2011. *Impossible Exchange*. Translated by Chris Turner. London: Verso.

Beauregard, Guy. 2015. "On Not Knowing: *A Tale for the Time Being* and the Politics of Imagining Lives After March 11." *Canadian Literature* 227 (Winter): 96-112.

Bernard, Catherine. 2017. "And Yet: Figuring Global Trauma in Ruth Ozeki's *A Tale for the Time Being.*" In Ganteau and Onega 2017, 22-34.

Dallmayr, Reinhard. 1996. *Beyond Orientalism: Essays on Cross-Cultural Encounter*. Albany: SUNY P.

Davis, Bret W. 2018. "Zen's Nonegocentric Perspectivism." In Emmanuel 2018, 123-44.

Davis, Rocío G. 2015. "Fictional Transits in Ruth Ozeki's *A Tale for the Time Being*." *Biography* 38 (1): 87-104.

Deutsch, David. 2011. *The Beginning of Infinity: Explanations that Transform the World*. London: Allen Lane.

Dōgen, Eihei. 2002. *The Heart of Dōgen's Shōbōgenzō*. Translated by Norman Waddell and Masao Abe. Albany: SUNY P.

Emmanuel, Steven M., ed. 2018. *Buddhist Philosophy: A Comparative Approach.* Hoboken, NJ: Wiley Blackwell.

Ganteau, Jean-Michel and Susana Onega, eds. 2017. *Victimhood and Vulnerability in 21st Century Fiction.* New York and London: Routledge.

GASKINS, Robert W. 1999. "'Adding Legs to a Snake': A Reanalysis of Motivation and the Pursuit of Happiness from a Zen Buddhist Perspective." *Journal of Educational Psychology* 91 (2): 204-15.

GILES, James. 1993. "The No-Self Theory: Hume, Buddhism, and Personal Identity." *Philosophy East and West* 43 (2): 175-200.

HO, David Y. F. 1995. "Selfhood and Identity in Confucianism, Taoism, Buddhism, and Hinduism: Contrasts with the West." *Journal for the Theory of Social Behaviour* 25 (2): 115-39.

HOFFMAN, Louis et al. 2008. "Toward a Sustainable Myth of Self: An Existential Response to the Postmodern Condition." *Journal of Humanistic Psychology* 49 (2): 135-73.

KITTLER, Friedrich. 1987. "Gramophone, Film, Typewriter." Translated by Dorothea von Mücke with the assistance of Philippe L. Similon. *October* 41 (Summer): 101-18.

KREVEL, Mojca. 2017. "A Tale of Being Everything: Literary Subject in Ruth Ozeki's *A Tale for the Time Being*." *Brno Studies in English* 43 (2): 111-25.

LEE, Hsiu-chuan. 2018. "Sharing Worlds through Words: Minor Cosmopolitics in Ruth Ozeki's *A Tale for the Time Being*." *Ariel: A Review of International English Literature* 49 (1): 27-52.

LEVINE, Bruce E. 2013. "How our Society Breeds Anxiety, Depression and Dysfunction." *Salon*, August 26. [Accessed online on June 14, 2017].

LOVELL, Sue. 2018. "Towards a Poetics of Posthumanist Narrative Using Ruth Ozeki's *A Tale for the Time Being*." *Critique: Studies in Contemporary Fiction* 59 (1): 57-74.

OZEKI, Ruth. 2013a. "Confessions of a Zen Novelist." *Buddhadharma: The Practitioner's Quarterly* 15: 34-39.

—. 2013b. *A Tale for the Time Being.* New York: Penguin.

—. 2013c. "'A Universe of Many Worlds': An Interview with Ruth Ozeki." By Eleanor Ty. *MELUS: Multi-Ethnic Literature of the United States* 38 (3): 160-71.

—. 2013d. "Ruth Ozeki: 'This Book is about the Character Creating a Novelist.'" By Anita Sethi. *Guardian*, March 7. [Accessed online on March 15, 2016].

RAUD, Rein. 2015. "*Dōgen's* Idea of Buddha-Nature: Dynamism and Non-Referentiality." *Asian Philosophy* 25 (1): 1-14.

RIFKIN, Jeremy. 2009. *The Emphatic Civilization: The Race to Global Consciousness in a World in Crisis*. New York: Tarcher/Penguin.

RIVKIN, Julie and Michael Ryan, eds. 2004. *Literary Theory: An Anthology.* Oxford: Blackwell.

STOLOROW, Robert D. 2009. "Identity and Resurrective Ideology in an Age of Trauma." *Psychoanalytic Psychology* 26 (2): 206-209.

USUI, Masami. 2015. "The Waves of Words: Literature of 3/11 in and around Ruth Ozeki's *A Tale of* [*sic*] *the Time Being*." *Procedia: Social and Behavioral Sciences* 208: 91-95.

Mojca Krevel is Full Professor of Literatures in English at the University of Ljubljana. She is the author of books on cyberpunk fiction and the Avant-pop and the editor of a volume on hybridity in postmodern American fiction. She is coeditor of the journal *ELOPE*. Her research focuses primarily on contemporary American fiction from the perspective of the ongoing historical paradigm shift.

Address: English Department. Faculty of Arts. University of Ljubljana. Askerceva 2. 1000, Ljubljana, Slovenia. Tel. +386 2411338.

Body Awakening through Athletics:
A Gender Analysis of Corporealities in *Breathe, Annie, Breathe*

Rocío Riestra-Camacho
Universidad de Oviedo
rocioriestra23@gmail.com

In the context of Young Adult Sports Fiction, Miranda Kenneally's *Breathe, Annie, Breathe* (2014) addresses some crucial problematics that her protagonist, Annie, experiences through her body changes as she enters the world of athletics and campus life. Structured as a coming-of-age novel, *Breathe, Annie, Breathe* depicts Annie's progressive acknowledgement of her body as she trains for a marathon so as to honor her recently deceased boyfriend. First characterized as a rather passive young woman with no awareness of her physical and emotional potential, Annie starts to become a mature adult with a burgeoning sense of self, able to understand her body, academic goals and sexual desires, ultimately leading her to recover her affectivity beyond her first love. As her training progresses, Annie focuses increasingly on her growing endurance and prowess rather than her weight loss. Thus, from a gender perspective, Kenneally's novel demystifies the weight-loss process as an intrinsically feminine one, aligning it with wellbeing rather than beauty, in contrast to previous young adult novels. This points to an evolution in the Young Adult Sports Fiction genre which should be addressed in order to evaluate the positive impact it may have on young female readers' canons of corporeal beauty.

Keywords: Young Adult Sports Fiction; contemporary North American fiction; female body; sexuality; empowerment; eating disorders

. . .

Atletismo y despertar corpóreo: análisis en perspectiva de género de la corporalidad en *Breathe, Annie, Breathe*

En el campo de la literatura juvenil deportiva, *Breathe, Annie, Breathe* (2014), de la autora estadounidense Miranda Kenneally, aborda la transición a la universidad de su protagonista,

Annie, quien experimenta importantes cambios vitales y corporales al comenzar la vida en el campus e introducirse en el atletismo. Siguiendo la estructura de una novela de iniciación, *Breathe, Annie, Breathe* se centra en el reconocimiento del cuerpo a través de una maratón para la que la protagonista se entrena con la intención de honrar a su pareja, recientemente fallecida. Inicialmente caracterizada como una joven pasiva y sin conciencia sobre su potencial físico y afectivo, Annie va evolucionando hacia la madurez adulta, al tiempo que descubre su cuerpo y deseos sexuales y centra sus aspiraciones académicas. Este proceso, al final, la llevará a recuperar un sentido de afectividad más allá de su primer amor. A medida que avanza en sus entrenamientos, Annie no concede importancia a su pérdida de peso y se enorgullece, por el contrario, de la fuerza y resistencia conseguidas. En este sentido, desde una perspectiva de género la obra de Kenneally desmitifica la feminidad de la pérdida de peso al equiparar el cambio físico con el bienestar, más que con la belleza, al contrario de lo que ocurría con novelas juveniles anteriores. Ello indica una evolución en la novela juvenil deportiva que requiere de atención académica con el fin de evaluar el impacto positivo que puede tener sobre los cánones de belleza corpórea de las lectoras jóvenes.

Palabras clave: novela deportiva juvenil; novela norteamericana contemporánea; cuerpo femenino; sexualidad; empoderamiento; desórdenes alimenticios

1. The Development of Young Adult Sports Fiction in North American Literature

Young Adult Sports Fiction (henceforth YASF) is a subgenre within Young Adult (henceforth YA) literature whose characters, be it the protagonist or the majority of the characters, live in the world of sport. In the United States, this subgenre enjoys great popularity. According to Chris Crowe (2001, 131), by 2001 it had become the third most read subgenre overall. *BookPage* assistant editor Lily McLemore confirmed that this trend persisted well into 2015; indeed, she even claimed that YASF, especially in combination with romance, has undergone a phenomenon of "over publication" (McLemore 2016).

The history of YASF is well documented by Crowe, who explains how the basic narrative schema of the genre was established in the late nineteenth century with the appearance of short pulp sports novels, facetiously called "dime novels" (129). Their plot outline operated as follows: "a white boy […] with the help of a kindly mentor figure (an oldish white man) is able to rise up from mediocrity in his chosen sport (usually baseball but certainly one of the 'Big Three') to achieve success on the field or court, culminating in a home run, touchdown, or basket that wins the championship" (Beggs 2005, 1). The publication of weekly nonfiction sports columns by American writer and broadcaster John Roberts Tunis in *The New Yorker* between 1925 and 1932 popularized the sports story and was followed by the arrival of novels in the genre, also written by Tunis from the 1930s. Over the next few decades, Clair Bee, Thomas Dygard, Matt Christopher and Dean Hughes, among others, treaded on Tunis's heels; they published rather predictable sporting stories that did not vary much from the formula of those prototype pulp novels that had appeared at the turn of the nineteenth century (Beggs 2005, 1).

In the 1970s, the genre started becoming increasingly complex, particularly as regards gender, owing mainly to the work of Rozanne Knudson, who achieved enormous popularity with the portrayal of Zan, a pseudonym of herself as a fictional female athlete in a series of four sport novels, *Zanballer*, *Zanbanger*, *Zanboomer* and *Zan's Marathon*, published between 1972 and 1984. The date of the first part of the tetralogy is no coincidence, since this is the year when United States legislation changed the world of female sport with the incorporation of Title IX in the Education Amendments Act of 1972. The Title dictates that "no person in the United States shall, on the basis of sex, be excluded from participation in, be denied the benefits of, or be subjected to discrimination under any education program or activity receiving Federal financial assistance" (US Government Publishing Office 1972). The prohibition of sex discrimination in any kind of education activity increased female participation in college sports substantially:

> Before Title IX, few opportunities existed for female athletes. The National Collegiate
> Athletic Association (NCAA), which was created in 1906 to format and enforce rules in men's

football but had become the ruling body of college athletics, offered no athletic scholarships for women and held no championships for women's teams. Furthermore, facilities, supplies and funding were lacking. As a result, in 1972 there were just 30,000 women participating in NCAA sports, as opposed to 170,000 men. (History.com Editors 2009)

The enactment of Title IX led to an increase in the number of secondary school girls doing sport from 295,000 in 1972 to more than 2.6 million in 2009. In college, the number grew from 30,000 in 1972 to more than 150,000 in 2009 (History.com Editors 2009), a figure that has continued to rise since then. Girls' participation in football, for example, increased by 36,591 players between 2014-2015 and 2015-2016. By 2016, there were over 3.3 million girls registered in high-school sports programs (National Federation of State High School Associations 2016). The wider implications of Title IX and, more generally, of female incorporation in sports were essentially related to the economic and job markets. For one thing, it meant that more girls could have access to federal financial help through sports, which in the United States is a primary way to pursue further education programs. Moreover, being able to engage in sports subjects allowed young girls to escape the traditional sewing and homemaking school subjects which had long anchored them to the American housewife model. All in all, owing to the force and visibility of second-wave feminism, the 1970s was an important decade for women's advancement in classically male spheres, sport certainly being one of them.

Increased female participation in sports, however, was accompanied by major problems. Body image became increasingly acknowledged as an issue from the mid-1970s—by academia, in gender studies (for a review, see Howson 2005) and by society at large—coinciding with a huge rise in the number of women following diets and subjecting themselves to cosmetic surgery (Wolf [1991] 2015, 11). As Naomi Wolf starkly states, "the more legal and material hindrances women have broken through, the more strictly and heavily and cruelly images of female beauty have come to weigh upon us" (10), a fact that is reinforced by YA fiction in general, as an analysis of the genre by Beth Younger shows. Younger found that after 1975 there was "an increasing awareness of body-image issues" and the YA novels she discussed "reflect[ed] that growing awareness" (2009, 1).[1] She specifically claimed that "YA literature reflects […] the contemporary ultrathin standard of beauty" (3). The social mores of those years, she continued, evolved in terms of the meaning of beauty and sexuality for women. Her work, an analysis of the intersection between body image and sexuality in YA fiction since 1975, sheds light on the strong links that exist between these two corporeal spheres. The topics she investigates, including "weight, beauty, dieting and 'lookism' (the idea that a person is judged solely by looks)," are issues that "can be found in every subset of YA literature" (Younger 2009, xvi).

---

[1] Younger's 2009 extensive study deals with YA fiction from 1975 to 2005, thus expanding on her 2003 article, which covers until 1999.

The literary works written and published in the first two decades of the period Younger focuses on—from the 1970s to the mid-1990s—reflect a persistent reality about their characters: those "who do not 'fit' the hyper-thin European ideal [of the female body] are marginalized. In a revealing intersection of sexuality and body image, heavy characters are sexually promiscuous, passive and act as if they were powerless, while in marked contrast thin characters act responsibly and appear to be powerful" (Younger 2009, 4). In other words, "true" feminine beauty is epitomized in YA fiction by thin characters who, in turn, derive their "sexual assertion" (2009, 9) and sense of autonomy from their socially accepted bodies. Younger's analyses of these novels reveal that female athletes' bodies were also called into question for not demonstrating an "appropriate" femininity. Furthermore, their great emphasis on heteronormativity and compliance with feminine pursuits, focusing on attaining beauty, signal a fear of the potential association of female athletes with lesbianism and masculine bodies.[2]

If representation of female athletes in fiction, according to Younger, increased over the years mirroring the gains attained in women's sport owing to Title IX, a realistic depiction of them had not ensued.[3] Eating disorders, rampant among women and abundant within the female athlete population too, were often unacknowledged and were even wrongly represented in sports literature. This is emphasized by Mary Kane and Kimberly D. Pearce's claim that readers of YASF were given "just the opposite impression" since female characters' views about "gaining weight [were] hardly a concern" (2002, 81). Female athletes were depicted as voracious eaters with no concerns about their image: "for example, the gymnasts often met at a local hangout and routinely ordered ice cream cones and banana splits" (Kane and Pearce 2002, 81). It is not until the mid-1990s that North American YASF authors began portraying characters and situations that were closer to the new social realities regarding gender equality, feminism, female body image and, by extension, sexuality. From this point onwards, YASF novels progressively include corporeal disorders experienced by the female athlete protagonists and thinness is no longer the recurrent default position from which to attain sexual confidence.

In this context, Miranda Kenneally's work is of great interest as she is currently one of the most popular North American YASF writers and her books are crowded with girls who have contemporary, so-called female problems that they address through sports. In general terms, the depiction of female corporeality Kenneally offers focuses on the wellbeing

---

[2] A comprehensive study of the representation of female athletes on the covers of the two most bought US sports magazines—*Sports Illustrated* and *ESPN The Magazine*—from 1987/1998 to 2009 found an insistence on accentuating their femininity and commitment to heterosexual gender norms, including passivity in sports (Martin and McDonald 2012, 81, 88).

[3] In contrast with Younger, Grant Smith notes the existence of only nine novels in the 1970s, twenty-three in the 1980s and thirty-five until 1998 (1998). Similarly, Teri Rueth-Brandner reveals that in 1991, North American YASF works with male protagonists were still six times more common than works about female athletes (1991, 89).

of the protagonists within the context of their shared love for sport.[4] Nonetheless, her production and that of coetaneous YASF writers remains unacknowledged within the academia. The scarcity of analyses of YASF has been the case for decades, particularly with regard to works depicting female protagonists—in part because, as already mentioned, they still represent a minority within the genre. In 1985, only one article addressed this topic, Patricia Griffin's "R. R. Knudson's Sport Fiction: A Feminist Critique." From a gender perspective, Griffin examined the representation of adolescent sports women in Knudson's YASF novels and concluded that they were portrayed as social oddities. At the end of the 1990s, Mary Kane's "Fictional Denials of Female Empowerment: A Feminist Analysis of Young Adult Sports Fiction" (1998) stands out, her major contribution being the incorporation of a feminist perspective on the subgenre. She pointed out that previous analyses had focused on the gendering of sports within print and broadcast journalism and, moreover, on adult figures. They had tended to ignore sports fiction and, more specifically, young adult sports fiction. In her work, she went on to show that YASF novels "characterized female protagonists as going against their 'true nature'" and concluded that, up to that point, YASF with female protagonists represented "a fictional denial of sport as a site of resistance and empowerment for athletic females" (1998, 231). In a very recent review, Wendy J. Glenn analyzed a set of young adult novels with female characters practicing sports in male teams published between 2005 and 2017. Glenn showed how "they [the female characters] struggle to navigate the culture of power (i.e., the male world of sport)" and concluded that "the institutional structures of sport reinforce traditionally masculine norms" in these works (2019: i).

The virtual nonexistence of reviews of Kenneally's novels is somewhat surprising, given her great popularity. In what follows, I put forward the first literary analysis of her fiction from a gender perspective. I focus particularly on her 2014 novel *Breathe, Annie, Breathe,* where the intersection between body image, sexuality and wellbeing (both physical and emotional) is depicted in a positive light that is well worth investigating from this angle.

2. The Representation of Eating Disorders, Sports and Gender in Kenneally's Work

That eating disorders are pervasive among women is a well-researched phenomenon within medical literature (see, for example, Bordo 1993). The situation is particularly worrying among athletes. As is the case with the general population, female athletes tend to experience harmful corporeal disorders more often than their male counterparts (Beals 2004, 45; Dosil 2008, xvi). These include both disordered eating practices

---

[4] For the purposes of the analysis, the concept of "wellbeing" is preferred over the somewhat slippery notion of "health." The latter is exploited by contemporary fitness trends (Shildrick and Price 1998, 10), while socially acclaimed commitment to health may contribute to socializing practitioners into extreme or orthorectic approaches to exercising (Bratman and Knight 2004, 9).

(e.g., bulimia) and those directly linked to sports (e.g., bigorexia), yet the latter have hitherto been reported as being exclusive to males. Thus, Katherine Beals, following Arnold Andersen (1994), states that "males are more apt to use excessive exercise as a means of weight-control, whereas *females typically use more passive methods*, such as severe energy restriction, vomiting and laxative abuse" (2004, 63; italics added). The section in italics points to the prevalent association between women, or rather femininity, and passivity, which has permeated Western thought since Aristotle, as noted by Simone de Beauvoir in her classic study *The Second Sex* ([1949] 2012, 37).

Correspondingly, the hegemonic masculinity prevalent among athletes, underpinned by the "overwhelming sociocultural belief [...] that 'real men don't diet'" (Beals 2004, 63), leads them to mockingly reject passive weight-control methods as part of anorexia, "the female's disease." This attitude is so widespread that Beals devotes a whole section to explaining the etiology behind anorexia's gender gap in athletes' eating disorders. Female athletes, she explains, are more pressured to be thin and are more readily judged by their body appearance, including weight and shape (Beals 2004, 56). It is therefore understandable that women have historically been associated with doing sport for aesthetic reasons, that is to say, in order to attain a more beautiful body (Tsaturyan 2010, iii). As Pierre Bourdieu points out, for females, "who are more imperatively required to submit to the norms defining what the body ought to be, not only in its perceptible configuration but also in its motion, its gait, etc.," the "health-giving functions" of sport "are always more or less strongly associated with what might be called aesthetic functions" (1991, 372). The importance of the physiological benefits of sport, therefore, is quickly overridden for women by the pursuit of beauty, a pattern that underpins the higher prevalence of disordered eating habits among women, which, if taken to extremes, provoke serious organic problems. They may even prevent the adequate performance of the sports activity itself.

Current positive body image movements, such as the eat-to-grow movement among Instagram fitness practitioners, might point to a recent societal mutation wherein women have started doing exercise and sports in order to gain strength and a sufficiently energized body, while, however, still aiming to stay thin.[5] To put it another way, although women still work to achieve a slim body, they may also be engaging in sports activities for wellbeing-based reasons. If this trend continues to evolve and both goals are maintained in the female imaginary, the change might be signaling a significant transformation of the experience of corporeality for women in Western society, one that would no doubt be beneficial to women's health in future. Nonetheless,

---

[5]   The eat-to-grow movement has over 1.3 million posts on Instagram alone and appears well balanced as regards gender. The trend is indicative of the progressive acceptance of muscularity in women. In *Venus with Biceps: A Pictorial History of Muscular Women*, David Chapman notes that women, "including those in the emerging female bodybuilder community, have had to fight hard to reclaim the image of female muscularity as their own" (2011, i). See also Elizabeth Wessinger (2015) for an updated historical review of the volatility of female corporeal trends.

as Wolf claims, the compulsive kind of exercising that may arise from these practices still derives from the beauty myth, which "is not about women at all. It is about men's institutions and institutional power" ([1991] 2015, 13). Thus, it remains unsafe to state that this latest trend is in fact totally favorable for the female body. Truly positive female corporeal images must result from women's embracing their own bodies fully, rather than emanate from some specific imperative at any given moment in time.

With this caveat in mind, Kenneally's novel *Breathe, Annie, Breathe* does display a salutary evolution of the female corporeal imaginary through its representation of the protagonist's wellbeing-related rather than aesthetic reasons for engaging in athletics. Annie becomes involved in the world of running in order to fulfill the dream that Kyle, her recently deceased partner, could not himself realize. From a gender lens, it could be readily argued that Annie's reasons for taking up this sport are not, at least at the outset, truly empowering. However, as the plot progresses, the reader discovers that the protagonist is really running the race for the sake of her own health, that is, to heal her tortured mind and afflicted body, in constant sorrow following her life-changing loss.[6] By discovering her new wants and desires and by means of a first-person, internally focalized narrative, Annie gradually develops her voice, which feels increasingly cognizant of her world as the story unfolds. As Caroline Knapp puts it (2004, 46-53), the question posed addresses young female identity: what are the protagonist's "hungers" for adult life? She needs to discover them and running allows her to do so by gaining control of her surrounding context: "High school is over. I take a sip of my drink. The more I think about it, what I love most about the running and exercising is the control. I have complete control over me, my body, my future. Which is something I haven't felt since he died. And I want to keep that feeling" (Kenneally 2014, 55).[7] When questioned by a fan about her source of inspiration for the novel, Kenneally supported this complementary body/identity view: "I thought that coming to terms with a death would be a good plot to complement the marathon training, because both are very tough things to work through" (2015). In addition, developing a sense of identity through sport helps Annie to lose her fears about her own physicality. In the author's words, she is "a very normal girl" who has always hated running, yet proves to young female readers that "they can learn to run long distances too" (2015).

As discussed above, the much commoner goal for a woman to engage in any kind of sport, particularly if it is unconnected to training for a competition, is losing weight. The protagonist herself acknowledges this when she reflects that "some people on my team are running because it's a lifelong dream, some want to lose weight and others like me haven't told anyone why they're doing this" (4). Nevertheless, even what might

---

[6] In her recently released autobiography, English model and actress Kelly Brook makes a similar case with respect to dancing, which served as therapy for enduring her father's cancer (2014, 21).

[7] Susie Orbach relates female identity formation with control through the idea that for a woman "the need to control her body […] is a symbol of emotional needs" (2005, xii). Although specifically referring to anorexia in the original, the link is likewise relevant here.

initially seem to be an association of running with weight loss on the part of one of Annie's running partners, Liza, is later explained in terms of wellbeing. Liza claims: "'I needed to get back in shape and I wanted a fun way to meet people, so here I am'" (79). Liza's reasons for wanting to get in shape are made clear much later: "'I wasn't healthy. I hadn't been to the doctor in years and I was living off coffee and takeout […] and it didn't make me happy'" (219). Liza's emphasis on her decision to commit to marathon training in order to attain a personal sense of wellbeing and happiness definitely transcends a concern for her physical shape. As she adds, running a marathon is about "do[ing] something I've always wanted to do" (220).

Furthermore, losing excessive weight is marked as dangerous in the story, because it distances the protagonist from an energized body and from the appropriate frame of build to perform effectively in the marathon. Her trainer, Matt, urges Annie to "start adding more peanut butter and eggs to your diet. You're getting too skinny and you need to eat more as we start doing longer and longer runs" (82). Instead of emphasizing weight loss, her coach puts his effort into her gaining endurance and strength. In one of the training sessions, Matt announces that she is going to do "'some speed bursts. They'll make you stronger'" (81). Suicide sprints, in turn, are "to make [her] heart stronger" (148). At the time of her first race, run as part of her training schedule, Annie is already very proud of the physical prowess she has attained: "a year ago, I couldn't run half a mile. And I've just finished my first 5K. I laugh, grinning up at the sun" (178). The most telling thought she has about athletics in this sense is when she understands the influence exercise exerts on her sense of wellness. When talking about her future plans and the courses she intends to take, she reflects on the importance of sports and concludes, "I like feeling healthy" (136).

The second route the novel takes in order to signal the importance of wellbeing in the world of sport is its positive depiction of the female protagonist's relationship with food. There is never any hint that Annie is worried about food making her fat. Throughout the story, we are frequently told about her habit of nibbling: "I reach over into Nick's bowl and steal a potato chip" (164), "I steal cherries from the bar and pop them in my mouth" (171), "He [Jeremiah, the protagonist's new romantic attachment] opens a bag of Swedish fish he brought and offers me one. I choose an orange fish" (234). Although sometimes described as an instance of stealing, Annie shows playfulness and no guilt or shame about nibbling.[8] Greedily eating big quantities of food is positively portrayed as well, which is essential to a gender perspective since women's voracious habits with food have been historically condemned by being associated with promiscuous sexuality (Culbert and Klump 2005, 361) and masculine behaviors (Vartanian et al. 2007, 265). Annie, however, "rip[s] huge chunks off [a watermelon] with [her] teeth, wiping the juice from [her] lips with the back of [her] hand" and the only comment she gets is a funny one from Jeremiah about not eating the seeds or else "you'll grow a watermelon

---

[8]   Orbach (2005) explores the frequent negative affective component of women's relationship with food.

baby!" (187). On one of her first days at university, she loads her plate with food and Colton, one of her best friends, congratulates her for it: "Colton fist-bumps me. 'Now that is what I'm talking about. Three barbecue sandwiches *and* a hot dog?' 'I'm starving,' I say, taking a big bite of the hot dog" (224; italics in the original). These passages thus exemplify that Annie is both capable of eating small quantities of food, as when she nibbles, which is "considered feminine" (Knapp 2004, 43), but enjoys eating larger amounts too.

The kind of food Annie consumes is also worth mentioning, since she frequently eats large quantities of carbohydrates. Carbs, as they are often referred to, are a frequently feared food type among dieters, though they are also known as "athlete's food" because they are an important source of energy for sports performance (Dosil 2008, 6). That Annie takes carbo-loading seriously as an eating habit—"I wave at Joe as I pass Joe's All-You-Can-Eat-Pasta Shack where I like to carbo-load on Fridays at lunch before my Saturday long runs" (159)—indicates that she agrees to follow a specialized diet to ensure good sports performance. If she were worried about putting on weight, she would be avoiding both carbs and hyper-sugary training products—gel packs, Gatorade and bananas—and other calorific foods, which she in fact consumes regularly. Actually, Annie is depicted as a girl with a sweet tooth—she loves cookies, Blizzard shakes, Jolly Ranchers sweets—and as an eater of junk food—she often has pizza or hot dogs, which are often represented as key components of a masculinized diet (Lipschitz 2009, 1). Nevertheless, she also nourishes her body with salad and fruit, such as the already mentioned watermelon and cherries, quite frequently claimed to be more feminine foodstuffs (Lipschitz 2009, 1). Overall, this suggests that Annie simply follows her body's needs and is not engaged in any sort of disordered eating behavior. What is more, her food intake is portrayed as a social occasion rather than a private activity. This is counterindicative of the existence of any eating disorders, where sufferers typically avoid eating at social occasions (Abraham 2015, 107), although the opposite pattern of gorging oneself publicly only to compensate for it afterwards, as in bulimia, is also possible (Bordo 1993, 128). On the contrary, Annie has lunch with her mother and brother or when hanging out with friends, to mention but a couple of examples.

Finally, it is important to mention that after her first training sessions, Annie develops stomach problems, not being able to hold down food and vomiting frequently. Significantly, her worries at this point are mostly about the effects this may have on her ability to finish the remaining training sessions or the marathon itself. Her vomiting is not portrayed as a sign of bulimia at all: "My older brother is cooking a grilled cheese sandwich […]. He flips his sandwich. It sizzles in the frying pan and makes my stomach rumble. I'm starving, but I don't think I can hold any food down. Running screws with my stomach—I can't tell if I need to eat or use the bathroom" (22). In sum, through two strictly physiological aspects of wellbeing—living in a stronger body and properly nourishing it—Kenneally's novel can be seen as favoring a sensible corporeal

philosophy, which may be defined as "engaging in self-care behaviors" in order "to function well" (Wood-Barcalow et al. 2010, 112), while also preserving oneself from society's pressures about being overly skinny and having disordered eating habits (Wood-Barcalow et al. 2010, 110-12).

Annie's commitment to athletics is simultaneously linked to more symbolic growth in terms of wellness. As the story progresses, the protagonist matures, particularly as regards sexuality but also with respect to her emotions and her adult life choices. The use of a bildungsroman pattern focusing on the transition year between secondary school and university and the use of the marathon plot device are the formal elements through which the novel traces this growth. In the only review found of the novel, Amy Atkinson explains that the marathon plot device works in *Breathe, Annie, Breathe* as "moving both the reader and Annie through her training and her grief at a pace that feels authentic to the experience of deep loss coinciding with emerging adulthood and all its accompanying discoveries and excitement" (2014, i). Emotionally, readers know from the beginning that marathon training is Annie's mechanism for ending her mourning for Kyle, where she is stuck at the outset of the novel. Annie's mother addresses her in the following terms: "'Never talking about him isn't healthy sweetie. You need to let it out'" (84). There is an important parallel established at the beginning of her training between healing the mind and focusing on the body, which neatly explains the novel's title—"*Stop thinking about him. Stop already.* Breathe in, breathe out" (6; italics in the original) is swiftly followed by "Kyle's grin flashes in my mind. A quarter mile more. One foot after the other. Breathe, Annie, breathe" (8). Here, Annie's effort to concentrate on breathing and moving her feet, two corporeal actions, is portrayed as relieving her from thinking of her dead boyfriend. She thus eventually attains a view of her body that is neither separate from her state of mind, nor subsumed by it, granting transcendence to her own sense of corporeality, as Elizabeth Grosz contends (1994, 4).

On its part, the information provided about the protagonist's sexuality progressively shifts from focusing on her passivity and chastity with Kyle to emphasizing her agentic bodily desire for Jeremiah. Annie's sexual awareness grows as she acknowledges her body through running—"during my first session with [Matt] I discovered muscles I didn't know I had" (92)—and, consequently, her corporeal needs. Comparing a passage from the beginning of the story, when Kyle was still alive—"Month after month, mile after mile, I was there with an energy bar, a smile and a kiss […]. 'Can I have a kiss? To get me through the last five miles?' 'You're all sweaty and gross!' He [Kyle] pulled me to this chest. 'You don't care.' And he was right" (8-9)—to a couple from towards the end—"Jere takes my hand […]. His dark jeans, knit cap and snug gray tee make my mouth go dry" (259) and "then his lips tell me not to think anymore, to just do what I want to do, and I whisper okay" (265)—clearly illustrates the change. Taking into account that Annie experienced appetite loss right after Kyle's death, the references to Annie's mouth and Jeremiah's lips point to Annie's renewed appetite in relation to both

her nourishment and her sexual needs, which now appear to be more mature than her chaste attachment to Kyle. The references, in short, signal the protagonist's recovery of both her physiological and her emotional stability—she is now able to eat and to feel affection again.

Introduction into university life is the other field portrayed in the novel to illustrate Annie's symbolic growth. The emotional disorientation Annie experiences the day she arrives at university is made abundantly clear: "Laughter and music fill the hallways. I suddenly feel panicky, like I don't know who I am or what I'm supposed to do. Can you lose your identity in a place that you don't understand?" (215). This passage suggests feelings similar to those brought about by her physiological dizziness when she starts training—"*Two fucking laps? That's all I could do?* […]. On wobbly legs, I hobbled toward my car" (10; italics in the original). While teenage culture, particularly the magazines published explicitly for the adolescent market, "uniformly preach […] dieting and weight control" as the solution "to the crises of adolescence" (Knapp 2004, 27), Annie's crises are resolved through the nexus formed by her sporting life and her final degree choice of physical therapy instead of nursing. In fact, it is her acceptance of her body and her love for sport as it brings wellbeing to her life that make Annie want to extend positive corporeal behaviors to others: "I liked helping Jeremiah when he hurt his foot, and I like feeling healthy and being on a schedule. It could be cool to help somebody else the way Matt has helped me. I've sort of been thinking about physical therapy or nursing" (136). This is essential for the advancement of positive body awakening in the girls and young women who form the readership of Kenneally's novels. The study conducted by Nichole Wood-Barcalow, Tracy Tylka and casey Augustus-Hovarth emphasizes the importance of girls learning and teaching "body appreciation" to "others in their community, culture, and social network" (2010, 112) and the following statements by two of Kenneally's readers, reported in *Teen Vogue*, seem to confirm this:

> "Having girls play traditionally masculine sports in books *just makes it more normal*," Claire Westerlund, 18, tells *Teen Vogue*. "If you're in seventh or eighth grade and you're kind of like trying to decide 'what should I do in high school' or 'what should I start to get involved in,' I think it's really important to see that." […]. That resonated with Willa, who has dealt with *pressure many girls face:* feeling like they have to be good at everything […]. When Willa read Miranda's June 2017 release *Coming Up for Air*, a story following a swimmer with Olympic aspirations, she happened to be struggling with whether or not she wanted to stick with the sport. The book kept her in the pool. […]. "There wasn't, at least in my experience, someone really focusing on me just as being a female athlete" she says. "For me to see a book about a girl who struggles with her athleticism and to come out on top, and see her being really successful at that, gave me a lot of inspiration." (Felicien 2017; italics added)

3. Conclusion

In the 1990s, Linda Forrest stressed the need for young female audiences to find themselves represented in sports fiction so as to help them fight gender stereotyping at such an essential point in their lives (1993, 38). As has been contended throughout this article, a negative, essentialist trend had hitherto been prevalent in YA fiction. The female body was homogenized in terms of what it ought to look like for it to become a site of putative empowerment. Skinniness was equated with beauty and, therefore, confidence and autonomy, while YASF, in particular, not only avoided representing the bodily problems derived from this pattern, but on occasion misrepresented them by glossing over the eating disorders their female athlete characters often suffered from. Deriving from the influence of feminism and scholarly works like Forrest's, from the mid-1990s onwards North American YASF finally began fictionalizing the gender-specific, raw truth of female athletes'—and, by extension, women's—disordered corporealities and incorporating the reality of eating disorders in their plots. Nonetheless, it seems that academic recognition of these works from a gender perspective has stalled, since popularly acclaimed contemporary YASF works, like Kenneally's *Breathe, Annie, Breathe*, remain unacknowledged.

It has been my intention, therefore, to reclaim the positive influence her work can exert on young female audiences in the United States, as regards both their interest in the sporting world and its wellbeing benefits, and the development of a more positive outlook on their body. Such a transformation, as the protagonist of *Breathe, Annie, Breathe* shows, can be initiated through an acknowledgment of one's own wants, which for teenagers is sometimes a difficult step to take. Young women especially, as is the case with Annie, are "unfamiliar with their own needs" and their corporeal sense of self, which may lead them to look for shelter in narrowly defined views of it, like anorexia (Orbach 2004, 23). Engaging sensibly in sports is this novel's answer when it comes to young adult female identity and corporeal formation, as it provides the protagonist with the opportunity to learn to breathe, a metaphor, as the title suggests, for learning to know one's body and vital desires. Marathon running becomes Annie's new *appetite*. Definitely, she becomes literally hungrier for food in the novel, but only as the logical result of her training and physical effort. This contributes to recovering a meaning of "eating" that Knapp deems lost, as food has forfeited "its basic associations with nourishment" (2004, 28). What for one young woman may be the solution to an identity crisis, as sport is for Annie, may not fulfill the same function for another. Nevertheless, one asset of literature, and especially of YA novels, is that the experiences of the protagonists do not claim to represent those of every teenager, but they do have the capacity to make many adolescent readers feel a sense of identification.

WORKS CITED

ABRAHAM, Suzanne. 2015. *Eating Disorders: The Facts.* Oxford: Oxford UP.

ANDERSEN, Arnold. 1992. "Eating Disorders in Male Athletes: A Special Case?" In Brownell, Rodin and Wilmore 1992, 172-88.

ATKINSON, Amy. 2014. Review of *Breathe, Annie, Breathe,* by Miranda Kenneally. *Bulletin of the Center for Children's Books* 68 (1): 35-36.

BEALS, Katherine A. 2004. *Disordered Eating Among Athletes: A Comprehensive Guide for Health Professionals.* Champaign, IL: Human Kinetics.

BEAUVOIR, Simone de. (1949) 2012. *The Second Sex.* Translated by Constance Borde and Sheila Malovany-Chevalier. New York: Vintage.

BEGGS, Jim. 2005. "More Than a Game: Sports Literature for Young Adults (review)." *Children's Literature Association Quarterly* 30 (2): 221-24.

BORDIEU, Pierre. 1991. "Sport and Social Class." In Mukerji and Schudson 1991, 357-73.

BORDO, Susan. 1993. *Unbearable Weight: Feminism, Western Culture and the Body.* Berkeley: California UP.

BRATMAN, Steven and David Knight. 2004. *Health Food Junkies: Overcoming the Obsession with Healthful Eating.* New York: Broadway.

BROOK, Kelly. 2014. *Close Up: The Autobiography.* London: Pan Macmillan.

BROWNELL, Kelly D., Judith Rodin and Jack Wilmore, eds. 1992. *Eating, Body Weight and Performance in Athletes: Disorders of Modern Society.* Philadelphia, PA: Lea and Febiger.

CHAPMAN, David. 2011. *Venus with Biceps: A Pictorial History of Muscular Women.* Vancouver: Arsenal Pulp.

CROWE, Chris. 2001. "Young Adult Literature: Sports Literature for Young Adults." *The English Journal* 90 (6): 129-33.

CULBERT, Kristen and Kelly Klump. 2005. "Impulsivity as an Underlying Factor in the Relationship between Disordered Eating and Sexual Behaviour." *International Journal of Eating Disorders* 38 (4): 361-66.

DOSIL, Joaquín. 2008. *Eating Disorders in Athletes.* Chichester: John Wiley & Sons.

FELICIEN, Bria. 2017. "Three Reasons Why We Need More YA Books About Girls Who Play Sports." *Teen Vogue,* February 3. [Accessed online on December 3, 2017].

FORREST, Linda. 1993. "Young Adult Fantasy and the Search for Gender-Fair Genres." *Journal of Youth Services in Libraries* 7 (1): 37-42.

GATZ, Margaret, Michael Messner and Sandra Ball-Rokeach, eds. 2002. *Paradoxes of Youth and Sport.* Albany: SUNY P.

GLENN, Wendy J. 2019. "Fictional Girls Who Play with the Boys: Barriers to Access in the Transition to Male-Dominated Sports Teams." *Children's Literature in Education* 1: 1-23.

GRIFFIN, Patricia. 1985. "R. R. Knudson's Sport Fiction: A Feminist Critique." *Arete: The Journal of Sport Literature* 3 (1): 3-10.

GROSZ, Elizabeth. 1994. *Volatile Bodies: Toward a Corporeal Feminism*. Bloomington: Indiana UP.

HISTORY.COM EDITORS. 2009. "Title IX Enacted." *History*, Nov 16. [Accessed online on November 20, 2017].

HOWSON, Alexandra. 2005. *Embodying Gender*. London: Sage.

KANE, Mary. 1998. "Fictional Denials of Female Empowerment: A Feminist Analysis of Young Adult Sports Fiction." *Sociology of Sport Journal* 15 (3): 231-62.

KANE, Mary and Kimberly D. Pearce. 2002. "Representations of Female Athletes in Young Adult Sports Fiction: Issues and Intersections of Race and Gender." In Gatz, Messner and Ball-Rokeach 2002, 69-93.

KENNEALLY, Miranda. 2014. *Breathe, Annie, Breathe*. Naperville, IL: Sourcebooks Fire.

—. 2015. "Ask the Author: Miranda Kenneally." *Goodreads*. [Accessed online on November 30, 2017].

KNAPP, Caroline. 2004. *Appetites: Why Women Want*. Berkeley, CA: Counterpoint.

LIPSCHITZ, Lisa. 2009. "Being Manly Men: Conveying Masculinity through Eating Behaviour." Master's thesis, University of Toronto.

MARTIN, Adam and Mary McDonald. 2012. "Covering Women's Sport? An Analysis of *Sports Illustrated* Covers from 1987-2009 and *ESPN The Magazine* Covers from 1998-2009." *Graduate Journal of Sport, Exercise & Physical Education Research* 1: 81-97.

MCLEMORE, Lily. 2016. "Predicting the Next Romance Trend." *BookPage,* February 11. [Accessed online on November 15, 2017].

MUKERJI, Chandra and Michael Schudson, eds. 1991. *Rethinking Popular Culture: Contemporary Perspectives in Cultural Studies.* Berkeley: U of California P.

NATIONAL FEDERATION OF STATE HIGH SCHOOL ASSOCIATIONS. 2016. "High School Sports Participation Increases for 27th Consecutive Year." *NFHS News*, September 12. [Accessed online on October 30, 2017].

ORBACH, Susie. 2005. *Hunger Strike: The Anorectic's Struggle as a Metaphor for our Age.* London and New York: Karnac.

RUETH-BRANDNER, Teri. 1991. "Sports Fiction for Young Women: Not Enough of a Good Thing." *Voice of Youth Advocates* 14: 89-90.

SHILDRICK, Margrit and Janet Price. 1998. "Vital Signs: Texts, Bodies and Biomedicine." In Shildrick and Price 1998, 1-18.

SHILDRICK, Margrit and Janet Price, eds. 1998. *Vital Signs: Feminist Reconfigurations of the Bio/logical Body*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP.

SMITH, Grant. 1998. "Since Title IX: Female Athletes in Young Adult Fiction." *Oncourse-Indiana University Knowledge Base*. [Accessed online on January 14, 2018; no longer available].

TSATURYAN, Christina. 2010. "Sport as Art: The Female Athlete in French Literature." Master's thesis, Brigham Young University.

US GOVERNMENT PUBLISHING OFFICE. 1972. Education Amendments of 1972. Pub. L. No. 92-318. S. 659, 92nd Cong.

VARTANIAN, Lenny, Peter Herman and Janet Polivy. 2007. "Consumption Stereotypes and Impression Management: How You Are What You Eat." *Appetite* 48: 265-77.

WESSINGER, Elizabeth. 2015. *This Year's Model: Fashion, Media, and the Making of Glamour.* New York and London: New York UP.

WOLF, Naomi. (1991) 2015. *The Beauty Myth: How Images of Beauty are Used Against Women.* London: Vintage.

WOOD-BARCALOW, Nichole, Tracy Tylka and Casey Augustus-Hovarth. 2009. "'But I Like My Body': Positive Body Image Characteristics and a Holistic Model for Young-Adult Women." *Body Image* 7 (2): 106-16.

YOUNGER, Beth. 2003. "Pleasure, Pain, and the Power of Being Thin: Female Sexuality in Young Adult Literature." *NWSA Journal* 15 (2): 45-56.

—. 2009. *Learning Curves: Body Image and Female Sexuality in Young Adult Literature.* Lanham, MD, Toronto and Plymouth: Scarecrow.

Rocío Riestra-Camacho is a PhD candidate in the Department of English Philology at the University of Oviedo. Her research interests focus on US and YA literature, cognitive literary studies, gender and corporeality. She investigates the effects on young female readers of representations of eating and sports practice in novels, specifically their cognitive bibliotherapeutic potential to treat anorexia.

Address: Departamento de Filología Anglogermánica y Francesa. Facultad de Filosofía y Letras. Universidad de Oviedo. Calle Amparo Pedregal, s/n. 33011 Oviedo, Asturias, Spain. Tel.: +34 636596530.

Escape and Consolation:
Narrative Voice and Metafiction in the *Harry Potter* Series

AUBA LLOMPART PONS
Universitat de Vic - Universitat Central de Catalunya
auba.llompart@uvic.cat

This article sets out to examine narrative voice in J. K. Rowling's *Harry Potter* series (1997-2007) as well as the presence of metatextual and metafictional elements in her novels. Special attention will be paid to Tom Riddle's diary, which first appears in *Harry Potter and the Chamber of Secrets* (1998), and the book of fairy tales and companion to the series, *The Tales of Beedle the Bard* (2007). While Rowling's seven-book series has been extensively discussed, the companion books that purport to be the books that the main characters read in the novels—*Fantastic Beasts and Where to Find Them* (2001), *Quidditch Through the Ages* (2001) and *The Tales of Beedle the Bard*—have not received the same amount of critical attention. Yet these and other examples of metadiegetic narratives provide thought-provoking insights into the series's commentary on the relationship between texts and readers, adults and children. Through a careful examination of Rowling's narrative voice and her use of metafiction, I argue that the author gives her sometimes dark, disturbing story a narrative frame that not only provides the reader with consolation and reassurance, but also offers a commentary on the importance of storytelling and children's literature. Metafiction thus makes Rowling's work more complex than we might assume, challenging its readers to navigate through different narrative levels and reflect on the very act of reading.

Keywords: J. K. Rowling; *Harry Potter*; *Tales of Beedle the Bard*; narrative voice; metafiction; children's literature

. . .

Escapismo y consolación:
voz narrativa y metaficción en la saga *Harry Potter*

Este artículo analiza la voz narrativa y la presencia de elementos metatextuales y metaficcionales en las novelas de la saga *Harry Potter* (1997-2007), de J. K. Rowling,

prestando especial atención al diario de Tom Riddle, que aparece por primera vez en *Harry Potter y la Cámara Secreta* (1998), y al libro de cuentos complementario de la serie, *Cuentos de Beedle el Bardo* (2007). Mientras que se ha hablado mucho de los siete libros que componen la saga, los libros complementarios que pretenden ser los mismos que los protagonistas leen en las novelas—*Animales fantásticos y dónde encontrarlos* (2001), *Quidditch a través de los tiempos* (2001) y *Cuentos de Beedle el Bardo*—no han atraído el mismo nivel de atención por parte de los críticos. Sin embargo, estos y otros ejemplos de narrativas metadiegéticas nos permiten entender mejor la representación de la relación entre texto y lector, adulto y niño, a lo largo de la saga. Mediante el análisis de la voz narrativa y la metaficción, argumento que, a pesar de que la historia que se cuenta es a veces oscura y perturbadora, la autora le otorga un marco narrativo que proporciona acompañamiento y seguridad a los lectores, además de una reflexión sobre la importancia de la literatura infantil y del arte de contar historias. Así pues, la metaficción aporta complejidad a la obra de Rowling y desafía al lector a viajar entre los diferentes niveles de la narración y a reflexionar sobre el acto de leer.

Palabras clave: J. K. Rowling; *Harry Potter*; *Cuentos de Beedle el Bardo*; voz narrativa; metaficción; literatura infantil

1. Introduction

Ever since the start of its publication, J. K. Rowling's *Harry Potter* series has been praised for its tackling of disturbing issues, such as death, grieving, war and political conflicts, in a way that young readers can grasp. This, however, has also brought about harsh criticisms from parents who find the series's contents far too dark and disturbing for children. In the BBC documentary *J. K. Rowling: Harry Potter and Me* (Pattison 2001, 43:53), Rowling explains that a mother wrote her a letter complaining about the ending of the second book, *Harry Potter and the Chamber of Secrets* (1998), in which Harry confronts and kills a basilisk.[1] In response to this criticism, Rowling stated that "I'm not writing to make anyone's children feel safe" (Pattison 2001, 44:39). What these adult readers—and the author herself—seem not to be aware of is that, despite the darkness of its subject matter, the *Harry Potter* series does provide reassurance and consolation to its readers to a certain extent, thus conforming to the conventions of children's literature. This is achieved through Rowling's incredibly effective handling of narrative voice and narrative technique. In her study of narrative voice in children's fiction, Barbara Wall affirms that "loveliness and ugliness, sadness and delight, comedy, tragedy and horror are all part of life, and might all appropriately be part of fiction for children, provided that the voice of the narrator, the voice which presents these things to children, is a voice which speaks to them with love and respect" (1991, 273). We therefore need to pay attention not only to *what* is being told, but also *how* it is being told. In the case of children's literature, it is of the utmost importance that (adult) narrators address their (child) narratees in a way that reflects an appropriate relationship between adult and child. Indeed, although children's literature is and has always been characterised by its experiments in narrative voice, the vast majority of narrators of children's literature are reassuring and friendly adult voices that make unpleasant experiences palatable to child readers. Rowling's narrator is no exception, as the first section of this article aims to demonstrate.

The second section, on the other hand, looks into how the presence of metatextual and metafictional devices in the series temporarily challenges the reliability and the authority of Rowling's narrator, only to reaffirm these qualities in the end. This not only shows that Rowling's narrative technique conforms to and reinforces children's literature conventions, but it also provides insight into the discourse on books, reading, storytelling and the relationship between author and reader that the novels endorse. This discourse is articulated by means of two narrative devices commonly used not only in children's fiction, but also in fantasy novels: metafiction and metalepsis.

In light of this analysis, I argue that metatextuality and metafiction provide the author with the opportunity to build a discourse on the functionalities of texts,

---

[1]   In the second book, life in Hogwarts is disrupted by a mysterious monster whose victims are found petrified or dead. Legend has it that the founder of Slytherin house built a chamber in the castle, known as the chamber of secrets, to be the home of a monster that would purge Hogwarts of students who were not pure-blood witches and wizards. In Harry's second year of school, this monster, which is revealed to be a basilisk that kills everyone who looks it directly in the eye, is unleashed again by the heir of Slytherin, i.e., Lord Voldemort.

storymaking and storytelling in her novels, which concludes with the questioning of and a warning against those narratives that purport to be objective, such as news stories, diary entries and biographies, among others. This is best illustrated in Rowling's novels by journalist Rita Skeeter's outrageously sensationalist stories, Gilderoy Lockhart's deceptive memoirs and Tom Riddle's manipulative diary. By contrast, the *Harry Potter* series highlights the value of those texts that do not claim to be telling the truth and do not demand blind acceptance from the reader, like children's stories and fairy tales, as exemplified by the metafictional narrative *The Tales of Beedle the Bard*. The disruption of narrative levels thus serves to explore the relationship between texts and their readers and, while Rowling depicts the act of reading fiction as enlightening and harmless, she shows how reading self-proclaimed *objective* narratives requires special training in order to become a critical reader. This, therefore, reaffirms the value of what Rowling is doing—writing fiction. At the same time, it ensures that the authority of the adult storyteller remains unquestioned and that the acceptable separation of and relationship between adult storyteller and (implied) child reader remain firmly in place.

2. The Narrator's Voice

In the *Harry Potter* series, the worlds of children and adults collide and are constantly at odds with each other. The series features vicious adult characters that do not flinch from abusing children physically and psychologically, like Harry's nemesis Lord Voldemort, corrupt Ministry of Magic bureaucrat Dolores Umbridge or the werewolf Fenrir Greyback. Yet the child/adult conflict is framed by Rowling's markedly adult narrator, who treats her child protagonist and her narratee in a way that reflects a relationship of friendliness and complicity between the two age groups. Furthermore, the novels depict horrifying, and even tragic, events in Harry's life, focusing on such unsettling issues as bullying, child abuse and death. However, the friendly, reassuring, third-person voice of an adult who easily identifies with the child provides the consolation that is traditionally expected from children's books. In his essay "On Fairy Stories," J. R. R. Tolkien stated that fairy stories must provide escape from and consolation for readers' unfulfilled desires, ambitions and fears ([1947] 2008, 73), and this certainly applies to most works of children's literature. Harry's adventures are framed by Rowling's comforting tone and her narrative reliability. This is not to say that the adult narrator's authority is never threatened by the presence of unreliable intradiegetic character-narrators in Rowling's own narrative, like Tom Riddle or Rita Skeeter, who exhibit less benevolent interactions between texts and their readers. However, their fictional narratives ultimately reassert the credibility of Rowling's narrator and thus reinforce the view of the adult storyteller as an appropriate, and appropriately reliable, voice to speak to a child.

Rowling's narrative voice has been described as providing a "third person *limited omniscient view*" (Granger 2009, 26; italics in the original). The narrator in *Harry*

Potter is omniscient insomuch as she knows everything that is going on in and out of Harry's mind: "we see all the action in the books as if there were a house-elf sitting on Harry's shoulder with a minicam. This obliging elf can also tell us everything Harry is thinking and feeling in addition to showing us what he sees around him" (Granger 2009, 27).[2] This perspective, though, is limited, because much of the time "we don't see any more than Harry sees" (Granger 2009, 27), with a few exceptions like the opening chapters of *Philosopher's Stone* (1997), *Goblet of Fire* (2000), *Half-Blood Prince* (2005a) and *Deathly Hallows* (2007), which describe events in which Harry is not present.[3] Nevertheless, Granger also points out that "because we're not restricted to Harry's narration, it *seems* as if we're seeing a larger bit of the story than if Harry just told it himself" (Granger 2009, 27; italics in the original), and hence the illusion of omniscience created by Rowling's narration. As we will see, this illusion is fundamental to the narrative misdirection that characterises the seven books, a point to which I will return in due course.

When the narrator is inside Harry's mind, Rowling often uses narrated monologue to represent Harry's consciousness, among other types of figural narration. Narrated monologue is "a character's mental discourse in the guise of the narrator's discourse" (Nikolajeva 2002a, 178), a term first coined by Dorrit Cohn in *Transparent Minds* (1983). According to Cohn, narrated monologue can be regarded "as the moment when the thought-thread of a character is most tightly woven into the texture of third-person narration" (111). The following passage exemplifies this technique: "And what were Ron and Hermione busy with? Why wasn't he, Harry, busy? Hadn't he proved himself capable of handling much more than them? Had they all forgotten what he had done? Hadn't it been *he* who had entered that graveyard and watched Cedric being murdered, and been tied to that tombstone and nearly killed?" (Rowling 2003, 13; italics in the original). Despite being in the third person and presented as part of the narrator's discourse, these are clearly Harry's thoughts, not the narrator's. Nonetheless, although this technique gives more prominence to the child's mind, it is still markedly different from first-person narration insomuch as "the continued employment of third-person references indicates, no matter how unobtrusively, the continued presence of a narrator. And it is his *identification*—but not his *identity*—with the character's mentality that is supremely enhanced by this technique" (Cohn 1983, 112; italics in the original). I believe that, in children's literature, and in *Harry Potter* in particular, narrated monologue provides the child reader with an adult voice that is likable, among other things, because of how comfortably it identifies with the child. This not only brings the reader closer to the character, allowing them to have access to the character's thoughts and feelings, but it also provides comfort because it is an understanding adult voice that tells the story, an adult voice that seems not to have forgotten what

---

[2] Since the narrator's gender is never made explicit in the *Harry Potter* series, throughout this article it will be conflated with the female gender of the (implied) author for practical purposes.

[3] Only abbreviated titles of the *Harry Potter* novels are provided.

it is like to be Harry's age. Nikolajeva, on the other hand, sees narrated monologue as a covert way of transmitting ideology: "we may believe that authorial control is thus eliminated or at least subdued, while it is in fact merely hiding behind the characters. Covert didacticism and covert ideology can more easily be practiced through narrated monologue" (2002a, 180). A closer examination of Rowling's narrative voice should help clarify to what extent she practices covert ideology through her narrator.

Rowling's narrative manner and her use of language have been compared to those of previous British writers of children's literature, particularly Enid Blyton (Granger 2009, 44; Gallardo-C. and Smith 2003, 191) and Roald Dahl (Smith 2003, 82; Gallardo-C. and Smith 2003, 191). Wall describes Blyton's narrative manner as one that puts children's interests first with her "short sentences and simple vocabulary, the lack of detailed description of settings or analyses of situations or character, the dominance of dialogue, together with her remarkable skill in the manipulation of events and the management of pace" (1991, 190). Like Blyton's works, Rowling's narration also privileges the interests of the child and adolescent audience with her simplicity of style and her action-driven plot. Wall, however, also points out that Blyton's "restricting of what is told to what is known and understood by the children in her stories, the confining of the language and syntax to the level of their minds […] has meant inevitably that Blyton's are books for children to grow out of, not to grow into" (1991, 193). This is certainly not the case with Rowling's *Harry Potter* series, which as well as being enjoyed by children, also satisfies the needs of an adult readership. As Philip Nel explains, when asked for whom she writes—children or adults—Rowling replied, "'Both. I wrote something that I knew I would like to read now, but I also wrote something that I knew I would like to have read at age 10'" (2002, 174). Nel adds that "Like all great children's literature, Rowling's books offer pleasure for readers of any age because she does not write down to readers" (2002, 174-75). However, we cannot overlook the fact that, although Rowling's narrator does not talk down to readers, the novels are not devoid of adult moral commentary, which, significantly, is not verbalised by the narrator but by some of the adult characters themselves. This reveals Rowling's aim to please not only child readers, but also adults, especially perhaps those parents that might be watching over the child reader's shoulder.

The other classic children's author to whom Rowling has been compared is Dahl, because of the occasional presence of "tasteless" jokes and gross-out humour in the *Harry Potter* books and how the narrator seems to side with children. For example, in this passage Fred and George Weasley talk to their brother Ron about their latest invention, a magic fudge that allows students to skip classes by giving them a fever:

"Does it work?" enquired Ron hopefully […].
"Well, yeah," said Fred, "your temperature'll go right up."
"But you get these massive pus-filled boils, too," said George […].
"I can't see any boils," said Ron, staring at the twins.

"No, well, you wouldn't," said Fred darkly, "they're not in a place we generally display to the public."

"But they make sitting on a broom a right pain in the—" (Rowling 2003, 336)

Gross-out humour is clearly introduced for the child reader's enjoyment. Yet, the omission of a "bad" word in the last line reveals some self-consciousness about the presence of adults and a wish to please them as well. Thus, like Dahl's narrator who "puts himself in league with an implied child reader" (Wall 1991, 193), Rowling's encourages the child—and the childlike adult—to forget about political correctness, though always within acceptable limits.

The fact that Rowling's narrator privileges the interests of a child addressee is also apparent in her satirical portrayal of certain unsympathetic adult characters whose authority is undermined by Rowling's poignant sense of humour. This again echoes Dahl, who "ranges himself, not merely like Blyton, with children, but with children against adults. His stance shows him assuming that children will join with him and squirm delightedly at what many adults will find either nauseating or disgusting, will squirm all the more delightedly in fact because they do so with the approval of the adult who has joined them" (Wall 1991, 194). In *Harry Potter*, Harry's uncle Mr. Dursley, for instance, is scornfully described as "large and neckless"; Harry's aunt Mrs. Dursley is "horse-faced and bony"; and his cousin Dudley "blond, pink and porky" (Rowling 1998, 9). Such descriptions might be considered hilarious by some, but tasteless and offensive by others. Gregory G. Pepetone, for instance, declares that he does not share Rowling's fascination with "pop culture vulgarity" (2012, 224). Julie Cross, on the other hand, referring to Dahl in particular, acknowledges that the "opportunity for children to have the satisfaction of laughing at a 'stupid' adult is a long-standing mainstay of children's fiction. It is well established that children in middle childhood in particular enjoy the superiority and mastery aspect of seeing and laughing at the misunderstandings of naïve and stupid characters" (2008, 60-61). However, Cross also believes that "Dahl's world of grotesque caricatures can be too simplistic. […] and there are strong elements of moral didacticism which may not be desirable" (2008, 59-60). Furthermore, she regards the "farce and slapstick revenge and even gross-out, scatological humour" in Dahl's books, elements that are also present in *Harry Potter*, as a lower form of humour, inferior to "the humour of incongruity, a more cognitive, higher type of humour" that, in Cross's view, can be found in other children's books like Lemony Snicket's *A Series of Unfortunate Events* (2008, 61). I have some reservations regarding Cross's negative view of Dahlesque forms of humour, for I believe they fulfil the very basic need of laughing at that which in real life creates anxiety. And, certainly, bullies and child abusers are a very real source of anxiety for children and parents in real life.

These are only a few among the features that Rowling's narrator has in common with those of other British children's writers that put the interests of an implied child reader first. However, as I have already suggested, even if the language and humour

prioritise children's preferences, adult expectations are also largely satisfied, albeit indirectly. Although the narrator in *Harry Potter* never moralises explicitly nor tells children how to behave, the novel is by no means devoid of both covert and overt adult moral commentary. It is enough to look at which characters are portrayed as stupid through humour. It is not the wise, authoritative teacher, the protective, biological parent or the studious child. Rather, the ridiculed characters are parents who spoil their children and kids who prefer video games to books, as in the following ironic passage about Harry's dumb cousin Dudley: "By nightfall Dudley was howling. He'd never had such a bad day in his life. He was hungry, he'd missed five television programmes he'd wanted to see and he'd never gone so long without blowing up an alien on his computer" (Rowling 1997, 35). Rowling's caricatures also indulge the adult's wish to criticise the way other people raise their children and complain about how terrible kids are these days. Humour thus functions as a device to indicate which characters represent undesirable qualities, and the reader is incited to share the narrator's disapproval. The appeal of Rowling's narrator is, therefore, twofold: on the one hand, she is likable to child readers because she sides with Harry against the bullies, and, on the other, adult readers can easily identify with her because the views she represents are markedly adult.

This takes me back to Nikolajeva's assertion that indirect, covert ways of inculcating ideology may prove to be more effective (2002a, 180). In *Harry Potter*, the "voice of adult values"—to use Perry Nodelman's expression (2008, 33)—is not only implicit and hidden behind narrated monologue and humorous passages, but it is also made explicit. Rowling never actually hides the fact that her novels have a didactic dimension. Although she has claimed that "[she] never think[s] in terms of What [*sic*] am I going to teach [children]?", she also admits that "undeniably, morals are drawn" (Rowling 2005b, n.p.). Significantly, explicit didacticism is not delivered by the narrator in *Harry Potter*, for this is generally regarded as writing down, which has fallen out of favour in contemporary children's fiction. In The *Rhetoric of Character in Children's Literature*, Nikolajeva explains how "the implied author is responsible for the ideology of the text" and that, in a mainstream (adult) novel, "a character can serve as the author's mouthpiece" (2002b, 4). However, she points out, in children's fiction, "the author's views cannot […] be directly expressed through the child character without the narrative assuming an unnatural tone. A possible solution is to use an adult secondary character who will provide the desired opinions and counterbalance the child character's 'false' beliefs and assumptions" (2002b, 4). This is precisely the role that Dumbledore, the Hogwarts Headmaster, fulfils in *Harry Potter*. Acting as a mentor and a moral guide for Harry—and, in turn, the reader—Dumbledore is in charge of explaining, at the end of every book, the significance of the events that have taken place. This is why Granger compares him to the "Doctor ('learned man' in Latin) [who] explains the importance of good deeds in spiritual life" at the end of morality plays (2009, 176). Even in *Deathly Hallows*, when Dumbledore is already dead, Rowling adds a plot twist that allows him to talk to Harry from beyond the grave. This does not mean,

however, that adult authority goes unquestioned. Through the presence of metatextual and metafictional devices and fictional narrators inside her narrative, Rowling provides a complex commentary about texts, (adult) narrators and their reliability.

3. Metafiction and Metalepsis

According to Patricia Waugh, "metafiction is a term given to fictional writing which self-consciously and systematically draws attention to its status as an artefact in order to pose questions about the relationship between fiction and reality" (1993, 2). In children's fiction, metafictional elements acquire special connotations as they allow for a commentary on the relation between child reader and adult author, as well as for a pedagogical discourse on the function of books and reading in children's lives. In her article "Fantastic Books," Rebecca-Anne Do Rozario analyses this "material rather [than] allusive intertextuality—the book, ink, and paper" (2008, 209) that we often find in late twentieth- and twenty-first-century children's books, such as Cornelia Funke's *Inkheart* trilogy ([2003] 2004, 2005, [2008] 2009), Marcus Sedgwick's *The Book of Dead Days* ([2003] 2011) and its sequel *The Dark Flight Down* ([2005] 2010) or Jonathan Stroud's *Bartimaeus* trilogy ([2003] 2010a, [2004] 2010b, [2005] 2010c).[4] These are all children's novels that use metafiction as a narrative device in order to turn the book into an object that blurs the boundaries between fiction and reality. I would also add Toni DiTerlizzi and Holly Black's *The Spiderwick Chronicles* ([2003-2004] 2009), Michael Ende's classic *The Neverending Story* ([1979] 1993), Lemony Snicket's *A Series of Unfortunate Events* ([1999-2006] 2011) and, of course, the *Harry Potter* series itself to this list.[5]

The presence of fictional narratives and narrators within the *Harry Potter* novels provides a commentary on textuality, storytelling and reading that is relevant to my analysis of the adult-child relationship in Rowling's series. Veronica L. Schanoes states that, in *Harry Potter*, "certain passages regarding writing […] seem to explicitly indicate a textual metaconsciousness" (2003, 138). We see this as early as the beginning of the first book, when the narrator's reference to "the dull, grey Tuesday *our story starts*" (Rowling 1997, 7; italics added) breaks the fourth wall by addressing the reader outside the book. Another example can be found when Dumbledore and McGonagall leave baby

---

    4 Sedgwick's fantasy novels are about a magician, Valerian, who has only four days left to live as a result of a deal he made with evil, and the information he needs to save his life is hidden in the Book of Dead Days. In the *Inkheart* trilogy by German writer Funke, Meggie's father has a gift that makes fictional characters come to life when he reads aloud. Finally, Stroud's fantasy trilogy is about a young magician, Nathaniel, who lives in an alternative historical reality where magicians are the dominant class.
    5 In *The Spiderwick Chronicles*, the Grace children move to a new house where they find a book, *Arthur Spiderwick's Field Guide to the Fantastical World around You*, which reveals that fairies and other fantastical creatures really exist and are living among us. In Snicket's series, as in *The Neverending Story*, the main characters encounter a book which has the same title as the book they are part of. Moreover, Snicket's intrusive narrator keeps reminding the reader of the fact that he is writing a story.

Harry on the Dursleys' doorstep and McGonagall exclaims: "there will be books written about Harry—every child in our world will know his name!" (Rowling 1997, 15). Indeed, in the extradiegetic world, there *are* books about Harry, and there is probably not a single child who does not know his name, at least in English-speaking countries. Thus, from the beginning, this establishes a relationship between the fictional books inside Rowling's narration and the actual book the reader is holding in their hands. In addition, the fact that three of the fictional books that appear in Rowling's diegetic world—*Fantastic Beasts and Where to Find Them*, *Quidditch Through the Ages* and *The Tales of Beedle the Bard*—have been published as actual books in the extradiegetic world stresses this quality even more.[6] Metaleptic narrative devices, according to Poushali Bhadury, create pleasure not only for child readers, but for *all* readers in general, since they appeal to the "desire to be able to interact with the world of the text, or the desire to enter and co-create the storyworld" (2013, 10). With these three companions to the series, *Harry Potter* readers can indulge the fantasy of holding in their hands the same books that Harry, Ron and Hermione read. The appeal of metafiction and metalepsis may also thus account for the overwhelming success of Rowling's series among readers of all ages.

Nonetheless, in her analysis of metafiction and metalepsis in *Inkheart* and *The Neverending Story*, Bhadury also points out that these novels do not always portray the relationship between the child reader and the text as benign, but rather on certain occasions also show the dangers of reading (2013, 4). I argue that the same can be observed in *Harry Potter*, where narratives are represented as both enlightening—like Beedle the Bard's "The Tale of the Three Brothers" in *Deathly Hallows*—and deceptive—like Tom Riddle's diary in *Chamber of Secrets* or Rita Skeeter's sensationalist stories. These three fictional narratives sometimes lead the child protagonists to safety and sometimes to confusion and even mortal danger. Therefore, as Schanoes argues, "these passages of metaconsciousness openly force the reader to reflect upon the potential dangers and instability of the very text she holds in her hands" (2003, 138). Rowling's representation of narratives is, thus, inextricably linked to the construction of good and evil in her novels. As Schanoes adds, "Rowling's articulation of a uniquely complex understanding of morality is both dependent on and integral to the duplicitous nature of writing in her books" (2003, 131).

Tom Riddle's diary and its relationship with its readers is probably the best example of Gérard Genette's concept of metalepsis in Rowling's series, "an intrusion of the extradiegetic narrator or narratee into the diegetic universe (or by diegetic characters into a metadiegetic universe, etc.) or the inverse" (Genette 1980, 234-35). First introduced in *Chamber of Secrets*, this is a diary with apparently blank pages that Ginny Weasley—and, later, Harry—stumbles upon. Both characters soon learn that this is no

---

    [6] *Fantastic Beasts* and *Quidditch* are two Hogwarts textbooks that characters read in the series. *The Tales of Beedle the Bard*, on the other hand, is a book of fairy tales for young witches and wizards that Hermione inherits from Dumbledore when the latter dies.

ordinary diary for, when they write in it, the diary writes back and tells them stories about dark secrets affecting Hogwarts. In the end, it is revealed that the diary actually contains a piece of Lord Voldemort's soul and is a memory of Voldemort's younger self—Tom Riddle—who manages to control Ginny through it, forcing her to open the Chamber of Secrets. Eventually, the memory of Tom Riddle that was trapped in the diary is liberated and threatens to feed on Ginny's life in order to bring his teenage self, and hence Lord Voldemort, back to life. Thus, in this case we are dealing with the relationship between diegetic characters (Ginny and Harry) and the metadiegetic world of the diary, on the one hand, and an intradiegetic narrator (Tom Riddle) who eventually transgresses narrative levels and invades the diegetic universe, on the other. Whereas in the book Harry's contact with Tom Riddle is conducted exclusively through writing, in the film adaptation the diary functions more like a portal: Harry is actually magically sucked into the diary and physically transported back in time to the events the diary narrates. As such, the intrusion of a diegetic character into an intradiegetic universe is clearer and more straightforward in the film than in the novel.

In her discussion of the *Inkheart* trilogy, Bhadury argues that "Funke does not paint a wholly rosy, uncomplicated and benign picture of the kinds of interaction that are possible between readers and texts. This is essential in charting a deliberate—and somewhat radically subversive—move away from the kinds of naive, trusting reader-text models other instances of children's metafiction provide" (2013, 4). Similarly, Rowling's *Harry Potter* series also presents this duality. In the case of Tom Riddle's diary, the written text is represented as potentially deceptive, unreliable and dangerous. It is precisely their trust in the initially personal and friendly tone of the diary that leads both Harry and Ginny to mortal peril. At the beginning, Tom Riddle teases Harry's curiosity and lures him in by telling him that the diary "*holds memories of terrible things. Things which were covered up*" (Rowling 1998, 179; italics in the original). Eventually, however, this all turns out to be a trap to get Harry to trust Tom Riddle, who finally reveals himself as Lord Voldemort's younger self. Significantly, during Harry and Riddle's confrontation, the latter mocks Ginny for having confided in the diary: "I was sympathetic, I was kind. Ginny simply *loved* me. *No one's ever understood me like you, Tom … I'm so glad I've got this diary to confide in … It's like having a friend I can carry around in my pocket…*" (1998, 228; italics in the original). Tom Riddle thus seems to be a kind, sympathetic narrator that promises to tell children amazing things that adults are hiding from them. Yet, as the outcome of Harry's experience with the diary suggests, narratives that are told by apparently kind, friendly, alluring strangers are not to be trusted blindly. Other similar, albeit more satirical, examples of unreliable intradiegetic narrators in the series are Gilderoy Lockhart and Rita Skeeter. Lockhart, who brags in his books about all the extraordinary things he has done, turns out to be a fraud, an incompetent wizard who became famous by stealing the credit for other people's achievements. When he is found out by Harry, Lockhart simply tells him that "books can be misleading" (Rowling 1998, 220). Similarly, Rita Skeeter is the author

of numerous fake news and manipulated interviews that spread lies about Harry and Dumbledore.

The presence of all these unreliable narratives shows that the relationship between reader and text is not always a benign one, and Rowling's series provides plenty of examples of what Bhadury calls "models of bad readership" (2013, 3), i.e., cases where characters do not question the information that they find in books nor the narrators' authority, which always leads to dire consequences. As Bhadury explains by reference to *Inkheart*, "if we consider writing to be one of the most important forms of (adult) power, here Funke seems to be making a radical observation regarding the possible limits of adult authority" (2013, 5). This, I argue, also applies to Rowling's series. It might be claimed that the fact that Rowling is constantly underlining the unreliability of narratives and of apparently friendly narrative voices calls into question the trustworthiness of her own narrative. In my view, however, the presence of metatextual narratives in Rowling's series does not aim to discredit the figure of the storyteller. As the examples I have provided suggest, in *Harry Potter* unreliability is linked to "official narratives, [which] despite a pretense of accuracy, objectivity, and coherence, are revealed to be made of unreliable, arguable assumptions and manipulative misinterpretations" (Schanoes 2003, 138). With characters like Rita Skeeter and Dolores Umbridge, who while not a writer, is also guilty of manipulating information, Rowling seems to be warning her readers against reading official narratives without applying acute critical skills, a quality that is most often embodied by Harry's best friend Hermione.

Rowling's critique, however, does not seem to include fiction. Schanoes's article was published in 2003, four years before *Deathly Hallows*, which includes the fairy tale for witches and wizards "The Tale of the Three Brothers." Therefore, the one example of metafiction in the *Harry Potter* saga which involves commentary on reading fictional narratives does not appear in her discussion. Still, I concur with Schanoes when she speculates that "fiction does not rely on an allegedly objective authority and does not demand blind acceptance; rather, the success of an unequivocally fictional narrative depends on a complicity between writer and reader, a willing suspension of disbelief. Perhaps the collusion between writer and reader required by fiction renders it harmless in Rowling's schema" (2003, 143). Her guess is confirmed in *Deathly Hallows* with Beedle the Bard, a fictional storyteller who "lived in the fifteenth century" (Rowling 2008, xiii) and wrote stories for wizarding children. Beedle the Bard could be the Charles Perrault or the Geoffrey Chaucer of Rowling's magical world, except that his fairy tales are told from the point of view of witches and wizards. Granger, for instance, emphasises the resemblance between "The Tale of the Three Brothers" and Chaucer's "The Pardoner's Tale" (2009, 181). On the other hand, in Rowling's introduction to *The Tales of Beedle the Bard*, it is said that "much of his life remains shrouded in mystery" (2008, xiii), which is also reminiscent of William Shakespeare.

This intradiegetic storyteller does much more than just reinforce one of the main moral lessons in the series, the fact that attempting to escape death ultimately leads to

self-destruction. Beedle's tale also provides a commentary on narrative and, specifically, on narratives aimed at young readers. When Harry, Ron and Hermione first hear "The Tale of the Three Brothers" at Mr. Lovegood's house, the latter insists that the story actually happened and the Deathly Hallows—the three magical objects created by Death that appear in the tale—really exist. Hermione, the most rational of the three, dismisses the idea as "'completely ridiculous'" (Rowling 2007, 334). Even Ron, who is less given to critical thinking than Harry and Hermione, also expresses his disbelief: "'that story's just one of those things you tell kids to teach them lessons, isn't it? "Don't go looking for trouble, don't pick fights, don't go messing around with stuff that's best left alone! Just keep your head down, mind your own business and you'll be OK"'" (2007, 336). Yet, in the end, both Ron and Hermione are proven wrong. Beedle's story is indeed a cautionary tale with fantasy added to make the story more attractive to children, but it does turn out to be based on real facts. Thus, not only does "The Tale of the Three Brothers" contain truth, but it also proves to be crucial in the denouement of the series. Similarly, in the earlier *Chamber of Secrets*, Harry's History of Magic teacher tells students that the legend about the Chamber of Secrets is "'such a very *sensational*, even *ludicrous* tale'," "'a tale told to frighten the gullible'," as opposed to "'solid, believable, verifiable *fact*!'" (1998, 113-15; italics in the original). In the end, it turns out that this legend was also true and the accepted history was in fact a false account, manipulated by a former Hogwarts headmaster to save his own reputation. I read this as an affirmation of the potential of fictional stories—and particularly children's stories, folklore and fairy tales—to transmit knowledge without necessarily claiming to hold the absolute truth as other types of narratives masquerading as history or fact do.

Consequently, this does not contradict but rather affirms what Rowling is doing: she is also telling a fictional story from which truth and knowledge can be gained, yet with no pretence of absolute authority. I do not, therefore, believe that the presence of metadiegetic unreliable narratives in the series suggests that Rowling's narrator is also unreliable. Unreliability and danger in Rowling's fictional world are in fact associated with narratives claiming to be objective, not with fiction. There certainly are character-narrators in *Harry Potter* that contradict the adult narrator's account, such as Rita Skeeter, whose stories for the news media viciously distort the "truth" which is, after all, the narrator's version of the story, but they are so over-the-top that the reader knows from the beginning that she is not to be trusted. The effect created by these metadiegetic narratives is therefore mostly satirical and does not, in my opinion, challenge the credibility of Rowling's narrator. It certainly cannot be overlooked that Rita Skeeter's lurid account of Dumbledore in *Deathly Hallows* actually contains much truth, but even then, Rowling gives the Headmaster the chance to explain his own story, and it is *his* account that prevails in the end.

Although Rowling's narrator is reliable, it is true that, as Schanoes explains, she uses generic conventions to confuse and fool the reader, and it is relevant to refer back to narrative misdirection at this point. For example, the characterisation of Severus

Snape is deliberately misleading. He has "the dark looks of a gothic villain. By all conventional narrative cues, Snape's nastiness should indicate that he is a villain of the deepest dye. But Snape is not evil. Snape is a good guy who protects Harry on several occasions and risks his own life in the fight against Voldemort" (Schanoes 2003, 132). Certainly, Rowling's narrator constantly makes the reader see that appearances are deceptive and that people—and objects—are sometimes not what they seem to be. For example, at the end of *Philosopher's Stone*, when Harry confronts evil Professor Quirrell, whom he had believed to be harmless, "Quirrell mocks Harry, and, by extension, Rowling mocks her reader for being taken in by a particularly sly combination of her own writing and her use of genre conventions" (Schanoes 2003, 131). The same thing happens in *Goblet of Fire* when Professor Mad-Eye Moody is revealed to be Barty Crouch Jr. under the effects of Polyjuice Potion, which gives the drinker the physical appearance of another person. Here, Rowling again plays with the reader's expectations and prejudices and makes them realise that they had wrongly associated madness and eccentricity with evil doing. I insist, however, that this does not make Rowling's narrator unreliable, but intentionally and playfully misleading. At the end of every book, the truth is always revealed and any loose ends are neatly tied up at the end of the series, when all the different pieces of the story come together. There is nothing in the text that suggests an alternative outcome, as happens in unreliable narratives. In *Harry Potter*, any attempt to mislead the reader is only temporary, and the version of the adult narrator is ultimately reasserted, which takes me back to the sense of security or, in Tolkien's words, the escape and consolation that the series ultimately conveys.

4. Concluding Remarks

As Frank Serafini et al. put it, "the embedding or nesting of narrative challenges young readers to understand distinctions among the various levels of a story and the very boundaries between fiction and reality" (2018, 313). Furthermore, they add, "complexity is not just a factor of the length of a text nor the selected vocabulary. As the narrative structures, visual images and design features offered in contemporary texts grow more complex, we need to foster strategies and approaches for helping young readers navigate and understand them" (318). In this article, we have seen how metafiction is also a way of complicating the act of reading, for it encourages readers not only to distinguish between the different narrative levels, but also to reflect on both the potential value and the potential dangers of the text they hold in their hands. In the case of Rowling's *Harry Potter* series, the author's use of metatextual elements clearly stresses the importance of reading critically, especially when it comes to so-called official narratives. Reading fiction, on the other hand, and particularly reading children's stories and fairy tales, is portrayed as harmless and enlightening. This is revealed in the last book when "The Tale of the Three Brothers" plays a crucial part in the saga's denouement: not only does

it convey the ultimate teaching of the whole *Harry Potter* series, but it also turns out to be instrumental in Harry's final defeat of Voldemort. Furthermore, it can be inferred that reading fiction in *Harry Potter* is linked not to rationality, but to emotions. It is certainly not a coincidence that Dumbledore gives a copy of *The Tales of Beedle the Bard* to Hermione, the epitome of what Bhadury calls the "good reader" (2013, 14) in the series, hoping that she will be able to decipher its meaning and significance. However, Hermione's initial overly rational interpretation of the tales as being simply children's stories fails to uncover the secret. It is only when the protagonists open their minds and understand that the basis of all children's stories is rooted in reality that they finally get on the right track to discovering that the Deathly Hallows are real and that without them they cannot defeat Voldemort.

Thus, unlike other authors such as Ende or Funke, Rowling always portrays the relationship between children's fiction and its readers in a positive light, which in turn reasserts the value of the activity she herself engages in as a writer. In Rowling's children's books, the relationship between (adult) narrator and (child) narratee is not based on the latter's submission to the former's authority, but rather it is always a positive and friendly one. Although the adult narrative voice clearly occupies a position of superiority from which she transmits knowledge to the child narratee, she also identifies easily with the child inside the book and the child outside the book, for whom she also provides pleasure and escapism by means of humour, playful narrative misdirection and metafiction.

WORKS CITED

ANATOL, Giselle Liza, ed. 2003. *Reading Harry Potter: Critical Essays*. Westport, CT: Greenwood.

BHADURY, Poushali. 2013. "Metafiction, Narrative Metalepsis, and New Media Forms in *The Neverending Story* and the *Inkworld* Trilogy." *The Lion and the Unicorn* 37 (3): 301-26.

COHN, Dorrit. 1983. *Transparent Minds: Narrative Modes for Presenting Consciousness in Fiction*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton UP.

CROSS, Julie. 2008. "Frightening and Funny: Humour in Children's Gothic Fiction." In Jackson, Coats and McGillis 2008, 57-76.

DITERLIZZI, Toni and Holly Black. (2003-2004) 2009. *The Spiderwick Chronicles: The Completely Fantastical Edition*. New York: Simon & Schuster.

DO ROZARIO, Rebecca-Anne C. 2008. "Fantastic Books: The Gothic Architecture of Children's Books." In Jackson, Coats and McGillis 2008, 209-26.

ENDE, Michael. (1979) 1993. *The Neverending Story*. Translated by Ralph Manheim. London and New York: Puffin.

FLIEGER, Verlyn and Douglas A. Anderson, eds. 2008. *Tolkien: On Fairy Stories*. London: HarperCollins.

Funke, Cornelia. (2003) 2004. *Inkheart*. Translated by Anthea Bell. Frome: The Chicken House.

—. 2005. *Inkspell*. Translated by Anthea Bell. Frome: The Chicken House.

—. (2008) 2009. *Inkdeath*. Translated by Anthea Bell. Frome: The Chicken House.

Gallardo-C., Ximena and C. Jason Smith. 2003. "Cinderfella: J. K. Rowling's Wily Web of Gender." In Anatol 2003, 191-206.

Genette, Gérard. 1980. *Narrative Discourse: An Essay in Method*. Translated by Jane E. Lewin. Ithaca, NY: Cornell UP.

Granger, John. 2009. *Harry Potter's Bookshelf: The Great Books behind the Hogwarts Adventures*. New York: Penguin.

Jackson, Anna, Karen Coats and Roderick McGillis, eds. 2008. *The Gothic in Children's Literature: Haunting the Borders*. New York and London: Routledge.

Nel, Philip. 2002. "Bewitched, Bothered and Bored: Harry Potter, the Movie." *Journal of Adolescent and Adult Literacy* 46 (2): 172-75.

Nikolajeva, Maria. 2002a. "Imprints of the Mind: The Depiction of Consciousness in Children's Fiction." *Children's Literature Association Quarterly* 26 (4): 173-87.

—. 2002b. *The Rhetoric of Character in Children's Literature*. Lanham, MD: Scarecrow.

Nodelman, Perry. 2008. *The Hidden Adult: Defining Children's Literature*. Baltimore, MD: The John Hopkins UP.

Pattison, Nicky, dir. 2001. *J. K. Rowling: Harry Potter and Me*. BBC and A&E Television Networks, 57 min. December 28, 2001. [Accessed online on July 14, 2018].

Pepetone, Gregory G. 2012. *Hogwarts and All: Gothic Perspectives on Children's Literature*. New York: Peter Lang.

Rowling, J. K. 1997. *Harry Potter and the Philosopher's Stone*. London: Bloomsbury.

—. 1998. *Harry Potter and the Chamber of Secrets*. London: Bloomsbury.

—. 1999. *Harry Potter and the Prisoner of Azkaban*. London: Bloomsbury.

—. 2000. *Harry Potter and the Goblet of Fire*. London: Bloomsbury.

—. 2003. *Harry Potter and the Order of the Phoenix*. London: Bloomsbury.

—. 2005a. *Harry Potter and the Half-Blood Prince*. London: Bloomsbury.

—. 2005b. "J. K. Rowling Hogwarts and All." Interview by Lev Grossman. *Time Magazine*, July 17. [Accessed online on July 14, 2018].

—. 2007. *Harry Potter and the Deathly Hallows*. London: Bloomsbury.

—. 2008. *The Tales of Beedle the Bard*. London: Bloomsbury.

—. 2017. *Quidditch through the Ages*. London: Bloomsbury.

—. 2018. *Fantastic Beasts and Where to Find Them*. London: Bloomsbury.

Schanoes, Veronica L. 2003. "Cruel Heroes and Treacherous Texts: Educating the Reader in Moral Complexity and Critical Reading in J. K. Rowling's *Harry Potter* Books." In Anatol 2003, 131-46.

Sedgwick, Marcus. (2003) 2011. *The Book of Dead Days*. New York: Ember.

—. (2005) 2010. *The Dark Flight Down*. London: Orion.

SERAFINI, Frank, Daniel Kachorsky and Stephanie Reid. 2018. "Revisiting the Multimodal Nature of Children's Literature." *Language Arts* 95 (5): 311-21.

SMITH, Karen Manners. 2003. "Harry Potter's Schooldays: J. K. Rowling and the British Boarding School Novel." In Anatol 2003, 69-87.

SNICKET, Lemony. (1999-2006) 2011. *A Series of Unfortunate Events Complete Collection: Books 1-13 with Bonus Material*. New York: HarperCollins.

STROUD, Jonathan. (2003) 2010a. *The Amulet of Samarkand*. Westport, CT: Hyperion.

—. (2004) 2010b. *The Golem's Eye*. Westport, CT: Hyperion.

—. (2005) 2010c. *Ptolemy's Gate*. Westport, CT: Hyperion.

TOLKIEN, J. R. R. (1947) 2008. "On Fairy Stories." In Flieger and Anderson 2008, 27-84.

WALL, Barbara. 1991. *The Narrator's Voice: The Dilemma of Children's Fiction.* London: MacMillan.

WAUGH, Patricia. 1993. *Metafiction: The Theory and Practice of Self-Conscious Fiction*. New York and London: Routledge.

Auba Llompart Pons has a PhD in English Philology (Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona) and she specialises in English literature. Her main research interests include children's literature and fairy tale studies, Gothic studies and gender studies. She currently teaches English language and culture in the Translation, Interpreting and Applied Languages Department at Universitat de Vic - Universitat Central de Catalunya.

Address: Departament de Traducció, Interpretació i Llengües Aplicades. Facultat d'Educació, Traducció i Ciències Humanes, Universitat de Vic - Universitat Central de Catalunya. Carrer de la Laura, 13. 08500, Vic, Spain. Tel. +34 938861222.

Examining Racial Taboo through X-phemism in the TV Show *Black-ish*

RAQUEL SÁNCHEZ RUIZ AND ISABEL LÓPEZ CIRUGEDA
Universidad de Castilla-La Mancha
Raquel.SanchezRuiz@uclm.es, Isabel.LCirugeda@uclm.es

Taboos occur in everyday life as part of language and culture. One typical way of addressing them is through euphemism; however, sometimes the taboo is broken in informal, interpersonal or joking situations in phenomena like *friendly banter* or *playing the dozens*. With this in mind, this article aims to analyze the linguistic resources employed in the US sitcom *Black-ish* (2014-) to convey the boundaries between the need for respect for black racial backgrounds and the breaking of existing taboos for shock value or in friendly environments within the humorous context projected by the series. To this end, we rely on appraisal theory. The results will show how the series uses x-phemism and polarization as major resources of the black community to reflect their assimilation, separation, integration or marginalization in the United States in the twenty-first century.

Keywords: racial taboo; x-phemism; playing the dozens; *Black-ish*; humor; appraisal theory

. . .

El tabú racial a través del x-femismo en la serie televisiva *Black-ish*

El tabú forma parte de la vida cotidiana, pues es parte de la lengua y la cultura. Una forma habitual de lidiar con él es el eufemismo. No obstante, el tabú se rompe frecuentemente en relaciones informales o interpersonales y en ambientes distendidos mediante el llamado *insulto ritual*. Con estas premisas, el presente artículo analiza los recursos lingüísticos de la comedia *Black-ish* (2014-) para expresar los límites entre el respeto a la cultura e historia negras y la ruptura del tabú en ambientes distendidos con fines sorpresivos dentro del contexto humorístico de la serie. Para ello empleamos la teoría de la valoración. Los resultados demuestran cómo la serie emplea el x-femismo y la polarización como recursos significativos de la población negra para reflejar su asimilación, separación, integración o marginalización en los Estados Unidos del siglo XXI.

Palabras clave: tabú racial; x-femismo; insulto ritual; *Black-ish*; humor; teoría de la valoración

1. Introduction

Political correctness and linguistic prescription constantly attempt to censor language that should be avoided for social, political, sexual or religious reasons (Moreno Fernández 1998, 201) in order to prevent discomfort, harm or offense in a specific context (Allan and Burridge 2006, 1).[1] Specifically, the striving of black people to overcome the suffering of slavery and their subsequent marginalization in the United States provides rich grounds for the study of linguistic taboo, since no other community has historically been "as denigrated by ethnic slur as the blacks" (Hughes 2006, 25), traditionally related to negative stereotypes such as loudness, laziness or rudeness (Fairchild 1985, 50). However, in the 1960s, the black community started to perceive the term *black* positively and associate it with desirable qualities, as part of a heritage that should endure rather than be hidden or assimilated (Smith 1992). That implies the construction of another kind of stereotype being produced within the group which has no need for external validation.

Comedy is a breeding ground for the polarization of ideological extremes, since the tradition of humor includes techniques of exaggeration, ridicule, coincidence, repetition and misunderstanding (Berger 1993), revealing relations of power (Pérez and Greene 2016, 265). This permits the crossing of the line of socially acceptable behavior and language in interpersonal relationships. However, even in the twenty-first century and despite Obama's Presidency, the situation of the black community in the US does not seem to have changed much. The Black Lives Matter Movement was triggered by recent shootings of black citizens by the police. This movement's political discourse is based on the persistence of the dichotomy ingroup/us versus outgroup/them in such a way that "us" are represented positively (positive self-presentation) and "them" negatively (negative other-presentation) (Dijk 1999, 95). Speakers persuasively spread their inner group's assumptions "to express, confirm, and show allegiance to group goals, values, and norms, and may thus evaluate group actions towards ethnic outgroups" (Dijk 1997, 26).

Taking the above into consideration, this article aims to gain some insight into the linguistic expression of the subtle boundaries between the need for respect for black racial backgrounds and the breaking of existing taboos for shock value or insider-friendly banter in the US comedy show *Black-ish* (2014-) made for ABC Studios. The choice of this particular TV sitcom is not random since *Black-ish* has been addressed from a social perspective that deals with black identity and popular culture (Childs 2015), making it suitable for the study of the linguistic and sociopragmatic dimensions of taboo. To this end, we rely on Maite Taboada and Jack Grieve's appraisal method (2004, 159-61), based on James Robert Martin's appraisal (2000) and Martin and Peter R. White's appraisal theory (2005).

---

[1] Part of this article was presented at Taboo Humo(u)r: Language, Culture, Society, and the Media (TaCo2016), a conference held at Universitat Pompeu Fabra, Barcelona, on September 20-21, 2016.

2. Theoretical Framework

Linguistic taboo, "existent in all societies and cultures and at all times" (Horlacher 2010, 3), is associated with many everyday occurrences in life (Walker 2014, 1). Taboos are culturally revealing, as they "can be considered as symptoms of the customs, censorship or bad habits of the society" (Crespo-Fernández 2015, 1). A common way of addressing taboos is through *euphemism* and *dysphemism*. Euphemism is defined in terms of politeness as "sweet talking" (Allan and Burridge 2006, 1) or "the process whereby the taboo is stripped of its most explicit or obscene overtones" (Crespo-Fernández 2015, 2). The word *African-American*, for example, was born as a euphemism; it was promoted in the second half of the twentieth century by a movement led by the Rev. Jesse Jackson "to shift the definition of the group from the racial description black to a cultural and ethnic identity that ties the group to its continent of origin and fosters dignity and self-esteem," but it has always been surrounded by skepticism (Wilkerson 1989). Contrariwise, dysphemism is "speaking offensively" (Allan and Burridge 2006, 1) or "the process whereby the most pejorative traits of the taboo are highlighted with an offensive aim to the addressee or to the concept itself" (Crespo-Fernández 2015, 2). These processes, therefore, allow people to speak of the unspeakable or of taboo topics in the public domain, "either with the aim of preserving or violating the proscription imposed by society or by ourselves" (Crespo-Fernández 2015, 2). An example of this is Irving L. Allen's (1983) list of 240 derogatory terms for black people under eleven different headings, including variations of the noun *Negro* and *black*, allusions to color, general stereotypes on given names or occupations, cultural references or status degradation.

However, a word or expression is not euphemistic or dysphemistic per se, but rather depends on the context and the speakers' intentions and, as such, "the euphemistic or dysphemistic quality of a word can never be considered as an intrinsic quality of the word regardless of context" (Crespo-Fernández 2008, 107). For instance, the expressions *African-American* and *colored*, first conceived as euphemistic, have become quasi-dysphemistic due to their ability to hurt sensitivities. In fact, "the dividing line between taboo and dysphemism is, on occasions, quite blurred" and it is precisely these "conflicting emotions and antagonistic feelings [that] facilitate the existence of dysphemistic euphemisms and euphemistic dysphemisms" (Casas Gómez 2012, 43). This phenomenon is known as *x-phemism* because of the versatility of specific lexical units that can be considered mitigating or offensive depending on the particular context (Allan and Burridge 2006, 29). *Dysphemistic euphemism*, also called *quasi-euphemism*, refers to "items which are used positively to display friendship, solidarity, affection or intimacy despite their dysphemistic locution," while *euphemistic dysphemism*, or *quasi-dysphemism*, includes "those language expressions which, despite their socially acceptable disguise, are intentionally offensive" (Crespo-Fernández 2015, 46). Dysphemistic exaggeration and quasi-euphemism constitute a humoristic device, rooted in Stephen Burgen's *joking relationships* (1996) and Geoffrey Leech's *banter principle*, which consists in saying

something that is clearly not true and obviously rude but shows solidarity towards the recipient in a friendly or informal context (1983, 144-45)—that is, displaying friendship through rudeness, ritual insult or *friendly banter* (Allan and Burridge 2006, 87). Some of these common linguistic resources used to create tension and laughter in an amusing atmosphere, known as *playing the dozens* (Chimezie 1976, 401; Kihara 2015, 1) or *ritual put-downs* (Montgomery 1995), are considered essential features of black culture in the United States.

3. METHODOLOGY

As stated before, we have followed Taboada and Grieve's (2004, 159-61) approach, based on Martin's appraisal (2000) and Martin and White's appraisal theory (2005), which deal with emotions by classifying texts according to their subjective content or sentiment and taking into account contextual and pragmatic aspects, especially as regards the identification of ambiguous units. Taboada and Grieve categorize expressions regarding their positive or negative orientation in order to examine language examples and text structure, since appraisal theory analyzes how attitudes, judgments and emotive responses are presented in texts and how these expressions could be postulated as a challenge or contradiction by those with differing views (White 2015). Therefore, we focus on *attitude* or *attitudinal positioning*, as it permits the understanding of how writers or speakers use feelings and emotional reactions, judgments of behavior and meaning to positively or negatively assess people, places, things, happenings and states of affairs (White 2015). With that purpose, expressions are classified under the following categories: *affect* or *emotion*, the positive or negative emotional inclination to a person, thing, happening or state of affairs; *judgment* or *ethics*, the assessment of behavior regarding rules or conventions of behavior; and *appreciation* or *aesthetics*, the assessment of human artifacts, natural objects and human individuals according to their value in a particular field (Martin and White 2005, 42-43).

     X-phemistic language has been examined under Taboada and Grieve's appraisal method (2004, 159-61), with its crucial division into positive and negative semantic orientation of words. Both orientations are essential to determine what category of x-phemism a unit belongs to through the evaluation of a character's opinions and attitudes along with other pragmatic aspects, like the context of each scene. From this standpoint, our method comprised two parts: first, expressions were designated as having either a positive or a negative orientation, after which they were categorized as appreciation or comment on a thing, judgment or comment on a person, and affect or comment on one's self. A formula indicating the number of season and episode was employed, as in (1x01) for season 1, episode 1. Whenever different examples are found under a single formula, it means they belong to the same episode.

4. *Black-ish*, the TV Show

Black-ish portrays the life of a contemporary upper-middle class family in suburban Los Angeles, the Johnsons, composed of (married) couple Andre (Dre) and Rainbow (Bow), their children—Zoey (15), Junior (14), and twins Jack and Diane (8), joined in season 4 by baby DeVante—and grandparents Ruby and Pops, and pays particular attention to their identity issues as a black family amidst a mostly white society. Dre, the father and main character, shows how many scenes of his daily life trigger cultural challenges about his feelings of belonging to the black community, which he explains with frequent voiceovers. According to its producer, Larry Wilmore, the series is about "celebrating black more as a culture than as a race" (Moraes 2014). The first season, comprising our corpus, received five awards from the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People (NAACP), which, to a great extent, implies the association's support for the approach to race taken by the series.

Kenya Barris, the series's creator and executive producer, who sought to ensure the ethnic diversity of the screenwriters, declares the sitcom is inspired by his own personal and work experience (Nussbaum 2016). The pilot episode (2014) depicts an initial synopsis where Dre, a black man who lives and works in a mainly white community, which he acknowledges as a sign of his success, is put in charge of an urban section of publicity specifically aimed at black clients. This provides an opportunity for him to reflect on his identity, as our analysis of his linguistic choices shows.

The show provides a platform to make the ingroup values visible to a wider outgroup audience (Vickers 2018) and its approach on race has been perceived by some as controversial due to its alleged promotion of "ugly racial bigotry" (Peyser 2015). In fact, there was an unfruitful petition on *Change.org* to cancel the series on the grounds of it being "racist, socially damaging and offensive based on its concept that nonstereotypical black people are less their race than others, that hip hop culture is all blacks are supposed to embrace, and that culture and race are one in [*sic*] the same." It also received a tweet from Donald Trump accusing it of "racism at the highest level" (Jones 2014). Barris, who claims only 23% of his audience is black, defends the premise of the show by arguing that he considers racial issues to be a matter of concern in an increasingly divided society (Holloway 2016).

5. Analysis

The corpus for our study is composed of the scripts of the twenty-four episodes of season one, where the series's general concept of racial identity is presented. The show includes the two main backgrounds in the life of the protagonist, Dre: his house and Stevens & Lido, the publishing company he works for. Both environments reflect the continuous choices of the acculturation strategies of assimilation, separation, integration or marginalization made by black people in their daily lives in the United States in the twenty-first century (Berry 1997). At home, his concern is to prevent his four children—

especially the two teenagers—from assimilation into white mainstream culture, which seems the natural path given the upper-middle class status they have grown up in. Dre persistently struggles for them to be proud of their heritage, thus perpetuating his Pops's continuous reproaches to him for trying to act white or ignoring his black heritage. This battle is balanced by the actions of his wife, Bow, who, being biracial herself and having become a doctor thanks to equality scholarships, does not judge the system so negatively. She embodies the advantages of mingling with white population and culture, in a search for a peaceful coexistence aligned with Martin Luther King Jr.'s hopes for America in his "I Have a Dream" (1963) speech, which she in fact quotes on occasion. However, Bow's viewpoint is depicted as too naïve, as the show privileges Dre's perspective and he feels continuously challenged by his colleagues to define his concept of blackness.

The results of the analysis are presented below, starting with Martin and White's (2005) categories of affect or emotion, followed by appreciation or aesthetics and finishing with judgment or ethics.

5.1. Affect or Emotion

Regarding affect or emotion, most expressions revolve around the positive connotations of blackness. Dre uses the first person singular and plural indistinguishably, thus revealing that he regards himself as an archetype of the black population, which he strongly identifies with. It is sometimes difficult to discern whether he is referring to feelings or judgment/ethics, as he conveys many ideas which might be considered value judgments or his own perceptions and, thus, his use of "us" is usually euphemistic.

Affect is frequently employed to show his very positive self-esteem derived from being black, even if many of the gags demonstrate his many insecurities. Thus, the formerly taboo word *black*, potentially dysphemistic, is turned into a positive quality in the meaningful first line of the sitcom: "I'm just your standard, regular ol' incredibly handsome, unbelievably charismatic black dude." By playing off "standard, regular" against extremely positive attributes—"incredibly handsome" and "unbelievably charismatic"—he seems to be creating a formula in which those binomials are equated and thus he playfully implies that average people in his ethnic group are stunningly beautiful.

The concept of blackness is included in a euphemistic, synaesthetic metaphor to indicate that this color is intrinsically attractive, as when Dre tells Bow "me and my sweet cinnamony lips" (1x02). This is also a metonymy, as a part of the body (lips) stands for the person. His elder daughter Zoey, who uploads a makeup video tutorial, also conveys this feeling when she states: "I don't use bronzer because I have good skin. But my third best friend, Michelle, doesn't. As you can see, Michelle is very pale" (1x07). Therefore, her white friend is in need of blusher.

Being black is an asset that can be added to other positive features, as Dre says in "you know, I'm cool, plus I'm black, which is cool, so I win twice" (1x03). Blackness is

also viewed as positive in sports, thus assuming the general belief that black people are skilled at sports like basketball. Moreover, ethnic confrontation expresses the difference between black and white sportspeople and so—as in the aforementioned list by Allen (1983)—typical white people's proper names become quasi-dysphemistic as they represent white, less skilled basketball players. Dre also thinks that white players, even at their physical prime (twenty-five years old), cannot compare to black sportspeople even at an older age, such as forty:

(1) "I'm just saying, if you're gonna keep playing basketball, I think you really need to play a less intense game, maybe with more Colins and Ethans and less Maliks and Jamals."
"Are you trying to tell me I belong in a white game?"
"Oh, I'm absolutely telling you that. White game. Game of Whites. Black 40 is the white 25." (1x17)

Dre's racial pride merges with Black Nationalism and its creation of a cultural identity.[2] Black, however, also implies suffering and this is where negative linguistic appreciation finds its own space. When fighting with himself to keep this black essence, Dre repeatedly envisions Compton, his hometown, in contrast with LA. This is a confrontation between idealized memories of childhood, where life used to be humble but "decidedly black," and their present upper-class but "blackish" existence—in other words, it is implied that the more money they have, the less black and the whiter their lifestyle becomes. Dre and his father find comfort in constantly advocating a black life, even if, according to the latter, it includes three things: "stay black, pay taxes and die" (1x20). As used by Pops in a conversation with Dre, the expression "pay taxes" (1x20) also refers to how the whites take advantage of black people sometimes. Pops uses it in a simplistic and euphemistic way to express his opinion that white people expect to financially exploit black people while ensuring that they conduct their lives separately from them.

Everything seems systematically more complicated for black people, as Dre explains in this voiceover:

(2) "The only problem is, whatever American had this dream probably wasn't where I'm from. And if he was, he should've mentioned the part about how when brothers start getting a little money, stuff starts getting a little weird like in my neighborhood." (1x01)

Drew thereby illuminates the fact that even if upward mobility implies the end of economic issues, it also marks the beginning of odd relationships with both black and white people.

---

2   Black Nationalism or the Black Movement see black people as a nation per se. Even if they live in different places or countries, they consider themselves a single community, hence the use of *nation*.

Affect or emotion present black people negatively or ironically highlight whites' images of the black community through various, dysphemistic or quasi-dysphemistic, figures of speech. For example, Dre expresses how he felt scrutinized by his white neighbors through a reverie where a tourist jeep appears with the guide saying, "you'll see the mythical and majestic Black Family out of their natural habitat and yet still thriving" (1x01), as he and the rest of the family wave. Thus, despite the guide's mention of the grandeur of the scene, Dre points to the intrinsically dehumanizing gaze of white people, which frames them as if he and his family were animals observed on safari. This clearly evokes the metaphor BLACK PEOPLE ARE ANIMALS. In *More than Cool Reason: A Field Guide to Poetic Metaphor*, George Lakoff and Mark Turner discuss the Great Chain of Being metaphor (1989, 166-81), which propounds the notion that animals are inferior to humans, and animals is one the derogatory categories identified by Allen (1983).

According to Dre, white standards reduce a black man to being seen as necessarily either menacing or helpless and in need of white redemption. He evokes the former when he compares himself to Donald Bogle's stereotype of the violent, sexualized Buck (2016), as when he says "not that I want to go back to the days of being the big scary black guy. But I have to admit it did kind of have its advantages" (1x01). In other words, he prefers negative stereotypes to cultural misappropriation. On the other hand, the image of the helpless black man is found in Dre's voiceover: "well if you believe every Hollywood movie ever made, […] any black guy gets anywhere with the help of a white guy" (1x20).

When dealing with the linguistic concept of blackness, words referring to this ethnic group become crucial, due to the strongly dysphemistic connotations of certain terms and the emotional impact involved in the definition of this community. The second season starts with an episode, "The Word," in which the n-word—always hidden under a bleep sound—is categorically rejected even inside the ingroup. This contravenes the aforementioned rule by which words are not intrinsically euphemistic or dysphemistic (Chamizo Domínguez 2004, 45; Crespo-Fernández 2008, 107). Even if the show reflects different points of view throughout its various episodes, Dre and Bow completely agree on the unacceptability of this term, even among black people or friends. The sound effect covering the word officializes this viewpoint as that of the team behind the fiction. Other expressions used by the most critical characters, namely Dre and Pops, like "the black folks," are regarded as acceptable. Pops uses the pejorative, dysphemistic word Negro when he tells Dre, "you got to make an adjustment for the Negro inflation tax" (1x01), to emphasize that black people have to make economic sacrifices just because of their ethnic group, which is regarded as socially disadvantaged.

The series promotes the idea that other vocabulary choices, like "colored people" (1x09), should preferably be rejected in favor of "black," as inferred from their use in the script. The word "black" refers to very positive traits within the context of the ingroup, so there is no longer any need for euphemism, like "African-American." As Pops says, "We

black, not African. Africans don't even like us" (1x01), although "African-American" is retained by Dre when he speaks to white people in his office, usually clients (1x20). The preferential "black" is used 180 times—31 in 1x01, 23 in 1x03, 1 in 1x04, 5 in 1x06, 8 in 1x06, 1 in 1x07, 3 in 1x08, 13 in 1x10, 1 in 1x11, 25 in 1x12, 6 in 1x14, 3 in 1x15, 6 in 1x16, 7 in 1x17, 3 in 1x19, 18 in 1x20, 2 in 1x21, 3 in 1x22, 18 in 1x23 and 2 in 1x24—whereas "African-American" appears only 3 times—1x09, 1x20 and 1x22—and each time it is in order to show how white people see black people.

The show is particularly concerned about another word, *urban*. The pilot episode focuses on the rejection of this term when applied to black culture. Dre, who, as mentioned above, has been put in charge of an urban section of publicity specifically aimed at black clients, considers it annoying because it is an artificial construct used to refer to contemporary black culture from a white point of view. The term became popular after World War II, in the context of the mass migrations caused by suburbanization and the rural exodus. *Urban* was used euphemistically to refer to predominantly poor communities populated chiefly by "people of color" (Truscott and Truscott 2005, 123). In the series, the term is rejected since it has been defined by mainstream culture, which reflects predominantly the views of white people. In a voiceover, Dre expresses his resentment that urban celebrities are often from outside the community:

> (3) "Sometimes I worry that, in an effort to make it, black folks have dropped a little bit of their culture and the rest of the world has picked it up. They even renamed it *urban*. And in the urban world, Justin Timberlake and Robin Thicke are R&B gods, Kim Kardashian's the symbol for big butts, and Asian guys are just unholdable on the dance floor." (1x01; italics added)

As used in the show, "urban" is never interpreted in its literal sense, but usually quasi-dysphemistically, since as a once-intended euphemism it is ultimately offensive. In another voiceover, Dre claims, "urban can also mean hip, cool and colorful, just like my family" (1x01). But even if here the main character accepts that the term could be positive and applied to his own family, it is still a case of euphemism with negative connotations and so quasi-dysphemistic, as he alludes to himself through his use of the words "can also." Moreover, he claims he cannot be identified with "urban"—"the funny thing is I didn't feel urban. I just feel like a dad who was willing to do whatever he had to for his family. And isn't that the American Dream?" (1x01)—so he clearly appears to still be wrestling with the concept. This lack of a clear position seems to be the key to the title of the show, as the term *blackish* reflects the struggle against the assimilation of black culture in the United States. The very title thus defines the inner anxiety of the main character that he should not lose his true black essence, whatever it may be.

This might be linked to the binary split between two groups, white ("them") and black ("us") people. The following example illustrates this clearly, together with the quasi-dysphemistic use of "urban":

(4) "I said I wanted to be the first black SVP for Stevens & Lido, when, actually, I wanted to be the first SVP who happened to be black."

"What's the difference? Obama's the first black President. I mean, does that make him any less President? No."

"No, because he's the first black President of the United States, not the first black President of the *Urban* United States." (1x01; italics added)

This sense of polarization denotes a constant awareness of the opposition between black people and mainstream white culture, which is often present in conversations about race, reflecting dynamics of inclusion and exclusion (Gillota 2013, 2, 6). Humor concerning minorities of any kind is essentially built through stereotypes grounded in the opposition between those belonging to the mainstream group and the rest of society. This conception of two opposed groups is also used in the context of politics, where the speaker's aim is to persuade voters that they all share certain values and that those values are being threatened by another interest group. This is the sense in which Dre's voiceover speeches should be interpreted. Indeed, he even makes the political claim that "the White House was just that white until one man broke through and gave my people hope" (1x10), thus alluding to the difference between black and white politicians in their approach to the black community.

Dre also insists that the fact that black people are not Republicans is axiomatic. He is fond of his people's loyalty to black candidates and mentions that 91% of black people voted for Obama. His own fidelity to Obama is expressed with a hyperbole, "he could have dropped-kick this baby, and I still would have voted for him" (1x23). Dre considers that the fact that his son Junior identifies as a Republican is another sign that the family is losing their black identity. Even his moderate wife Bow is clear regarding her different political attachment and her view of herself and her family as "compassionate liberals who believe in tolerance, acceptance … open" (1x23), to which Dre adds they are black and that is all that matters. Later in the same speech he says "you can't be a black Republican" to his son Junior and provides a polarized reason: "they are not down for us, so we are not down for them." In the same episode, when he is asked if he is suggesting all Republicans are racist, he says, "No, of course not. But they are." Therefore, being a Republican is a veiled dysphemism. Through this exaggeration, Dre humorously tries to appear as a tolerant person while defending a reductionistic Democratic perspective. The expression "Uncle Tom," another stereotype identified by Bogle (2016), also appears as a dysphemistic term to refer to Republican black men, the darlings of the Republican whites (Hughes 2006, 476), once again from a simplistic Democratic perspective.

This permanent feeling of being confronted by the white world makes Dre mention that a white colleague calls him "Drigitty-Dre-Dre," "Big Dre" and "Mister Senior Vee-peezy" (1x01), using Snoop Dogg's slang so as to be friendly with him, which Dre considers "inappropriate" (1x01) as he feels reduced to a particular music and belittled

as a professional. Thus the expressions become instances of quasi-dysphemism. This seems the rule in his office, where nobody is able to find appropriate ways to cross cultural gaps and address him properly, at least in terms of Dre's standards: "As a black man in corporate America, my days are pretty much filled with a series of awkward handshakes." Some colleagues try to behave as if they are a "brother" and one person even calls his family "those people you live with" (1x20). He also resents being expected to use Ebonics (that is, African-American vernacular English) to address the urban division customers: "Keepin' it real isn't some checklist you find on *Yo! MTV Raps*." In contrast, his black colleague Charlie of the urban division seems comfortable with the office environment and communication styles. Dre in fact lives a constant contradiction. He assumes he has been promoted because of his professional merits, but he discovers that his employers' principal motivation was that they highly value his clear vision of black identity, which could help the company target black customers. Paradoxically, he is bothered by this, as he does not identify with their proposals for targeting black clients. For instance, in his view, using Ebonics or speaking like a rapper implies infantilism, lack of professional standards or even cultural misappropriation by white people.

Polarization is distinctly seen when, before his promotion, Dre says: "If I could have your attention at Stevens & Lido, there was a clear separation between lower management and upper management. And that always made me feel like it was us versus them" (1x01). That is, the two ethnic groups are seen as both polarized and asymmetrical, with whites being considered the superior race. Dre constantly resorts to this kind of binary vision, even in the ingroup. He claims that black people "have a double consciousness," their mainstream selves in "The Man's world," an allusion to James Brown's song "It's a Man's Man's Man's World" (1966), and their down-home selves for the "brothers" (1x20). This last term is an epithet used in the ingroup to replace "black men." His words clearly show that black people have to behave in specific ways to fit in the white world, but at the same time be proud of their roots and be themselves.

Finally, Dre, unlike Bow, perceives second (and hostile) intentions in white comments, as when he is offended when his son Jack is praised for being a natural athlete, as he would prefer him to be noticed because of his intelligence. This feeling is intensified when his son is compared to a panther. Bow, on the other hand, considers the praise and comparison "cool." Dre's sense of insult stems from the same animal dysphemism as in his safari park reverie.

5.2. Appreciation or Aesthetics

Appreciation uses the two euphemistic terms *urban* and *black* to assess an individual in regard to their value in a particular field. The statement "I may have to be *urban* at work, but I'm still going to need my family to be *black*" (1x01; italics added) shows how Dre resents being categorized by whites as urban, in contrast with black people's

criteria. Dre continually fights with the concept and basically only accepts it when black people (his ingroup) use it and considers it a case of quasi-dysphemism when used by whites.

Dre finds it ironic to discover that one of his children does not really know what prejudice is when they are in "a backwoods convenience store gratuitously named Whitey's," where the white storekeeper gives them "the white-man once-over" (1x12). He states that the owner is watching them like a hawk so that they do not steal anything. Even though he is critical of the stereotype, he exploits it by pretending to be stealing something in order to demonstrate to his son that the white storekeeper is a racist.

Positive appreciation is frequently made by Dre through approbatory references to black cultural aspects, namely soul—*soulicious*—food or typically black dishes like tater tots or turkey, especially his mother's "spread fried pork chops, biscuits, thick-ass gravy" (1x08). Black food is persistently presented as superior to white food—exemplified by white or frozen yogurt or vegan pasta—and as signaling the embrace of a particular culture, as when Dre is talking to Pops about his children's friends: "Are we talking raw, uncut biggie black or Low-Cal Drake black?" (1x03), where reference is made to biracial musician Drake as a symbol for the *not-so-black*.

Another instantiation of black culture is the nod, which Dre describes as "the internationally accepted, yet unspoken, sign of acknowledgement of black folks" (1x03) around the world. He affirms that it is their duty to give the nod. He also talks about the aforementioned linguistic resource of playing the dozens, a phenomenon traditionally considered a part of quasi-euphemism. The expression becomes a case of quasi-dysphemism in the example below, since it is seen as a way to stereotype black people and as a slur that Dre traces back to slavery and the ability of black people to address their problems with a game of nonsensical insults similar to those traded between siblings:

(5) "The dozens? Yeah, you see, we come from a long, proud African tradition of talking trash. […] Long ago, opposing African tribes didn't actually fight. They'd just make fun of each other. Later, those same dudes came across the ocean on something like *The Love Boat* only no love, all Isaacs, pissed-off Isaacs. Eventually, they arrived in America, and the less-desirable slaves were sold by the dozen. But they found a way to turn their pain into something positive by making fun of each other. That's what we call *playing the dozens*. […] Through the years, our ancestors found the comedy in pain." (1x15)

False compliments and the standardized expression of friendly banter "you big" prove to be simple and powerful, especially since they seem to easily intimidate some white characters.

As explained in the example of "urban," misappropriation of black culture is a matter of concern for Dre, who resents how his wife and children prefer to sing and perform white Meghan Trainor's song "All about that Bass" (2014) when he is trying

to explain the importance of racial prejudice on the occasion of Martin Luther King Jr. Day (1x12). However, he does affirm that "a black guy can marry someone white and still be cool" (1x23); he provides a long list of names, such as Kanye West, Tiger Woods and Cuba Gooding Jr., and goes on to say that it is the same as him being part of mostly white America without losing his identity. In short, some expressions or concepts might be understood as positive if used by a black person or negative if uttered by a white person since they are considered misappropriation.

5.3. Judgment or ethics

Judgment is very fruitful as there are many comments on individual people. Dre constantly tries to promote and instill a positive attitude towards black culture in his family, but he also alludes to white celebrities—"next to him, you'll be Denzel Clooney Kodjoe Chestnut" (1x02)—thereby mixing black and white people in his list of acknowledged standards of male beauty to talk about someone less beautiful in a quasi-dysphemistic manner. However, in line with his racial pride and Black Nationalism, it is insulting for him that a white boy knows more about Martin Luther King Jr. than his own son, which he describes as "an embarrassment" (1x12).

Negative judgment also appears. Dre uses quasi-dysphemism to criticize how his child modifies or changes his name to fit in with white or Jewish standards—"So, Junior, if I hear anybody calling you [Jewish] *Schlomo* or *Shmuel* or especially [white] *Andy*, I'm gonna back you over, and whoever else is saying it, in my car" (1x01; italics added)—without realizing his child is just searching for his own voice in the midst of adolescence. Negative ideas revolve around not being black enough in the sense of not having the required customs or knowledge of black culture. He himself is included in the criticism, since he recognizes he knows many black people, but apparently does not know his own children. He also criticizes his wife through dysphemistic terms for being biracial when he introduces her to the audience as "this drooling, pigment-challenged, mixed-race woman […] my wife, Rainbow" (1x01). Dre wants to discredit her opinion as not belonging to a real black woman and does so by using politically correct terminology which is shockingly artificial. She rejects both those expressions and the distinction between the black and the not-so-black by alluding to her unambiguously black appearance:

> (6) "All this coming from, uh, a biracial or mixed or omni-colored-complexion, whatever-it-is-they're-calling-it-today woman—who technically isn't even really black?"
> "Okay, well, if I'm not really black, then could somebody please tell my hair and my ass?" (1x01)

However, Dre repeatedly resents Pops's accusation that he does not eat a real black diet: "Oh, so fried, fried chicken is too black for you" (1x01). He also considers it an

insult to their culture when his son wants to play a sport typically played by white people, field hockey. When his wife tries to counter his exaggeration by using hyperbole, he reprimands her for blaming O. J. Simpson, the celebrity who was acquitted just because of the color of his skin, as is said to be typically the case with whites:

> (7) "Babe, you don't get it. Today, it's field hockey. Tomorrow, he's running from the police in a white bronco."
> "Oh, my God are you suggesting that our son is gonna grow up and murder his wife?"
> "Aha! You think O. J. did it!"
> "Oh, come on." (1x01)

Racial tags are sometimes used by Dre to refer to his wife—"Mixed Bow, Asian Maisie, and Black Lance" (1x19)—as well as his mother. (1x10). Jokes are even made about white identity when Dre is playing the dozens with his colleagues: "You so white, Wayne Brady's jealous," "You so white, you thought Malcolm X was a porno," "You so white, ghosts are scared of you," and "Yeah, man, you don't look like the inside of Conan O'Brien's thigh" (1x15).

There are also many references to Mexicans, understood as a community of their own. Dre, and even Bow, substitute expressions applied to food for the word *Mexican* to describe a woman he daydreams of: "that nice little burrito girl who gives them extra guacamole" and "[y]ou want me to choke to death so that you can get with Chipotle girl?" (1x18). Dre uses Spanish to mock Mexicans and attributes certain, less socially acceptable jobs to them. Once again, this can also be applied to the agreeable Bow, who puts her foot in it when trying to clarify a misunderstanding with her neighbor and then feels she is offending the Latino gardener: "I'm still a doctor! Janine, I am not just a gardener! Oh, Pedro, I'm so sorry" (1x07). Dre employs the dysphemistic expression "damn Mexican" with an offensive intention and justifies his words as "totally acceptable" when he angrily refers to a colleague who "robbed" him the role of Santa (1x10). He has two reasons to deride her for not being the right candidate: she is a woman and she is Mexican. This opinion is partly supported by his family, who claim "there's supposed to be a black Santa before a Mexican Santa." They create their own Chain of Being for human history and argue the order for Presidency should be white President, black President, Mexican President, gay President; therefore, the order for Santa should be "white Santa, black Santa, Mexican Santa, Thunderdome" (1x10), which suggests the world will never be ready for more changes beyond the integration of Latinos. Even though Dre tries to offend with statements like these, he ends up recognizing that they are racist and insane.

Prejudices and stereotypes are also applied to other ethnicities, nationalities or geographical identities, such as Canadians and Europeans. In fact, Dre displays inverted racism towards people of a different origin. Europeans, for instance, are depicted as depraved and obsessed with sex. He is especially offensive with the French, as his wife

affirms: "the French thing has overtaken the white thing on your list of stupid reasons to freak out," she says when their daughter is dating someone French and Dre is worried about them having sex.

Even though Dre distinguishes between white Americans and white Canadians, he still criticizes how whites in general conceive black people in terms of stereotypes. He complains because he is frequently asked if he knows Jay-Z, responding that "all black people don't know one another" (1x16). This would imply reductionism and that they are a minority. However, this is mitigated as his interlocutor asks if he knows RuPaul, which he actually does.

Apart from emphasizing his black nationalistic feelings by "looking for more black friends" for his son (1x03) or alluding to representatives or symbols of black people like Whoopi Goldberg in *The Color Purple* (1985) or Oprah Winfrey, Dre resorts to euphemistic metaphors to define how black people have progressed despite the impediments posed by white people throughout history. Thus, he tells his daughter that "some species flourish in any environment" (1x03). Dre also uses a euphemistic expression to denounce how white people have always discredited black people in both senses of the expression—"to put it mildly, credit hasn't always been the easiest thing for a black man to get, whether it's a credit-card application, the birth of rock 'n' roll, or civilization itself" (1x04).

6. CONCLUSIONS

While meeting the standards for family sitcoms addressing the difficult task of parenthood, *Black-ish* is mainly about being black and middle-class in the United States in the twenty-first century. Racial tensions are portrayed as a major preoccupation for Black America in terms of issues ranging from professional glass ceilings to the so-called misappropriation of black culture, especially in the music industry, as well as more serious questions like the persistence of open racism. Every episode reflects topics relevant to current society from various perspectives within the black community, who generally enjoy better life conditions while attempting not to forget the slavery of their ancestors and confronting subtler yet persistent forms of discrimination. Even if the NAACP has appreciated this approach, the series has also provoked controversy, with some voices accusing it of displaying inverted racism.

The tensions appearing in the series are reflected in numerous linguistic resources concerning taboo and friendly banter or playing the dozens. Humor is not used to either confirm or reject the stereotypes set by a dominant outgroup majority, but rather to provide, from the inside, a space where different ways of understanding blackness are confronted. There is, firstly, the perspective of those who are blackish, whose position is, in some way, prone to assimilation. This is the viewpoint of Dre's wife and children, who feel both inside the black community and not discriminated against by the whites, leading them to truly believe in color blindness or the eventual overcoming of racial

obstacles, although occasionally they feel rejected by both communities. Secondly, the real black perspective is represented by Pops. It fights active white oppression and aims for separation. Its implicitly exaggerated representation in the show has not been understood by some sectors of the audience, hence the accusations of reverse racism. Thirdly, the option of full integration is propounded by Dre himself, who perceives clear color lines in his office and, through his many insecurities, consistently reveals his wish for integration and his dislike of marginalizing black stereotypes. Finally, marginalization, understood as the acceptance of the white prejudices shared by Dre's colleagues, white or not.

There is, however, some agreement in the show on the preference for the term *black* from among other alternatives. In fact, being neutral in meaning, the word acquires the implications the speaker gives it and, since black people have associated it with desirable qualities, there is no longer any need for taboo expressions (affect). Some other words or metaphors are intrinsically dysphemistic and must be avoided, even in the ingroup, although there are some members who do not seem to be aware of this. Under the guise of not being racist, dysphemism is used to negatively characterize other ethnic groups, like whites or Mexicans, whom Dre perceives as rivals (judgment). This antithetical conception of the United States is shown through a persistent use of polarization as a linguistic resource which confronts "us" and "them," whereby everything concerning black culture is positive (appreciation) and endangered. Despite everything, the story of the Johnsons is one of success and getting on in life. And, as Dre himself says, "point is, there is a story to tell, the story of us, our family, our culture. The details of the story might change over time, but the important thing is, *we* tell it" (1x24; italics added).

WORKS CITED

ALLAN, Keith and Kate Burridge. 2006. *Forbidden Words: Taboo and the Censoring of Language*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP.

ALLEN, Irving L. 1983. *The Language of Ethnic Conflict: Social Organization and Lexical Culture*. New York: Columbia UP.

BARRIS, Kenya. 2014-. *Black-ish*. Television Series. New York: ABC.

BERGER, Arthur Asa. 1993. *An Anatomy of Humor*. New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction.

BERRY, John W. 1997. "Immigration, Acculturation, and Adaptation." *Applied Psychology* 46 (1): 5-34.

BOGLE, Donald. 2016. *Toms, Coons, Mulattoes, and Bucks: An Interpretive History of Blacks in American Films*. 5th ed. New York: Bloomsbury Academic.

BLOMMAERT, Jan and Chris Bulcaen, eds. 1997. *Political Linguistics*. Amsterdam and Philadelphia, PA: John Benjamins.

BURGEN, Stephen. 1996. *Your Mother's Tongue*. London: Indigo.

CASAS GÓMEZ, Miguel. 2012. "The Expressive Creativity of Euphemism and Dysphemism." *Lexis: Journal in English Lexicology* 7: 43-64.

CHAMIZO DOMÍNGUEZ, Pedro J. 2004. "La función social y cognitiva del eufemismo y del disfemismo." *Panace@* V: 45-51.

CHILDS, David. 2015. "Socially Constructing Race and History: Exploring Black Identity and Popular Culture in Social Studies Classrooms through Cultural Studies Framework." *Journal of Pan African Studies* 8 (2): 55-73.

CHIMEZIE, Amuzie. 1976. "The Dozens: An African-Heritage Theory." *Journal of Black Studies* 6 (4): 401-20.

CRESPO-FERNÁNDEZ, Eliecer. 2008. "Sex-Related Euphemism and Dysphemism: An Analysis in Terms of Conceptual Metaphor Theory." *Atlantis: Journal of the Spanish Association of Anglo-American Studies* 30 (2): 95-110.

—. 2015. *Sex in Language: Euphemistic and Dysphemistic Metaphors in Internet Forums.* London and New York: Bloomsbury.

DIJK, Teun A. van. 1997. "What is Political Discourse Analysis?" In Blommaert and Bulcaen 1997, 11-52.

—. 1999. *Ideología. Una aproximación multidisciplinaria.* Translated by Lucrecia Berrone de Blanco. Barcelona: Gedisa.

FAIRCHILD, Halford H. 1985. "Black, Negro, or Afro-American? The Differences Are Crucial!" *Journal of Black Studies* 16 (1): 47-55.

GILLOTA, David. 2013. *Ethnic Humor in Multiethnic America.* New Brunswick, NJ and London: Rutgers UP.

HOLLOWAY, Daniel. 2016. "'Black-ish' Creator: I Get So Tired of Talking about Diversity." *Variety*, August 4. [Accessed online on February 22, 2018].

HORLACHER, Stefan. 2010. "Taboo, Transgression and Literature: An Introduction." In Horlacher, Glomb and Heiler 2010, 3-22.

HORLACHER, Stefan, Stefan Glomb and Lars Heiler, eds. 2010. *Taboo and Transgression in British Literature from the Renaissance to the Present.* Basingstoke and New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

HUGHES, Geoffrey. 2006. *An Encyclopedia of Swearing: The Social History of Oaths, Profanity, Foul Language, and Ethnic Slurs in the English-Speaking World.* Armond, NY: M. E. Sharpe.

HUNSTON, Susan and Geoffrey Thompson, eds. 2000. *Evaluation in Text: Authorial Stance and the Construction of Discourse.* Oxford: Oxford UP.

JONES, Dave. 2014. "1 Million Strong against ABC's New Sitcom 'Black-ish'." *Change. org* petition. [Accessed online on February 22, 2018].

KIHARA, Claudius Patrick. 2015. "Mchongoano and the Ethnography of Communication." *University of Nairobi Journal of Language and Linguistics* 4: 1-19.

KING, Martin Luther, Jr. 1963. "I Have a Dream: Address at March on Washington for Jobs and Freedom." *The Martin Luther King Jr. Research and Education Institute.* [Accessed online on February 22, 2018].

LAKOFF, George and Mark Turner. 1989. *More than Cool Reason: A Field Guide to Poetic Metaphor.* Chicago: U of Chicago P.

Leech, Geoffrey. 1983. *Principles of Pragmatics*. New York: Longman.

Martin, James Robert. 2000. "Beyond Exchange: Appraisal Systems in English." In Hunston and Thompson 2000, 142-75.

Martin, James Robert and Peter R. White. 2005. *The Language of Evaluation: Appraisal in English*. Basingstoke and New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Montgomery, Martin. 1995. *An Introduction to Language and Society*. London: Routledge.

Moraes, Lisa de. 2014. "ABC's 'Black-ish' about Culture more than Race, Exec Producers Say." *Deadline*, July 15. [Accessed online on February 22, 2018].

Moreno Fernández, Francisco. 1998. *Principios de sociolingüística y sociología del lenguaje*. Barcelona: Ariel.

Nussbaum, Emily. 2016. "In Living Color: With 'Black-ish,' Kenya Barris Rethinks the Family Sitcom." *New Yorker*, April 25. [Accessed online on February 22, 2018].

Pérez, Raúl and Viveca S. Greene. 2016. "Debating Rape Jokes vs. Rape Culture: Framing and Counter-Framing Misogynistic Comedy." *Social Semiotics* 26 (3): 265-82.

Peyser, Andrea. 2015. "Shows like 'Black-ish' Perpetuate Racist Stereotypes." *New York Post*, April 6. [Accessed online on February 22, 2018].

Qu, Yan, James Shanahan and Janice Wiebe, eds. 2004. *Proceedings of AAAI Spring Symposium on Exploring Attitude and Affect in Text*. Menlo Park, CA: AAAI Press.

Smith, Tom W. 1992. "Changing Racial Labels: From 'Colored' to 'Negro' to 'Black' to 'African American'." *Public Opinion Quarterly* 56 (4): 496-514.

Taboada, Maite and Jack Grieve. 2004. "Analyzing Appraisal Automatically." In Qu et al. 2004, 158-61.

Trump, Donald. 2014. "How is ABC Television Allowed to have a Show Entitled 'Blackish'? Can you Imagine the Furor of a Show, 'Whiteish'! Racism at Highest Level?" Tweet. October 1.

Truscott, Diane M. and Stephen D. Truscott. 2005. "Differing Circumstances, Shared Challenges: Finding Common Ground between Urban and Rural Schools." *Phi Delta Kappan* 87 (2): 123-30.

Vickers, Jasmine. 2018. "Black or Black-ish: Decoding Black-ish and Its Place in the Conversation of Diversity." Master's thesis, Syracuse University.

Walker, Laura A. 2014. "Linguistic and Cultural Approaches to Menstruation Taboo and Euphemism." Bachelor's thesis, Swarthmore College.

White, Peter R. 2015. *The Appraisal Website: The Language of Attitude, Arguability and Interpersonal Positioning*. [Accessed online on February 22, 2018].

Wilkerson, Isabel. 1989. "'African-American' Favored by Many of America's Blacks." *New York Times*, January 31. [Accessed online on October 18, 2018].

Dr. Raquel Sánchez Ruiz is an Assistant Professor (tenure track) at the Faculty of Education in Albacete (UCLM), where she has been teaching in the Department of Modern Languages (English) for nine years. She has published papers on linguistics and discourse analysis in peer-reviewed journals and is interested in political discourse, discourse analysis and taboo.

Dr. Isabel López Cirugeda is an Assistant Professor (tenure track) in the Department of Modern Languages (English) of the Universidad de Castilla-La Mancha. She has been teaching at the Faculty of Education of Albacete (Spain) for sixteen years, on both BA and MA courses. Her research is related to political discourse analysis and taboo studies.

Address: Departamento de Filología Moderna. Facultad de Educación. Universidad de Castilla-La Mancha. Plaza de la Universidad, 3. 02071, Albacete, Spain. Tel.: +34 967599200; ext. 2292 and 2898.

Another Look at Old English Zero Derivation and Alternations

JAVIER MARTÍN ARISTA
Universidad de La Rioja
javier.martin@unirioja.es

This article offers an overview of zero derivation in Old English, a description of the vocalic alternations that hold between zero derived nouns, adjectives and weak verbs and their bases of derivation as well as an account of the significance of alternations in the wider context of the evolution of the lexicon of English. Alternations are quantified and related to i-mutation and word-formation processes by distinguishing direct from reverse alternations and alternations with a strong verb source from alternations with a weak verb target. The conclusions reflect the synchronic-diachronic character of alternations. On the synchronic axis, alternations represent a relatively generalised phenomenon that affects all classes of both strong and weak verbs, while, on the diachronic axis, they allow us to assess the progress of the change from variable to invariable base morphology.

Keywords: alternation; word-formation; zero derivation; morphology; Old English

. . .

Nuevas perspectivas en la derivación cero y las alternancias del inglés antiguo

Este artículo ofrece una visión general de la derivación cero en inglés antiguo, una descripción de las alternancias que se establecen entre los nombres, adjetivos y verbos débiles, de una parte, y sus bases de derivación, de otra parte; y una valoración de la importancia de las alternancias para la evolución del léxico inglés. Se cuantifican las alternancias y se relacionan con la mutación de la i y con los procesos de formación de palabras mediante distinciones entre las alternancias directas y las inversas y entre el verbo fuerte como origen de la derivación y el verbo débil como meta de la derivación. Las conclusiones reflejan el carácter sincrónico-diacrónico de las alternancias. En el eje sincrónico, las alternancias representan un

fenómeno relativamente generalizado que afecta a todas las clases de verbos fuertes y débiles; mientras que en el eje diacrónico las alternancias permiten medir el progreso del cambio de la morfología de base variable a la morfología de base invariable.

Palabras clave: alternancia; formación de palabras; derivación cero; morfología; inglés antiguo

1. Aims, Scope and Previous Research

Word-formation is not only an area where phonology, lexicology and grammar meet but also an aspect of language structure which often resists a purely synchronic analysis. This is particularly the case with Old English because it constitutes a remarkably long period in which the degree of diachronic and diatopic variation present indicates that a number of changes are underway that undermine the synchronic unity of this stage of the English language. An important consequence of assuming the synchronic status of Old English is that the effects of well-attested diachronic changes such as the fronting and raising of back vowels and diphthongs known as *i-mutation* have to be integrated into the synchronic grammar of the language in order to appropriately describe and explain the morphological processes that are witnesses to them.

The two topics of this article, zero derivation and alternations, clearly reflect the situation just described, since the overlapping of synchronic fact and diachronic motivation, on the one hand, and lack of productivity and relatively widespread distribution, on the other, point to an extremely unstable system which is very likely to disappear during its subsequent evolution, but which still calls for explanation in the synchronic grammar of Old English. That said, the general aim of the article is to take a new look at Old English zero derivation and alternations in terms of (i) an overview of zero derivation in Old English, (ii) a description of the vocalic alternations that relate zero derived nouns, adjectives and weak verbs to their bases of derivation and (iii) an account of the significance of alternations in the wider context of the evolution of the lexicon of English. In general, the line taken in this research is that the framework of alternations is valid if it is applied systematically and exhaustively; and, moreover, that it allows the researcher to come to conclusions regarding the structure of the lexicon.

The point of departure of this review is Herbert Pilch's *Altenglische Grammatik* (1970), given its concern with the synchronic explanation for grammatical aspects of Old English in general and word-formation in particular. Pilch finds some parts of the inflectional morphology of Old English that display i-mutation (such as the singular second and third persons of the present indicative of strong verbs) and, above all, a noteworthy set of derivational processes in which a relation often holds between an i-unmutated base of derivation and an i-mutated derivative (1970, 88). Although the formation of deverbal nouns with a dental suffix is identified by Pilch as conveying i-mutation (*mǣgð* "ambition" < *magan* "to be able"), the vast majority of derivational processes presenting i-mutation can be included under the general heading of zero derivation (or derivation without derivational morphemes). These include the formation of causative verbs (as in *brengan* "to produce" < *bringan* "to bring"), denominal weak verbs from class 1 (as in *gehylman* "to provide with a helmet" < *helm* "helmet"), deadjectival nouns (like *hǣte* "heat" < *hāt* "hot"), deverbal nouns without suffix (such as *gebæc* "baking" < *bacan* "to bake") and deverbal adjectives without suffix (of the type *gescēad* "reasonable" < *gescēadan* "to separate"). Pilch's description does

not include i-mutated denominal adjectives like *strēme* "having a current" (< *strēam* "stream") and, more importantly, does not constitute a principled systematic account.

Dieter Kastovsky's *Old English Deverbal Substantives Derived by Means of a Zero Morpheme* (1968) presents a complete framework of recurrent and fairly frequent constrasts or *alternations* between the vocalism of verbs and deverbal nouns. He also draws a distinction between the vocalism of strong verbs due to the functioning of gradation and alternations and remarks:

> As to the structural status of these alternations, they are of course not derivative morphemes, as little as is gradation. The alternations originated by purely phonological processes in the course of which former inflexional or derivational morphemes were lost as overt forms and were replaced by zero morphemes (or allomorphs), while the allophones of the stem vocalism or consonantism which had been conditioned by the vowel(s) of the lost morphemes were phonemicised. The ensuing opposition of vowels and/or consonants constitutes a concomitant feature, as far as derivation is concerned. (59)

Kastovsky's vocalic alternations, presented in table 1, are based on historical considerations. Direct alternations (A1, A2, etc.) are due to i-mutation, while reverse alternations (A1R, A2R, etc.) "describe those cases where the verbal stem or part of the verbal stem underwent i-mutation, while the derived noun did not" (57).

TABLE 1. Vocalic alternations in Kastovsky (1968)

Alternation		Examples
A1	<a> ~ <æ>	*faran* "to travel" ~ *fær* "journey"
A1R	<æ> ~ <a>	*stæl* (*stelan* "to steal") ~ *stalu* "stealing"
A2	<a> ~ <e>	*acan* "to ache" ~ *ece* "ache"
A2R	<e> ~ <a>	*sendan* "to send" ~ *sand* "sending"
A3	<ea> ~ <ie>	*feallan* "to fall" ~ *fiell* "fall"
A3R	<ie> ~ <ea>	*mierran* "to disturb" ~ *gemearr* "obstruction"
A4a	<e> ~ <i>	*gecweden* (*gecweðan* "to say") ~ *cwide* "saying"
A4b	<eo> ~ <ie>	*weorpan* "to throw" ~ *wierp* "throw"
A4bR	<y> ~ <eo>	*wyrcan* "to work" ~ *weorc* "work"
A5	<o> ~ <y>	*gebrocen* (*brecan* "to break") ~ *bryce* "breach"
A5R	<y> ~ <o>	*spyrian* "to make a track" ~ *spor* "track"

	Alternation	Examples
A6	<u> ~ <y>	*burston* (*berstan* "to burst") ~ *byrst* "burst"
A6R	<y> ~ <u>	*gryndan* "to underlie" ~ *grund* "bottom"[1]
A7	<ā> ~ <ǣ>	*drāf* (*drīfan* "to drive") ~ *drǣf* "action of driving"
A7R	<ǣ> ~ <ā>	*lǣran* "to teach" ~ *lār* "instruction"
A8	<ō> ~ <ē>	*lōcian* "to look" ~ *lēc* "look"
A8R	<ē> ~ <ō>	*fēdan* "to feed" ~ *fōda* "food"
A9	<ēa> ~ <īe>	*hlēat* (*hlēotan* "to cast lots") ~ *hlīet* "lot"
A9R	<īe> ~ <ēa>	*īecan* "to increase" ~ *ēaca* "addition"
A10	<ēo> ~ <īe>	*flēotan* "to float" ~ *flīete* "curds"
A10R	<īe> ~ <ēo>	*stīeran* "to steer" ~ *stēora* "steersman"
A11	<ū> ~ <ȳ>	*būan* "to inhabit" ~ *bȳ* "dwelling"[2]

Kastovsky's framework of alternations constitutes a significant departure from the traditional approach which focused on the vocalic grades of the strong verb and is represented by Carl Palmgren (1904), Eduard Schön (1905), Claus Schuldt (1905), John Jensen (1913) and others. For instance, Palmgren, on the basis of i-mutation, distinguishes eight types of formal relation between nouns and denominal weak verbs (*land* "land" ~ *lendan* "to land," *lār* "teaching" ~ *lǣran* "to teach," *segl* "sail" ~ *siglan* "to sail," *bold* "house" ~ *byldan* "to build," *blōd* "blood" ~ *blēdan* "to bleed," *lust* "pleasure" ~ *lystan* "to please," *rūm* "room" ~ *rȳman* "to clear up" and *stēan* "steam" ~ *stīeman* "to emit steam"), but relates the derivatives of strong verbs mainly to the ablaut of the verb and only secondarily to other phenomena. However, in spite of the central role attributed by Kastovsky to strong verbs, the scope of his work does not include weak verbs based on strong verbs, and excludes non-verbal derivations, as Pilch also does.

As regards the motivation of alternations, for Kastovsky the opposition of vowels between the two members of the alternation constitutes "a concomitant feature" which "originated by purely phonological processes" (59). Subsequent work by Kastovsky (2006) is more explicit in attributing an unproductive and irregular character to alternations:

---

[1] The pair *hūsc* "insult" ~ *hyscan* "to reproach" is asymmetrical because it opposes a long and a short vowel. Kastovsky renders both the verb and the noun with short vowel. In this article the alternants *grund* "bottom" and *gryndan* "to underlie" illustrate A6W (1968, 280).

[2] The same illustration for alternation A11 <ū> ~ <ȳ> as Kastovsky's is used in this article, that is, *būan* "to inhabit" ~ *bȳ* "dwelling." Although *bȳ* is a hapax legomenon, other pairs of alternants with A11 <ū> ~ <ȳ>, such as *brūcan* "use" ~ *brȳce* "useful," are far more frequent in the texts and, moreover, the two variants of the alternation together evince twelve instances.

Towards the end of the Old English period, the language was characterised by large-scale allomorphic variation, with most of these alternations being unpredictable. This eventually led to considerable analogical levelling in the Middle English period with the result of eliminating most of these alternations [...]. Stem-alternation became a characteristic feature of the irregular part of inflection, whereas it disappeared from word-formation on a native basis except some unproductive cases such as *long ~ length*. (171-72; italics in the original)

In this same vein, Luisa García García finds eighteen different sound alternations in Old English *jan*-pairs like *swincan* "toil, labour, work with effort" ~ *swencan* "cause a person to labour, harass, afflict." According to this author, these alternations are "remnants of phonologically motivated changes produced by a word-formation strategy which was relatively unambiguous in Germanic" (2012, 25). As such, sound alternations do not play a morphological role in the formation of Old English *jan*-causatives. García García goes on to say that "the term 'lexical alternations' is more accurate for the alternations in Old English *jan*-causatives, since they are lexically conditioned, thus constituting relic alternations" (26; italics in the original). Carmen Novo Urraca and Laura Pesquera Fernández (2015) follow the same track, although they use the term *morphological* to refer to the fact that, with the extinction of the phonological changes that motivated them, alternations constitute a contrast between bases and derivatives that cannot be repeated productively.

Kastovsky (2006), García García and Novo Urraca and Pesquera Fernández all distinguish between synchronic fact and diachronic motivation and ultimately account for the phenomenon of variation in terms of evolution on the diachronic axis: from phonologically conditioned alternations to lexical constrasts that constitute a closed set of vocalic correspondences and represent a remnant of word-formations resulting from processes that are no longer productive. The data presented in the remainder of the article do not indicate that alternations are systematic in Old English: they are neither generalised nor regular. In this sense, this work does not differ from the authors cited in this paragraph. Nevertheless, a more exhaustive application of the model of alternations than that carried out by these linguists can explain aspects of word-formation, such as the comparatively low importance of verbal suffixation, and more general aspects of lexical organisation, like the spread of the change to invariable base morphology and the beginnings of conversion.

Against this background, this article is organised as follows. Section two defines zero derivation and offers a quantitative overview of this phenomenon. Section three presents the extended model of alternations and compares it to previous approaches. The sections that follow apply the extended model of alternations by type of alternation, lexical category and morphological class: direct alternations based on strong verbs (section four), reverse alternations based on strong verbs (section five), direct alternations resulting in weak verbs (section six) and reverse alternations resulting in weak verbs (section seven). In order to offer an exhaustive account of formal changes

in zero derivation, section eight considers this question with respect to nouns and adjectives. Section nine discusses the results of the analysis and their implications for the organisation and evolution of the lexicon of Old English and, to close this work, section ten summarises the main conclusions.

2. The Definition of Zero Derivation

In this work, zero derivation is derivation without derivational morphemes. In English, this includes the relationship that holds between the verb *to play* and the noun *play,* in which no formal contrast is involved, as well as between the verb *to sing* and the noun *song,* which differ from each other as to their root vowel. The term *zero derivation,* therefore, is preferred over *recategorisation* or *conversion,* to account for both fossilised formations like *song* and fully productive derivations like the noun *play,* which share the property of lacking explicit derivational morphology. In Old English, this definition comprises four subtypes: (i) zero derivation with inflectional morphemes and without derivational morphemes, as in *rīdan* "to ride" > *ridda* "rider"; (ii) zero derivation without explicit morphemes, either inflectional or derivational, as in *bīdan* "to delay" > *bīd* "delay"; (iii) zero derivation with or without explicit inflection but displaying ablaut, such as, respectively, *cnāwan* "to know" > *cnēowian* "to know carnally" and *drīfan* "to drive" > *drāf* "action of driving"; and (iv) zero derivation with formatives that cannot be considered derivational affixes in synchronic analysis, such as *-m* in *flēon* "to fly" > *flēam* "flight."

This definition of zero derivation is motivated by the coexistence in the lexicon of relics from earlier stages of the language and the product of fully operative processes of derivation. In a strictly synchronic analysis, the noun *drāf* "action of driving," for instance, is morphologically related to the preterit of the Class I strong verb *drīfan* "to drive," while the noun *gedrīf* "tract" holds a morphological relation to the present of *drīfan.* Diachronically, the derivatives with æ like *ūtdrǣf* "decree of expulsion" derive from the Germanic weak verb **draibjanan* > Old English *(ge)drǣfan* "to drive" (Holthausen 1963, 75; Seebold 1970, 163; Orel 2003, 74), although the weak verb can be traced back to the strong one in Germanic (Hinderling 1967, 37). On the synchronic axis, *drǣf* presents a vocalic contrast with the main parts of *drīfan,* which, if described with respect to the first preterit, can be put down as *drāf ~ drǣf* and related to i-mutation. The evidence presented in this article, which concurs with the authors cited below on this question, indicates that ablaut formations like *drǣf* are losing ground in Old English to derivatives with the vocalic grade of the infinitive such as *gedrīf.* Nevertheless, relics like *drāf* and productive formations of the type *gedrīf* can be integrated into a unified account of non-affixal derivation comprised of the four types given above.

This approach has two consequences. In the first place, the scope of zero derivation is drastically widened with respect to the zero ablaut grade of Proto-Germanic, which,

in nouns, is restricted to -*a*-stems (*gecor* "decision"), -*ja*-stems, -*to*-stems, -VCV-stems, -(*s*)T-*r*/*la*-stems (*rifter* "sickle"), -*ō*-stems, -C*ō*-stems, *i*-stems (*bryce* "fraction"), -*ti*-stems (*flyht* "flight"), -*tu*-stems (þurst "thirst"), -C*u*-stems and *n*-stems (*wiga* "fighter") (Mailhammer 2008, 286). In the second place, as Kastovksy puts it, this means that "in those instances where the stem-formatives originally acting as derivational exponents were lost or reinterpreted (e.g. *spring, cuma, hunta*) we have to assume their replacement by a zero morpheme in order to keep up the binary interpretation of word-formation sintagmas" (2005, 44; italics in the original).

Thus defined, zero derivation is less transparent than other derivational processes like affixation. For this reason, a paradigmatic approach to lexical analysis is required if this phenomenon is to be studied accurately and exhaustively. The key concept of paradigmatic morphology is the derivational paradigm, which consists of a primitive of derivation and its derivatives, that is, all the lexical items that can be related to the primitive on the basis of both form and meaning (Martín Arista 2012, 2013). Derivational paradigms are relevant for a synchronic analysis of derivational morphology, although they contain the formations of both productive and unproductive processes. As claimed by Robert Hinderling (1967), Elmar Seebold (1970) and others, the strong verb is the starting point of lexical derivation in this analysis, which excludes the formation of strong verbs from categories different from the strong verb itself. Nouns and adjectives can be either derived from strong verbs (Kastovsky 1992) or primitives (Heidermanns 1993) and, as such, function as the base of derivation of weak verbs (Bammesberger 1965; Hallander 1966; Stark 1982). In other words, while strong verbs are always primitive, weak verbs are the result of derivation from strong verbs, nouns, adjectives and adverbs, such as *ūp* "up" > *uppian* "to rise up." In Robert Mailhammer's words, "strong verbs are primary because they somehow go back to Indo-European verbal roots (e.g. Gmc. +*kwem-a-* "come" < IE +*gᵘem-* "come"), or because the original base has been lost, and consequently the explicit derivation would have been obscure to the native speaker (e.g. Gmc. +*bed-ja-* "demand")" (2007, 51). Consider, as illustration, the derivational paradigm of the strong verb *þurfan* "to need," which includes the zero derived noun *þearf* "need" and adjective *þearf* "necessary," on which the noun *þearfa* "needy person" as well as the weak verb *þearfian* "to be in need" are based. The affixal derivation found in this paradigm comprises, among others, the prefixal strong verb *beþurfan* "to need" and the nouns *oferðearf* "extreme need" and *unþearf* "disadvantage," together with the suffixed forms *þorffæst* "useful," *þorflēas* "useless," *þearflic* "necessary" and *þearflīce* "usefully."

With these premises, there are approximately 2,900 zero derivatives in Old English, which can be broken down by category as follows: around 1,700 verbs, 1,000 nouns and 200 adjectives. These figures represent over fifty percent of weak verbs (which total around 3,900) and approximately five percent of nouns (out of a total of ca. 18,500) and adjectives (from a total of around 6,300). The number of formations on the ablaut of the verb is 587. Among the formations on the different vocalic grades of the verbal

stem, the infinitive is chosen in almost fifty percent of cases (308). These data have been retrieved from the lexical database of Old English *Nerthus*, which is based on the dictionaries by Henry Sweet (1987), Joseph Bosworth and Thomas N. Toller (1973) and, especially, John R. Clark Hall and Herbert D. Meritt (1996), on which it draws for headword spelling.[3]

3. The Extended Model of Alternations

This section deals with the alternations that arise between verbs, nouns and adjectives. At this point, it is necessary to explain the principles that underlie the extended model of alternations, to describe its implementation and to compare it to previous approaches.

The extended model of alternations is based on two principles. Firstly, all the major lexical classes take part in alternations and hence alternations must be analyzed exhaustively as they apply to nouns, adjectives and verbs, both strong and weak. Secondly, alternations can only be identified in a well-defined network of relations of morphological and lexical inheritance such as word-formation.

These two principles are implemented in the definition of alternations in the following way. To begin with, alternations have a graphemic basis and therefore frequent alternative spellings need to be registered. For instance, <ēo> alternates with the variants <īe>, <ī> and <ȳ>. Alternations always relate two vowels or two dipthongs that display the same vocalic length, thus the distinction between <ea> ~ <ie> and <ēa> ~ <īe>. The ablaut of the verb is avoided as alternant although it is not totally excluded: the first candidate for alternant is the infinitive of the strong verb, then the past participle (as in *cweðen*, from *cweðan* "to say") and then the preterit (as is the case with *barn*, from *biernan* "to burn"); and the infinitive of the weak verb without exception. As regards the direction of zero derivation, strong verbs constitute the base of derivation of weak verbs, nouns and adjectives, while weak verbs are derived from basic nouns and adjectives as well as strong verbs. With respect to pairs of nouns and adjectives that are morphologically unrelated to a strong verb, the direction of derivation may be unclear unless it can be attributed to i-mutation. Alternations in the direction of i-mutation are considered direct, whereas those in the opposite direction are reverse (R). Strong alternations (A), starting in a strong verb, are distinguished from weak alternations (W), which result in a weak verb. With these distinctions, it turns out that full alternations have the strong form, the weak form, the reverse strong and the reverse weak form. For example, the direct strong form A3 presents the variants <ea> ~ <ie>, <ea> ~ <i> and <ea> ~ <y>; the reverse strong form A3R comprises the variants <ie> ~ <ea> and <e> ~ <ea>; the direct weak form shows the variants <ea> ~

---

[3]   As Michael Ellis (1993) shows, the Clark Hall-Meritt dictionary represents a balanced solution between the early spelling preferred by Sweet (1987) and the late orthography adopted by the Dictionary of Old English (Cameron et al. 2018). Moreover, it is fairly consistent in giving the West-Saxon form of headwords. See Fulk (2009) on the alleged consistency of late West-Saxon spelling.

<ie> and <ea> ~ <i>; and the reverse weak form is <e> ~ <ea>. Many alternations are defective because, unlike full alternations, they do not present the four forms, but even those that do have not been found with all the variants of each form that can be seen in the example above. To avoid circularities, a maximum of one of the four principal parts of the strong verb can be an alternant. For instance, the alternation <a> ~ <æ> *barn* (preterit of *biernan* "to burn") ~ *bærnan* "to cause to burn" is ruled out by <a> ~ <æ> as in *faran* (infinitive) "to travel" ~ *fær* "journey." Finally, the recurrent character of alternations excludes contrasts with only one instance (including the strong form, the weak form and the reverse strong and weak forms).

   In the following sections, a total of thirteen alternations are discussed. In comparison to Kastovsky's (1968) set of alternations, the extended model is applied to all the major lexical categories, presents four additional alternations, considers frequent alternative spellings and is more systematic as regards the distinction between direct and reverse alternations. This entails the revision of the alternations displayed in table 2, which here are not considered reverse, as they are in Kastovsky (1968), but as weak because they appear in the formation of weak verbs.

TABLE 2. Comparison with Kastovsky (1968)

	Alternation		Examples
A3W	(K-A3R)	<ea> ~ <ie>	*gemearr* "obstruction" ~ *mierran* "to disturb"
A5W	(K-A5R)	<o> ~ <y>	*spor* "track" ~ *spyrian* "to make a track"
A6W	(K-A6R)	<u> ~ <y>	*grund* "bottom" ~ *gryndan* "to underlie"
A7W	(K-A7R)	<ā> ~ <ǣ>	*lār* "teaching" ~ *lǣran* "to teach"
A8W	(K-A8R)	<ō> ~ <ē>	*fōda* "food" ~ *fēdan* "feed"
A9W	(K-A9R)	<ēa> ~ <īe>	*ēaca* "increase" ~ *īecan* "to increase"
A10W	(K-A10R)	<ēo> ~ <īe>	*stēor* "steer" ~ *stīeran* "to steer"

   The next section of this article applies the alternations presented in this section to the zero derivations in which strong and weak verbs partake.

4. DIRECT ALTERNATIONS BASED ON STRONG VERBS

Beginning with frequent alternations, of which more than twenty instances can be found, the vocalic alternation A1 <a> ~ <æ> presents twenty-three instances, divided between class VI verbs and nominal derivatives (*wascan* "to wash" ~ *wæsc* "washing"), adjectival derivatives (*onsacan* "to deny" ~ *onsæc* "denying") and verbal derivatives (*wacan* "to wake" ~ *wæccan* "to watch"). There are thirty-four instances of alternation

A2 <a> ~ <e>, involving class VI strong verbs and nouns (*standan* "to stand" ~ *stede* "place") and verbs (*forspanan* "to seduce" ~ *forspennan* "to entice"), as well as class VII verbs and nouns (*gangan* "to go" ~ *gegenga* "fellow-traveler"), adjectives (*forgangan* "to neglect" ~ *forgenge* "hard to carry out") and verbs (*foregangan* "to go before" ~ *foregengan* "to go in front"). The three variants of alternation A3 throw a total of twenty-six instances, comprising class VII strong verbs, on the one hand, and nouns (*weallan* "to bubble" ~ *willa* "spring"), adjectives (*oðhealdan* "to withhold" ~ *oðhylde* "contented") and verbs (*sealtan* "to salt" ~ *syltan* "to season"), on the other. The two variants of alternation A4a present thirty-two instances in total, including class III strong verbs and nouns (*melcan* "to milk" ~ *milc* "milk"), class V strong verbs with nouns (*stecan* "to sting" ~ *sticce* "sting") and weak verbs (*wiðercweðan* "to withstand" ~ *wiðercwiddian* "to murmur") and class VI strong verbs along with nouns (*āðswerian* "to swear" ~ *āðswyrd* "oath-swearing"). There are twenty-four instances of alternation A5 <o> ~ <y>, all of them displaying a class IV strong verb and a noun (*beran* "to carry" ~ *byrd* "burden") or an adjective (*brecan* "to break" ~ *bryce* "fragile"). Alternation A7 <ā> ~ <ǣ> is the most frequent, providing forty-four instances, both from class I strong verbs, which alternate with nouns (*gehnītan* "to thrust" ~ *gehnǣst* "conflict"), adjectives (*fīgan* "to be or become an enemy" ~ *fǣge* "fated") and verbs (*snīðan* "to cut" ~ *snǣdan* "to slice") and with class VII strong verbs, which alternate with nouns (< *āswāpan* "to sweep off" ~*āswǣpa* "rubbish"). The four variants of alternation A10 altogether evince twenty-eight instances, corresponding to class II verbs that alternate with nouns (*rēocan* "to emit smoke" ~ *rēc* "smoke"), adjectives (*āgēotan* "to pour out" ~ *āgīta* "prodigal") and verbs (*āflēogan* "to fly" ~ *āflīegan* "to put to flight") and to class V verbs and adjectives (*geflēon* "to flee" ~ *geflīeme* "fugitive").

Focusing on relatively infrequent alternations of the direct type, which each yield between ten and twenty instances, the two variants of alternation A4b yield seventeen instances, all of them comprising a class III verb and a noun (*weorpan* "to throw" ~ *wierp* "throw") or a verb (*onhweorfan* "to change" ~ *onhwierfan* "to turn"). Alternation A6 <u> ~ <y> presents a total of seventeen instances, comprising a class III strong verb and an adjective (*scrincan* "to wither" ~ *scrynce* "withered") or a verb (*spurnan* "to spurn" ~ *spyrnan* "to stumble"). A total of twelve instances of the two variants of alternation A11 are found, consisting of a class II strong verb and an adjective (*brūcan* "to use" ~ *brȳce* "useful") and a verb (*sūcan* "to suck" ~ *sȳcan* "to suckle") or a class VII strong verb and an adjective (*būan* "to inhabit" ~ *bȳne* "inhabited").

Three direct alternations evince less than ten instances and can thus be considered infrequent. The total of instances of alternation A8 is nine, including class VII strong verbs alternating with nouns (*spōwan* "to succeed" ~ *spēd* "success"), adjectives (*swōgan* "to sound" ~ *swēge* "sonorous") and verbs (*hrōpan* "to call" > *hrēpan* "to cry out"). The two variants of alternation A9 present eight instances in total, consisting of a class VII strong verb and an alternating noun (*ēacan* "to be increased" ~*īht* "increase"). Finally, two alternations show one instance only: alternation A12 <æ> ~ <e>, holding between

a class VI strong verb and a noun (*stæppan* "to step" ~ *stepe* "step"); alternation A14 <a> ~ <æ>, involving the class III strong verb *biernan* "to burn" (preterit *barn*) and the weak verb *bærnan* "to cause to burn."

5. Reverse Alternations Based on Strong Verbs

The only frequent reverse alternations is A4aR <i> ~ <e>, of which seventy-two instances have been found, including nouns derived from class III verbs like *drincan* "drink" ~ *drenc* "drink," as well as derivatives from class V verbs of the adjectival class (*ymbsittan* "to set around" ~ *ymbsett* "neighbouring") and the verb class (*licgan* "to lie" ~ *lecgan* "to lay"). Alternation A2R <e> ~ <a> is relatively infrequent, given that it provides ten instances based on class V verbs (nouns such as *wrecan* "to avenge" ~ *wracu* "revenge" and verbs like *wegan* "to carry" ~ *wagian* "to move") and on class VI verbs, which alternate only with nouns like *swerian* "to swear" ~ *swara* "swearer."

Most reverse alternations based on strong verbs are infrequent. There are just nine instances of A1R <æ> ~ <a>, involving class IV verbs and nouns (*cwelan* "kill" ~ *cwalu* "killing"), adjectives (*gestelan* "to steal" ~ *gestala* "accessory in theft"), verbs (*gestelan* "to steal" ~ *stalian* "to go stealthily") and class VI verbs that alternate with nouns like *stæppan* "to step" ~ *stapela* "post." The variant <e> ~ <ea> of alternation A3R relates class IV strong verbs to nouns, as in *beran* "to bear" ~ *bearn* "child." The variant <ie> ~ <ea> of alternation A3R occurs with class IV, V and VI verbs, which alternate exclusively with nouns: *scieran* "to shear" ~ *scear* "ploughshare," *ofergietan* "to forget" ~ *ofergeatu* "oblivion," *hliehhan* "to laugh" ~ *hleahtor* "laughter." All in all, alternation A3R presents fourteen instances. A total of four instances of alternation A4bR <e> ~ <eo> are evinced, where class IV, V and VI verbs are linked to nouns, as in *āðswerian* "to swear" ~ *āðsweord* "swearing." There is only one instance of alternation A10R <ī> ~ < ēo >, comprising a class I strong verb and a noun, *fīgan* "to be or become an enemy" ~ *fēond* "foe." Finally, two instances of A12R <e> ~ <æ> have been found, comprising class III strong verbs and nouns, as in *hebban* "to heave" ~ *hæf* "leaven."

6. Direct Alternations Resulting in Weak Verbs

Among the frequent alternations resulting in weak verbs we find A2W <a> ~ <e>, comprising both nouns (*sagu* "saying" ~ *secgan* "to say") and adjectives (*strang* "strong" ~ *strengan* "to strengthen") and presenting twenty-eight instances. The four variants of alternation A3W (<ea> ~ <ie>, <ea> ~ <i>, <ea> ~ <y> and <ea> ~ <e>) together evince a total of thirty instances including pairings of noun and weak verb (*heaðor* "confinement" ~ *geheðerian* "to shut in") as well as of adjective and weak verb (*beald* "bold" ~ *gebieldan* "to encourage"). There are twenty-three instances of alternation A5W <o> ~ <y>, which comprise nouns (*hosp* "reproach" ~ *gehyspan* "to reproach") and adjectives (*scort* "short" ~ *scyrtan* "to shorten"). A total of forty instances have

been found that correspond to alternation A7W <ā> ~ <ǣ>, linking both nouns (*snās* "skewer" ~ *snǣsan* "to pierce") and adjectives (*fāg* "variegated" ~ *fǣgan* "to paint") to weak verbs. There are thirty-two instances of alternation A8W <ō> ~ <ē>, with pairs comprising nouns (*sōm* "agreement" ~ *sēman* "to reconcile") and adjectives (*cōl* "cool" ~ *cēlan* "to cool").

The relatively infrequent alternations that result in weak verbs include, to begin with, the two variants of alternation A4bW (<eo> ~ <ie> and <eo> ~ <y>), which provide eleven instances containing both nouns (*smeoru* "ointment" ~ *smierwan* "to smear") and adjectives (*beorht* "bright" ~ *gebierhtan* "to brighten"). A total of fourteen instances can be found that correspond to alternation A6W <u> ~ <y> with nouns (*hungor* "hunger" ~ *hyngran* "to be hungry") and adjectives (*gesufel* "with a relish" ~ *gesyflan* "to provide with relishes"). All in all, thirteen instances can be identified of the three variants of alternation A9W (<ēa> ~ <īe>, <ēa> ~ <ȳ> and <ēa> ~ <ē>), in which both nouns (*stēam* "steam" ~ *stīeman* "to emit steam") and adjectives (*dēad* "dead" ~ *dȳdan* "to kill") alternate with weak verbs. There are thirteen instances of the three variants of alternation A10W (<ēo> ~ <ī> and <ēo> ~ <īe> and <ēo> ~ <ȳ>) displaying nouns (*hlēor* "cheek" ~ *hlȳrian* "to blow out the cheeks") and adjectives (*lēoht* "light" ~ *lītan* "to make light"). Alternation A11W presents twelve instances, with nouns (*scrūd* "dress" ~ *scrȳdan* "to clothe") as well as adjectives (*cūð* ~ "known" ~ *cȳðan* "to proclaim").

The infrequent direct alternations that result in weak verbs include alternation A1W, which presents five instances with nouns (*wacen* "wakefulness" ~ *wæcnan* "to awake") and adjectives (*bær* "bare" ~ *barian* "to lay bare"). There are nine instances of the two variants of alternation A4aW (<e> ~ <i> and <e> ~ <y>), all of which link a noun to a weak verb, as in *helm* "helmet" ~ *gehylman* "to cover." Alternation A12W evinces five instances, with nouns (*ðæc* "covering" ~ *ðeccan* "to cover") and adjectives (*hwæt* "sharp" ~ *hwettan* "to sharpen"). One single instance can be found of alternation A13W <ǣ> ~ <ē> with a noun and a weak verb: *dǣl* "portion" ~ *dēlan* "to divide." Finally, alternation A13W <o> ~ <e> has two instances comprising the noun *edroc* "rumination" ~ *edreccan* "to chew."

7. REVERSE ALTERNATIONS RESULTING IN WEAK VERBS

No reverse alternation resulting in a weak verb has more than two instances, while the relatively infrequent alternation A1WR <æ> ~ <a> evinces seventeen instances from both nouns (*stæf* ~ *stafian* "to dictate") and adjectives (*smæl* "thin" ~ *smalian* "to become thin"). Among the infrequent alternations we find firstly 2WR <e> ~ <a>, which presents one instance only, involving an adjective and a weak verb: *enge* "oppressive" ~ *angian* "to be in anguish." Alternation A3WR <e> ~ <ea> also evinces one instance, linking an adjective to a weak verb: *ǣmelle* "insipid" ~ *āmeallian* "to become insipid." A total of three instances can be found of A7WR <ǣ> ~ <ā>. They

involve nouns and weak verbs, as in *wlǣtta* "loathing" ~ *wlātian* "to cause to loathe." Alternation A11WR <ȳ> ~ <ū> presents one instance, with an adjective (*drȳge* "dry" ~ *drūgian* "to dry up"). Finally, there are two instances of alternation A12WR <e> ~ <æ>, including the pairing of the noun and weak verb *fregen* "question" ~ *fræġnian* "to ask" as well as that of the of adjective and weak verb *wērig* "weary" ~ *wǣrigian* "to weary."

8. Nouns and Adjectives

In the previous sections, the alternations that involve verbs were analyzed. Nevertheless, a complete picture of the situation in Old English as far as zero derivation and alternations are concerned cannot leave non-verbal classes aside. This is to say, adjectives and verbs should be accounted for not only as derivatives of strong verbs or bases of weak verbs, but also as belonging in noun-adjective and adjective-noun formations. The direction of derivation involving nouns and adjectives cannot be fully ascertained and, consequently, the model of alternations is not applied to these categories. The analysis that follows pays heed to any formal change of the vocalic type between zero derived nouns and adjectives, except when an affix is attached to the zero derivative, as in *wōd* "mad" > *gewēde* "fury," and when the zero derivative does not convey a significantly different meaning, as in *hāt* / *hǣtu* "heat." The direction of derivation from adjectives is based on Heidermanns (1993) and, when possible, on i-mutation.

A total of 108 nouns derived from adjectives by zero derivation have been found, of which twenty-three show i-mutation: *bieldo* "boldness" (< *beald* "bold"), *bierhtu* "brightness" (< *beorht* "bright"), *blǣce* "irritation of the skin" (< *blāc* "pale"), *blǣco* "pallor" (< *blāc* "pale"), *ieldesta* "chief" (< *eald* "old"), *ieldo* "age" (< *eald* "old"), *ieldra* "ancestors" (< *eald* "old"), *frico* "usury" (< *frec* "greedy"), *fyllo* "fulnes" (< *full* "full"), *gǣls* "pride" (< *gāl* "proud"), *grȳto* "greatness" (< *grēat* "great"), *hǣru* "hoariness" (< *hār* "hoary"), *hǣte* "heat" (< *hāt* "hot"), *hielde* "slope" (< *heald* "sloping"), *hierdenn* "hardening" (< *heard* "hard"), *hlȳd* "noise" (< *hlūd* "noisy"), *menigu* "multitude" (< *manig* "many"), *nīehsta* "neighbour" (< *nēah* "near"), *prȳto* "pride" (< *prūd* "proud"), *rētu* "joy" (< *rōt* "glad"), *snyttru* "cleverness" (< *snotor* "clever"), *wlæce* "tepidity" (< *wlaco* "tepid") and *wlenc* "pride" (< *wlanc* "proud").

Forty-seven adjectives derived from nouns by zero derivation have been found, nine of which show i-mutation: *drȳme* "melodious" (< *drēam* "melody"), *filde* "field-like" (< *feld* "field"), *flēre* "having a floor" (< *flōr* "floor"), *fēðre* "loaded" (< *fōðor* "load"), *fēte* "provided with feet" (< *fōt* "foot"), *geiht* "yoked together" (< *geoc* "yoke"), *strīeme* "having a current" (< *strēam* "stream"), *wēse* "moist" (< *wōs* "juice") and *renc* "pride" (< *ranc* "proud")

This formation of adjectives and nouns by zero derivation is not a very productive process. Neither does it present much formal change between base and derivative. Moreover, it is clearly less affected by i-mutation than those processes involving verbs,

which might suggest than we are dealing with formations that ocurred later than the derivation from strong verbs. It might also be the case that the origin of modern conversion, or recategorisation without formal change, as in *poor-the poor* and *bottle-to bottle*, should be sought in the zero derivation of nouns and adjectives that are morphologically unrelated to verbs, not only because there is little formal change of stems between bases and derivatives, but above all because the declension of nouns and adjectives is remarkably similar in Old English, which must have boosted the derivational process. Eventually, with the simplification of inflections, recategorisation was, as in other lexical categories, even more straightforward. More research is needed in this area.

9. Results and Discussion
In the analytical part of this article the set of unproductive formations represented by alternations was quantified, described by lexical category and morphological class of verb and related to i-mutation and word-formation processes by distinguishing, on the one hand, direct from reverse alternations and, on the other, alternations with a strong verb source from those with a weak verb target. Furthermore, the general impact of alternations was contextualised with respect to ablaut formations and zero derivation in general. At this point, a word needs to be said on the significance of this phenomenon with respect to the types of alternations and the tokens that instantiate these types.

Beginning with the types of alternations, the results of the analysis can be seen in table 3.

Table 3. Quantitative results

Alternation	Occurrences	Alternation	Occurrences
A1 <a> ~ <æ>	23	A7 <ā> ~ <ǣ>	44
A1R <æ> ~ <a>	9	A7W <ā> ~ <ǣ>	40
A1W <a> ~ <æ>	4	A7WR <ǣ> ~ <ā>	3
A1WR <æ> ~ <a>	17	**A7 total**	**87**
A1 total	**53**	A8 <ō> ~ <ē>	9
A2 <a> ~ <e>	34	A8W <ō> ~ <ē>	32
A2R <e> ~ <a>	10	**A8 total**	**41**
A2W <a> ~ <e>	28	A9 <ēa> ~ <īe>	7
A2WR <e> ~ <a>	1	A9 <ēa> ~ <ī>	1
A2 total	**73**	A9W <ēa> ~ <īe>	7
A3 <ea> ~ <ie>	9	A9W <ēa> ~ <ȳ>	4

A3 <ea> ~ <i>	4	A9W <ēa> ~ <ē>	2
A3 <ea> ~ <y>	13	**A9 total**	**21**
A3R <ie> ~ <ea>	9	A10 <ēo> ~ <īe>	9
A3R <e> ~ <ea>	5	A10 <ēo> ~ <ī>	5
A3W <ea> ~ <ie>	16	A10 <ēo> ~ <ē>	6
A3W <ea> ~ <i>	3	A10 <ēo> ~ <ȳ>	8
A3W <ea> ~ <y>	7	A10R <ī> ~ <ēo>	1
A3W <ea> ~ <e>	3	A10W <ēo> ~ <īe>	5
A3WR <e> ~ <ea>	1	A10W <ēo> ~ <ī>	3
A3 total	**70**	A10W <ēo> ~ <ȳ>	5
A4a <e> ~ <i>	22	**A10 total**	**42**
A4a <e> ~ <y>	10	A11 <ū> ~ <ȳ>	10
A4aR <i> ~ <e>	72	A11 <ū> ~ <ī>	2
A4aW <e> ~ <i>	3	A11W <ū> ~ <ȳ>	12
A4aW <e> ~ <y>	4	A11WR <ȳ> ~ <ū>	1
A4b <eo> ~ <ie>	6	**A11 total**	**25**
A4b <eo> ~ <y>	11	A12 <æ> ~ <e>	1
A4bR <e> ~ <eo>	4	A12R <e> ~ <æ>	2
A4bW <eo> ~ <ie>	5	A12W <æ> ~ <e>	4
A4bW <eo> ~ <y>	6	A12WR <e> ~ <æ>	2
A4 total	**143**	**A12 total**	**9**
A5 <o> ~ <y>	24	A13W <o> ~ <e>	2
A5W <o> ~ <y>	23	**A13 total**	**2**
A5 total	**47**		
A6 <u> ~ <y>	17	**Strong direct (A) total**	**275**
A6W <u> ~ <y>	14	**Strong reverse (R) total**	**112**
A6 total	**31**	**Weak direct (W) total**	**232**
		Weak reverse (WR) total	**25**
		Grand total	**644**

As shown in table 3, from a qualitative point of view the weak version is the only one present in all alternations, while the reverse variant shows the lowest distribution. Quantitatively, direct versions outnumber the corresponding inverse version (although the difference is much higher for the weak direct and the weak inverse version). These results are in keeping with the primitive nature of strong verbs and the derived character of weak verbs, on the one hand, and the generalised impact of i-mutation, on the other. Indeed, the number of direct alternations, which go along the lines of i-mutation, exceeds reverse alternations, opposite to i-mutation, by far.

Turning to the tokens of the alternations described in this article, two perspectives can be adopted. From a descriptive perspective, the seven classes of strong verbs and the three classes of weak verbs (mostly class 1) take part in alternations. Hence, in spite of the irregular character of the phenomenon, it certainly deserves attention. Overall, 644 alternating pairs were found, representing nearly twenty-five percent of the total number (2,862) of zero derivatives. By lexical class, the bases of the word-formation process in which the alternations occur include eighty-three adjectives, 171 nouns and 387 verbs (as well as two adverbs), while the derivatives belong to the classes of adjective (39), noun (197) and verb (408). All in all, the relative weight of the verb stands out, both as base and as derivative, considering that the verb is the smallest of the major lexical classes in Old English: there are around 18,500 nouns, 6,300 adjectives and 5,500 verbs in the lexicon. This assessment of the role of the verb in zero derivation must be considered in the context of two facts: the generalised prefixation of verbs (which is largely opaque from the semantic point of view, thus Hiltunen 1983; Ogura 1995; Brinton and Traugott 2005; Martín Arista 2011, 2014) and the narrow scope of verbal suffixation (Kastovsky 1992, 391), which is comprised of few overtly derivational suffixes because they have largely fused with inflectional endings. In other words, the figure of verbal zero derivation compensates for the suffixation of this class because, considering the definition of zero derivation as derivation without derivational morphemes, the formations on the boundary between derivation and inflection count as zero derivatives.

In explanatory terms, it must be underlined that the number of formations on the ablaut of the verb (587) is outnumbered by alternating formations (644). These figures provide a quantitative assessment of what Kastovsky calls "the typological change from stem-formation to word-formation" (1992, 487) and Alexander Haselow considers a "rise of analytic tendencies" (2011, 278). On the one hand, there is evidence for a tendency to select variable bases of morphology, given that there are more alternations than non-alternating formations, and that the number of derivatives based on the preterit and the past participle, which represent variable morphological bases, is practically the same as those based on the infinitive, which stands for an invariable morphological base. On the other hand, in the derivation of nouns and adjectives, out of 885 denominal weak verbs only 168 partake in alternating pairs whilst 83 deadjectival verbs out of 415 alternate with their adjectival bases. This is to say, less than twenty percent of

derivatives alternate with their nominal and adjectival bases of derivation. Whereas in the derivation from strong verbs alternations are more frequent than the derivation based on the verbal ablaut, in the derivation from nouns and adjectives alternating pairs are rather exceptional. All in all, these data indicate that variable bases are still preferred over invariable bases of derivation, but also that the change to invariable base morphology is well underway. This, in turn, points out that the typological change to word-formation and the rise of analytic tendencies might be taking place at a slower pace than suggested by Kastovsky (1992) and Haselow (2011).

10. Conclusion

The main conclusions of this work have a bearing on the two axes of analysis. On the synchronic axis, the seven classes of strong verbs and the three classes of weak verbs take part in alternating pairs, which may be verb-noun, verb-adjective or verb-verb, and around one fourth of zero derivatives show alternations. Alternations, then, constitute a remarkable synchronic fact, both qualitatively and quantitatively, which the loss of motivation and lack of productivity of these contrasts cannot deny. On the diachronic axis, the main conclusion is that variable base morphology is well entrenched in Old English and, consequently, the change to invariable base morphology is taking place at a slow pace. As this analysis has shown, variable morphological bases as represented by alternations and verbal ablaut based on the preterit and the past participle outnumber invariable bases of morphology.[4]

Works Cited

Bammesberger, Alfred. 1965. "Deverbative *jan*-Verba des Altenglischen, vergleichend mit den übrigen altgermanischen Sprachen dargestellt." PhD diss., Ludwig-Maximilians Universität.

Bauer, Laurie and Salvador Varela, eds. 2005. *Approaches to Conversion/Zero Derivation*. Münster: Waxmann.

Bosworth, Joseph and Thomas N. Toller. 1973. *An Anglo-Saxon Dictionary*. Oxford: Oxford UP.

Brinton, Laurel J. and Elizabeth C. Traugott. 2005. *Lexicalization and Language Change.* Cambridge: Cambridge UP.

Cameron, Angus et al. 2018. *Dictionary of Old English: A to I Online*. Toronto: Dictionary of Old English Project.

Clark Hall, John R. and Herbert D. Meritt. 1996. *A Concise Anglo-Saxon Dictionary*. Toronto: U. of Toronto P.

Ellis, Michael. 1993. "Old English Lexicography and the Problem of Headword Spelling." *ANQ: A Quarterly Journal of Short Articles, Notes and Reviews* 6 (1): 3-11.

Fulk, Robert D. 2009. "Morphology and Diachrony in *A Grammar of Old English* and the *Dictionary of Old English*." *Florilegium* 26: 15-35.

García García, Luisa. 2012. "Old English *jan*-Causatives: Between Grammar and Lexicon." In Martín Arista et al. 2012, 15-28.

Hallander, Lars G. 1966. *Old English Verbs in* -sian: *A Semantic and Derivational Study*. Stockholm: Almquist and Wiksell.

Haselow, Alexander. 2011. *Typological Changes in the Lexicon. Analytic Tendencies in English Noun Formation.* Berlin: De Gruyter.

Heidermanns, Frank. 1993. *Etymologisches Wörterbuch der germanischen Primäradjektive*. Berlin: De Gruyter.

Hiltunen, Risto. 1983. *The Decline of the Prefixes and the Beginnings of the English Phrasal Verb*. Turku: Turun Yliopisto.

Hinderling, Robert. 1967. *Studien zu den starken Verbalabstrakta des Germanischen.* Berlin: De Gruyter.

Hogg, Richard, ed. 1992. *The Cambridge History of the English Language I: The Beginnings to 1066*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP.

Holthausen, Ferdinand. 1963. *Altenglisches etymologysches Wörterbuch*. Heidelberg: Carl Winter Universitätsverlag.

Jensen, John. 1913. *Die I. und II. Ablautsreihe in der ae. Wortbildung*. Kiel: H. Fiencke.

Kastovsky, Dieter. 1968. *Old English Deverbal Substantives Derived by Means of a Zero Morpheme*. Tübingen: Eberhard-Karls-Universität.

—. 1992. "Semantics and Vocabulary." In Hogg 1992, 290-408.

—. 2005. "Conversion and/or Zero: Word-Formation Theory, Historical Linguistics, and Typology." In Bauer and Varela 2005, 31-50.

—. 2006. "Typological Changes in Derivational Morphology." In Kemenade and Los, 151-77.

Kemenade, Ans van and Bettelou Los, eds. 2006. *The Handbook of the History of English*. Oxford: Blackwell.

Mailhammer, Robert. 2007. *The Germanic Strong Verb: Foundations and Development of a New System*. Berlin: De Gruyter.

—. 2008. "Ablaut Variation in the Proto-Germanic Noun: The Long Arm of the Strong Verbs." *Sprachwissenschaft* 33 (3): 279-300.

Martín Arista, Javier. 2011. "Adjective Formation and Lexical Layers in Old English." *English Studies* 92 (3): 323-34.

—. 2012. "The Old English Prefix *ge*-: A Panchronic Reappraisal." *Australian Journal of Linguistics* 32 (4): 411-33.

—. 2013. "Recursivity, Derivational Depth and the Search for Old English Lexical Primes." *Studia Neophilologica* 85 (1): 1-21.

—. 2014. "Noun Layers in Old English. Asymmetry and Mismatches in Lexical Derivation." *Nordic Journal of English Studies* 13 (3): 160-87.

MARTÍN ARISTA, Javier et al., eds. 2012. *Convergent Approaches to Mediaeval English Language and Literature*. Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars.

MARTÍN ARISTA, Javier, ed. et al. 2016. *NerthusV3. Online Lexical Database of Old English*. Nerthus Project. Universidad de La Rioja. [Accessed online on July 12, 2017].

NOVO URRACA, Carmen and Laura Pesquera Fernández. 2015. "Alternation vs. Allomorphic Variation in Old English Word-Formation: Evidence from the Derivational Paradigm of Strong Verbs." *Studia Anglica Posnaniensia* 49: 63-82.

OGURA, Michiko. 1995. "The Interchangeability of Old English Verbal Prefixes." *Anglo-Saxon England* 24: 67-93.

OREL, Vladimir. 2003. *A Handbook of Germanic Etymology.* Leiden: Brill.

PALMGREN, Carl. 1904. *English Gradation-Nouns in their Relation to Strong Verbs*. Uppsala: U. of Uppsala.

PILCH, Herbert. 1970. *Altenglische Grammatik*. München: Max Hueber Verlag.

SCHÖN, Eduard. 1905. *Die Bildung des Adjectivs im Altenglischen*. Kiel: Verlag von Robert Cordes.

SCHULDT, Claus. 1905. *Die Bildung der schwachen Verba im Altenglischen*. Kiel: Verlag von Robert Cordes.

SEEBOLD, Elmar. 1970. *Vergleichendes und etymologisches Wörterbuch der germanischen starken Verben*. The Hague: Mouton.

STARK, Detlef. 1982. *The Old English Weak Verbs. A Diachronic and Synchronic Analysis*. Tübingen: Niemeyer.

SWEET, Henry. 1987. *The Student's Dictionary of Anglo-Saxon*. New York and London: Macmillan.

Professor Javier Martín Arista teaches Old English and Linguistics at the University of La Rioja. He is the lead researcher of the research project Nerthus, which deals with the linguistic analysis and lexicography of Old English.

Address: Departamento de Filologías Modernas. Facultad de Letras y de la Educación. Edificio de Filología. Universidad de La Rioja. 26004-Logroño, Spain. Tel.: +34 941299425.

BOOK REVIEW ARTICLES

ARTÍCULOS DE REVISIÓN

Towards a Multilingual Approach to the History of English.
A Critical Review of

Elise Louviot and Catherine Delesse, eds. 2017. *Studies in Language Variation and Change 2: Shifts and Turns in the History of English*. Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars. ix + 258 pp. ISBN: 978-1-5275-0030-3.

Päivi Pahta, Janne Skaffari and Laura Wright, eds. 2017. *Multilingual Practices in Language History: English and Beyond*. Berlin and New York: De Gruyter. v + 361 pp. ISBN: 978-1-5015-0494-5.

Amanda Roig-Marín
University of Cambridge, UK
adr41@cam.ac.uk

The ever-increasing awareness of multilingualism as the norm rather than the exception in both historical and present-day societies has reshaped the monolingual emphasis that used to permeate the study of the history of the English language, among many other academic spheres. This paradigm shift is pertinently highlighted by the two volumes under review: *Multilingual Practices in Language History: English and Beyond* (2017), edited by Päivi Pahta, Janne Skaffari and Laura Wright, and *Studies in Language Variation and Change 2: Shifts and Turns in the History of English* (2017), edited by Elise Louviot and Catherine Delesse. The former book seems to follow up on an earlier monograph which was also edited by one of its coeditors, Herbert Schendl and Wright's *Code-Switching in Early English* (2011), which discusses many of the terminological contentions and empirical observations that are at the centre of the aforementioned volume under review: the widely debated boundaries between *one-word code-switches* and *lexical borrowings*—see the contributions in Pahta et al. (2017) by Schendl (39-59), Rita Queiroz de Barros (61-76) and Louise Sylvester (77-96)—and the thorny question of language boundaries in the Middle Ages—see, for instance, the contributions from Tom ter Horst and Nike Stam (223-42) and Sylvester (77-96). These topics are extensively covered in the two introductory chapters of the present book: Pahta, Skaffari and Wright's "From Historical Code-Switching to Multilingual Practices in the Past" (3-17) and Penelope Gardner-Chloros's "Historical and Modern Studies of Code-Switching: A Tale of Mutual Enrichment" (19-36).

By and large, Pahta et al. and Louviot and Delesse evidence how the study of historical multilingual texts has been significantly informed by research into contemporary multilingual practices. Two main overarching approaches have been followed to date: the sociolinguistic approach, which gives prominence to the social participants taking part in the communicative event and the factors involved in language use (see, e.g., Mary Catherine Davidson 2005 and Arja Nurmi and Pahta 2010), and the structural/ grammatical approach, which endeavours to describe structural constraints and recurrent patterns (see, *inter alia*, Siegfried Wenzel 1994, Schendl 2000 and Wright 2010; for a more thorough illustration of both approaches, see Schendl and Wright (2011, 3)). Likewise, present-day theoretical frameworks (amongst others, those by Pieter Muysken 2000, Barbara E. Bullock and Almeida J. Toribio 2009, Gardner-Chloros 2009 and Carol Myers-Scotton and Janice Jake 2009) have nurtured the terminological basis employed by historical linguists in their conceptualisations of the status of multilingual material in relation to its donor/recipient language(s). In particular, Myers-Scotton's Matrix Language-Frame (MLF) model (1993; 1997; 2001) has played a major role in the description of medieval code-switching, as Mareike Keller's chapter, "Code-switched Adjectives in Macaronic Sermons" (Louviot and Delesse 2017, 197-216), clearly shows. I will, however, assess to what extent researchers considering medieval texts can rely on theoretical frameworks devised to analyse present-day data later on in this book review article.

A quick browse through the chapters makes it clear that Louviot and Delesse's and Pahta et al.'s edited collections share not only thematic trends, but also certain contributors, namely, Richard Ingham and Sylvester, scholars renowned for their extensive work on Anglo-French in relation to Middle English. In "Studying French-Origin Middle English Lexis Using the Bilingual Thesaurus of Medieval England" (Louviot and Delesse 2017, 217-28), Sylvester and Imogen Marcus report on the structure and functionality of their bilingual thesaurus, which they developed with Ingham, and select two of its occupational domains, "Manufacture" and "Travel by Water," to gauge the extent to which French-origin lexis entered Middle English. More broadly, their work forms part of a noteworthy body of research debunking the long-standing misbelief that tends to correlate Anglo-French with the elite of society alone. In his thorough analysis of French as a spoken language in later medieval England, Ingham (2009, 81) pointed out that the "uneducated classes constituting the vast majority of the population surely continued to be monolingual users of English." A counterpoint to this is represented by authors such as Maryanne Kowaleski, who suggests that a rather considerable number of English mariners knew basic French—despite being illiterate in most cases (2009, 117)—thereby challenging Ingham's statement (see Amanda Roig-Marín (2018, 180-81) for a succinct overview of the literature on the use of Anglo-Norman across social strata).

Complementarily, in "A Semantic Field and Text-Type Approach to Late-Medieval Multilingualism" (Pahta et al. 2017, 77-96), Sylvester examines lexical items belonging

to the "Dress and Textiles" semantic domain in a variety of text types, fleshing out the advantages of adopting a semantic and text-based approach. The two chapters by Ingham draw on a variety of texts in order to prove how vernacular bilingualism was a reality in late medieval England—though it can be only scantly apprehended given the number of textual witnesses available (see "Medieval Bilingualism in England: On the Rarity of Vernacular Code-Switching" in Pahta et al. (2017, 319-37))—and how Anglo-Norman was de facto an oral and written language well into the late fourteenth century ("English and French in Medieval England: Spoken Bilingualism or Code Diglossia?" in Louviot and Delesse (2017, 175-96)).[1]

The interplay between French and English throughout history is further addressed, to varying degrees, in the two volumes: "Code-Switching in the Long Twelfth Century" by Skaffari (Pahta et al. 2017, 121-42) touches upon French, coupled with English and Latin, as one of the languages encountered in English manuscripts from that century. In "The Social and Textual Embedding of Multilingual Practices in Late Modern English: A Corpus-Based Approach" (Pahta et al. 2017, 171-98), Nurmi, Jukka Tyrkkö, Anna Petäjäniemi and Pahta focus on the influence of French (among other languages) in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. A narrower investigation of French borrowings into nineteenth-century English is carried out in Julia Schultz's "Nineteenth-Century French Cuisine Terms and their Semantic Integration into English" (Louviot and Delesse 2017, 229-56), which considers food and drink-related French borrowings and their treatment across lexicographical resources of the two languages. Lastly, within this French-related cluster, Marion Schulte's "Investigating Semantic Change in Derivational Morphology" (Louviot and Delesse 2017, 41-60) focuses on derivational morphemes in English, while bringing the French borrowings -ment and -age into the discussion (42-45). The relative prominence of Anglo-French in these volumes is in line with the increasing attention that this variety of French has garnered over the last decades—see, among the most recent monographs, Ingham (2010; 2012) and Thelma Fenster and Carolyn P. Collete (2017)—in the larger context of multilingualism in medieval England (on the linguistic make-up of late medieval England, see some of latest contributions in Jocelyn Wogan-Browne et al. (2009), Judith Jefferson and Ad Putter (2013) and Tim W. Machan (2016)). This linguistic ecology is also covered by Wright's "A Multilingual Approach to the History of Standard English" (Pahta et al. 2017, 339-58), which revisits the topic of another volume she edited, *The Development of Standard English*, 1300–1800 (2000), and gives an overview of her main findings over the past twenty years on what she calls "mixed-language business writing" (e.g. Wright 1992; 1995; 1998; 2002; 2010; 2011; 2012; 2017).

Having traced some of the thematic commonalities between Pahta et al. and Louviot and Delesse, I shall now compare their structural organisations, one of the most divergent aspects. The former volume comprises four sections and a total of sixteen contributions:

---

[1] Some authors prefer the politically neutral term *Anglo-French* to the traditional name employed here, *Anglo-Norman.* However, many lexicographers would use the labels interchangeably and the main dictionary of this variety of French is entitled *The Anglo-Norman Dictionary* (1977-92).

a two-chapter introduction section and three major themes, "Borderlands" (chapters three to seven), "Patterns" (chapters eight to twelve) and "Contexts" (chapters thirteen to sixteen).[2] "Borderlands" (39-142) reflects upon terminological conundrums and the blurring of spatial areas, such as the Welsh-English border in Simon Meecham-Jones's "Code-Switching and Contact Influence in Middle English Manuscripts from the Welsh Penumbra—Should we Re-interpret the Evidence from Sir Gawain and the Green Knight?" (97-119). The two other major sections, "Patterns" and "Contexts," seem to be partly inspired by the sociolinguistic and structural/grammatical approaches outlined above. The "Contexts" section (275-358) encompasses papers on early modern Poland—by Joanna Kopaczyk (275-98)—as well as medieval England (chapters thirteen to sixteen), and the contributions in the "Patterns" section (145-271) innovatively make use of large databases and corpora. Although no large corpora like the *Helsinki Corpus of English Texts*, the *Corpus of Early English Correspondence* or the *Corpus of Middle English Medical Texts* exist for multilingual historical sources, purpose-built databases and even monolingual corpora (see also Nurmi et al. 2017) can shed some light on the study of language interactions (Pahta et al. 2017, 10). New tools for processing multilingual data like *Multilingualiser* have proven to be particularly useful in quantitative-oriented research, as shown in "The Social and Textual Embedding of Multilingual Practices in Late Modern English: A Corpus-Based Analysis" by Nurmi et al. (Pahta et al. 2017, 171-98).

On the other hand, at first sight, there does not seem to be a clear unity in Louviot and Delesse's edited volume: six out of its eleven chapters focus on the study of the internal history of English, accounting for changes or variation in the language through its own internal developments and specifically relating to quantifiers (chapter one), metaphoric-metonymic interactions in zoosemy (chapter two), grammatical gender variation in Old English (chapter four), the treatment of titles in Old English proper names (chapter five) and diachronic vowel changes (chapters six and seven).[3] A degree of structural cohesiveness does, however, seem to emerge from chapter four onwards: chapters four and five concentrate on Old English, chapters six and seven on phonology and, finally, the last major group (chapters eight to eleven)—albeit invisible to the uninitiated reader—is concerned with the effects of language contact on English. The reason for such discrepancies and the absence of section headings in the table of contents is not clarified; a more explicit indication of the motivation behind this array of thematic strands would have been desirable, precisely because some of them tie in very well with ongoing work, such as that brought together in Pahta et al. Links between the two volumes surface once again in the penultimate chapter in Louviot and

---

[2] The aim of this book review article is not to offer a linear summary of the contents of each volume—which are very diverse in terms of topics and scopes—but rather to guide the reader through their common theoretical and methodological premises.

[3] Given the length of some of the chapter titles, they are not included here in order to avoid the disruption of the reading. Others may be abbreviated for the same reason.

Delesse, Keller's "Code-Switched Adjectives in Macaronic Sermons" (197-216), and chapter eight in Pahta et al., Jukka Tuominen's "Trifling Shews of Learning? Patterns of Code-Switching in English Sermons 1640-1740" (145-69), both of which examine macaronic sermons across time.[4] Diachronic variation is particularly noticeable in Tuominen's chapter, which reveals a progressive decline in the number of code-switches to Latin from the first to the second half of the seventeenth century. His examination of ten sermons from the *Lampeter Corpus* also allows him to discuss a wider range of factors, such as education, which may have played a part in the use of code-switching.

I will take Keller's piece of research—which illustrates a very close application of the MLF model—as my point of departure from which to raise wider issues applicable to various chapters of the two volumes under consideration. Keller tested this model against an edited text, the English *Macaronic Sermons* (Horner 2006), extant in MS Bodley 649 and dated to c. 1400-1450. She extracted 192 mixed determinant phrases manually and classified them according to language. Overall, her thorough analysis showed that only two cases contradicted the predictions of the MLF model (211). Still, at the core of her study, as well as similar investigations, are a few pitfalls which are not tackled in the chapter, but may be worth noting here: the use of editions (or non-diplomatic transcriptions) may have prevented the author from encountering more instantiations of morphological ambiguity (i.e. bare forms); the suspension and abbreviation system was part and parcel of manuscript writing and further opened up the possibilities of interpreting a given root as belonging to several languages—a subject fully dealt with in ter Horst and Stam's "Visual Diamorphs: The Importance of Language Neutrality in Code-Switching from Medieval Ireland" (Pahta et al. 2017, 223-42). If the words extracted by Keller from the published edition have not been contrasted with the original manuscript sources, silently expanded abbreviations and suspensions may have gone unidentified. Likewise, attempting to compare present-day oral code-switching with medieval manuscript sermons seems rather problematic.

Generally speaking, code-switching involves the alternation between two (or more rarely, three) linguistic codes with no integration of the items involved, whereas borrowing usually presupposes an incorporation of the material from the donor language into the recipient language (e.g. Poplack and Meechan 1998; Poplack and Dion 2012). From this perspective, both morphology and phonology provide the most widely used indices to measure integration. In historical written texts, only the morphological criterion can be taken as a reliable indicator of integration. Yet, with regard to inflectional morphology, in manuscripts the line between (decorative)

---

[4] The term "macaronic" (< Lat. *macaronicus*) was primarily used to refer to "a burlesque form of verse in which vernacular words are introduced into the context of another language (originally and chiefly Latin), often with corresponding inflections and constructions" (*OED* 2000). Its meaning then extended to encompass any form of mixed language with similar characteristics, which shows how the practice of alternating more than one language within the same communicative event has remained a constant throughout time (see Lazzerini (1982) for a fuller account of the earliest uses of the term).

flourishes and abbreviations indicating Latin-inflected marking is sometimes blurred, so that a given word could potentially be both an integrated and a non-integrated borrowing. In fact, the *OED* expressed plans to revise entries in the dictionary by reassessing the original manuscripts of the edited texts from which the quotations were taken in the past (Durkin and Harvey 2017). Following the *OED* policy, if what were thought to be flourishes are indeed Latin abbreviations, those quotations would be discarded as faithful attestations of English words (see Wright's (2013) observations about similar lexicographical policies).

Moreover, both code-switching and borrowing are rooted in the idea that elements of (usually) two respective monolingual linguistic varieties can be mixed, presupposing the existence of unmixed languages. Shana Poplack and Marjory Meechan emphasised that "it is important to have as explicit an idea as possible of the nature of these vernaculars before concluding that a codemixed element takes aspects from one or the other or both" (1998, 130). Attempts to identify the matrix language with a monolingual code have sometimes been unfruitful, which has resulted in the formulation of the "matrix language" as an abstract construct (Myers-Scotton 2002; Auer and Muhamedova 2005). If this discussion is extrapolated beyond present-day communities, what becomes particularly noticeable, especially after reading the contributions in the two volumes under review, is that our contemporary notions of languages as clearly delineated and distinguishable entities do not apply to the Middle Ages. The processes of standardisation were not underway, so it is not uncommon to find great variability and hybridity across languages in contact. In the case of late medieval England, the primary focus of a significant proportion of Pahta et al. and, to a lesser extent, Louviot and Delesse, the simultaneous coexistence of not two but at least three languages (i.e., Medieval Latin and the two vernaculars, Middle English and Anglo-French) with an asymmetrical sociolinguistic distribution, complicates the disentangling of the origin of the lexical material used.

Myers-Scotton (2002) postulated that frequency rather than integration could help to establish distinctions between code-switching and borrowing. Consequently, one imperative guiding code-switching research could be to obtain the largest possible data sample, something which now seems more feasible than a few decades ago, as can be gleaned from the contributions in Pahta et al. Nevertheless, attestations are still challenging: some lexical items may be *hapax legomena* or scribal *verbatim* copies from *exempla* (thereby not representing the actual language use of the individual); others may be so widely spread (internationalisms) that they cannot be easily traced. Faced with such taxonomical difficulties, each author in the present volumes proposes different methodological frameworks. For example, following Yaron Matras (2009, 110-14), Schendl puts forward five criteria for identifying one-word switches (Pahta et al. 2017, 49-50), and Queiroz de Barros identifies nine types of foreignisms applying graphemic, typological, phonological and grammatical criteria (Pahta et al. 2017, 70-72). The particulars of these classifications vary, but most of them—if not all—acknowledge the continuum on which code-switching and borrowing should be placed. Even relatively

straightforward loanwords may have different routes of transmission, depending on the specific context of production (the writer might have made use of sources and intermediate translations in other languages, etc.).

Finally, the language choice in these two volumes merits further attention. The subtitle of Pahta et al., "English and Beyond," hints at the broader range of languages considered (in addition to English, French, Irish, Latin, Polish, Portuguese, Scots, Spanish and Welsh). Apart from English, the majority of contributions include Latin: to name but a few of the language combinations, Šime Demo's "Mining Macaronics" (199-221) surveys sixty poems written in eleven language pairs (Neo-Latin and a vernacular), ter Horst and Stam's chapter on visual diamorphs (223-42) investigates Irish and Latin, and Kopaczyk's paper (275-98) examines Latin, Polish and Scots language-mixing among Scottish immigrants in early modern Poland/Lithuania. In contrast, Louviot and Delesse has a more limited language coverage (English, French and Latin) but nevertheless exemplifies a progressive—and long-awaited—move towards a multilingual approach to the history of English. Along these lines, the global turn that fields such as medieval studies are taking demands a reassessment of the geographical and epistemological limitations that have characterised traditional research. Connectedness and mobility beyond Europe were central to the premodern world in ways which are now being much more fully appreciated. Pahta et al. argue that "it is important to look beyond the borders and coasts of England and aim at a Europe-wide approach" (2017, 6), but, I would add, researchers working on multilingualism should not confine themselves just to Europe; even the minutely local can come to interact with ideas involving the global. Words and their etymologies can, in fact, lead us far beyond Europe, thus the potential of larger units—namely, multilingual texts—remains to be further explored in this light.

WORKS CITED

ASHDOWNE, Richard and Carolinne White, eds. 2017. *Latin in Medieval Britain*. Oxford: Oxford UP/British Academy.

AUER, Peter and Raihan Muhamedova. 2005. "'Embedded Language' and 'Matrix Language' in Insertional Language Mixing: Some Problematic Cases." *Rivista di Linguistica* 17 (1): 35-54.

BULLOCK, Barbara E. and Almeida J. Toribio. 2009. "Themes in the Study of Code-Switching." In Bullock and Toribio 2009, 1-17.

—, eds. 2009. *The Cambridge Handbook of Linguistic Code-Switching*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP.

DAVIDSON, Mary Catherine. 2005. "Discourse Features of Code-Switching in Legal Reports in Late Medieval England." In Skaffari et al. 2005, 343-51.

DURKIN, Philip and Anthony Harvey. 2017. *Spoken Through: How Scholarly Dictionaries Mediate the Past*. Cambridge: Department of Anglo-Saxon, Norse and Celtic Publications.

FENSTER, Thelma and Carolyn P. Collette, eds. 2017. *The French of Medieval England: Essays in Honour of Jocelyn Wogan-Browne*. Cambridge: D.S. Brewer.

FISIAK, Jacek, ed. 1995. *Medieval Dialectology*. Berlin and New York: De Gruyter.

GARDNER-CHLOROS, Penelope. 2009. *Code-Switching*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP.

HORNER, Patrick, ed. 2006. *A Macaronic Sermon Collection from Late Medieval England*. Toronto: PIMS.

INGHAM, Richard. 2009. "Mixing Language on the Manor." *Medium Aevum* 78 (1): 80-97.

—, ed. 2010. *The Anglo-Norman Language and its Contexts*. York: York Medieval Press and Boydell Press.

—. 2012. *The Transmission of Anglo-Norman: Language History and Language Acquisition*. Amsterdam and Philadelphia, PA: John Benjamins.

JACOBSON, Rodolfo, ed. 2001. *Codeswitching Worldwide II*. Berlin and New York: De Gruyter.

JAHR, Ernst H., ed. 1998. *Language Change: Advances in Historical Sociolinguistics*. Berlin and New York: De Gruyter.

JEFFERSON, Judith and Ad Putter, eds. 2013. *Multilingualism in Medieval Britain (c. 1066-1520)*. Turnhout: Brepols.

KOWALESKI, Maryanne. 2009. "The French of England: A Maritime Lingua Franca?" In Wogan-Browne et al. 2009, 103-17.

LAZZERINI, Lino. 1982. "Aux Origines du Macaronique." *Revue des Langues Romanes* 86: 11-33.

LOUVIOT, Elise and Catherine Delesse, eds. 2017. *Studies in Language Variation and Change 2: Shifts and Turns in the History of English*. Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars.

MACHAN, Tim W., ed. 2016. *Imagining Medieval English: Language Structures and Theories, 500-1500*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP.

MATRAS, Yaron. 2009. *Language Contact*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP.

MUYSKEN, Pieter. 2000. *Bilingual Speech: A Typology of Code-Mixing*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP.

MYERS-SCOTTON, Carol. 1993. *Social Motivations for Codeswitching: Evidence from Africa*. Oxford: Clarendon.

—. 1997. *Duelling Languages: Grammatical Structure in Codeswitching*. Oxford: Oxford UP.

—. 2001. "The Matrix Language Frame Model: Development and Responses." In Jacobson 2001, 23-58.

—. 2002. *Contact Linguistics: Bilingual Encounters and Grammatical Outcomes*. Oxford: Oxford UP.

MYERS-SCOTTON, Carol and Janice Jake. 2009. "A Universal Model of Code-Switching and Bilingual Language Processing and Production." In Bullock and Toribio 2009, 336-57.

NURMI, Arja and Päivi Pahta. 2010. "Preacher, Scholar, Brother, Friend: Social Roles and Code-Switching in the Writings of Thomas Twining." In Pahta et al. 2010, 135-62.

Nurmi, Arja, Tanja Rütten and Päivi Pahta, eds. 2017. *Challenging the Myth of Monolingual Corpora*. Leiden and Boston, MA: Brill Rodopi.

Oxford English Dictionary Online. 2000. s.v. "Macaronic." [Accessed online on January 20, 2019].

Pahta, Päivi et al., eds. 2010. *Social Roles and Language Practices in Late Modern English*. Amsterdam and Philadelphia, PA: John Benjamins.

Pahta, Päivi, Janne Skaffari and Laura Wright, eds. 2017. *Multilingual Practices in Language History: English and Beyond*. Berlin and New York: De Gruyter.

Poplack, Shana and Marjory Meechan. 1998. "How Languages Fit Together in Codemixing." *International Journal of Bilingualism* 2 (2): 127-38.

Poplack, Shana and Nathalie Dion. 2012. "Myths and Facts about Loanword Development." *Language Variation and Change* 24 (3): 279-315.

Rissanen, Matti et al., eds. 1992. *History of Englishes: New Methods and Interpretations in Historical Linguistics*. Berlin and New York: De Gruyter.

Roig-Marín, Amanda. 2018. "When the Vernaculars (Anglo-Norman and Middle English) and Medieval Latin Fuse into a Functional Variety: Evidence from the Administrative Realm." *Studia Neophilologica* 90 (2): 176-94.

Schendl, Herbert. 2000. "Syntactic Constraints on Code-Switching in Medieval Texts." In Taavitsainen et al. 2000, 67-86.

Schendl, Herbert and Laura Wright, eds. 2011. *Code-Switching in Early English*. Berlin and New York: De Gruyter.

Sikorska, Liliana and Marcin Krygier, eds. 2013. *Evur Happie & Glorious, for I Hafe at Will Grete Riches*. Frankfurt: Peter Lang.

Skaffari, Janne et al., eds. 2005. *Opening Windows on Texts and Discourses of the Past*. Amsterdam and Philadelphia, PA: John Benjamins.

Stone, Louise W. and William Rothwell, eds. 1977-1992. *Anglo-Norman Dictionary*. [Accessed online on January 20, 2019].

Taavitsainen, Irma et al., eds. 2000. *Placing Middle English in Context*. Berlin and New York: De Gruyter.

Wenzel, Siegfried. 1994. *Macaronic Sermons: Bilingualism and Preaching in Late-Medieval England*. Ann Arbor: U. of Michigan P.

Wogan-Browne, Jocelyn et al., eds. 2009. *Language and Culture in Medieval Britain: The French of England c. 1100-c. 1500*. York: York Medieval Press.

Wright, Laura. 1992. "Macaronic Writing in a London Archive, 1380-1480." In Rissanen et al. 1992, 762-70.

—. 1995. "A Hypothesis on the Structure of Macaronic Business Writing." In Fisiak 1995, 309-21.

—. 1998. "Mixed-Language Business Writing. Five Hundred Years of Code-Switching." In Jahr 1998, 99-118.

—. 2002. "Code-Intermediate Phenomena in Medieval Mixed-Language Business Texts." *Language Sciences* 24 (3-4): 471-89.

—. 2010. "A Pilot Study on the Singular Definite Articles *le* and *la* in Fifteenth-Century London Mixed-Language Business Writing." In Ingman 2010, 130-42.

—. 2011. "On Variation and Change in Medieval Mixed-Language Business Writing." In Schendl and Wright 2011, 191-218.

—. 2012. "Mixed-Language Accounts as Sources for Linguistic Analysis." In Jefferson and Putter 2012, 123-36.

—. 2013. "On Historical Language Dictionaries and Language Boundaries." In Sikorska and Krygier 2013, 11-26.

—. 2017. "On Non-Integrated Vocabulary in the Mixed-Language Accounts of St Paul's Cathedral, 1315-1405." In Ashdowne and White 2017, 272-98.

Amanda Roig-Marín, BA (Universitat d'Alacant), MPhil (University of Cambridge), is a PhD student working on the multilingual makeup of texts produced in late medieval England. Her main research interests include both historical and present-day language contact, Middle English Philology, and manuscript studies. She has published her work in journals such as *Neophilologus*, *Studia Neophilologica* and *Notes and Queries*.

Address: Selwyn College. Grange Rd, Cambridge CB3 9DQ. United Kingdom. Tel.: +44 7716027246.

Acknowledgements

Editorial Policy, Instructions to Contributors and Abridged Guidelines

What we publish

Atlantis publishes articles and book review articles in the field of English studies. Contributions submitted to *Atlantis* should meet the following criteria:

- Suitability for the aim and scope of the journal
- Originality and interest in relation to subject matter, method, data or findings
- Relevance to current research in the field
- Revision of previously published work on the topic
- Logical rigour in argumentation and in the analysis of data
- Adequate use of concepts and research methodology
- Discussion of theoretical implications and/or practical applications
- Command of recent bibliography
- Linguistic appropriateness, textual organisation and satisfactory presentation
- Readability and conciseness of expression

Submissions

Articles should be 6,000-8,000 words and book review articles 3,000-4,500 (including abstract, keywords, footnotes and references).

Contributions should be uploaded to the journal's webpage (www.atlantisjournal. org), in a 1.5-spaced, point 12 electronic Microsoft Word document (or equivalent electronic version). Please follow the indications on the journal's webpage, especially with regard to the metadata accompanying your submission:

www.atlantisjournal.org/index.php/atlantis/about/submissions#onlineSubmissions

- Title of the manuscript
- Author's name
- Institutional affiliation and full postal address
- Telephone numbers (both home and office)
- Institutional e-mail address
- Word processor and version used to format the document
- Total number of words, including works cited and notes
- A 60-word bionote
- The *Atlantis* checklist

COPYRIGHT NOTICE AND CONCURRENCE

Authors are expected to know and heed basic ground rules that preclude simultaneous submission and/or duplicate publication. Prospective contributors to *Atlantis* commit themselves to the following when they submit a manuscript:

- That no concurrent consideration of the same, or almost identical, work by any other journal and/or publisher is taking place.
- That the potential contribution has not appeared previously nor is about to appear within two years, in any form whatsoever, in another journal, electronic format, or as a chapter/section of a book.

If, after two years, a contribution first published in *Atlantis* is to be reprinted elsewhere, permission is not required but the author should credit *Atlantis* for the contribution's first appearance. If in doubt about any of the above, the author should consult the Editor.

Seeking permission for the use of copyright material is the responsibility of the author.

ANONYMITY POLICY

All details of personal identification must be absent from the manuscript, as well as from the file properties. The author's name should be replaced by "author" throughout the paper. If the submission contains any element of identification of the author, it will not be sent to referees.

FORMAL GUIDELINES

Before submitting an article, please make sure that your text observes the following guidelines. Articles that do not comply with the *Atlantis* style sheet will be returned for resubmission before being sent out to referees.

§ 1. EXTERNAL PRESENTATION

1.1. Submission

Authors must submit their contribution (Microsoft Word document) accompanied by the following documents in separate files:

- *Atlantis* checklist
- Personal data and a bionote of approx. 60 words
- An institutional address and phone number following the example below

Address: Departamento de Filología Moderna. Facultad de Educación. Universidad de Castilla-La Mancha. Plaza de la Universidad, 3. 02071, Albacete, Spain. Tel.: +34 000000000; ext. 0000.

1.2. Language

Manuscripts are to be submitted in English. Authors must consistently follow either British or American spelling conventions. A version or translation of the title, abstract and keywords in Spanish must be provided. For those contributors who do not handle Spanish the Editors will provide the translation.

1.3. Length

For articles: 6,000-8,000 words (including abstract, keywords and references); for book review articles: 3,500-4,500 words.

1.4. Abstract (articles)

The first page of each article must include a title plus a 100-200 word summary. The abstract should be written in an 11-point Times New Roman font, 1.5 spacing, indented (0.5 cm) and positioned immediately before the body of the text. It should consist of one paragraph and contain no bibliographical reference in parenthetical form.

1.5. Keywords (articles)

Just after the abstract, append a list of up to six keywords in an 11-point Times New Roman font, separated with semi-colons, so that your contribution can be accurately classified by international reference indexes. Do not use a period at the end of the list of keywords.

§ 2. GENERAL STYLISTIC, STRUCTURAL AND FORMATTING GUIDELINES

All manuscripts should follow the author-date guidelines of the 16th edition of the *Chicago Manual of Style* unless otherwise specified.

2.1. Format

The text should be submitted in 1.5 line spacing. Use a 12-point Times New Roman font for the main text and an 11-point Times New Roman font for the abstract, keywords, footnotes and indented quotations.

The first line of each paragraph should be intended 0.5 cm (please use the indentation tool included in Word, not the tab key), with the exception of the first line in the first paragraph of each section. The first line of all footnotes should also be indented 0.5 cm.

2.2. Titles of contributions

Place them at the top and centre of the page on which the text begins. Capitalise only the first letter of the first word and all other significant words (nouns, adjectives, verbs and adverbs) as well as proper nouns. Always capitalise the last word. Do not use period after titles.

2.3. Textual divisions and headings

Section headings should be used with discretion. They must begin from the left margin,

with no period at the end. The use of Arabic numerals for headings is recommended. If absolutely necessary, further division within a section should follow the same format used for section headings. They must be preceded by Arabic numerals separated by period (e.g., 1.1.). Do not capitalise headings in full (only content words should be in capital letters) and use small caps.

2.4. Tables, drawings and graphic items
Please avoid their proliferation, since it may result in an excessive number of pages. This could affect the eligibility of your work for publication. All tables and figures should be numbered consecutively and referred to by their numbers within the text (e.g., as we see in example/table/figure 1). Take into account that graphs must be clearly understood when printed in black and white.

2.5. Punctuation
All punctuation marks, except colon and semicolon, should precede closing quotation marks (e.g., "the bookshelf," she replied).

   Question marks (?) and exclamation marks (!) should not normally be used in scholarly writing unless they are part of a quotation.

   Do not use commas (,) before "and" and "or" in a series of three or more. Never use a comma and a dash together.

   Square brackets ([ ]) are used for an unavoidable parenthesis within a parenthesis, to enclose interpolations or comments in a quotation or incomplete data and to enclose phonetic transcription. Slash marks (/ /) are used to enclose phonemic transcription.

2.6. Numbers
Spell out whole numbers from zero to one hundred and numbers followed by *hundred*, *thousand*, *hundred thousand*, *million* or *billion*. Spell out all numbers beginning a sentence.

2.7. Dates
Centuries are spelled out and lowercased (the twenty-first century). Use standard dating (April 13, 1990). No comma is used between month and year when no day is given (May 1990).

   Express decades in numerals (the 1870s, the 1920s).

2.8. Italics
Use italics for emphasis (only when strictly necessary), foreign words, technical terms and linguistic forms (words, phrases, letters) cited as examples or as subjects of discussion. Italicise titles of books, plays, periodicals, films, television and radio programmes, paintings, drawings, photographs, statues or other works of art.

2.9. Capitalisation

Capitalise the first letter of the first word and all of the principal words—including nouns, adjectives, adverbs and verbs in hyphenated compounds, but not articles, prepositions and conjunctions—in titles of publications, lectures or papers. In mentioning magazines, journals or newspapers (e.g., the *Gentleman's Magazine*), do not treat an initial definite article as a part of the title.

Do not capitalise references to standard parts of a specific work, such as preface, acknowledgements, appendix, chapter, etc. (e.g., as discussed in chapter four).

2.10. Quotation marks

Double quotation marks (" ") are used to enclose quoted speech or writing when they are run into the text. They are also used for titles of articles, book chapters and poems. Do not use straight double quotation marks (" ").

For quotations within run-in quotations and within titles of articles or book chapters use single quotation marks (' ') (e.g., "'Fractions of Men': Engendering Amputation in Victorian Culture").

2.11. Quotations

All quotations should correspond exactly with the originals in wording, spelling, capitalisation and internal punctuation. Italicising words for emphasis should be used with discretion and be explicitly indicated as follows: "You find yourself, at the final blackout, *holding your breath*" (Tripney 2015, 8; italics added). If the emphasis is in the original, it should also be indicated: "The writerly text is *ourselves writing*" (Barthes 1974, 5; italics in the original).

If the source contains a spelling error, insert the italicised word *sic* in square brackets ([*sic*]). Clarifications, as well as translations, must be enclosed in brackets—e.g., "He [Stephen Spender] is one of the finest poets Britain has ever produced."

When using the author-date system, the reference of the quotation should always be placed at the end of the clause, before the punctuation mark—e.g., a "nice suggestion" (Russell 2016, 36).

Second-hand quotations or references must be used only sparingly. If an original source is unavailable and "quoted in" must be resorted to, mention the original author and date in the main text and reference the source used both in the parenthetical reference and in the works cited list, as follows:

Main text:
In Louis Zukofsky's "Sincerity and Objectification," from the February 1931 issue of *Poetry Magazine* (quoted in Costello 1981, 53), …

Works Cited:
Costello, Bonnie. 1981. *Marianne Moore: Imaginary Possessions*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard UP.

2.12. Run-on and indented quotations

Unless special emphasis is required, prose quotations up to about 75 words should be run into the surrounding text. Longer quotations should be set off, indented (0.5 cm) and never enclosed in quotation marks. An 11-point font should be used.

Verse quotations of up to two lines should be run in, with the lines separated with a slash, leaving one space on either side (/). Longer verse quotations must be set off.

2.13. Ellipsis within quotations

Use three periods enclosed in brackets […] to indicate that part of a quotation has been deleted. Avoid using this device to open or close quotations that are obviously complete syntactic fragments.

2.14. Em dash (—)

The use of em dash instead of parentheses is advised. Do not leave any space before or after them—e.g., "haunting ghosts of the past—slavery and its legacy—should be laid to rest before a better future can be built."

2.15. Footnotes

These should be limited to authorial commentary that cannot be easily accommodated in the body of the text and their use is discouraged. They must not be used to give bibliographical references that can appear in parenthetical form within the text. They should be numbered, superscripted and placed after the closest punctuation mark. The first line of the footnote should be indented 0.5 cm.

2.16. Exemplification

If the author provides a list of examples including sentences they should be listed, indented (0.5 cm) and written in an 11-point font following the example:

(1) Hello my name is Charlie. My town is xxx. (S5b4P)

(2) Hello! Mr. and Mrs Edwards. I'm Julia and I live in xxx. (S210g5P)

(3) Hello family! My name is Berta and my surname is Santos. (S1g6P)

§ 3. DOCUMENTING SOURCES

Do not forget to add to your list of works cited all the references you mention throughout the text. Bear in mind that specific page numbers must be provided for all quotations included.

Leave page numbers in full up to 109; abbreviate them after that. Do so for in-text citations—e.g., (Thomson 2006, 108-109); (Suedfell 1997, 849-61)—as well as for pages in the works cited list—e.g., *Modern Drama* 61 (1): 109-10; *Political Psychology* 18 (4): 384-95.

Never use Latin reference tags (*op. cit.*, *ibidem*, etc.).

If you want to indicate that some information is missing you can use the following devices: n.p. for "no publisher"—where the publisher's name would appear in your entry—also for "no place of publication" and "no page"—e.g., online material without pagination. The use of n.d. is advised for "no date." If the author or editor is unknown, the entry should begin with the title of the publication.

Publishing company names are abbreviated in the list of works cited. Remove articles, business abbreviations (Co., Inc.) and descriptive words (Publishers and so on). Any university press will be abbreviated according to one of these two patterns: U of Miami P or Toronto UP.

Avoid giving initials for authors in your works cited. Full names should be provided when possible.

In English, use a colon to separate titles from subtitles of books (e.g., *The Feminist Reader: Essays in Gender and the Politics of Literary Criticism*). In other languages, follow common practice (e.g., *Multiculturalismo. Los derechos de las minorías culturales*).

In accordance with the author-date system, two different types of documentation will be used: parenthetical in-text citations and a works cited list following the examples provided below. Other cases not included here must also follow the *Chicago Manual of Style* (16th edition).

Books and book chapters

Books with single author:

Barnes, Julian. 1984. *Flaubert's Parrot*. London: Jonathan Cape.

(Barnes 1984, 38)

Several books by the same author (and same year of publication):

Samaddar, Ranabir. 1999a. *The Marginal Nation: Transborder Migration from Bangladesh to West Bengal*. Delhi: Sage.

—, ed. 1999b. *Reflections on Partition in the East*. Kolkata: Vikas.

(Samaddar 1999a, 124)

(Samaddar 1999b)

Books with two or more authors:

In the list of works cited, for more than three authors, use only the name of the first author followed by et al. In text citations, for more than two authors, use only the name of the first author followed by et al. Note that et al. is not italicized.

Allan, Keith and Kate Burridge. 1991. *Euphemism and Dysphemism: Language Used as Shield and Weapon*. Oxford and New York: Oxford UP.

(Allan and Burridge 1991, 24)

PAHTA, Päivi, Janne Skaffari and Laura Wright, eds. 2017. *Multilingual Practices in Language History: English and Beyond*. Berlin and New York: De Gruyter

(Pahta et al. 2017)

Incorrect: BURFORD, Barbara, Gabriela Pearse, Grace Nichols and Jackie Kay. 1988. *A Dangerous Knowing: Four Black Women Poets*. London: Sheba.

Correct: BURFORD, Barbara et al. 1988. *A Dangerous Knowing: Four Black Women Poets*. London: Sheba.

(Burford et al. 1988, 45)

BOOK BY A CORPORATE AUTHOR:

American Cancer Society. 2016. *Breast Cancer Clear & Simple*. 2nd ed. Washington: ACS.

(American Cancer Society 2016)

EDITED BOOKS:

BROADBENT, John, ed. 1974. *Poets of the Seventeenth Century*. 2 vols. New York: New American Library.

SINOR, Jennifer and Rona Kaufman, eds. 2007. *Placing the Academy: Essays on Landscape, Work and Identity*. Logan: Utah State UP.

If the same author appears as editor, list your references following the model:

O'HALLORAN, Kay. 2004. *Multimodal Discourse Analysis*. London: Continuum.

—, ed. 2005. *Mathematical Discourse: Language, Symbolism and Visual Images.* London: Continuum.

CONFERENCE PROCEEDINGS:

QU, Yan, James Shanahan and Janice Wiebe, eds. 2004. *Proceedings of AAAI Spring Symposium on Exploring Attitude and Affect in Text*. Menlo Park, CA: AAAI Press.

TRANSLATIONS/EDITIONS:

BAKHTIN, Mikhail. 1981. *The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays*. Translated by Michael Holquist and edited by Caryl Emerson. Austin: U of Texas P.

SECOND AND SUCCESSIVE EDITIONS:

WIENER, Martin J. 2004. *English Culture and the Decline of the Industrial Spirit, 1850-1980*. 2nd ed. Cambridge: Cambridge UP.

REPRINTS:

HARJO, Joy. (1983) 2008. *She Had Some Horses*. New York: Norton.

(Harjo [1983] 2008, 21)

MULTIVOLUME WORK:

BROADBENT, John, ed. 1974. *Poets of the Seventeenth Century*. 2 vols. New York: New American Library.

CHAPTERS IN BOOKS OR CONFERENCE PROCEEDINGS:
List both the cited chapter(s) and the edited book itself, as follows:

HOWE, Irving, ed. 1977. *Jewish-American Stories*. New York: Mentor-NAL.
OLSEN, Tillie. 1977. "Tell Me a Riddle." In Howe 1977, 82-117.

(Olsen 1977, 93)

MIRANDA, Deborah. 2007. "Teaching on Stolen Ground." In Sinor and Kaufman 2007, 169-87.
SINOR, Jennifer and Rona Kaufman, eds. 2007. *Placing the Academy: Essays on Landscape, Work and Identity*. Logan: Utah State UP.

(Miranda 2007, 172-76)

QU, Yan, James Shanahan and Janice Wiebe, eds. 2004. *Proceedings of AAAI Spring Symposium on Exploring Attitude and Affect in Text*. Menlo Park, CA: AAAI Press.
TABOADA, Maite and Jack Grieve. 2004. "Analyzing Appraisal Automatically." In Qu et al. 2004, 158-61.

(Taboada and Grieve 2004, 160)

INTRODUCTIONS, PROLOGUES, FOREWORDS TO A BOOK:

HOLQUIST, Michael. 1984. Prologue to *Rabelais and his World*, by Mikhail Bakhtin, xiii-xxiii. Translated by Hélène Iswolsky. Bloomington: Indiana UP.

ARTICLES

JOURNAL ARTICLES:

CORNIS-POPE, Marcel. 1990. "Poststructuralist Narratology and Critical Writing: A 'Figure in the Carpet' Textshop." *The Journal of Narrative Technique* 20 (2): 245-65.
LIN, Yi-Chun Tricia. 2016. "Indigenous Feminisms: Why Transnational? Why Now?" *Lectora* 22: 9-12.

(Cornis-Pope 1990, 247)
(Lin 2016, 10)

JOURNALS CONSULTED ONLINE:

In the case of academic journals with stable websites, please DO NOT include either an URL or a date of access. Follow the same model as for journal articles consulted in print.

> PÉREZ, Raul and Viveca S. Greene. 2016. "Debating Rape Jokes vs. Rape Culture: Framing and Counter-Framing Misogynistic Comedy." *Social Semiotics* 26 (3): 265-82.

(Pérez and Greene 2016, 273)

NEWSPAPER AND WEBSITE ARTICLES:

If consulted online, please DO NOT include any URL. Add, however, the access date [Accessed online on Month day, year] at the end followed by a period. If the web is no longer available, add [no longer available].

> BANKS, Sandra. 1986. "The Devil's on Our Radio." *People*, May 7, 72.
> SMITH, Ali. 2012. "Once upon a Life." *Observer*, May 29. [Accessed online on August 2, 2015].

(Smith 2012, n.p.)

> SMITH, Grant. 1998. "Since Title IX: Female Athletes in Young Adult Fiction." *Oncourse-Indiana University Knowledge Base*. [Accessed online on January 14, 2018; no longer available].

PUBLISHED INTERVIEWS:

> BELLOUR, Raymond. 1979. "Alternation, Segmentation, Hypnosis: Interview with Raymond Bellour." By Janet Bergstrom. *Camera Obscura* 3-4: 89-94.
> ROWLING, J. K. 2005. "J. K. Rowling Hogwarts and All." Interview by Lev Grossman. *Time Magazine*, July 17. [Accessed online on July 14, 2018].

(Bellour 1979, 92)

REVIEWS:

> CHURCHWELL, Sara. 2012. Review of *Home*, by Toni Morrison. *Guardian*, April 27. [Accessed online on July 13, 2015].
> SORBY, Angela. 2008. "A Woman in Saudi Arabia Chafes at Gender Restrictions." Review of *Songs of Ourselves: The Uses of Poetry in America*, by Joan Shelley Rubin. *American Historical Review* 113 (2): 449-51.

Unpublished dissertations, theses and manuscripts:

SANDREI, Maria. 1990. "Life and Death in Eighteenth-Century Love Letters." PhD diss., University of Oviedo.

VEDRASHKO, Ilya. 2011. "Advertising in Computer Games." Master's thesis, University of Arizona.

KLEIN, Katherine. "Postmodern Literary Theory Revisited." Unpublished manuscript, last modified October 2, 2013, Microsoft Word file.

Lectures/papers presented at conferences:

DUNKER, Patricia. "Salvage: On Writing Neo-Victorian Fiction." Lecture given at the AEDEAN Annual Conference, Málaga, November 2012.

Multimedia

E-Books, Films, Cds, Dvds, Vhss:

COLL-PLANAS, Gerard. 2013. *La carne y la metáfora. Una reflexión sobre el cuerpo en la teoría queer*. Barcelona: Egales. Kindle edition.

GILLIAM, Terry Gilliam and Terry Jones, dirs. (1975) 2001. *Monty Python and the Holy Grail*, special ed. DVD. Culver City, CA: Columbia Tristar Home Entertainment.

HANDEL, George Frideric. 1988. *Messiah*. Atlanta Symphony Orchestra and Chamber Chorus, Robert Shaw. Performed December 19, 1987. Ansonia Station, NY: Video Artists International. Videocassette (VHS), 141 min.

MEHRA, Rakeysh Omaprakash, dir. 2006. *Rang de Basanti*. ROMP and UTV Motion Pictures.

Online multimedia:

Please DO NOT include any URL Add, however, the access date [Accessed online on Month day, year] at the end followed by a period. If the web is no longer available, add [no longer available].

HARWOOD, John. 2008. "The Pros and Cons of Biden." *New York Times* video, 2:00. August 23, 2008. [Accessed online on February 22, 2015].

POLLAN, Michael. 2007. "Michael Pollan Gives a Plant's-Eye View." Filmed March 2007. TED video, 17:31. [Accessed online on July 13, 2013; no longer available].

Blogs:

Please DO NOT include any URL. Add, however, the access date [Accessed online on Month day, year] at the end followed by a period. If the web is no longer available, add [no longer available].

FLINDERS, Matthew. 2014. "Politics to Reconnect Communities." *OUPblog* (blog), April 2. [Accessed online on May 23, 2015].